



BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT



**COMMUNITY  
ADVISORY COUNCIL**  
**CLEAN AIR FOR ALL**

BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL

COUNCIL MEMBERS

FERNANDO CAMPOS  
WILLIAM GOODWIN  
MS. MARGARET GORDON  
ARIEANN HARRISON  
JOHN JEFFERSON  
JOY MASSEY  
HANA MENDOZA  
RIO MOLINA

MAYRA PELAGIO  
CHARLES REED  
DR. JEFF RITTERMAN  
KEVIN RUANO HERNANDEZ  
FAGAMALAMA VIOLET SAENA  
KEN SZUTU  
LATASHA WASHINGTON

**MEETING LOCATION(S) FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE BY  
COUNCIL MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC**

**Bay Area Metro Center  
1st Floor Board Room  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105**

**THE FOLLOWING STREAMING OPTIONS WILL ALSO BE PROVIDED**

**These streaming options are provided for convenience only. In the event that streaming connections malfunction for any reason, the Community Advisory Council reserves the right to conduct the meeting without remote webcast and/or Zoom access.**

**The public may observe this meeting through the webcast by clicking the link available on the air district's agenda webpage at [www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/community-advisory-council/agendasreports](http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/community-advisory-council/agendasreports).**

**Members of the public may participate remotely via Zoom at <https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/88079901658>, or may join Zoom by phone by dialing (669) 900-6833 or (408) 638-0968. Para Español, marque: (888) 688-2099. Esta línea telefónica es solo para escuchar, no hay moderador.**

**The Webinar ID for this meeting is: 880 7990 1658**

**Public Comment on Agenda Items:** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on a matter on the agenda will have three minutes each to address the Council on that agenda item, unless a different time limit is established by the Co-Chairs. No speaker who has already spoken on an item will be entitled to speak to that item again.

The Council welcomes comments, including criticism, about the policies, procedures, programs, or services of the District, or of the acts or omissions of the Council. Speakers shall not use threatening, profane, or abusive language which disrupts, disturbs, or otherwise impedes the orderly conduct of a Council meeting. The District is committed to maintaining a workplace free of unlawful harassment and is mindful that District staff regularly attend Council meetings. Discriminatory statements or conduct that would potentially violate the Fair Employment and Housing Act – i.e., statements or conduct that is hostile, intimidating, oppressive, or abusive – is *per se* disruptive to a meeting and will not be tolerated.

# COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING AGENDA

**THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 30, 2023**

**6:00 PM**

## ***Land Acknowledgement Statement***

*We begin by acknowledging that this land is unceded Indigenous land. The territories, or counties we represent, are of the Indigenous people. To acknowledge this history of our country - that this nation was built on genocide, the exclusion and erasure of Indigenous people - grounds our work in truth. We also acknowledge that our modern global economy was founded on the free and forced labor of enslaved Black people. And that exploited labor continuously perpetuates itself in disadvantaged communities of color, as we see in the treatment of farm workers, immigrant workers, prison labor, and domestic workers. This practice of land acknowledgement calls on us to recognize our violent history that is the foundation of white supremacy, and to recognize the longstanding and ongoing resistance of People of Color to dehumanization, repression, and homicide. And that the brilliance and leadership of People of Color in resistance, vision, wisdom, and love be honored and recognized as we work to dismantle ongoing legacies of settler colonialism and anti-blackness.*

## **1. Call to Order - Roll Call**

*The Facilitator, on behalf of the Council Co-Chairs, shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council Members.*

## **2. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters**

*Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda will be given an opportunity to address the Council. Members of the public will have three minutes each to address the Council, unless a different time limit is established by the Chair. The Council welcomes comments, including criticism, about the policies, procedures, programs, or services of the District, or of the acts or omissions of the Council. Speakers shall not use threatening, profane, or abusive language which disrupts, disturbs, or otherwise impedes the orderly conduct of a Council meeting. The District is committed to maintaining a workplace free of unlawful harassment and is mindful that District staff regularly attend Council meetings. Discriminatory statements or conduct that would potentially violate the Fair Employment and Housing Act – i.e., statements or conduct that is hostile, intimidating, oppressive, or abusive – is per se disruptive to a meeting and will not be tolerated.*

**CONSENT CALENDAR (Item 3)**

3. Approval of the Draft Minutes of the Community Advisory Council Special Meeting/Retreat of September 14 and 15, 2023

*The Council will consider approving the Draft Minutes of the Community Advisory Council Special Meeting/Retreat of September 14 and 15, 2023.*

**ACTION ITEM(S)**

4. Vote on the Creation of a Community Advisory Council Member Selection Ad Hoc Committee

*This is an action item for the Council to create an Ad Hoc Committee that will select Community Advisory Council candidates for Board consideration to fill one vacant youth seat.*

**INFORMATIONAL ITEM(S)**

5. Advancing an Equitable Transition To Clean and Healthy Buildings

*Air District staff will present an overview of the Air District's effort to advance an equitable, accessible, and smooth technology transition to zero pollution space and water heating in residential homes across the San Francisco Bay Area. This is an informational item only and will be presented by Dr. Idania Zamora, Assistant Manager of the Climate Protection Program.*

6. Community Advisory Council September Retreat Next Steps

*The Council and the public will receive highlights of the inaugural Community Advisory Council (CAC) Retreat held on September 14-15 in Petaluma and next steps on creating an equity statement by the CAC. This item will be presented by CAC Co-Chair Latasha Washington.*

7. Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee Update

*The Council and the public will receive an update from the Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee.*

8. Environmental Justice Policy Ad Hoc Committee Update

*The Council and the public will receive an update from the Environmental Justice Policy Ad Hoc Committee.*

**OTHER BUSINESS**

9. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO

10. Council Member Comments / Other Business

*Any member of the Council, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda.*

11. Time and Place of Next Meeting

*Time and place are to be determined at a later time.*

12. Adjournment

*The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the facilitator.*

**CONTACT:**

**MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS**  
**375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105**  
[vjohnson@baaqmd.gov](mailto:vjohnson@baaqmd.gov)

**(415) 749-4941**  
**FAX: (415) 928-8560**  
**BAAQMD homepage:**  
[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the Air District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

**Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy**

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at [www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility](http://www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility) to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Suma Peesapati, at (415) 749-4967 or by email at [speesapati@baaqmd.gov](mailto:speesapati@baaqmd.gov).

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105  
FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:  
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS**

**NOVEMBER 2023**

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Legislative Committee Meeting	Wednesday	29	10:00 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
Community Advisory Council Meeting	Thursday	30	6:00 p.m.	1st Floor, Board Room

**DECEMBER 2023**

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Nominating Committee	Wednesday	6	8:45 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	6	9:00 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Finance and Administration Committee	Wednesday	6	1:00 p.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee - CANCELLED	Wednesday	13	10:00 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor, Yerba Buena Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee - CANCELLED	Wednesday	13	1:00 p.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor, Yerba Buena Room
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	20	9:00 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee - CANCELLED	Wednesday	20	1:00 p.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons John Kevin Jefferson and Latasha Washington  
and Members of the Community Advisory Council

From: Philip M. Fine  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 30, 2023

Re: Approval of the Draft Minutes of the Community Advisory Council Special Meeting/Retreat of September 14 and 15, 2023

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the Draft Minutes of the Community Advisory Council Special Meeting/Retreat of September 14 and 15, 2023.

BACKGROUND

None.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the Draft Minutes of the Community Advisory Council Special Meeting/Retreat of September 14 and 15, 2023.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Philip M. Fine  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka  
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson



ATTACHMENTS:

1. Draft Minutes of the Community Advisory Council Special Meeting/Retreat of September 14 and 15, 2023

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, California 94105  
(415) 749-5073

**DRAFT MINUTES**

Community Advisory Council  
Special Meeting/Retreat

Thursday, September 14, 2023  
and  
Friday, September 15, 2023

Meeting Location:  
Sheraton Sonoma Wine Country Petaluma Hotel  
Great Blue Heron Ballroom  
745 Baywood Drive  
Petaluma, CA 94954

**THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2023 (DAY 1)**

**1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

The meeting Facilitator, Randolph Belle of Randolph Belle, Artist (RBA) Creative, called the Community Advisory Council (Council) in-person meeting to order at 12:07 p.m., on Day 1 of 2.

Co-Chairperson Latasha Washington welcomed everyone to the retreat. Co-Chairperson John Kevin Jefferson gave remarks regarding previously-identified communication issues that can be improved. He explained a new procedure that would allow more Council Members to be heard. Council Member Cecilia Mejia announced that she is stepping down from the CAC, effective September 30, 2023, and thanked the Council and Air District staff for contributing to her experiences as a Council Member.

**Roll Call:**

Present, In Person: Council Co-Chairpersons Ms. Margaret Gordon, Kevin John Jefferson, and Latasha Washington; and Council Members Dr. Juan Aguilera, William Goodwin, Arieann Harrison, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, and Ken Szutu.

Absent: Council Member Fernando Campos.

Others Present: Board Chairperson John J. Bauters and Board Vice Chairperson, Davina Hurt.

2. **GROUNDING THE WORK OF THE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL ON ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE (EJ)**

- A. **Organizational Level Setting** – Air District Board of Directors Chair Bauters and Vice Chair Hurt provided welcoming remarks. Dr. Philip M. Fine, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), gave the staff presentation *Air Quality Management and Air District Overview*, including: outline; air pollution terms; emissions: air pollution from sources; ambient concentrations: levels of pollution measured in the air; exposure: amount of pollution that people are exposed to; basics of air quality management (who, what, from where, and how); Air District mission; air pollutants and their impacts; emissions inventory: estimates of sources of air pollution; Bay Area greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions; measurements throughout the Bay Area; examples: some areas have higher day-to-day levels of pollution or higher peak levels of pollution during short episodes, and community-partnered mobile monitoring study to identify areas of elevated air toxics near sources of concern; where can the public get air quality data; rule development; permits; Compliance and Enforcement; incentives: and grants for clean air and climate solutions.
- B. **Team Building Discussion** – The Council engaged in a team building discussion to strengthen its communication, collaboration, and connections. One by one, each Council Member answered the question “What air pollution problem exists in your neighborhood or the community you work with?”
- C. **Federal Perspective on Environmental Justice** – Robin Collin, Senior Advisor to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Administrator for Environmental Justice, provided a perspective on how government can partner with local communities to promote wellness, which included her personal experiences of environmental injustice.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments:

The Council asked questions and gave comments, including: appreciation for Dr. Fine’s explanation of the Air District’s structure and activities; the history of Assembly Bill (AB) 398 (E. Garcia), how California air districts are prevented from setting limits on carbon dioxide at stationary sources that are subject to the State’s Cap and Trade program; how much control the Air District has over the grant program that it facilitates on behalf of the State; the desire for an official system that addresses questions from communities and puts the community in the center of all Air District activities (planning, engineering, compliance and enforcement, rules, etc.); concerns about the Air District’s new web tool that provides searchable information for all the notices of violation that the agency has issued within the past five years; whether the Air District can ban all residential wood burning activities; whether the Air District is interested in carbon capture; the desire of the Council to see and exchange data with the Air District’s lab that analyses air samples; the request for the Air District’s current organizational chart; concerns that Air District

field staff that interface with the public do not communicate the same objectives as Air District management; the desire for both air quality modeling *and* monitoring; the request for reparations to communities impacted by air pollution; whether existing laws may be revised to incorporate community engagement into them; and concerns about industrial plants that operate for years without Air District permits.

### Council Action

None; receive and file.

## **THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 2:37P.M., AND RESUMED AT 2:53 P.M.**

### **3. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ACTION PLANNING**

Vernice Miller-Travis, Executive Vice President of The Metropolitan Group, gave the presentation *Environmental Justice Action Planning*, including: outcome; outline; requested action; EJ perspectives from The Metropolitan Group; how agency culture change happens – theory of Diffusion of Ideas; positive impact of community on EJ solutions; EJ community case study of “soft power”; organizing together for effective change; WE ACT for EJ: Theory of Change; and facilitator spotlight.

Co-Chair Washington then provided an update from the EJ Policy Ad Hoc Committee. She showed slides to indicate the EJ Action Plan’s development process and timeline.

Ms. Miller-Travis then engaged the Council in the development of the EJ Action Plan by utilizing the structure of the Theory of Change (Slide 21). The Council was asked to do the following:

1. *Review selected comments that resulted from the EJ Policy Ad Hoc' s brainstorm of Question 1A: What is the Environmental Justice need?*
2. *Review all 13 comments that resulted from the brainstorm of Question 1B: What impact could the EJ Action Plan have?*
3. *Interactive activity – All CAC M embers select the top 3 comments from Question 1B that resonate with their own desired impact of the EJ Action Plan.*
4. *Discussion – CAC M embers may share additional desired impacts of the EJ Action Plan*

1A. What is the Environmental Justice need? (e.g., what is the problem to solve? what changes are we seeking?)

1B. What specific impact could the EJ Action Plan (and Strategic Plan) have in addressing the need?

Based on this activity, the most desired comment that was listed was “Hire more Air District staff with EJ skills, mindsets, and lived experience and have more persons of color in higher positions of leadership.”

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

Regarding the presentation, the Council gave comments, including: appreciation for Dr. Phil Martien engaging in community-based science with the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project; concerns about the Air District’s community engagement practices and the desire for enhanced and improved engagement, as well as a larger community engagement budget; concern about the way in which Council Members’ questions are taken and answered by Air District staff at Council meetings; the fact that those living in impacted, overburdened communities can normalize their degradation; the need to think about those who will be joining the Council in the future and focusing on those transitions; and when utilize direct action.

Ms. Margaret Gordon announced that this will be her last meeting as a Co-Chair.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

**4. APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING OF JULY 20, 2023**

Public Comments

No requests received.

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Co-Chair Washington made a motion, seconded by Co-Chair Jefferson, to **approve** the Draft Minutes of the Community Advisory Council meeting of July 20, 2023, and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES:	Aguilera, Goodwin, Gordon, Harrison, Jefferson, Massey, Mejia, Mendoza, Molina, Pelagio, Reed, Ritterman, Saena, Szutu, Washington.
NOES:	None.
ABSTAIN:	None.
ABSENT:	Campos, Ruano Hernandez.

**THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 4:57 P.M ON SEPTEMBER 14, 2023, AND RESUMED AT 9:07 A.M. ON SEPTEMBER 15, 2023.**

**FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 15, 2023 (DAY 2)**

**5. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

Mr. Belle called the Community Advisory Council (Council) in-person meeting to order at 9:07 a.m., and resumed the meeting on Day 2 of 2.

**Roll Call:**

Present, In Person: Council Co-Chairpersons Ms. Margaret Gordon, Kevin John Jefferson, and Latasha Washington; and Council Members Dr. Juan Aguilera, William Goodwin, Ariann Harrison, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, and Ken Szutu.

Absent: Council Member Fernando Campos.

Others Present: None.

**6. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE PERSPECTIVES**

- A. Team Building Discussion** – The Council engaged in a team building discussion to strengthen their communication, collaboration, and connections. One by one, each Council Member answered the question “How do you define equity?”

NOTED PRESENT: Council Member Ruano Hernandez was noted present at 10:03 a.m.

- B. Local Perspective on Environmental Justice** – Marisol Cantú, third generation Richmond resident, teacher, and advocate, provided a perspective on local efforts to reduce emissions as a member of the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Area AB617 Community Steering Committee. She spoke about her personal experiences with environmental injustice as a resident of Richmond, California, as well as the work of the Richmond Progressive Alliance’s Listening Project, the goal of which is to take political decision-making back from corporations and put power back into the hands of the community. Ms. Cantú then began to engage the Council in a listening activity, but the Council requested that Air District staff be the ones to respond instead. Air District staff was asked to listen to excerpts of the Listening Project’s podcast, and then summarize what they heard; list key themes and messages that they heard; list emotions from tones, pauses, pitches, and inflections that they heard; and express how they felt upon listening.

### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Esther Goolsby.

### Council Action

None; receive and file.

## **THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 10:54 A.M., AND RESUMED AT 11:02 A.M.**

### **7. DEVELOPMENT OF COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL GOALS AND WORK PLAN**

Council Member Goodwin, and Belinda Lyons-Newman and Erica Harrell, of Lyons-Newman Consulting, gave the presentation *Development of Community Advisory Council Goals and Work Plan*, including: outcome; outline; requested action; expectations & ground rules; Council Work Plan; revised Work Plan; developing an updated Work Plan; Lyons-Newman Consulting staff and approach; project objective; definition of terms; background; goals and action example; and priority goals.

Ms. Lyons-Newman then engaged the Council in a working session to further refine and develop the Council's Work Plan, including the development of goals for the year. Based on a survey regarding priority goals that was previously completed by the Council, the following subsequent list of five goals were displayed:

- *Goal A: educate and engage communities most affected by air pollution*
- *Goal B: boost monitoring and reporting on air quality and enforcement of laws*
- *Goal C: support community members to replace indoor gas appliances*
- *Goal D: Develop and EJ and equity framework to inform BAAQMD processes and Council's decision-making*
- *Goal E: Strengthen the Council's effectiveness and impact on change in communities*
- *Goal F: Find ways to direct resources to communities (added during meeting)*

## **THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 12:00 P.M., AND RESUMED AT 1:00 P.M.**

Based on this activity, the most desired goal became "Build on experience and expertise and engage communities most affected by air pollution." Ms. Harrell then led the Council through an exercise, filling out the Work Plan framework template created by the consultant. For each goal listed above, the Council was asked to identify activities, potential Board recommendations, and a Council Member lead.

### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Esther Goolsby.

### Council Comments

The Council discussed and made suggested revisions to the language of the five goals. The question of whether the Council wished to engage in participatory budgeting was also discussed. Co-Chair Washington expressed concern with this activity, as she had hoped to hear more policy-oriented activities identified by the Council.

### Council Action

None; receive and file.

### **OTHER BUSINESS**

#### **8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Thursday, November 30, 2023, at 6:00 p.m. at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA, 94105. The meeting will be in-person for the Community Advisory Council members and members of the public will be able to either join in-person or via webcast.

Dr. Fine asked Veronica Eady, Deputy Executive Officer of Equity & Community Programs, to provide closing remarks. Ms. Eady remarked on the progress the Council made over the two days of the retreat, and announced her upcoming departure from the Air District.

#### **9. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 2:26 p.m.

Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards



**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons John Kevin Jefferson and Latasha Washington and Members of the Community Advisory Council

From: Philip M. Fine  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 30, 2023

Re: Vote on the Creation of a Community Advisory Council Member Selection Ad Hoc Committee

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Select Council Members for an ad hoc committee to identify candidates for Board consideration to fill one vacant youth seat on the Community Advisory Council.

BACKGROUND

Per the Community Advisory Council (CAC) Charter, CAC members are appointed by the Board of Directors. CAC vacancies are to be filled by the Board of Directors as described in the following process: The Community Equity, Health, and Justice (CEHJ) Committee shall provide guidance on selection criteria and on prospective CAC members. The CAC shall create a CAC Member Selection Ad Hoc Committee, which may include at least one CEHJ Committee member or other Board members chosen by the Board Chair, to recommend a candidate or slate of candidates to the Community Equity, Health, and Justice Committee, according to the guidance provided by the CEHJ Committee.

Resolution No. 2023-14, Resolution of the Board of Directors of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District Establishing a Governance Structure for the Community Advisory Council provides initial criteria for selection of CAC candidates. Moreover, the resolution indicates that priority should be given to individuals from Bay Area communities overburdened by air pollution, environmental justice communities, and/or those with a history of partnering with environmental justice communities. The CEHJ Committee will recommend the selected youth candidate for final approval by the Board of Directors.

DISCUSSION

The CAC youth member seat selection process will begin with the creation of the CAC Member Selection Ad Hoc Committee. The Air District Board Chair will select a Board Member to join the Member Selection Ad Hoc Committee. The Member Selection Ad Hoc Committee will then meet to review existing selection criteria and recommend any changes to the criteria for approval by the CEHJ Committee. Once the CEHJ Committee finalizes the selection criteria, the

application will be released and there will be a 30-day window for interested youth to apply for the vacant CAC youth seat. After the Member Selection Ad Hoc Committee reviews applications, it will recommend applicants to the CEHJ Committee. The CEHJ Committee will recommend the selected candidate to the Board of Directors for final approval. Once the Board makes its selection, the Ad Hoc Committee will report back to the CAC.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None. Stipends for the work of the Community Advisory Council members selected to participate in the ad-hoc committee are included in the budget for fiscal year 2024.

Respectfully submitted,

Philip M. Fine  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Brian Butler and Miriam Torres  
Reviewed by: Victor Douglas

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1. None

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

## Memorandum

To: Chairpersons John Kevin Jefferson and Latasha Washington and Members of the Community Advisory Council

From: Philip M. Fine  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 30, 2023

Re: Advancing an Equitable Transition To Clean and Healthy Buildings

**RECOMMENDED ACTION**

None; receive and file.

**BACKGROUND**

On March 15, 2023, the Air District's Board of Directors adopted amendments to Regulation 9, Rule 4: Nitrogen Oxides from Fan Type Residential Central Furnaces (Rule 9-4) and Regulation 9, Rule 6: Nitrogen Oxides Emissions from Natural Gas-Fired Boilers and Water Heaters (Rule 9-6) to include zero-nitrogen oxides (NOx) emission standards for residential space and water heating with the first compliance date starting on January 1, 2027 and the initial staff report due to the Board of Directors January 1, 2025. Currently, the only alternative technological solutions to meet these new standards are fueled by electricity.

Due to the wide-ranging impacts of this potential technological shift, Air District staff have convened a multi-stakeholder working group to support implementation of the amended rules over an extended period. This Building Appliance Rules Implementation Working Group (IWG) will serve as the central forum for information-sharing and discussion regarding implementation of Rules 9-4 and 9-6 and will support Air District staff's reporting on rule implementation to the Air District's Board of Directors.

**DISCUSSION**

Buildings have a critical role in the health and safety of our residents. Natural gas combustion for space and water heating in buildings is responsible for a significant share of air pollutants that affect the health of our communities and drive climate change and its impacts. The recently amended building appliance rules are expected to significantly reduce building emissions of nitrogen oxides. Once fully implemented, the benefits include; a projected reduction of 37-85 premature deaths and \$400-890 million per year in health savings, particularly benefiting communities of color. In advance of the compliance dates for these rules, the Implementation Working Group will be working to advance an equitable, accessible, and smooth technology transition to zero NOx space and water heating in residential homes across

the San Francisco Bay Area. Air District staff will present an overview of the IWG goals, structure, process, and timeline to achieve these goals and highlight opportunities for members of the Community Advisory Council to influence the outcome of this effort.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Philip M. Fine  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Idania Zamora  
Reviewed by: Victor Douglas

ATTACHMENTS:

1. None

This updated CAC Work Plan is organized as a calendar of agenda items for future CAC meetings. It is the result of the information gathered at the September 2023 CAC retreat and further developed by lead CAC members and the Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee.

**This is a draft for comment until December 12, 2023. Submit your comments via email to CAC Staff.**

Goal A	Build on experiences and expertise, and engage communities most affected by air pollution
Goal B	Strengthen the CAC's effectiveness and impact on change in communities and BAAQMD (Priority #1)
Goal C	Boost monitoring and reporting on air quality and enforcement of laws
Goal D	Support community members to replace indoor gas appliances
Goal E	Develop an environmental justice and equity framework to inform BAAQMD processes, CAC's decision-making, and BAAQMD accountability
Goal F	Find ways to direct resources to communities (Community Benefits Fund)

## Calendar of Agenda Items (CAC Work Plan)

Meeting Year	Meeting Month	Goal	Workplan Agenda Items (this column was formerly "Activities")	Potential Recommendations (or Information Only?)	CAC Member Lead	Description of Community Benefit
FY24/25	July 2024 or Sep 2024	C	Develop community level monitoring capacity	To manage community level air quality based on monitored data.	Council Members Reed and Szutu	Enables community to report pollution and track progress based on data.
FY24/25	July 2024 or Sep 2024	C	Finalize recommendations for how to increase efficiency of responses to complaints	Increase efficiency of responses from program that tracks complaints (e.g., send drones to complaint sites); Amend rule for responding to complaints; Create a review system to determine how complaints are processed; Include additional information from community members in the complaint handling process; Engage community in sample collection.	Council Member Szutu	Community can provide feedback to complaint handling.

Meeting Year	Meeting Month	Goal	Workplan Agenda Items (this column was formerly "Activities")	Potential Recommendations (or Information Only?)	CAC Member Lead	Description of Community Benefit
FY24/25	July 2024 or Sep 2024	E	Update on Development of the EJ Policy and Action Plan	EJ Policy Ad Hoc develops EJ strategic goals to embed in the District's Strategic Plan; EJ Action Plan will contain multiple recommendations for EJ solutions for each division.	Council Members Washington and Ruano-Hernandez	The EJ strategic goals that will be created and submitted to the Strategic Planning process, as well as the EJ Action Plan with detailed EJ solutions and measurable actions for the AD's functions, will have an EJ-focused impact on how the AD does their work. Some goals of this EJ Action plan are to increase AD transparency, community engagement and information-sharing in the AD's functions, as well as having more EJ approaches to updating regulations and creating more strict policies for enforcement with the prioritization of frontline communities and decreasing air pollution for impacted communities.
FY24/25	Nov 2024 or Jan 2025	A	Have our community members (e.g., from the CERPs) report to the CAC (add 30 min to future meetings to listen to what other communities are doing)	Provide space during the CAC meetings to learn directly from impacted individuals in our communities.	Council Member Pelagio	Provide the opportunity for community members to make recommendations for improvements/ CAC can utilize resources to advocate for communities in need of support from BAAQMD

Meeting Year	Meeting Month	Goal	Workplan Agenda Items (this column was formerly "Activities")	Potential Recommendations (or Information Only?)	CAC Member Lead	Description of Community Benefit
FY24/25	Nov 2024 or Jan 2025	B	Review the work that the CAC has recently done, and decide on next steps to develop recommendations	Strengthen the CAC's effectiveness and impact on change in communities and BAAQMD.	Council Member Goodwin	By providing relevant and timely recommendations to the BAAQMD Board of Directors on how to improve the effectiveness of processes and programs within the BAAQMD, we aim to accelerate community engagement and elevate community confidence in the Air District's mission to "create a healthy breathing environment for every Bay Area resident."
FY24/25	Nov 2024 or Jan 2025	D	Discuss how the CAC will present recommendations regarding indoor gas appliances to the board (TBD after November)	Establish readiness criteria before hand. Compare implementation status with readiness criteria	Council Member Szutu	Make sure equitable transition is considered as part of final decision for readiness.
FY24/25	Nov 2024 or Jan 2025	F	Create a proposed plan for equitable disbursement of Community Benefit Fund	Recommend to the Air District Board a plan to disburse the Community Benefit Fund	Chairs of Community Benefit Fund Ad Hoc Committee	Communities overburdened by air pollution receive benefits from the Air District's Community Benefit Fund. Reduce air pollution and related health impacts through projects funded by the Air District's Community Benefit Fund.
FY24/25	March or May 2025	A	Review our current public record access (PRA) process	To review the workflow of PRA, e.g., type of records requested, number of requests, wait time, identify areas we can have the data readily available without going through the PRA process	Council Member Szutu	Improve access to Air District data, and shorter wait times. Also reduce person-hour needed by the legal division to manually retrieve the data.

Meeting Year	Meeting Month	Goal	Workplan Agenda Items (this column was formerly "Activities")	Potential Recommendations (or Information Only?)	CAC Member Lead	Description of Community Benefit
FY24/25	March or May 2025	F	Learn about air pollution community needs, health impacts, and funding pathways	Information Only	Chairs of Community Benefit Fund Ad Hoc Committee	Community engages in making local improvement to air quality
FY24/25	March or May 2025	B	Green collar jobs/internships/program for young people to learn about air quality science. Specific agenda items to be developed but could entail: 1. Presentation of opportunities for young people to be involved in Air District activities and 2. Opportunities for young people to learn about these skills and the science behind air quality.	The CAC will strategize how to implement youth opportunities in order to give opportunities to young people on Green Collar jobs in the air quality sector.	Council Member Ruano Hernandez	Increase attention and resources towards young people to help them enter into the environmental space. Gain more support from the young generation by implementing a program for young people to help them learn about Air Quality and other opportunities.



Meeting Year	Meeting Month	Goal	Workplan Agenda Items (this column was formerly "Activities")	Potential Recommendations (or Information Only?)	CAC Member Lead	Description of Community Benefit
FY 24/25	March or May 2025	F	Small group to present recommendations to the CAC to improve Transportation Fund for Clean Air County Program Manager Fund	Generate a letter to the Air District Board (specific recommendations TBD)	Council member Goodwin	Through a shared understanding and agreement on specific changes to improve the Transportation Fund for Clean Air County Program Manager Fund we aim to educate the community regarding the allocation of funds, who is being served by this program, and how this program benefits all of our communities. By generating a letter to the Air District Board (with specific recommendations, TBD), we aim to accelerate community engagement and elevate community confidence in the Transportation Fund for Clean Air County Program and thereby enhance the Air District's mission to "create a healthy breathing environment for every Bay Area resident."
FY24/25		A	Create an ad hoc committee to develop a toolkit of educational materials for the community and community presentations (e.g, provide a one-pager that includes contact numbers, including BAAQMD, for individuals to easily report a complaint and follow up)	Information pending	Council Member Mendoza	Information pending
FY24/25	Recurring every other meeting	C	Recurring update and exploration of topics around compliance and enforcement (C&E)	To share real-time information on issues and resolutions in regards to settlements, violations and lawsuits.	Co-Chair Jefferson	Better understanding of rules and regulations, of actual issues on a real-time basis