

ATTACHMENT A
Proposed Renewal Major Facility Review Permit
Chevron Products Company – Plant No. A0010
Public Comments -
BAAQMD Responses

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
19	Table II - Permitted Source - Table II A 1	S-4333	S-4333 is listed as "TKC Vacuum Furnace, F-1750" in Table II A 1. This source should be renamed "LNHF Vacuum Furnace, F-1750."	Rename S-4333 to "LNHF Vacuum Furnace, F-1750."	Both the district's databank and original data form list this source as "TKC Vacuum Furnace, F-1750." This change should be addressed within a district application prior to amending the TV permit.
31-32	Section II – Equipment – Table II A 2– Permitted Sources (Non-Grandfathers & Non-New Source Review)	S-1908 (Tank), S-1909 (Tank), S-1911 (Tank), S-2917 (Tank), S-2918 (Tank) and S-2921 (Tank)	BAAQMD permit engineering staff stated agreement to move sources now listed in Table II.A.2 to Table II.A.1 with Table II.A.1 to be re-titled "NSR & other enforceable permitted limits". These sources have explicit permit conditions (# 4233 & #11208) limiting their annual throughput.	Delete references to S-1908, S-1909, S-1911, S-2917, S-2918 and S-2921 from Table II A 2 and add to Table II A 1.	These tanks do not appear to have been offset and may not be appropriate on the NSR table. The basis for the permitting action appears to be a loss of exemption and not a NSR application. The district did agree to reviewing this change but the submittal from Chevron did not include these changes. Each source needs to be reviewed in order to determine the appropriate table. This change will require additional review.
31-39	Table IIA2	All sources listed in Table II.A.2	As Chevron proposed, Table II.A.1 has now been relabeled "NSR & Other Enforceable". The thrupt limits for sources in Table II.A.2 are stated in the permit to be enforceable & these have the same reporting requirements as the thrupt limits in Table II.A.1. Hence, the sources & thrupt limits of Table II.A.2 could all be moved to Table II.A.1. Though BAAQMD moved many sources from Table II.A.2 to Table II.A.1 in this draft, some sources remain with their thrupt limits in Table II.A.2.	Move all sources with their throughput limits in Table II.A.2 to Table II.A.1. Leave the title "NSR & Other Enforceable" for Table II.A.1. Delete Table II.A.2 entirely from the permit.	The district did agree to reviewing this change but the submittal from Chevron did not include these changes. Each source needs to be reviewed in order to determine the appropriate table. This change will require additional review.
31-32	Section II – Equipment – Table II A 2– Permitted Sources (Non-Grandfathers & Non-New Source Review)	S-1908 (Tank), S-1909 (Tank), S-1911 (Tank), S-2917 (Tank), S-2918 (Tank) and S-2921 (Tank)	BAAQMD permit engineering staff stated agreement to move sources now listed in Table II.A.2 to Table II.A.1 with Table II.A.1 to be re-titled "NSR & other enforceable permitted limits". These sources have explicit permit conditions (# 4233 & #11208) limiting their annual throughput.	Delete references to S-1908, S-1909, S-1911, S-2917, S-2918 and S-2921 from Table II A 2 and add to Table II A 1.	Same as above.

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
35	Section II – Equipment – Table II A 2 – Permitted Sources (Non-Grandfathers & Non-New Source Review)	S-4410 (General Maintenance Paint Booth) and S-4420 (Solvent Cleaner – Machine Shop)	BAAQMD permit engineering staff stated agreement to move sources now listed in Table II.A.2 to Table II.A.1 with Table II.A.1 to be re-titled "NSR & other enforceable permitted limits". Per District database. No daily limit. Intermittent Usage Only. A/N 5591. (500 coatings, 55 solvents)	Delete references to S-4410 and S-4420 from Table II A 2 and add to Table II A 1.	Same as above.
40-44	Table II.A.3	Grandfathered Sources	Chevron's grandfathered tanks thruput limits were set based in many cases on highest 6-months average historical rates. Throughput limits on upstream & downstream plants would provide adequate indication of a bottleneck & many grandfathered tanks & the wharf can operate at higher rates than the thruput limit without Chevron making a modification. Chevron's wharf emissions are already covered by the RLOP cap.	Throughput limits for grandfathered tanks & marine loading berths should be deleted. Multiple throughput limits upstream & downstream provide adequate indication of a modification. If the limits are not removed, then these limits should be set at the sum of the design capacities for the pumps on lines to & from tanks. Chevron requests that the District review the bases for grandfathered limits compared to other refineries, and work with Chevron to revise as appropriate.	This request was made too late to be included and also requires a policy change.
47	Table II -B Abatement Devices	A-0072, A-0073	Regulation 9, Rule 9 was amended by BAAQMD to include a revised emissions limit for NOx emissions.	Update Cogen NOx limits according to the amended Reg.9-9 (effective 1/1/2010).	This has been updated to reflect the changes made to Regulation 9-9.
84	Section II – Permitted Sources - Table II C - Exempt Equipment List	S-9324	Marine Loading Berths S-9324 is listed in Table II C exempt equipment list. This source is already listed in Table II A.3. - Grandfathered Sources.	Remove S-9324 from Table II C. It is already listed in Table II A.3.	This source has been removed per the request.
85	Table III - Generally Applicable Requirements	N/A	SIP Regulation 2-1-429 is shown as federally enforceable in Table III. The current version of the SIP for Regulation 2-1 does not include 2-1-429.	Remove federal enforceability for SIP 2-1-429 in Table III.	Section 2-1-429 appears to be in the SIP therefore no change is required.
118	Table IV.A.3.2	S-4159, S-4160	Condition 469 is listed in Table IV.A.3.2 with additional parts 12 - 14 which don't match numbering in condition 469 in Section VI of this same permit. Also the fuel use limits listed in Table IV A.3.2 for sources S-4159 and S-4160 do not match the limits in Permit Condition 469.	Revise the listing of these parts of condition 469 in Table IV.A.3.2 to be consistent with Condition 469 numbering in Section VI of this permit. Correct fuel use limits in Table IV.A.3.2 to match those stated in	This section has been corrected. However, the second part has not been changed since it appears to be the difference between higher and lower heating values. An application can be submitted to change permit conditions if desired.

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
				Permit Condition 469.	
175-176	Table IV D.1.1	N/A	<p>The District added 40 CFR 98 "Mandatory Greenhouse Gas Reporting" to Table IV.D.1.1. "Refinery Wide Applicable Requirements" (pg. 175). However, EPA has expressly stated that 40 CFR 98 is not a Title V applicable requirement. The preamble to EPA's GHG Reporting Rule, 74 FR 56287-288 (10/30/09), indicates:</p> <p><i>Comment: EPA also received numerous comments about whether the requirements imposed by this rule are "applicable requirements" under the title V operating permit program. The majority of the comments took the position that the current definitions of "applicable requirement" at 40 CFR 70.2 and 71.2 do not include a rule such as this, promulgated under CAA section 114(a)(1) and 208. Commenters requested that EPA confirm their interpretation of the regulations.</i></p> <p><i>Response: As currently written, the definition of "applicable requirement" in 40 CFR 70.2 and 71.2 does not include a monitoring rule such as today's action, which is promulgated under CAA sections 114(a)(1) and 208.</i></p> <p>40 CFR 98 should not be identified as an applicable requirement in the Title V Permit.</p>	Remove 40 CFR 98 from Table IV.D.1.1.	Per the request, this section and its subparts have been removed.
177	Section IV - Applicable Requirements - Table IV D.1.1	N/A	Regulation 8-18 is listed as federally enforceable, however, only a portion of Regulation 8-18 is federally enforceable.	List Regulation 8-18 as "Y/N" or denote that only a portion of the regulation is federally enforceable.	This is consistent with the level of detail provided in the Title V permits. The version of the rule is in the SIP then it is referred to as federally enforceable. However, if a specific citation is incorrectly identified from this federally enforceable version of the rule as being federally enforceable the district will correct the citation. This comment did not provide that level of detail.

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
188	Section IV - Table IV F.1.1 Tanks	N/A	Condition 20764 is listed in a deleted table, Table IV F.1.1.	Remove Condition 20764 from the deleted Table IV F.1.1.	This condition has been removed from this section.
192-193	Section IV – Source-specific Applicable Requirements – Table IV.F.1.2 – Tanks	F.1.2 Tanks Cluster 01b	The requirements associated with 63.646(i), 63.652(b), 63.654(f) and 63.654(h) are past one-time notifications.	Modify Table IV.F.1.2 to delete references to 63.646(i), 63.652(b), 63.654(f) and 63.654(h). If not deleted from the permit itself, include in the Statement of Basis the following: The requirements associated with 63.646(i), 63.652(b), 63.654(f) and 63.654(h) are past one-time notifications. Another approach would be to add to the Generally Applicable Requirements section of the permit a statement "There are no ongoing requirements for past one-time requirements such as initial notifications & initial performance tests."	These notification requirements even once past should remain in recordkeeping for 5 years. In a meeting with EPA, I asked for the representative's opinion and he suggested that the district leave these citations in the permit since he was aware of a facility that was cited for not meeting this type of requirement and the requirement was not listed within the facility's Title V permit. The thought being that leaving these citations in may assist in preventing a similar violation from occurring.
214	Section IV – Source-specific Applicable Requirements – Table IV.F.1.5 – Tanks	F.1.5 Tanks Cluster 11	The requirements associated with 63.9(b), 63.646(h), 63.646(l), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f) are past one-time notifications.	Modify Table IV.F.1.5 to delete references to 63.9(b), 63.646(h), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f). If not deleted from the permit itself, include in the Statement of Basis the following: The requirements associated with 63.9(b), 63.646(h), 63.646(l), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f) are past one-time notifications. Another approach would be to add to the Generally Applicable Requirements section of the permit a statement "There are no ongoing requirements for past one-time requirements such as initial notifications & initial performance tests."	Same as above.

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
220	Section IV – Source-specific Applicable Requirements – Table IV.F.1.6 – Tanks	S-1633 (Tank)	The requirements associated with 63.646(h), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f) are past one-time notifications.	Modify Table IV.F.1.6 to delete references to 63.646(h), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f). If not deleted from the permit itself, include in the Statement of Basis the following: The requirements associated with 63.646(h), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f) are past one-time notifications. Another approach would be to add to the Generally Applicable Requirements section of the permit a statement "There are no ongoing requirements for past one-time requirements such as initial notifications & initial performance tests."	Same as above.
255	Section IV – Source-specific Applicable Requirements – Table IV.F.1.11 – Tanks	S-1635 (Tank) and S-1637 (Tank)	The requirements associated with 60.7(a) are past one-time notifications.	Modify Table IV.F.1.11 to delete references to 60.7(a). If not deleted from the permit itself, include in the Statement of Basis the following: The requirements associated with 60.7(a) are past one-time notifications. Another approach would be to add to the Generally Applicable Requirements section of the permit a statement "There are no ongoing requirements for past one-time requirements such as initial notifications & initial performance tests."	Same as above.
262	Section IV – Source-specific Applicable Requirements – Table IV.F.1.12 – Tanks	F.1.12 Tanks Cluster 25	The requirements associated with 60.7(a) are past one-time notifications.	Modify Table IV.F.1.12 to delete references to 60.7(a). If not deleted from the permit itself, include in the Statement of Basis the following: The requirements associated with 60.7(a) are past one-time notifications. Another approach would be to add to the Generally Applicable Requirements section of the permit a statement "There are no ongoing requirements for past one-time requirements such as initial notifications & initial performance tests."	Same as above.

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
275	Section IV – Source-specific Applicable Requirements – Table IV.F.1.13 – Tanks	F.1.13 Tanks Cluster 26	The requirements associated with 63.646(h), 63.9(b), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f) are past one-time notifications.	Modify Table IV.F.1.13 to delete references to 63.646(h), 63.9(b), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f). If not deleted from the permit itself, include in the Statement of Basis the following: The requirements associated with 63.646(h), 63.9(b), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f) are past one-time notifications. Another approach would be to add to the Generally Applicable Requirements section of the permit a statement "There are no ongoing requirements for past one-time requirements such as initial notifications & initial performance tests."	Same as above.
285	Section IV – Source-specific Applicable Requirements – Table IV.F.1.14 – Tanks	S-1289 (Tank) and S-1645 (Tank)	The requirements associated with 63.646(h), 63.9(b), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f) are past one-time notifications.	Modify Table IV.F.1.14 to delete references to 63.646(h), 63.9(b), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f). If not deleted from the permit itself, include in the Statement of Basis the following: The requirements associated with 63.646(h), 63.9(b), 63.646(i), 63.652(b) and 63.654(f) are past one-time notifications. Another approach would be to add to the Generally Applicable Requirements section of the permit a statement "There are no ongoing requirements for past one-time requirements such as initial notifications & initial performance tests."	Same as above.

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
325-326	Table IV - Applicable Requirements - Table IV G.1.7 - Wastewater	S-4393	<p>Table IV G.1.7 Lists Regulation 8, Rule 8 as an applicable regulation to the Bioreactor (S-4393). The Bioreactor is exempt from Regulation 8, Rule 8 Sections, 501, 502, and 505 because the Bioreactor is exempt from Regulation 8, Rule 8 due to 8-8-113 and 208.</p> <p><i>8-8-113: Exemption, Secondary Wastewater Treatment Processes And Stormwater Sewer Systems: The requirements of Sections 8-8-301, 302, 306, and 308 shall not apply to any secondary wastewater treatment processes or stormwater sewer systems, as defined in Sections 8-8-208 and 216, that are used as a wastewater polishing step or for collection of stormwater that is segregated from the process wastewater collection system.</i></p> <p><i>8-8-208: Secondary Treatment Processes: Any wastewater treatment process which is downstream of the air flotation unit, any other biological treatment process at a refinery, or any treatment process which is regulated by the EPA National Categorical Pretreatment Standards. These treatment processes are considered to be wastewater polishing steps and include: activated sludge tanks/basins, trickling or sand filters, aerated lagoons, oxidation ponds, rotating biological contactors, and other biological wastewater treatment processes.</i></p>	Remove references to Regulation 8, Rule 8 from Table IV G.1.7.	<p>Exemption 8-8-113 does not exempt sources from the entire rule or from sections 501, 502, and 505. The sections of the Regulation that are not exempted are still applicable.</p> <p>It looks like section 8-8-113 should be added to Table IV G.1.7. This section will be added since Chevron is asserting that it is applicable.</p>
402	permit condition 11066.7A	FCC (S-4285)	With increasing numbers of source tests required, refineries face tougher challenge getting completed test reports from contractors in time to meet existing permit submittal deadline. 60 days deadline should give adequate time to submit stack test report.	Change due date for test from existing deadline to 60 days after the source test	This request requires the submittal of an application in order to review the requested change the permit condition prior to be included within a TV permit.
406	Permit Condition 11775	S-4701, S4702, S-4703	Permit condition #11775 requires the subject sources to "cease operation by January 31, 1995." This permit condition is no longer in effect.	Remove Permit Condition 11775 from Title V Permit.	This condition will be removed from the permit.

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
420	permit condition 16679	S-4170	Chevron proposed in the 5-year Title V Renewal application to add recordkeeping in a new condition part 6c.	Add Chevron proposed permit condition part 6c to add record keeping. See p. 409 of redline of Chevron's 5-year Title V Renewal Permit application.	This source has an enforceable permit condition regarding its maximum firing rate and combined with the requirements contained in Regulation 9-10-502 and 9-10-504 shall have both adequate monitoring and recordkeeping requirements to determine compliance with the limit.
448	Section VI - Permit Conditions – #21232.7 & #21232.8	Furnaces & Boilers covered by BAAQMD Reg. 9 Rule 10 & by permit condition # 21232	Permit Condition #21232 parts 7 & 8 requirement to test at least every 8 months could be interpreted to require starting-up a source that has been shutdown for an extended period in order to obtain a periodic source test.	Modify Permit Condition #21232 Parts 7 & 8 to require a source test within no more than 8 operating months.	This request requires an application to change the permit conditions and also requires the district to change its NOx Box policy, which includes standard permit conditions. After these two changes have been made then the change can be included in a TV application.
483	Table VII A.1.1 Cogeneration	S-4350, S-4351, S-4352, and S-4353	Regulation 9, Rule 9 was amended by BAAQMD to include a revised emissions limit for NOx emissions.	Table VII A.1.1 Cogen NOx limits should be updated according to current Regulation 9, Rule 9 limits.	This section has been changed to reflect the current Regulation 9-9 limits.
517	Section VII – Applicable Limits and Compliance Monitoring Requirements Table VII.A.3.2.	Multiple Combustion Sources	Fuel flow requirements in Table VII A.3.2 - Combustion for Permit Conditions 16686 and 23872 are not clearly presented and are redundant with limits stated in the permit conditions.	Delete the list of limits and reference the permit conditions for these requirements.	I was unable to locate any errors therefore no change has been made.
571	Section VII – Applicable Limits and Compliance Monitoring Requirements Table VII.F.1.3, F.1.4, F.1.5, F.1.6, F.1.7, F.1.9, F.1.10, F.1.11, F.1.12, and VII.F.1.13	Multiple Tank Sources	Tables list Method ST-7 from the District's Manual of Procedures, Volume IV, as the monitoring type to determine compliance with Regulation 8-5-306, the control device standard for tanks.	Modify the "Monitoring Type" column to include EPA Method 21 or "modified ST-7 per District Approved sampling plan" as an option.	The language in permit is consistent with the language in the Rule regarding section 8-5-306.1 therefore, no change will be made.

District Public Draft Page #.	Permit Condition	Source(s)	Principal Facts	Permit Modification Request	BAAQMD Response
596-597	Section IV - Applicable Requirements Table IV G.1.5, and Section VII – Applicable Limits and Compliance Monitoring Requirements – Table VII.G.1.5 - Wastewater	S-0605 (Alkane GWT Feed Surge Tank) & S-0610 (Alkane GWT Surge Tank)	The Alkane Treatment System is permanently dismantled & can be removed from the permit. (Also still ilve in Table IV)	Remove S-0605 (Alkane GWT Feed Surge Tank) & S-0610 (Alkane GWT Surge Tank) from Table IV.G.1.5 and Table VII.G.1.5.	This change has been made.
Multiple	Multiple	Multiple	Section VII contains multiple tables that reference Table II A as the basis for a monitoring requirement for a limit, and Table II A then references a Permit Application number versus a permit condition that is contained in the Title V Permit.	Recommend retaining permit conditions stating the applicable limit, e.g. firing rate, even if the remainder of the permit condition has been deleted and addressed in a new permit condition. This will retain the appropriate basis for limits and requirements stated in Table II and Table VII.	This situation occurs with sources that are subject to 9-10 NOx Box conditions and its replacement conditions. For these sources the limit expressed in Table II is enforceable and Regulation 9-10-502 and 9-10-504 contain continuous monitoring and recordkeeping requirements that should be adequate to determine compliance.