

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
	<b>Air District Website</b>			
1	<p>Many stakeholders, from both NGOs and industry, hope the new Production System for permit information can enable greater transparency of the permitting process and the performance of different permitted facilities. Stakeholders hope there is an opportunity for feedback on the final system design by a multi-stakeholder group.</p> <p><b>Comment:</b> Permitted facilities and communities/public stakeholders have different roles and interests in this. The production system is about PERMITTING for regulated entities, not so much about outreach and communications. (Janet Whittick)</p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Beta test system with permit holders first, separate from any outreach policy. Refer to CARE Task Force the question: what permit information should be made public and how? Recommend to CARE goals, objectives for this work. (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>In general, hopefully the new website is user friendly and can provide more information on existing permits for the public as well as government use. Basic info such as site, permit type and status would be great. Additional details such as exact complaints may still require a phone call....(Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>Whenever a permit review cycle is determined, please alert the stakeholders sixty days prior to the release of the request. This way we can contact our constituency and let them know of the requirement in advance. Then we will be assured that our referrals are given a fair and equitable opportunity to compete. (June Wallace)</p>	Some examples: Geotracker, MATES III, CARE bubble maps (JW?)
2	Many people prefer the previous website design and architecture more than the current design. They found it easier to navigate and it had information that has not been included on the new website.	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Beta test all major website redesigns (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>This is a website not intended for a layman to navigate. (June Wallace)</p>	For example: If the district were offering air filtration systems to people in areas suffering from asthma and/or respiratory ailments a culturally diverse animated video that repeats could be placed on the site. One, it will be interactive. Two, it can capture the information of the visitor to the site. Three, it can provide documented proof of the requests from various locations throughout the bay area. (June Wallace)
3	The homepage is nearly universally criticized, primarily because people find the Live / Work / Know framing as too conceptual and not utilitarian enough, and information is hidden behind drop-down menus.	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Better terms: "Business &amp; Industry" "Public Information" "Technical" (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>Beta test all major website redesigns (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>I agree the website should be designed for a fifth grade reader to understand. The site is very intellectual and will lose my constituency because you only have 30 seconds to grab their attention before they go to another site. (June Wallace)</p> <p>Home page should have a schematic that incorporates the clean air/public health objective with the regulatory authority mechanism/limitation (i.e., stationary sources), something very basic that could have links to more detail. (Jane Martin)</p>	For example: If I want to know what the air result are for the month of September in West Oakland, Marin County versus that of Bayview Hunter's Point, how would I find this information? A search field that answer frequently asked community issue could be developed. This one stop question should take me to the site's information without having to enter more information in order to get my question answered. Most of my constituents get frustrated and leave the site feeling as if the information is hidden. (June Wallace)
4	Many people use Google Search rather than the Air District's website search tool for navigating through or using the search function on the site.	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>BAEHC – Website Protocol December 2008</p> <p>I agree. The district needs to make the site more users friendly. (June Wallace)</p>	<p>South Coast Example Public Records (FIND) (Facility Information detail): 2006 web tool to search for public info re: regulated facilities; includes emissions and enforcement data <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/webappl/fim/default.htm">http://www.aqmd.gov/webappl/fim/default.htm</a></p> <p>For example: When I go to the website to report a smell, there are too many layers of information required in order to make the report. How do I navigate the website to do what I came to do which is report a bad smell? (June Wallace)</p>
5	The content on the website is not seen as reader-friendly and accessible, particularly for the lay public and businesses. Stakeholders want the website designed from ease of use from the public's perspective.	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>BAEHC – Website Protocol December 2008</p> <p>The information should be up-to-date:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Emissions data for TACs and criteria pollutants</li> <li>2. Health risk evaluation documents for recent permitting activities</li> <li>3. Enforcement data, including complaints, episodes, Notices of Violation, and Notices to Comply</li> </ol>	<p>South Coast Example</p> <p>Public Inquiry for Information about NOVs &amp; Notices to Comply: <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/nov/">http://www.aqmd.gov/nov/</a></p> <p>Search NOVs (posted after violation is validated by legal dep't, 30-60 days; search 1 yr pd max.): <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/nov/nov.aspx?notice_type=NOV">http://www.aqmd.gov/nov/nov.aspx?notice_type=NOV</a></p>

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
	<p>Comment: Who is "public" in this case? (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>The site is too wordy. The CARE program page is too long and we have to scroll down a lot (Ken Kloc/Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>Even if documents were translated into Spanish, Cantonese, Mandarin, Amharic or Tigrinya, the words used to translate the documents would often be technical jargon understandable by those with at least a high school level vocabulary. What about people at the literacy level or elementary level? (Rosina Roibal)</p>		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. Links to information on pending applications.</li> <li>5. General Information regarding how to sign up for public notice distribution lists*</li> <li>6. Information regarding significance thresholds</li> <li>7. Information regarding how to find out more information for each District activity</li> <li>8. Information regarding the District's public notice for procedures and protocols</li> </ol> <p>I agree. What happens to the lay community (senior citizens, deaf, blind people) without internet access that does not have web access? Is there an (800) number available that will have options to explain how they can access the district and file a report? (June Wallace)</p> <p>District can have an A-Z index page to find things. (Rosina Roibal?)</p> <p>News should be on the first page (instead of drilling down) (Rosina Roibal?)</p> <p>Should make google earth easier to find and add emissions information. Should have links to new pages instead (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>Whenever possible, pictures and simple sentences using short words need to be used in written documents(Rosina Roibal).</p>	<p>Search NTCs (posted after 30 days of notice issuance; search 1 yr pd max.): <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/nov/nov.aspx?notice_type=NC">http://www.aqmd.gov/nov/nov.aspx?notice_type=NC</a></p> <p>Toxics Emissions Reporting (AB2588): <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/aer/DataInquiry.html">http://www.aqmd.gov/aer/DataInquiry.html</a></p> <p>Facility Risks for all AQMD HRAs: <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/prdas/ab2588/pdf/AB2588_HRA_Risk.pdf">http://www.aqmd.gov/prdas/ab2588/pdf/AB2588_HRA_Risk.pdf</a></p> <p>Thresholds of significance trigger &amp; public notice: <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/prdas/ab2588/AB2588">http://www.aqmd.gov/prdas/ab2588/AB2588</a></p> <p>For example: If I report a bad smell, how do I know that the report has been received and an action is being taken? (June Wallace)</p>
6	<p>Many people would like significant improvements in the website's permit section. They would like to see current and more complete information about permitted facilities and permit applications. Specifically, stakeholders want a categorized, searchable, map-based database of permitted facility information. They also want information on notification sign-ups and opportunities for public comment.</p> <p>Comment1: I'm uncomfortable with the general use of "stakeholders" throughout this document. It fails to consider the very different needs of different types of stakeholders. (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>Comment2: I agree with this assessment. Until every person in the bay area understands that they have rights that can be protected or violated by this agency, we will not get the community buy in and involvement that is needed. A general marketing campaign can be designed similar to those used by the utility districts. (JW?)</p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Same as #1. CARE should look at what info is most useful, discuss how it can best be conveyed, and work to implement. Public Engagement TF, which is short in duration, should tee this work up for a more in-depth investigation and implementation by CARE TF. (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>BAEHC – Website Protocol December 2008</p> <p><b>Permit Applications.</b> The following information should be available (and updated weekly):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Date of application</li> <li>2. Name and address of applicant</li> <li>3. Description of permit applied for (proposed project, equipment, BACT/T-BACT, other relevant information)</li> <li>4. Proposed emissions data with any health risk evaluation documents</li> <li>5. Status of application</li> <li>6. Timeline including when application was submitted, received, noticed for public comment, proposed for issuance</li> <li>7. List of opportunities for public comment; Link to public notices</li> <li>8. Any public comments received and responses to comments</li> <li>9. Links to permitted facility database for existing facilities</li> <li>10. Request for public hearing form (especially Title V facilities)</li> <li>11. Contact information for responsible staff</li> <li>12. Projects will remain on the list until the final permit action is taken and the appeal period is over.</li> </ol> <p><b>Permitted Sources/Facilities.</b> The following information should be available (and updated weekly) for each permitted facility:</p>	<p>BAEHC – Website Protocol December 2008 – South Coast Example</p> <p><b>Permit Applications/Permits</b> (updated at least 1/wk): <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/wats/index.html">http://www.aqmd.gov/wats/index.html</a></p> <p><b>Search applications by facility:</b> <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/webappl/fim/prog/search.aspx">http://www.aqmd.gov/webappl/fim/prog/search.aspx</a></p> <p><b>Search applications by facility MAP:</b> <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/webappl/pubinfo/mapviewer.aspx">http://www.aqmd.gov/webappl/pubinfo/mapviewer.aspx</a></p> <p><b>Permitting Public Notices Search</b> (6 mo. default): <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/webappl/PublicNotices/Search.aspx">http://www.aqmd.gov/webappl/PublicNotices/Search.aspx</a></p> <p><b>Permitting Public Notices Title V:</b> <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/titlev/notices.html">http://www.aqmd.gov/titlev/notices.html</a></p> <p><b>Title V Search over 500 facilities:</b> <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/titlev/finalperm.html">http://www.aqmd.gov/titlev/finalperm.html</a></p> <p><b>Request for Public Hearing (Form):</b> <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/permit/Formspdf/TitleV/AQMDForm500-G.pdf">http://www.aqmd.gov/permit/Formspdf/TitleV/AQMDForm500-G.pdf</a></p> <p>For example: It is important that the district increase their outreach visibility in communities of color. I suggest that hiring a minority outreach person to develop relationship in churches of all faiths and ethnicities would enable the district to effectively reach previously untouched constituents. Once the relationships are intact the outreach person can use their relationship to submit information utilizing the networks of the churches to dispense information. (June Wallace)</p>

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
			<p>13. <u>Categorized and searchable</u> by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Street address</li> <li>b. City, zip code</li> <li>c. Name of facility</li> <li>d. Map/location</li> <li>e. Type of facility</li> <li>f. Contact information for responsible staff</li> <li>g. Keyword</li> <li>h. Dates of recent permit issuance (within 1 yr)</li> </ul> <p>14. Easily accessible from the BAAQMD home page and easily navigable</p> <p>*The website will have an easy-to-understand guide on how to sign up for email lists on permit activities. A message will be sent to confirm the registration.</p> <p>The community is always concerned about the air they breathe due to the enormous increase in asthma and respiratory illness in communities of color. (June Wallace)</p>	
7	<p>Stakeholders want to be able to track, via the website, public comments (e.g. for rules and permits), complaints (e.g. for smell, health impacts, etc.), and enforcement actions. The calendar needs additional information on when committee meetings are going to be held, when meetings are scheduled in the more distant future (e.g. 3-4 months ahead, if possible), and when meetings are cancelled.</p> <p>Comment1: Please # each row</p> <p>Comment2: These seem like separate findings. Please split.</p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Same as #1 and #6. (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>It may be helpful to have a public hearings page that identifies meetings...although this may only need to be a link to the Boards agendas page where the customer can look themselves...(Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>Community laymen need to be reached sixty days in advance utilizing the conduit of the churches.120 days in advance is too far out. The community liaison that is hired will make sure that these key communities are kept in the loop. When you demonstrate to communities of color that you are committed to including them, by hiring someone that will represent them, a better response will be the end result. (June Wallace)</p>	For example: It is a common fact that over 100 languages are spoken in the bay area. Kaiser Permanente has developed Spanish and Chinese speaking clinics. The district needs to do create information in these languages. By doing so, it will demonstrate the district's willingness to create access for all and builds trust. (June Wallace)
8	<p>The website copy and documents have limited availability in non-English languages</p> <p>The website needs to be accessible to LEP populations The Spanish portal is up, but lacks necessities. (Rosina Roibal)</p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>BAEHC – Website Protocol December 2008</p> <p>Language Access: BAAQMD will adopt the website recommendation in the BAEHC language access document:</p> <p>Translate basic info and have referral contact info on website for a given language if 5% or 10,000 (according to most recent census data) people make up the regional demographic, i.e. “For more information, contact ____”. (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>Also, provide Spanish and Chinese translations of key web pages, plus any other language for a given language if 5% or 10,000 (according to most recent census data) people make up the regional demographic. (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>The District website spanish portal needs to tell people how to request translations services for meetings &amp; documents and to list upcoming meetings/workshops. (Rosina Roibal)</p>	<p>BAEHC – Website Protocol December 2008 – South Coast Example</p> <p>Translation (web): Various documents available in Spanish, Chinese and Korean; see, e.g., Spanish: <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/spanish/interfaceLangSpanishTrans.html">http://www.aqmd.gov/spanish/interfaceLangSpanishTrans.html</a> (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>See websites: <a href="http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/ppgSpanish2005.pdf">http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/ppgSpanish2005.pdf</a> and <a href="http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/ch.hrm">http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/ch.hrm</a> City of Oakland Provides information advising LEP of free language assistance through availability of bilingual staff and translated materials See websites: <a href="http://www.oaklandnet.com/government/Equalaccess/English/Flyer.pdf">http://www.oaklandnet.com/government/Equalaccess/English/Flyer.pdf</a> and <a href="http://www.oaklandnet.com/government/Equalaccess/English">http://www.oaklandnet.com/government/Equalaccess/English</a> City of San Francisco</p>

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
			I agree. (June Wallace)	
9	Air quality data (example <a href="http://gate1.baaqmd.gov/aqmet/AQMonthly.aspx">http://gate1.baaqmd.gov/aqmet/AQMonthly.aspx</a> ) does not include explanation of the numbers in the charts so public cannot interpret or understand the relationship to health impacts. (Jenny Bard)	JB	Provide health exposure risk information/context for daily/monthly and annual data. (Jenny Bard)	<a href="http://www.stateoftheair.org/2011/assets/SOTA2011.pdf">http://www.stateoftheair.org/2011/assets/SOTA2011.pdf</a> <a href="http://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/cfm/recordisplay.cfm?deid=216546">http://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/cfm/recordisplay.cfm?deid=216546</a> (JB?)
11	The website doesn't provide the permitting documents/history of each facility (Rosina Roibal)	Lucas Williams at GGU Environmental Law and Justice Clinic (Rosina Roibal)	My main suggestion to improve the District's website is for it to provide the permitting documents/history of each facility like CEC's site (Rosina Roibal).	
12	The community page needs improvement (Ken Kloc/RR)	Ken Kloc, researcher and scientist at GGU Environmental Law and Justice Clinic (Rosina Roibal)	The calendar should be up on top. What is "Participate" vs "Public Comment" vs. "Community actions"? (Rosina Roibal)	ARB, EPA (RR?)
	<b>Engagement (Public Meetings, Workshops, hearings, Open Houses/Briefings)</b>  Comment: I added "hearings" to this category			
16	The meetings/workshops/briefings are not held early and often enough in the process to educate area residents about an issue before residents have already organized into positions. The meetings/workshops/ briefings are more often held reactively than proactively, and take place after Air District staff has introduced a rule, rather than before beginning development of the rule.  Comment: Might want to distinguish between sector- or source-based rulemaking, facility-specific actions, and planning and policies since these are different processes. Unsure which is the focus here. (Janet Whittick)	Assessment Key Findings document	TF should use rule development principles as a starting point in its evaluation, identifying gaps and recommending solutions. This model could also be adapted for policy and planning decisions. Do not reinvent the wheel. (Janet Whittick)  The intent of this document will encourage early notification and public engagement as well as a consistent approach for outreach for the district to use. (Gillian Hayes)  I agree. (June Wallace)	<a href="http://www.baaqmd.gov/Divisions/Planning-and-Research/Rule-Development.aspx">http://www.baaqmd.gov/Divisions/Planning-and-Research/Rule-Development.aspx</a> (JW?)  Public hearing notices online, board agenda web subscriptions for email notification of upcoming meetings (Gillian Hayes)  For example: Lack of dissemination of information/understanding appears as a lack of interest by our community. This is not the case, the communities lack of response to your system should not be used as an indication of our approval of the district's action. When we are told and not given the opportunity to participate that is when the walls of trust are broken (June Wallace)
17	Divisions of the Air District are inconsistent in their approach to participant notification, recruitment, and engagement.	Assessment Key Findings document	<i>Publicity:</i> should be ambitious and coordinated in collaboration with community organizations to ensure successful participation (Rosina Roibal).  <i>Materials:</i> hard copies of the draft rule and easily understandable versions should be available at workshops (Rosina Roibal).  I agree. (June Wallace)	For example: It would be great to see this information distributed wider in the grassroots community, i.e. Flyers placed in laundry mats, beauty and barber shops, health clinics, flea markets, on bus benches, in buses as well as on billboards, in schools etc. This would be accomplished much easier if the district hired individuals that know the specific communities. Individuals that are known in the community for their work on behalf of their constituents. This is true for all ethnic communities through out the Bay Area. (June Wallace)

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
18	Many public meetings could be more effective with better planning, trained facilitators and established ground rules.	Assessment Key Findings document	This is true but must be accomplished by individuals in the community with established relationships. They will host meetings to explain the rules, based on Roberts Rules of Order. I can not emphasize enough the importance of hiring outreach consultants who work in these communities. Until this is done and trust is built in the communities they will continue to come to meetings with the intent to be disruptive. (June Wallace)	For example: If consultants were hired in areas such as Chinatown, Japan town, Bayview Hunter's Point, West Oakland, Marin City and hired to train the community simultaneously, word of mouth would spread the "good news," that the district has heard them. Then these consultants can bring in the major stakeholders and explain the goal of communicating our needs to the district. Once, these leaders approve, they will allow the consultants to train their constituents. In each church or business or non-profit there is a gatekeeper. Until that individual is convinced of the integrity of the district's intention, no change will occur in any outreach effort. (June Wallace)
19	The number of meetings/workshops/briefings held is not proportional to the number of facilities that will be affected by a particular rule.  Comment: Not sure this is a good yardstick to measure mtg. frequency by. For example, a simple rule that affects a large population, like a fee increase, may not take a lot. A complex rule that affects a small number of facilities could take a long time to work out the details. (Janet Whittick)	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)	For example: Until the gatekeepers and stakeholders come together and build a collaboration to accept and promote the work of the district, there will be no acceptance of any efforts of the district. Meaning when this collaboration is established, the community will embrace the efforts of the district and trust the process. (June Wallace)
20	Members of the public would prefer the opportunity for two-way dialog rather than just listening to information, particularly about controversial issues.	Assessment Key Findings document	Ensure the public is heard in several venues. (Gillian Hayes)  I agree. (June Wallace)	Ability to submit web comments, paper, email and verbal call in comments as well & receive answers/feedback on them. (Gillian Hayes)  For example: Community of color is vocal and opinionated. Most information is passed via word of mouth, even though we live in the technologically advanced society. When our leaders accept this process, they will explain to their constituents how to hear and understand the districts work. All they know is how hard it was to get heard with the asbestos in Bayview. This opinion needs to change. Hiring minority consultants will help change this impression. (June Wallace)
21	Stakeholders want to see evidence that their comments are recorded and given serious consideration, and they want to know what results from their comments.	Assessment Key Findings document	Same as #9 - use existing guidelines as a starting point. (Janet Whittick)  I agree. (June Wallace)	For example: Place the results on the website in a user friendly manner. Make this a district process that the information will be posted within 72 hours of the meeting. By doing this on a routine basis (building trust) the district's intention will become accepted. (June Wallace)
22	The Air District could play a convening role for the region by bringing together fractious parties to address air quality issues in a more collaborative spirit. This could include a health summit of all air and GHG-related organizations as well as industry and local governments in the Bay Area.	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)	For example: Bay Area Black United Fund convened the African American Health Summit with the participation of over sixty non-profit community stakeholders. Given their work in nine counties, they would be able to pull together a Steering Committee of these groups to plan and implement this most needed summit. (June Wallace)
23	The Air District has not yet established a process for identifying the relevant stakeholders for an upcoming decision.	Assessment Key Findings document	Affected businesses and communities should be part of rule development from the earliest stage possible. (Janet Whittick)  City council members whose constituents live in impacted areas (near pollution sources or freeways) can help outreach to key stakeholders and should be part of notification list (Jenny Bard)  I agree. The district needs to develop a relationship with BABUF, who could bring together major stakeholders to help establish this process. The district should do the same in the Hispanic and Asian Community. All should release a report. Then those reports should be collated to form the work plan which will determine how the agency will work with the community on upcoming issues. (June Wallace)	For example: BABUF could bring together the health departments, non-profits, NAACP, Black Chambers of Commerce, Black Newspapers and Bay Area of Black Journalist Association, Minister Associations, and key stakeholders throughout the bay area to meet in a two or three day conference with facilitators to capture all information, which will be captured. Then a follow up meeting will occur after all have received the report. The group will be reconvened to develop a document which should be the mandate to establish processes to work in the community. (June Wallace)

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
24	Stakeholders want to know what actions are taken, or not taken, as a result of their input at meetings/workshops/briefings (and why)	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. Post the information on the website in a timely manner. (June Wallace)	<p>Email subscription to agendas would notify interested party of upcoming meetings (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>For example: If the district hired someone to capture the data, via film, review it and produce an event narrative. That concise report can be posted on the website. This will be viewed as an effort to maintain community and continue to build trust within the community when they hear from the district. (June Wallace)</p>
25	District outreach to CARE communities is VERY limited and weak. The District does not have outreach plans for each CARE community. (Rosina Roibal)		<p>BAEHC – Public Participation Protocol March 2009) (See also Timing of Engagement Section)</p> <p>Outreach Implementation Plan BAAQMD shall develop and implement an effective public outreach plan for each identified area to effectively determine the community's priorities and needs regarding public notice, outreach, and opportunities for participation.</p> <p>A. Public Workshops. BAAQMD shall conduct a series of workshops in each target area, planned and coordinated in partnership with community organizations and interested residents. Through these workshops, BAAQMD shall determine the most appropriate form of outreach in each area, and shall identify additional outreach measures as appropriate. The objective is to gather information for BAAQMD to conduct efficient public outreach to prepare community residents for effective participation in BAAQMD proceedings.</p> <p>B. Notification List. BAAQMD shall develop a notification list for each target area, including, but not limited to, public libraries, neighborhood and community centers, and local media, in addition to entities automatically added to the list and residents added by request (see Section 3.C and 4.B below).</p> <p>C. Information Repositories. BAAQMD shall determine, in consultation with community residents, the best locations for repositories of public information including public notices and related permit documents.</p> <p>D. Public Record. BAAQMD shall keep a public record of its outreach activities, including comments raised at public meetings and workshops. (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>City council members whose constituents live in impacted areas (near pollution sources or freeways) can help outreach to impacted residents and should be part of notification list (Jenny Bard)</p>	

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
26	Many residents cannot get to workshops or meetings. Workshops and meetings aren't accessible to working people. (Rosina Roibal)		<p><i>Video recordings</i> of workshops should occur and made available to the public, through email lists and the website (Rosina Roibal). Meetings and workshops should be scheduled in the most highly impacted communities after working hours. Meetings should be webcast. Written comments and phone messages before the meeting/workshop should be an option. Live videoconferencing for meetings (board meetings and public hearings) can allow people to participate without traveling to meeting, and thus save time and greenhouse gases from driving. (Air district has 3 such centers, and could expand to more locations) (Rosina Roibal)</p>	
27	The District has a history of not holding public hearings for proposed regulatory actions in or affecting highly impacted areas. (Rosina Roibal)		<p>BAEHC – Public Participation Protocol March 2009 Public Hearings</p> <p>A. Highly Impacted Areas. BAAQMD shall hold a public hearing for all proposed regulatory actions in or affecting highly impacted areas.</p> <p>B. Medium Hazard and Low Hazard Areas. In medium and low hazard areas where a public hearing is not already planned, BAAQMD shall hold a public hearing upon request or when concern is raised by any of the following parties, even if the site is not in a CARE priority community or other high hazard area:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Residents. A group of five residents</li> <li>ii. Organization or Association</li> <li>iii. Individual Member of the Public. A member of the public raises a legitimate concern during the public comment period.</li> </ul> <p>C. (moved to page 6 – section) Accessibility of Public Hearings and Informational Meetings. Public hearings and public informational meetings shall be held in the affected area and at a convenient time and place in order to maximize community attendance and the public's ability to participate. The desired times and locations shall be determined through the public workshops in the outreach implementation plan.</p> <p>D. Demolition, Remediation, Clean-up Activities. Where demolition, remediation, or clean-up activities are planned and subject to BAAQMD jurisdiction, BAAQMD shall hold a public hearing in the affected area after conducting outreach through the means identified in the outreach implementation plan (see Section 5). Residents shall be informed about proposed activities including BAAQMD oversight and enforcement, and shall be given an opportunity to provide input. (Rosina Roibal)</p>	

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
	<b>Task Forces &amp; the Advisory Council</b>			
28	A primary complaint from stakeholders about Task Forces organized for a particular decision is that Task Forces are not organized early enough in the process, usually after the rule or policy is already out.	Assessment Key Findings document	This is an ongoing complaint. The district should be proactive in forming these task forces and councils longingly. (June Wallace)	<p>When the issue is identified, outline process (ie task force) assigned to deal with issue. (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>For example: The district should meet quarterly with the gatekeepers who represent these communities. By doing so, the district will continue to build trust, visibility and assure the community that the district is concerned about their concerns. (June Wallace)</p>
29	<p>Several stakeholders who have been involved in the Cumulative Impact Workgroup and/or the Community Air Risk Evaluation Program (CARE) Task Force (these two groups recently merged) complained about the ineffectiveness of this group due to poor meeting planning and facilitation, disruptive behaviors, lack of follow-up, and lack of progress from meeting to meeting.</p> <p>Comment: As a CARE TF member, I do not wholly agree with this statement. (Janet Whittick)</p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Report this finding to CARE TF for action by that group. (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>Agendas should be created in collaboration with members of the task force. Notes should be distributed to members of the task force and public. Next steps and follow up need to happen. The agenda should be sent out much further in advance. Meetings should be scheduled around members' schedules. (??)</p> <p>Utilize professional mediators for meetings whether on staff of consultant hired for large issues. Clearly this is a recurring theme that people are not feeling heard. (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>This is true. If the district were consistent in their meetings and reported the results to the community in a timely manner through a vehicle they trusted the community would feel more supported and less likely to be disruptive at meetings. No one likes to be dictated to. Involve them at the beginning, not after decisions are made. (June Wallace)</p> <p>1) Look for ways to document discussion key points and publish or send out session report that includes recommendations and/or next steps (for CARE Taskforce). This would be a step toward accountability. 2) Implement a structure in CARE Taskforce meetings that limits each person's comments to 1-2 minutes. (Jane Martin)</p>	<p>Utilize professionals which will in turn run the meetings with: interest based problem solving, guidelines like speaking time limits to discourage disruptive behaviors, keep the group on task, follow up, etc. (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>For example: The community would have been ecstatic to understand the districts report on air emission in and around Bayview Hunter's Point or West Oakland. Both communities are circled by major highways and freeways, which means that these communities are saturated with fumes from diesel trucks and cars that travel at a high rate daily. If they understood the impact on their community was an increase in asthma and respiratory disease, perhaps, they would have asked the district to demonstrate how they could help them. That could have begun a campaign to encourage use of air filters in baby's room, in bedrooms or living rooms. Maybe the district could have donated some air filters to the health clinics or churches for distribution to their community. (June Wallace)</p>
	<b>Resource Team and Grant Making</b>			
30	Many clean air advocates are not familiar with the Spare the Air Resource Teams. Some very active clean air advocates have never been invited to join a local Spare the Air Resource Team.	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Advertise and outreach the program (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>I agree. (June Wallace)</p>	<p>Web, newspaper, radio, fairs, schools, etc to educate the public (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>For example: If the community knew of them, they would encourage them to attend. Information can only be shared once it is made available. (June Wallace)</p>
31	Stakeholders that have applied for grants have often been confused as to the grant-making process, causing grantees to have to seek, rather than to receive, new information.	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Target trade and business journals and other non-traditional media outlets to disseminate grant info; survey target populations to ID best media outreach (Janet Whittick)</p> <p>Go to communities with tech assistant or workshops. Some communities want face to face communication (Charlene Henderson)</p> <p>I agree. (June Wallace)</p>	<p>For example: If the RFP's were written at a fifth grade level, applicants could apply to do more effective work for the district. They could also better achieve the outcomes expected by the district. (June Wallace)</p>



	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
	<b>Public Education</b>			
32	Some stakeholders believe that insufficient resources are put into educating the public on emerging regulations, for example, wood smoke or diesel regulations, affecting day-to-day activities.	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)	For example: The district should develop materials that are easy to understand. Posters could be designed in three languages, English, Spanish and Chinese. When people understand that burning wood in their fireplace emits toxins in their already air stressed community, they will understand why they should purchase the safe burning logs at the grocery store or buy a gas burning grill to bar-b-que on. (June Wallace)
33	Some stakeholders have a sophisticated understanding of the science, modeling, and policies behind Air District decision-making, but others do not. This limits their ability to meaningfully participate. The Air District sometimes makes contradictory statements, sometimes even in print, which makes it difficult for supporters to mobilize regarding decisions.  Comment: Supporters of what? (Janet Whittick)	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)  Make available to the public a simple step by step guide that explains the components of a Health Risk Assessment and in simple language explains what the results mean, perhaps even including some background commentary on what the shortcomings are of these standard measures (what the skeptics would say or document). (Jane Martin)	For example: On spare the air day, we are encouraged to commute, use public transportation, etc. The community that we represent has to be hand held in regard to public transportation. Many are proud to own a car and feel it is their right to drive it. If they understood that if 1 in 4 of their neighbors stop driving to work two days a week, the impact it would have on their air, then they would feel better taking the bus, because they are doing something good for their community. Their perceptions must be changed, ie, like buying at Toyota Prius so that they fill up twice a month instead of twice a week. (June Wallace)
34	The Air District does not sufficiently inform the public of its various activities that directly benefit the public's interests, such as cleaning up dry cleaners and gas stations.  Comment: Suggest expanding this to cover AQ generally, since not all improvements result from direct District action. Could distinguish among different agencies and programs, if this level of info is useful to people. (Janet Whittick)	Assessment Key Findings document	Show not just current emissions and exposure data, but also trends over time. Make it easy to see what progress has been made, and where more effort needs to be given. Refer for further development to CARE TF. (Janet Whittick)  I agree. Again, toot the district's horn, by revising the website and demonstrating these successes via posters, animated cartoons, advertising on bus benched, etc. (June Wallace)	A list of permits and status available to the public online as discussed above could help with this. (Gillian Hayes)
35	The District still doesn't publicize their existence as a regulatory agency well.	Janice Schroeder email	ads on TV, popular radio stations, local papers, etc (Rosina Roibal)	
	<b>Hearing Board</b>			
36	The Hearing Board only meets in San Francisco, which inhibits broad attendance. Hearing Board members have found they are less productive when meetings are held in the field as the meetings are often attended by advocates almost exclusively supporting one position rather than a broader representation of interests.	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)	Encourage email, phone calls and written communication for those who cannot attend in person. (Gillian Hayes)  For example: If the district hired outreach consultants and created a collaboration to educate the communities outside of San Francisco, these meetings would be productive because the community stakeholders would ensure that they are represented at the meetings. Therefore the lobbyist and corporate representatives would not have such an impact because the community would be there to represent their own interest. (June Wallace)
37	It has sometimes taken several years of complaints by stakeholders to get the Hearing Board to consider a case against a permittee.	Assessment Key Findings document	Make complaint process transparent. (Gillian Hayes)  I recognize that the district has truly made an effort. The district is making strides in their effort, but much more is needed. (June Wallace)	How to web page (Gillian Hayes)  For example: The community shows up and shows out at these meetings to protest their exclusion from the decision making process. If they were included, (this would be the work of the outreach coordinator) there would be no need to protest their exclusion, because they would know that they are part of the decision making process. (June Wallace)

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
38	Little public notice seems to be provided of Hearing Board actions.	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree, because if the community feels excluded they react negatively or not at all. Silence does not indicate agreement with the efforts of the district. (June Wallace)	Email subscriptions of board agendas again would help here (Gillian Hayes)  For example: Notifying a group four months in advance is not the solution. Anything can happen in four months. With the help of the outreach coordinator, sixty days is enough notice for the community to attend a meeting. BUT, the community does not have a coordinator, so this issue continues to face the district.
	<b>Public Comment</b>			
39	Many stakeholders feel that by the time a draft rule is released for public comment, staff has already made many of the key strategic decisions. This often makes public input seem like a formality which has little impact on the outcome of a rule.	Assessment Key Findings document	When appropriate, work with diverse stakeholders on problem identification before advancing proposed solutions (Janet Whittick)  <i>Response to public comment.</i> BAAQMD should respond in writing to all public comments (made both during the comment period and at workshops) with explanations of whether comments are being incorporated and if not, the reason. The response should be posted on the website in a timely manner (Rosina Roibal).  I agree. (June Wallace)	<a href="http://www.baaqmd.gov/Divisions/Planning-and-Research/Rule-Development.aspx">http://www.baaqmd.gov/Divisions/Planning-and-Research/Rule-Development.aspx</a>  For example: If there is no outreach effort to our community leaders, we are just being informed of the decision, which only upset the community and begins the cycle of distrust. (June Wallace)
40	Several stakeholders think because environmental justice-focused organizations lobby the Air District intensively, this may result in rushed decisions that do not include the involvement or interests of other affected -stakeholders and communities.	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)	For example: Since the lobbyist are there and focus on their issues, because they understand the process of the district. If we don't know that we don't know, how can we be proactive? The district needs to create a collaboration by hosting the summit and the community collaborative forum. (June Wallace)
41	<a href="#">Public comment opportunities are limited</a>		BAEHC – Public Participation Protocol March 2009 Public Comment  A. Comment Periods. To fulfill public comment requirements, BAAQMD shall, in addition to fulfilling existing legal requirements regarding public notification and comment (e.g., per BAAQMD Reg. 2-1-412 2-6-412, and under CEQA), provide a public comment period for any proposed permit or regulatory action, as follows: i. Highly Impacted Areas. In highly impacted areas, BAAQMD shall provide a mandatory public comment period of at least 30 days for all proposed permit actions, consistent with the BAEHC Pollution Reduction Protocol (March 2009). ii. Medium and Low Hazard Areas. In “medium” and “low” hazard areas, BAAQMD shall provide a public comment period of at least 30 days for all upcoming permit actions, if requested by a member of the public.  B. (Moved to pg. 13 – section3) Response. Before a final decision is made, BAAQMD shall respond in writing to all public comments made during the public comment period or at public meetings on proposed proceedings. All comments and responses to comments shall be posted on the BAAQMD website in a timely manner.  C. Public Record. BAAQMD shall keep a public record of all comments raised during permit proceedings, and BAAQMD responses. (Rosina Roibal)	

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
42	Many stakeholders do not find the Air District policy and process for complaints about permitted facilities to be responsive, primarily because the Air District does not provide feedback on what happens as a result of a complaint.	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)	See web page idea above. Make it clear and easy to understand how the complaint process works (Gillian Hayes)  For example: If the information is available via website, how would I find it and why would I feel the need to look for it? (June Wallace)
43	When members of the public directly email Air District staff there is not an established policy for response turnaround time.	Assessment Key Findings document	TF with AD establishes appropriate turnaround time. When someone emails, respond with email that outlines time for response, i.e. urgent, immed. Demystify why it takes so long it that is an issue. (Charlene Henderson)  I agree. (June Wallace) 72 hours is enough time or acknowledge the receipt of the email and inform me when I will get a response.	Many agencies struggle with this. What is the districts protocol? With reduced staff our goal is to respond within 48 hrs in my jurisdiction. Clearly outline the policy so the expectation matches. (Gillian Hayes)  For example: If I don't have internet or am challenged due to hearing, site, etc. how can I communicate with the district staff? (June Wallace)
44	Some Air District staff members take ownership of comments on a draft decision and run them through the appropriate channels to return to the relevant stakeholder with a response. Others do not and the comments seem to fall on deaf ears.	Assessment Key Findings document	A formal procedure needs to be written out for the comment process (Rosina Roibal)  I agree. The district needs to create a policy for response and all staff must be mandated to respond in a timely manner. (June Wallace)	AN open comment process should take into account all types of comments. Decisions made should look at all information equally. If comments were identified, outlined and considered in the file, staff report or other it may prevent feelings of not being heard. (Gillian Hayes)
<b>Communications</b>				
45	Educating the public about engagement: The Air District does not adequately educate the public about how it makes decisions and how the public can be involved.	Assessment Key Findings document	Seek out sources like community papers to submit literacy level appropriate information (Charlene Henderson)  Be deliberate in framing issues so that one gets results and not disunity. (Charlene Henderson)  I agree. (June Wallace)	<a href="http://www.publicagenda.org">Center for Advancement on Public Engagement www.publicagenda.org</a> <a href="#">Reframing Framing: Will Friedman, Ph. D</a>  Clear email and phone communication can alleviate these feelings. If the expectation is to receive a call or email back within a week, communicate that so expectations are realistic. (Gillian Hayes)  <a href="#">Hire outreach consultants that reflect the community that they are serving. (June Wallace)</a>
46	Providing information in a way the public can understand: Information about facilities subject to Air District regulations is neither easy-to-find nor easy-to-understand.	Assessment Key Findings document	Refer to CARE TF for further development. (Janet Whittick)  I agree. (June Wallace)	This is the twenty first century and yet we still have problems communicating. Even with technology, perhaps I don't have internet, I do have a cell phone. The district should invest in sending text messages far and wide. This would impact many communities because cell phones are taking the place of land lines. Metro PCs made it possible for everyone, regardless of income to have a cell phone. Establish focus groups to test their constituencies. You will be surprised at the results. (June Wallace)
47	Stakeholder identification and email database management. The Air District collects names and contact information in disparate ways and misses opportunities to notify and follow-up with interested stakeholders.	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)	This is a missed opportunity, send out surveys (Limit the questions to 3 or less), the response will amaze you. (June Wallace)
48	Telephone access. The Air District's phone system is highly de-centralized and does not have a clear, consistent, multi-lingual access point for people who call. This creates frustration and limits access.	Assessment Key Findings document	I agree. (June Wallace)	Hire a private firm to handle this piece. A phone service can be contracted to handle the huge volumes of calls. The service will be contracted to have multi-lingual (Statin line-fax employee the questions or calls they miss) operators trained to answer and refer callers to services or information that they need. Then the public will feel like someone hears them (again building community trust.(June Wallace)

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
	<b>Other Items for Consideration</b>			
49	<b>Language Complexity and Context:</b> Content for the website and public meetings is written in technical or complex language and lacks sufficient context.	Assessment Key Findings document	<p><a href="#">Consult with New American Media or other org to improve multi-lingual capacity (Janet Whittick)</a></p> <p>I agree. The public needs access to vital information reduced to a narrative summary that makes it possible for the lay public to understand. This does not mean the entire report should not be included or made available, Just remember, that the district has a responsibility to educate the public, therefore it is necessary for the public to understand the districts effort. (June Wallace)</p>	<p><a href="#">Glossary of terms on the website? (Gillian Hayes)</a></p> <p>Write narrative summaries in three languages, English, Spanish and Chinese. (June Wallace)</p>
50	<p><b>Timing of Engagement:</b> Stakeholders often feel by the time they are engaged in a decision-making process, for example in rule development or permitting, the Air District has already made a decision, and that stakeholder input often has little-to-no impact on the outcome.</p> <p><a href="#">Comment: Seems duplicative and should be grouped with similar comments</a></p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p><a href="#">Comment: Then it really isn't a decision making process as much as a report. Suggestion: Be transparent about how decisions are made so that stakeholders have a clear model of the process (Charlene Henderson)</a></p> <p>BAEHC – Public Participation Protocol March 2009</p> <p>Public Notice</p> <p>A. Highly Impacted Areas. For all proposed permit and regulatory actions in highly impacted areas, BAAQMD shall provide adequate notice of availability of public documents and access to public proceedings for all proposed regulatory actions, including permit applications, public comment periods, public meetings and public hearings. All relevant documents shall be made available in a timely manner by the means identified through the outreach implementation workshops (see Section 5), and on the BAAQMD website.</p> <p>B. Adequate Notice. To fulfill adequate public notice requirements, BAAQMD shall, in addition to fulfilling existing legal requirements regarding public notification (e.g., per BAAQMD Reg. 2-1-412 2-6-412, and under CEQA), provide public notice of any proposed permit or regulatory action:</p> <p>i. Within a Geographic Boundary. Notice shall be provided to all residents, property owners, organizations and businesses within 3,000 feet of a site at which regulatory action is proposed.</p> <p>ii. In Accessible Language. Notice language and permit documents shall be readily accessible in easily understandable language, in addition to the recommendations in the BAEHC Limited Proficiency Proposals (September 2008). (See also Language Complexity section)</p> <p>iii. By Request. Any member of the public can request to be on a “public notification list” to receive public notices, in a method of her or his choosing, for all BAAQMD permit applications and proposed regulatory actions for any facility or facilities in a geographic region (e.g., by zip code, city, county, or district-wide) or the region as a whole.</p> <p>iv. Automatically to Certain Entities. When the public notice requirement is triggered, in addition to entities required by law and identified by request, BAAQMD shall automatically provide adequate notice to environmental health and justice organizations and neighborhood associations identified through the outreach implementation plan. (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p><a href="#">I agree. (June Wallace)</a></p>	<p><a href="#">Sixty days advance notice is sufficient if the district hires an outreach consultant and hosts conference to develop collaborative relationships in the African American, Hispanic and Chinese community. (June Wallace)</a></p>

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
51	<p><b>Complaint Response:</b> Stakeholders are not aware of the Air District's policy for responding to public complaints about facilities and want the Air District to provide information on facility complaints on the website.</p> <p>Comment: Duplicative, group.</p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Publicize complaint process via website, email, newspaper, community meetings. (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>As described above put the process online for transparency (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>I agree. (June Wallace)</p>	The district must make the website more user friendly and remember the deaf, blind and physically challenged community. Develop an 800 number and revise the website. (June Wallace)
52	<p><b>Complaint Response:</b> Complainants of wood smoke problems do not always receive response from air district about actions taken to address problem. (Jenny Bard)</p>		<p>Written response and follow up for actions taken to address wood smoke problem provided to complainants.</p> <p>On website, list the number of complaints made and the number of citations issued.</p> <p>Report smoke complaint information to local governments to work cooperatively to enforce wood burning regulations. (Jenny Bard)</p>	
53	<p><b>Interpersonal Relations:</b> Some Air District staff members' interactions with stakeholders, particularly at meetings, are, at times, confrontational and defensive.</p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>Culturally competence training; create allies within the community to facilitate communication. Knowing the audience and yourself is key. (Charlene Henderson)</p> <p>Utilize only those staff members that are best at facilitation. Use other staff members at meetings for technical info if needed but not in a facilitation role if they lack those skills. Train and identify leaders with these skills to run meetings. (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>Many district meetings end up in disarray due to the volatile reaction of certain communities to the districts efforts. (June Wallace)</p>	<p>Hire consultants if needed or look into hiring more staff with facilitation skills. Bring in training on interest based problem solving for staff playing roles in public meetings. (Gillian Hayes)</p> <p>Hire outreach coordinators and develop key relationships in various communities. Until this is done, the district will continue to be bombarded and misunderstood by the community. (June Wallace)</p>
54	<p><b>Public Records Requests:</b> Stakeholders are frustrated by having to make Public Records Act requests for information they think should be readily available.</p>	Assessment Key Findings document	<p>The district is a public entity. All records should be easily found and accessible. Create a process that is understood by the community. Then develop a marketing strategy to educate the public. (ie. The same way that Spare the Air day was marketed). (June Wallace)</p>	<p>The district needs to address this matter once and for all. The district has been around too long for this matter to be such a highly volatile issue. It is not the public's responsibility to create a plan to access your information. Make this a priority and handle this once and for all. Until you do so, the district continue to be secretive. Or look as if the district is being secretive. (June Wallace)</p>
<b>Public Engagement (General)</b>				
55	<p><b>Principles of Public Engagement:</b> The air district does not have established principles of public engagement and should clearly define "public engagement" (Jenny Bard)</p>		<p>Work with BAEHC and impacted community stakeholders to develop guiding principles of public engagement. (Jenny Bard)</p> <p>Define clearly what "public engagement is with clearly defined objectives and outcomes (Jenny Bard, Charlene Henderson)</p> <p>The District should make an official commitment to give more effort into engaging community residents specifically (Rosina Roibal).</p> <p>BAEHC has submitted a proposed Public Engagement Policy for the District to consider as principles o engagement (Rosina Roibal).</p>	<p>BAEHC protocols for public engagement (Jenny Bard)</p> <p>Also see City of Portland <a href="http://www.portlandonline.com/oni/index.cfm?c=51069&amp;a=312804">http://www.portlandonline.com/oni/index.cfm?c=51069&amp;a=312804</a> (Jenny Bard)</p>

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
56	<b>Language Complexity and Context:</b> Content for the website and public meetings is written in technical or complex language and lacks sufficient context.		BAEHC – Public Participation Protocol March 2009  Neutral Language. BAAQMD shall provide neutral language in public notices and permit documents. i. Proposed Actions. BAAQMD notices shall clarify that the proposed actions under consideration are proposed, not final, and that public comment is sought on proposed actions. ii. Unbiased Language. BAAQMD notices shall use neutral and unbiased language and shall not rely on industry marketing materials or industry claims as the basis for proposed decisions.	
<b>Limited English Proficient Accessibility</b> <b>Comment: I added the LEP access category (Rosina Roibal)</b>				
57	The Air District currently lacks consistency in the services provided for Limited English Proficient populations (Air District staff)			
58	The District lacks translation services and equipment (Rosina Roibal)		Purchase 100 headsets for translation, with an appropriate number of receivers and at least 3 transmitters capable of interpreting 3 languages at once. (Rosina Roibal)	
59	LEP speakers get unequal time to speak because of translation (Rosina Roibal)		Provide twice the amount of speaking time for public speakers who request translation assistance at meetings. (Rosina Roibal)	a. Language source: The San Francisco Board of Supervisors "... will provide twice the amount of speaking time for public speakers who request translation assistance at meeting of the Board of Supervisors and Board Committees." San Francisco Board of Supervisors Rules of Order, Rule No. 1.2.1, Motion 01-73, File # 010701 Example: <i>City and County of San Francisco, Board of Supervisors</i>  (Rosina Roibal)
60	Translation hasn't been provided for areas with high language access needs. (Rosina Roibal)		Provide interpreters that can provide translation that is accurate, verbatim, independent, and certified. Either from a jointly (Board and community group) developed approved list or a professional certification. Provide translation for a given language if 5% or 10,000 (according to most recent census data) people make up that demographic in "potentially impacted areas" with "significant or non-significant" impacts. (Rosina Roibal)	a. Language source for the <b>5 %</b> rule: A "'substantial number of non-English-speaking people" are members of a group who either do not speak English, or who are unable to effectively communicate in English because it is not their native language, and who comprise 5 percent or more of the people served by any local office or facility of a state agency." Cal. Gov. Code § 7292(a), available at <a href="http://www.spb.ca.gov/bilingual/dymallyact.htm">http://www.spb.ca.gov/bilingual/dymallyact.htm</a>  Language source for the <b>10,000 persons</b> rule: "Substantial Number of Limited English Speaking Persons Group" or "Group" shall mean at least 10,000 limited English speaking City residents who speak a shared language other than English. The City Planning Department shall determine annually whether at least 10,000 limited English speaking City residents speak a shared language other than English by referring to the best available data from the United States Census Bureau or another reliable source and shall certify its determination to the City Manager no later than December 1

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
				<p>of each year.”  From <i>Oakland City Council Ordinance No. 12324, Equal Access to Services Ordinance</i>, Sec. 2.30.020 (d)</p> <p>Language source for <b>5% or 10,000 persons</b> rule:  “either 10,000 City residents, or 5 percent of those persons who use the Department’s services.” San Francisco Admin. Code Sec. 91.2(j)</p> <p>Examples: <i>City of Oakland</i> goes by the 10,000 rule  <i>City of San Francisco</i> goes by the 5% and 10,000 rules</p> <p>(Rosina Roibal)</p>
61	The District needs to have qualified bilingual people in public contact positions. (Rosina Roibal)		Employ a sufficient number of qualified bilingual persons in public contact positions. (Rosina Roibal)	<p>Example: The <i>Dymally-Alatorre Bilingual Services Act</i> defines “qualified”:  Cal. Gov. Code §7296(a): As used in this chapter, a “qualified bilingual person,” “qualified bilingual employee,” or “qualified interpreter” is a person who is proficient in both the English language and the non-English language to be used. For any state agency, “qualified” means one of the following:</p> <p>(1) A bilingual person or employee who the State Personnel Board has <b>tested and certified</b> as proficient in the ability to understand and convey in English and a non-English language commonly used terms and ideas, including terms and ideas regularly used in state government.</p> <p>(2) A bilingual employee who was tested and certified by a state agency or other testing authority <b>approved by the State Personnel Board</b> as proficient in the ability to understand and convey in English and a non-English language commonly used terms and ideas, including terms and ideas regularly used in state government.</p> <p>(3) <b>An interpreter who has met the testing or certification standards established by the State Personnel Board for outside or contract interpreters</b>, as proficient in the ability to communicate commonly used terms and ideas between the English language and the non-English language to be used and has knowledge of basic interpreter practices, including, but not limited to, confidentiality, neutrality, accuracy, completeness, and transparency.</p> <p>(b) The determination of what constitutes “qualified” for local agencies, shall be left to the discretion of the local agency.</p> <p>(Rosina Roibal)</p>
62	For years the complaint hotline didn’t accommodate different languages. (Rosina Roibal)		1(800) 334-ODOR: The complaint hotline should be able to accommodate different languages, from the menu to the person fielding the call. (Rosina Roibal)	<p>Language sources:</p> <p>a. “<i>SEC. 230.080 All Departments shall maintain recorded telephonic messages in each language spoken by the Substantial Number of Limited English Speaking Persons Group(s). The message shall contain basic information about the Department’s operation including, at a minimum, business hours, location(s), services offered and the means of accessing such services, and the availability of language assistance.</i>”</p> <p>b. From the Oakland City Council Equal Access to Services Ordinance</p> <p>“<i>All Departments with recorded telephonic messages about the Department’s operation or services shall maintain such messages in each language spoken by a Substantial Number of Limited English Speaking Persons or where applicable a Concentrated Number of Limited English Speaking Persons. Such Departments are encouraged to include in the telephonic messages information about business hours, office location(s), services offered, and the means of accessing such services, and the availability of</i></p>

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
				<p><i>language assistance. If the Department is governed by a commission the messages shall include the time, date, and place of the commission's meetings."</i></p> <p>From the San Francisco Admin. Code Sec. 91.7; see also Sec. 91.4</p> <p>a. Examples: <i>City of Oakland, City of San Francisco</i></p> <p><i>South Coast AQMD</i>  A toll-free Spanish language line attended 7 am-9 pm Tues-Sat. At other times, callers can leave messages which will generate automatic pages to AQMD inspectors who are on call 24-hours a day, 365 days a year in the event of an air pollution incident, such as a toxic release from a factory or refinery. See also <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/news1/1999/Spanish_complaint_line.htm">http://www.aqmd.gov/news1/1999/Spanish_complaint_line.htm</a> for more details.</p> <p>(Rosina Roibal)</p>
63	<p>LEP access is inconsistent and limited; the District has no internal process for translating documents. (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>Board agendas are not translated (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>Project documents are not translated (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>It is unclear which documents the District translates. (Rosina Roibal)</p>		<p>Translate Board meeting agendas for a given language if 5% or 10,000 (according to most recent census data) people make up the regional demographic.</p> <p>A procedure should be written for when and how translation services/tasks are to be completed; District needs an internal process for when LEP residents need documents translated (Rosina Roibal).</p> <p>The District needs a written statement of what documents the Air District translates and which you would agree to translate in the future, and which would be fully translated documents vs. executive summaries(Rosina Roibal) (The District recently wrote a statement but it should be published in the Plan as well).</p> <p>PROJECT DOCUMENTS: For health risk evaluations, public notices, public comments and response to comments, EIR-related documents (draft EIRs included), fact sheets related to permitting, and related documents, the Board must make accessible:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Full Translation of documents &lt; 11 pages</li> <li>• Executive summaries for documents &gt; (Rosina Roibal)</li> </ul>	<p>a. Language source for documents already being provided for the public:  <i>"Whenever notice of the availability of materials explaining services available is given, orally or in writing, it shall be given in English and in the non-English language into which any materials have been translated. This section shall not be interpreted to require verbatim translations of any materials provided in English by a state agency. (7295.2)"</i></p> <p>From Cal. Gov. Code §7292(a); available at:  <a href="http://www.spb.ca.gov/bilingual/dymallyact.htm">http://www.spb.ca.gov/bilingual/dymallyact.htm</a></p> <p>Language source for what should be translated:  <i>"SEC. 91.4 Translation of Materials...Departments shall translate the following written materials that provide vital information to the public about the Department's services or programs into the language(s) spoken by a Substantial Number of Limited English Speaking Persons; applications or forms to participate in a Department's program or activity or to receive its benefits or services; written notices of rights to, determination of eligibility of, award of, denial of, loss of, or decreases in benefits or services, including the right to appeal any Department's decision...or any other written documents that have the potential for important consequences for an individual seeking services from or participating in a program of a city department."</i></p> <p>From San Francisco Admin. Code Sec. 91.4  See also Oakland Equal Access Ordinance, Sec. 2.30.100</p> <p>a. Language source:  <i>"Translation of Materials...Departments shall translate the following written materials that provide vital information to the public about the Department's services or programs into the language(s) spoken by a Substantial Number of Limited English Speaking Persons... notices advising limited English-proficient persons of free language assistance..."</i></p> <p>From San Francisco Admin. Code Sec. 91.4</p> <p>a. Examples: <i>South Coast Air Quality Management District</i>  Website is available in English, Spanish, Chinese, and Korean. Multilingual translationS of key documents are also found on the web.  - See website: South Coast Air Quality Management District:  <a href="http://www.aqmd.gov/">http://www.aqmd.gov/</a></p> <p><i>California Air Resources Board</i></p>



	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
				<p>Includes Spanish versions of important documents such as the ARB'S "Public Participation Guide to Air Quality Decision Making in California" and "Complain Resolution Protocol".</p> <p>(Rosina Roibal)</p>
64	Complaints aren't translated and responded to in the original language. (Rosina Roibal)		Non-English written complaints should be translated and responded to in the original language. (Rosina Roibal)	<p>From San Francisco Admin. Code, Sec. 91.8</p> <p>a. Examples:  <i>City of San Francisco</i>  <i>City of Oakland</i>  <i>California Air Resources Board</i>  <i>"All local air districts are committed to responding in a timely and appropriate way to complaints received from the public, including complaints received in languages other than English."</i> [emphasis added]  From the California Air Resources Board Complaint Resolution Protocol (p. 10), available at <a href="http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/ch.hrm">http://www.arb.ca.gov/ch/ch.hrm</a></p> <p>1. Non-English written comments should be translated and responded to in original language.</p> <p>a. Language source re: Dissemination of Translated Materials from State and Federal Government  <i>"If the State or Federal government or any agency thereof makes available to a Department written materials in a language other than English, the Department shall maintain an adequate stock of the translated materials and shall make them readily available to persons who use the Department's services."</i></p> <p>From Oakland City Council Equal Access to Services Ordinance, Sec. 2.30.060</p> <p>b. For Toxics NSR, Title V, and other proposed permit proceedings where public comment is required or allowed, response to comments should be in the original language.</p> <p>c. Examples: Kettleman City Case: <i>El Pueblo Para el Aire y Agua Limpio v. County of Kings</i>, 22 ELR 20,357 (Sac'to Sup. Ct. 1991) (translation of key documents required in proceedings where public participation is key part of public review; here under CEQA)</p> <p>a. Example: Cal. Gov. Code § 7299.4  <i>City of San Francisco</i>  <i>City of Oakland</i></p> <p>a. Language source about complaint forms:  <i>"Translation of Materials...Departments shall translate the following written materials that provide vital information to the public about the Department's services or programs into the language(s) spoken by a Substantial Number of Limited English Speaking Persons...complaint forms..."</i>  From San Francisco Admin. Code Sec. 91.4</p> <p>Language source about complaints re: language access  "(a) Departments shall allow persons to make complaints alleging violation of this Article to the Department in each language spoken by a Substantial Number of Limited English Speaking Persons. The complaints may be made by telephone or by completing a complaint form.  "(b) Departments shall document actions taken to resolve each complaint and maintain copies of complaints and documentation of their resolution for a period of not less than 5 years. A copy of each complaint shall be forwarded to the</p>

	Finding	Source of Finding	Recommendation	Practice/Example
				<p>Commission within 30 days of its receipt.”</p> <p>(Rosina Roibal)</p>
65	Compliance plan (Rosina Roibal)		<p>COMPLIANCE PLAN: Develop and implement a compliance plan to assess the language needs of populations served by the District and to ensure the District’s compliance with the law and any new regulations. (Rosina Roibal)</p>	
66	<p>Public notices aren’t translated enough. (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>Public notices are not translated always correctly or consistently. (Rosina Roibal)</p>		<p>Translate all public notices issued by the Air District for a given language if 5% or 10,000 (according to most recent census data) people make up the regional demographic. (Rosina Roibal)</p> <p>Public notices should have phone number and website of how residents can request translated documents and services for meetings/workshops. This information should be translated in the languages identified in the District’s LEP assessment. (Rosina Roibal)</p>	<p>a. Language source:  <i>“Every state agency which serves a substantial number of non-English-speaking people and which provides materials in English explaining services shall also provide the same type of materials in any non-English language spoken by a substantial number of the public served by the agency. Whenever notice of the availability of materials explaining services available is given, orally or in writing, it shall be given in English and in the non-English language into which any materials have been translated. This section shall not be interpreted to require verbatim translations of any materials provided in English by a state agency.”</i>            From Cal. Gov. Code §7295.2; available at:  <a href="http://www.spb.ca.gov/bilingual/dymallyact.htm">http://www.spb.ca.gov/bilingual/dymallyact.htm</a> (Rosina Roibal)</p>
67	<p>Even if documents were translated into Spanish, Cantonese, Mandarin, Amharic or Tigrinya, the words used to translate the documents would often be technical jargon understandable by those with at least a high school level vocabulary. What about people at the literacy level or elementary level?</p>		<p>Whenever possible, pictures and simple sentences using short words need to be used in written documents(Rosina Roibal).</p>	