

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Community Advisory Council
Special Meeting/Retreat

Thursday, September 14, 2023
and
Friday, September 15, 2023

Meeting Location:
Sheraton Sonoma Wine Country Petaluma Hotel
Great Blue Heron Ballroom
745 Baywood Drive
Petaluma, CA 94954

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2023 (DAY 1)

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

The meeting Facilitator, Randolph Belle of Randolph Belle, Artist (RBA) Creative, called the Community Advisory Council (Council) in-person meeting to order at 12:07 p.m., on Day 1 of 2.

Co-Chairperson Latasha Washington welcomed everyone to the retreat. Co-Chairperson John Kevin Jefferson gave remarks regarding previously-identified communication issues that can be improved. He explained a new procedure that would allow more Council Members to be heard. Council Member Cecilia Mejia announced that she is stepping down from the CAC, effective September 30, 2023, and thanked the Council and Air District staff for contributing to her experiences as a Council Member.

Roll Call:

Present, In Person: Council Co-Chairpersons Ms. Margaret Gordon, Kevin John Jefferson, and Latasha Washington; and Council Members Dr. Juan Aguilera, William Goodwin, Arieann Harrison, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, and Ken Szutu.

Absent: Council Member Fernando Campos.

Others Present: Board Chairperson John J. Bauters and Board Vice Chairperson, Davina Hurt.

2. **GROUNDING THE WORK OF THE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL ON ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE (EJ)**

- A. Organizational Level Setting** – Air District Board of Directors Chair Bauters and Vice Chair Hurt provided welcoming remarks. Dr. Philip M. Fine, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), gave the staff presentation *Air Quality Management and Air District Overview*, including: outline; air pollution terms; emissions: air pollution from sources; ambient concentrations: levels of pollution measured in the air; exposure: amount of pollution that people are exposed to; basics of air quality management (who, what, from where, and how); Air District mission; air pollutants and their impacts; emissions inventory: estimates of sources of air pollution; Bay Area greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions; measurements throughout the Bay Area; examples: some areas have higher day-to-day levels of pollution or higher peak levels of pollution during short episodes, and community-partnered mobile monitoring study to identify areas of elevated air toxics near sources of concern; where can the public get air quality data; rule development; permits; Compliance and Enforcement; incentives: and grants for clean air and climate solutions.
- B. Team Building Discussion** – The Council engaged in a team building discussion to strengthen its communication, collaboration, and connections. One by one, each Council Member answered the question “What air pollution problem exists in your neighborhood or the community you work with?”
- C. Federal Perspective on Environmental Justice** – Robin Collin, Senior Advisor to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Administrator for Environmental Justice, provided a perspective on how government can partner with local communities to promote wellness, which included her personal experiences of environmental injustice.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments:

The Council asked questions and gave comments, including: appreciation for Dr. Fine’s explanation of the Air District’s structure and activities; the history of Assembly Bill (AB) 398 (E. Garcia), how California air districts are prevented from setting limits on carbon dioxide at stationary sources that are subject to the State’s Cap and Trade program; how much control the Air District has over the grant program that it facilitates on behalf of the State; the desire for an official system that addresses questions from communities and puts the community in the center of all Air District activities (planning, engineering, compliance and enforcement, rules, etc.); concerns about the Air District’s new web tool that provides searchable information for all the notices of violation that the agency has issued within the past five years; whether the Air District can ban all residential wood burning activities; whether the Air District is interested in carbon capture; the desire of the Council to see and exchange data with the Air District’s lab that analyses air samples; the request for the Air District’s current organizational chart; concerns that Air District

field staff that interface with the public do not communicate the same objectives as Air District management; the desire for both air quality modeling *and* monitoring; the request for reparations to communities impacted by air pollution; whether existing laws may be revised to incorporate community engagement into them; and concerns about industrial plants that operate for years without Air District permits.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 2:37P.M., AND RESUMED AT 2:53 P.M.

3. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ACTION PLANNING

Vernice Miller-Travis, Executive Vice President of The Metropolitan Group, gave the presentation *Environmental Justice Action Planning*, including: outcome; outline; requested action; EJ perspectives from The Metropolitan Group; how agency culture change happens – theory of Diffusion of Ideas; positive impact of community on EJ solutions; EJ community case study of “soft power”; organizing together for effective change; WE ACT for EJ: Theory of Change; and facilitator spotlight.

Co-Chair Washington then provided an update from the EJ Policy Ad Hoc Committee. She showed slides to indicate the EJ Action Plan’s development process and timeline.

Ms. Miller-Travis then engaged the Council in the development of the EJ Action Plan by utilizing the structure of the Theory of Change (Slide 21). The Council was asked to do the following:

1. *Review selected comments that resulted from the EJ Policy Ad Hoc' s brainstorm of Question 1A: What is the Environmental Justice need?*
2. *Review all 13 comments that resulted from the brainstorm of Question 1B: What impact could the EJ Action Plan have?*
3. *Interactive activity – All CAC M embers select the top 3 comments from Question 1B that resonate with their own desired impact of the EJ Action Plan.*
4. *Discussion – CAC M embers may share additional desired impacts of the EJ Action Plan*

1A. What is the Environmental Justice need? (e.g., what is the problem to solve? what changes are we seeking?)

1B. What specific impact could the EJ Action Plan (and Strategic Plan) have in addressing the need?

Based on this activity, the most desired comment that was listed was “Hire more Air District staff with EJ skills, mindsets, and lived experience and have more persons of color in higher positions of leadership.”

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

Regarding the presentation, the Council gave comments, including: appreciation for Dr. Phil Martien engaging in community-based science with the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project; concerns about the Air District's community engagement practices and the desire for enhanced and improved engagement, as well as a larger community engagement budget; concern about the way in which Council Members' questions are taken and answered by Air District staff at Council meetings; the fact that those living in impacted, overburdened communities can normalize their degradation; the need to think about those who will be joining the Council in the future and focusing on those transitions; and when utilize direct action.

Ms. Margaret Gordon announced that this will be her last meeting as a Co-Chair.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

CONSENT CALENDAR

4. APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING OF JULY 20, 2023

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Co-Chair Washington made a motion, seconded by Co-Chair Jefferson, to **approve** the Draft Minutes of the Community Advisory Council meeting of July 20, 2023, and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES:	Aguilera, Goodwin, Gordon, Harrison, Jefferson, Massey, Mejia, Mendoza, Molina, Pelagio, Reed, Ritterman, Saena, Szutu, Washington.
NOES:	None.
ABSTAIN:	None.
ABSENT:	Campos, Ruano Hernandez.

THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 4:57 P.M ON SEPTEMBER 14, 2023, AND RESUMED AT 9:07 A.M. ON SEPTEMBER 15, 2023.

FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 15, 2023 (DAY 2)

5. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

Mr. Belle called the Community Advisory Council (Council) in-person meeting to order at 9:07 a.m., and resumed the meeting on Day 2 of 2.

Roll Call:

Present, In Person: Council Co-Chairpersons Ms. Margaret Gordon, Kevin John Jefferson, and Latasha Washington; and Council Members Dr. Juan Aguilera, William Goodwin, Ariann Harrison, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, and Ken Szutu.

Absent: Council Member Fernando Campos.

Others Present: None.

6. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE PERSPECTIVES

- A. Team Building Discussion** – The Council engaged in a team building discussion to strengthen their communication, collaboration, and connections. One by one, each Council Member answered the question “How do you define equity?”

NOTED PRESENT: Council Member Ruano Hernandez was noted present at 10:03 a.m.

- B. Local Perspective on Environmental Justice** – Marisol Cantú, third generation Richmond resident, teacher, and advocate, provided a perspective on local efforts to reduce emissions as a member of the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Area AB617 Community Steering Committee. She spoke about her personal experiences with environmental injustice as a resident of Richmond, California, as well as the work of the Richmond Progressive Alliance’s Listening Project, the goal of which is to take political decision-making back from corporations and put power back into the hands of the community. Ms. Cantú then began to engage the Council in a listening activity, but the Council requested that Air District staff be the ones to respond instead. Air District staff was asked to listen to excerpts of the Listening Project’s podcast, and then summarize what they heard; list key themes and messages that they heard; list emotions from tones, pauses, pitches, and inflections that they heard; and express how they felt upon listening.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Esther Goolsby.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 10:54 A.M., AND RESUMED AT 11:02 A.M.

7. DEVELOPMENT OF COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL GOALS AND WORK PLAN

Council Member Goodwin, and Belinda Lyons-Newman and Erica Harrell, of Lyons-Newman Consulting, gave the presentation *Development of Community Advisory Council Goals and Work Plan*, including: outcome; outline; requested action; expectations & ground rules; Council Work Plan; revised Work Plan; developing an updated Work Plan; Lyons-Newman Consulting staff and approach; project objective; definition of terms; background; goals and action example; and priority goals.

Ms. Lyons-Newman then engaged the Council in a working session to further refine and develop the Council's Work Plan, including the development of goals for the year. Based on a survey regarding priority goals that was previously completed by the Council, the following subsequent list of five goals were displayed:

- **Goal A:** *educate and engage communities most affected by air pollution*
- **Goal B:** *boost monitoring and reporting on air quality and enforcement of laws*
- **Goal C:** *support community members to replace indoor gas appliances*
- **Goal D:** *Develop and EJ and equity framework to inform BAAQMD processes and Council's decision-making*
- **Goal E:** *Strengthen the Council's effectiveness and impact on change in communities*
- **Goal F:** *Find ways to direct resources to communities (added during meeting)*

THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 12:00 P.M., AND RESUMED AT 1:00 P.M.

Based on this activity, the most desired goal became "Build on experience and expertise and engage communities most affected by air pollution." Ms. Harrell then led the Council through an exercise, filling out the Work Plan framework template created by the consultant. For each goal listed above, the Council was asked to identify activities, potential Board recommendations, and a Council Member lead.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Esther Goolsby.

Council Comments

The Council discussed and made suggested revisions to the language of the five goals. The question of whether the Council wished to engage in participatory budgeting was also discussed. Co-Chair Washington expressed concern with this activity, as she had hoped to hear more policy-oriented activities identified by the Council.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

OTHER BUSINESS

8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Thursday, November 30, 2023, at 6:00 p.m. at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA, 94105. The meeting will be in-person for the Community Advisory Council members and members of the public will be able to either join in-person or via webcast.

Dr. Fine asked Veronica Eady, Deputy Executive Officer of Equity & Community Programs, to provide closing remarks. Ms. Eady remarked on the progress the Council made over the two days of the retreat, and announced her upcoming departure from the Air District.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 2:26 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards