



**BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT**

## **MEETING SUMMARY**

Public Engagement Stakeholder Advisory Task Force

Meeting 1

September 8, 2011, 5:00 — 8:00 PM

San Francisco State University Downtown Campus  
835 Market Street, San Francisco, CA 94103, Room 610

### **Meeting Attendees:**

#### **Stakeholder Advisory Task Force**

Wafaa Aborashed, Healthy 880 Communities  
Carl Anthony, Breakthrough Communities  
Jenny Bard, American Lung Association  
Guy Bjerke, Western States Petroleum Association  
Dr. Henry Clark, West County Toxics Association  
Margaret Gordon, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project  
Gillian Hayes, City of Santa Rosa Environmental Planner  
Stan Hayes, Air District Advisory Council Member (Public-At-Large)  
Charlene Henderson, Black Coalition on AIDS  
Edward Kangeter, Custom Alloy Steel Scraps  
John Knox-White, TransForm  
Denny Larson, Global Community Monitor  
Le Tim Ly, Chinese Progressive Association  
Jane Martin, Alameda County Public Health  
Kathy Renfrow, Monument Community Partnership  
Tom Rivard, City of San Francisco  
Dave Robinson, AB&I Iron Foundry  
Rosina Roibal, Bay Area Environmental Health Collaborative  
June Wallace, California Transplant Donor Network  
Janet Whittick, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance

#### **Air District Staff**

Kristina Chu, Public Information Officer  
Lisa Fasano, Communications Director  
Aneesh Rana, Events Coordinator  
Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer  
Ana Sandoval, Communications Manager  
Jim Smith, Senior Public Information Officer  
Sonam Shah, Public Information Officer

## **Kearns & West**

Ben Gettleman, Facilitator and Plan Developer

Pam Jones, Facilitator and Plan Developer



Pushpin markers in the document denote action items detailed under “Action Items.”

### **Welcome and Introductions**

Jean Roggenkamp and Lisa Fasano from the Air District made opening remarks and thanked Task Force members for their participation.

Jean Roggenkamp stated that the Air District’s public engagement practices have evolved over the years and that now is the time to create a formal public engagement policy and guidance plan

Task Force members introduced themselves and briefly shared their histories with the Air District. Air District staff introduced themselves and provided information about their role with the Public Engagement Policy and Plan. Kearns & West staff introduced themselves and provided background information on Kearns & West. Kearns & West was selected to assist the Air District in developing the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan for the Air District and will be the neutral facilitator for Stakeholder Advisory Task Force Meetings.

Pam Jones, facilitator, provided information on the development of the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan and the Assessment Key Findings document. Ms. Jones stated that to inform the Assessment Key Findings Kearns & West spoke with 26 stakeholders from different organizations that interact with the Air District. She provided an overview of the purpose of the Stakeholder Advisory Task Force, including:

- The Task Force will offer input and guidance in the development of the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan.
- Task Force meetings will act as informal opportunities to engage with other stakeholders.
- Members will act as ambassadors in local communities and assist the Air District in hosting regional meetings.
- The Task Force will provide insight in designing regional meetings that best meet local needs.

Ms. Jones asked Task Force members if their pictures could be taken during Task Force meetings for documentation of the process. Task Force members agreed.

Ms. Jones reviewed the meeting materials, including:

- Meeting Agenda
- Stakeholder Advisory Task Force Charter

- Stakeholder Advisory Task Force Membership Roster
- Assessment Key Findings Document
- Task Force Travel Reimbursement Form
- Proposed Public Engagement Opportunities
- Assessment Interviews and Meetings List

Ms. Jones reviewed the Task Force Charter. A Task Force member expressed concern that the development of the Charter was not a collaborative effort. A Task Force member suggested that the charter include principles of collaboration and offered examples. Ms. Jones stated Task Force members could send comments about the Charter via e-mail to Kearns & West.

A Task Force member asked about the development timeline of the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan project. Ms. Jones stated the Air District will host regional workshops to inform the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan. The document will then be presented to Air District Board of Directors' Public Outreach Committee followed by the Air District Board of Directors in late December 2011. There will be ongoing input and review from the Task Force throughout the development process. There was general consensus among Task Force members that the project timeline was too short. Air District staff indicated the timeline could be adjusted if necessary but stated the Air District would like to adopt, in a relatively short time, a "living" guidance document that the Air District can begin to implement and can be amended over time.

A Task Force member asked to discuss the meaning of the word "engagement" and the engagement goals of the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan. Another member added that it was important to hear each Task Force member's goals with respect to the project.

A Task Force member asked Ms. Jones how many public engagement documents the firm had developed. She stated that Kearns & West has worked on approximately 100 public engagement plans.

Task Force members discussed additional items related to the development of the Public Engagement Policy and Plan, including:

- The importance of educating the public on the Air District's geographic and regulatory jurisdiction;
- The importance of including additional stakeholders in the process; and
- The possibility of identifying short- and long-term goals to improve public engagement while developing the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan.

## Discussion of Key Findings Document

Ben Gettleman, co-facilitator, noted the Task Force is vital to the development of the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan. He described the purpose of the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan, which includes affirming the Air District's commitment to public engagement. Additionally, the Plan will outline opportunities for public engagement, and Air District resources for engagement. The Policy will outline the Air District's commitment to engaging limited-English-proficient individuals. The Plan will provide guidelines for engaging limited-English-proficient individuals.

A Task Force member asked if the Task Force would determine the policy aspect of the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan or only the Plan aspect. Mr. Gettleman stated the Plan will act as a guidebook to meeting principles and accomplishing the public engagement policy. Mr. Gettleman stated Task Force members should identify and share best practices that might be applicable to the Air District's work and should be considered for the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan.

A Task Force member asked if the criteria for determining best practices had already been developed. Mr. Gettleman stated the criteria will be developed by the Air District with input from the Task Force and the consultant, Kearns & West.

A Task Force member offered information about customer service practices at the City of Oakland that might be helpful; another Task Force member stated the Air District complaint line could be more effective.



A Task Force member offered information about a project in Ohio regarding air quality monitoring and complaints. Another Task Force member asked for that information to be shared with the entire Task Force.

Mr. Gettleman reviewed the Key Findings Assessment document – a stakeholder evaluation of the Air District's public outreach and engagement efforts. He stated that to develop the Assessment Key Findings document Kearns & West staff spoke with 26 stakeholders including a meeting with members of the Bay Area Environmental Health Collaborative (BAEHC), whose documents they also reviewed, and also evaluated Air District communications products.

A Task Form member stated that building partnerships with other local permitting agencies is an important step in the development of the Plan. A Task Form member stated the Air District is an authority on air quality issues in the Bay Area, and the community needs to trust that the District is doing its job; if trust issues exist, those should be explored and efforts made to build trust. Another Task Form member stated there is a need to educate the public on the Air District's regulatory jurisdiction.

Mr. Gettleman stated that one finding of the Assessment Key Findings document was that the Air District makes an effort to hold workshops and public meetings; however, some meetings are perceived as reactionary instead of proactive.

A Task Force member observed that not all Task Force members had been interviewed as part of the Assessment. A Task Force member asked if the document had been developed by Kearns & West and if the document had been edited by Air District staff. Air District staff stated they assisted with editing for clarity. A Task Force member requested that recommendations previously provided to the Air District be included in the Plan.

### **Task Force Input on Best Practices for Public Engagement**

Mr. Gettleman presented a draft matrix that is being developed to match key needs and/or gaps in public engagement identified in the assessment to potential best practices intended to address the needs. Mr. Gettleman explained that the matrix would be used as a tool to organize Task Force recommendations for the Guidance Plan; to consider practices Kearns & West is familiar with; and to consider practices Kearns & West's research indicates may address the engagement needs of the Air District and its stakeholders. The potential best practices will be evaluated and used to inform the Plan.

A Task Force member stated that it was important to understand that different organizations have different goals related to the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan; for example, members representing local government agencies have specific goals related to the Policy and Guidance Plan, particularly as the agencies with authority over land use.



A task force member suggested sending the group web links to other best practices.



Task Force members agreed to identify best practices based on the Key Assessment findings in a collaborative Google document. The Task Force recommended a timeline for collaboration on the document. Mr. Gettleman requested that if Task Force members have best practices that do not correspond to findings from the Assessment document, that they insert a new row into the matrix and identify the new finding or need they are addressing. Task Force members agreed to discuss the matrix at the next Task Force meeting.

Task Force members proposed breaking into groups by organization type at the next Task Force meeting to better understand the needs, concerns and ideas of similar stakeholders. Some Task Force members stated breaking into groups would not allow members to hear the perspectives of the collective group.

## Action Items

- Kearns & West will distribute a Google document with the “needs/best practices” matrix reviewed at the first Task Force meeting by COB Friday, September 16, 2011. The matrix will be pre-populated with the results of the Key Findings Assessment document.
- Kearns & West will send a brief “how-to” guide for working in Google documents to Task Force members by COB Friday, September 16, 2011.
- By COB September 30, 2011, Task Force members will insert additional public engagement “gaps” along with recommendations and best practices into the Google document. Task Force members who need assistance with the document should contact Kearns & West.
- Kearns & West will distribute the Task Force-populated Google document and a summary of the matrix one week in advance of the next Task Force meeting.
- Task Force members will review both matrix documents prior to the next meeting.
- Kearns & West will distribute links to best practices to the Task Force.
- Denny Larson will provide information about an air quality project in Ohio to Kearns & West for distribution to the Task Force.
- Kearns & West will poll members for their date availability for the second Task Force meeting.
- Kearns & West will distribute a draft summary of the first Task Force meeting for review and comment by COB September 16, 2011. The meeting summary will be on the agenda for approval at the next Task Force meeting.
- Task Force members are asked to put “Task Force” in the subject lines of their emails to the Air District and/or Kearns & West.