

Community Advisory Council Charter

DRAFT

January 17, 2023

Purpose

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) Community Advisory Council (CAC) was established on November 4, 2021 by the Community Equity and Health Justice Committee (CEHJ) of the Air District Board of Directors. On November 17, 2021 the Air District Board of Directors approved the formation of the CAC. The purpose of the CAC is to use Environmental Justice principles to provide guidance to the Board of Directors on programs and policies that impact overburdened communities within the Air District's jurisdiction to ensure the fair treatment of all persons living in those communities. The CAC will use Environmental Justice Principles to identify and inform with the goal to mitigate and/or remedy projected disproportionate impacts of air pollution exposures and to reduce health risks and inequities associated with poor air quality for people who live, work, and play in already vulnerable and historically marginalized [overburdened communities](#). The CAC will aim to meaningfully engage impacted communities to represent and address stakeholders' interests. The CAC advises Air District leadership on community related matters to advance an equity forward policy agenda.

Definitions:

1. Environmental Justice: The State of California defines ***environmental justice*** as “the fair treatment of people of all races, cultures, and incomes with respect to the development, adoption, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies.” California Government Code §65040.12(e).
2. Fair treatment: According to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, ***fair treatment*** means “no group of people should bear a disproportionate share of the negative environmental consequences resulting from industrial, governmental and commercial operations or policies.”ⁱ
3. Overburdened community: an area located within a census tract identified by the California Communities Environmental Health Screening Tool (CalEnviroScreen), Version 4.0, as having an overall CalEnviroScreen score at or above the 70th percentile, or within 1,000 feet of any such census tract.ⁱⁱ
4. Underrepresented community: Underrepresented community describes communities historically and systematically excluded from political and policy-making processes.

5. Meaningfully engage: Meaningfully involving impacted communities is essential to addressing environmental justice. According to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, *meaningful involvement* means “(1) potentially affected populations have an appropriate opportunity to participate in decisions about a proposed activity that will affect their environment and/or health ; (2) the public's contribution can influence the regulatory Agency's decision; (3) the concerns of all participants involved will be considered in the decision-making process; and (4) the rule-writers and decision-makers will seek out and facilitate the involvement of those potentially affected.”ⁱⁱⁱ

The CAC will utilize the 17 Principles of Environmental Justice and Jemez Principles for Democratic Organization, which are both available on the Air District website and hereinafter incorporated by reference in Appendix A.

Mission Statement



The Community Advisory Council believes in protecting the fundamental right to clean air for all communities. We aim to provide access to meaningful community engagement and bring community priorities into focus at the Air District. We are committed to democratic decision-making and achieving equitable solutions to the impacts of air pollution and the polluting economy. We prioritize solutions that can be applied to more than one community. We are dedicated to eliminating these threats both upstream and downstream, standing in solidarity, sharing power and resources, and listening to and amplifying voices from communities that are the most impacted and overburdened communities.

Goals

The goals of the CAC are as follows:

- Provide representation on behalf of overburdened communities to the Air District Board of Directors.
- CAC serves as a liaison between the community and the Air District Board of Directors and Air District Staff in influencing Air District Board of Directors' decisions, policies, and procedures, as well as processes to ensure equity, inclusion, civil rights, and environmental justice.

Guiding Principles

CAC Members will provide independent and objective advice and commit to the following principles:

1. Laying a solid foundation for successful, future CAC Members and ensuring long-term sustainability of the CAC's commitment to Environmental Justice (EJ).
2. Elevating voices and advocating for communities who are not currently being represented or heard.
3. Building a deep, authentic, and mutually accountable relationship within CAC Members.
4. Helping CAC Members value, actualize, and institutionalize EJ principles throughout all CAC practices.
5. Being recognized as partners in the fight to define how we mitigate the impacts of climate change and air pollution exposure to reduce health risks and inequities associated with poor air quality.
6. Using influence, expertise, and privilege to protect our communities.
7. Identifying missing gaps with underrepresented, community-led decision-making, and avenues for well-compensated opportunities for Black, Indigenous, People of Color (BIPOC).
8. Striving to include cultural competence.
9. Acknowledging that one methodology does not address all communities and seeking to address the conditions in each community as needed. Utilizing and applying resources and tools based on those differences.
10. Maintaining impartiality, fairness, and respect for all CAC members and the communities we represent.

[INSERT CIVILITY LANGUAGE HERE]

CAC Leadership

In 2022, the CAC approved a three Co-Chair model. The leadership model may be amended based on the need expressed by the CAC.

Duties of Leadership

- The CAC Co-Chairs shall preside over Bi-monthly meetings of the CAC in rotation.

- In the event the Co-Chair scheduled to preside over the meeting is absent or unable to perform their duties, the next Co-Chair scheduled to preside next shall preside over the meeting and perform all Chair duties.
- Presiding over a meeting requires a Co-Chair to open, manage, and adjourn meetings, and to adjust the set order of speakers in collaboration with the Facilitator and Air District Staff.
- CAC Leadership shall oversee the preparation and distribution of the agenda and materials for the CAC meetings.
- CAC Leadership shall work with Air District Staff and the CAC meeting Facilitator to plan, structure, and coordinate CAC meetings.
- CAC Leadership shall attend and provide updates to the Air District Board of Directors (as needed and/or requested) and interact with the Air District Board of Directors in representation of overburdened communities within the 9 Bay Area Counties, and on behalf of the CAC Members.
- CAC Leadership shall oversee activities of the Ad Hoc Committees.
- CAC Leadership shall perform all other necessary or incidental duties as prescribed by the CAC Charter.
- The Co-Chairs shall communicate with each other, divide work, and share information/updates in a timely manner.
- CAC Leadership shall address conflict within the CAC membership and leadership.
- CAC Leadership shall ensure CAC decisions are made in a democratic, equitable, and timely manner.
- CAC Leadership shall represent the CAC at the Budget Committee and provide feedback on the Air District's budget.
- CAC Leadership shall work with Air District Staff to define and oversee the CAC's budget annually.
- CAC Leadership shall understand and adhere to the Brown Act and Robert's Rules of Order.

Leadership (Co-Chairs) Terms of Office

Leadership shall hold office for two (2) years. When more than two (2) Co-Chairs are selected, the terms of office shall be staggered as set forth below.

Terms of Leadership

Two (2) Co-Chairs are appointed for two (2) years in the inaugural term, and one (1) Co-Chair is appointed for one year. In the event that we have three (3) Co-Chairs, names will be randomly chosen to determine which position is in the inaugural term of

two (2) years and which will last one (1) year. The names will be randomly chosen by Air District Staff.

Leadership is appointed for a two (2)-year term and no member may serve for more than two, 2-year terms consecutively.

Election of Leadership (Co-Chairs)

The inaugural leadership was elected at the 2nd meeting of the CAC. Future leadership will be elected based on the staggered terms described above.

If any Leadership position becomes vacant, that position must be filled within two meetings after the vacancy occurs. The Leadership position shall be filled through a nomination, selection, and voting process. The process will be as follows:

- Members seeking a vacant leadership position shall submit an essay which provides a summary of their background and outlines the reasons they seek the position. The full CAC shall be presented with the essays 72 hours in advance to review them prior to the meeting in which the CAC will vote on each prospective candidate. The candidate receiving the majority of the votes will be selected to fill the vacant Leadership position.

CAC Members

Composition of the CAC

The Membership of the CAC (including Co-Chairs) shall be composed of seventeen (17) members from overburdened communities, as follows:

- Four (4) Alameda County
- Four (4) Contra Costa
- One (1) San Francisco County
- One (1) San Mateo County
- Two (2) Santa Clara County
- One (1) Solano County
- Two (2) At-Large
- Two (2) Youth

Duties of Members

CAC members shall fully participate in bi-monthly meetings and be fully engaged during discussion. The CAC members shall also review materials prior to meetings and come prepared for engaged discussion, active listening, and respectful dialogue. Meeting

preparation includes attending required trainings defined below and other trainings as planned by the Co-Chairs or suggested by the CAC. Further, CAC members shall perform all other duties as prescribed by this Charter.

Mandatory Annual Trainings

CAC Members and Leadership shall attend and participate in three (3) mandatory trainings annually as follows:

- Brown Act Training: The Brown Act is California's open meetings law for local public agencies and their subordinate bodies. It guarantees the public a right to attend, participate and discuss in meetings of local legislative bodies.
- Robert's Rules of Order Training: Robert's Rules, which is also widely known as parliamentary procedure, was developed to ensure that meetings are fair, efficient, democratic, and orderly.
- Civility Training: Civility is an essential aspect of every work environment to create and maintain a fair and professional culture. This Civility training is designed to teach CAC Members the norms of acceptable conduct and how to identify, prevent, and respond professionally to situations of incivility.

Additionally, all members of the CAC shall complete an Ethics Training course within the first year of their term on the CAC and are required to have follow-up training bi-annually.

Virtual, Hybrid, and In-Person Meetings

During 2022, the CAC attended meetings virtually. As of March 2023, the CAC meetings will need a physical location within the Bay Area with an in-person quorum (9 out of 17 members). CAC members may attend remotely under specific circumstances outlined in the Brown Act and AB2449.

CAC Members and members of the public with disabilities that need accommodations consistent with Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act to have equal opportunities to participate in the CAC's meetings should contact Air District staff.

Reimbursements for travel are outlined in the CAC's Compensation Policy and Procedures.

Members Terms of Office

CAC Members shall hold office for up to four (4) years. At the two-year mark, nine (9) Members shall be allowed to opt-out of the CAC. This will ensure others have the opportunity to participate in the CAC and continuity of County or institutional knowledge. When less than nine CAC Members opt-out at the two-year mark, CAC members will ask Staff to report on CAC Member attendance in CAC and Committee Meetings. The nine CAC members with the worst track record of attendance will vacate their seats.

Appointment of Members

The CAC Members are appointed by the Board of Directors. Vacancies are to be filled by the Board of Directors as described in the following process. The CAC shall create a CAC Selection Ad Hoc Committee to recommend a candidate or slate of candidates to the Committee on Equity, Health, and Justice (CEHJ). The candidate approved by the CEHJ Committee would be routed to the Board of Directors for final approval. The CAC Selection Ad Hoc Committee would be tasked with developing criteria for the selection of the candidate. Priority should be given to individuals from communities overburdened by air pollution, environmental justice communities in the Bay Area, and/or those with a history partnering with environmental justice communities.

Standing Committee and Ad Hoc Committee

Upon approval by a majority of the members of the CAC, the CAC may form committees to advise the CAC on its on-going functions. The committees shall be composed of members of the CAC. Committee members shall vote on its leadership during the first meeting.

Standing Committee

A standing committee is considered a legislative body and subject to the Brown Act requirements and requires staffing support, funding permitting. A committee is considered “standing” if, irrespective of its composition, it has a continuing subject matter jurisdiction, or a meeting schedule fixed by charter, ordinance, resolution or formal action of a legislative body.

Ad Hoc Committee

An Ad Hoc committee is an advisory committee which is composed of less than a quorum of the legislative body, will serve a limited or single purpose, and will be dissolved once the task is completed. Once the mission is accomplished and presented

to and approved by a quorum of the CAC membership, the Ad Hoc Committee will be dissolved. The Ad Hoc Committees will aim to complete their task(s) within 6 months.

Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee

The CAC will form a CAC Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee to set the CAC's work plan and schedule for the year or several years. The CAC Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee will identify several priority areas in which it desires adherence and establish appropriate criteria. CAC Members, Community Members, Air District Staff and the Air District Board will be given the opportunity to recommend agenda items of potential relevance to the CAC for inclusion in the work plan. Once dissolved, CAC Co-Chairs are responsible for implementing the work plan and reserve the right to amend the Work Plan as needed. The Co-Chairs will report to the CAC if the Work Plan needs to be drastically adjusted.

Governance Ad Hoc Committee

In 2022, the CAC formed a CAC Governance Ad Hoc Committee to develop the CAC's Governance agreement. The CAC hereby presents the CAC's Charter which sets forth the Mission, Goals, scope, rules and actions applicable to the CAC and the CAC Membership. Once the mission is accomplished and presented to and adopted by a quorum of the CAC membership, and approved by the Board of Directors, the Governance Ad Hoc Committee will be dissolved.

The CAC Governance Ad Hoc Committee may be reestablished with a new slate of Council Members to review, revise, and/or propose amendments. Any revisions to the existing Charter shall be presented and adopted by the CAC and approved by the Air District Board of Directors.

Community Engagement

The CAC will aim to engage the community in the following ways:

- Bi-annual newsletter which should include items that have been addressed, future meeting dates and agendas, success stories, and ways to engage with the CAC (ex. attend C&E meetings, CAC meetings, website).
- CAC Web Page.
- Meetings of the CAC.
- Periodic outreach events hosted by CAC members or the Air District.
- Bi-monthly community-engaged enforcement meetings and other workshops.

Meetings

Facilitation of Meetings

An external professional meeting Facilitator will be hired to assist the CAC with bi-monthly CAC meetings, unless the budget does not allow for this expense. For 2022-2023, the Facilitator was hired through a competitive process with participation from CAC members. The external Facilitator works directly with the CAC Leadership to plan and execute the meeting plan in consultation with Air District Staff. The Facilitator will facilitate meetings to keep the meetings on track with guidance from the CAC Leadership and will enforce the following meeting expectations and ground rules:

- **Preparation:** *Please come prepared to meetings and review all documents that the CAC will discuss.*
- **Communication and Language:** *Communicate with respect, personal attacks will not be tolerated. Be mindful of how much space you're taking and of those who haven't spoken. Remember zoom meetings are part of the public record.*
- **Distractions:** *Avoid distractions and stay present. Active listening is imperative to ensure that we understand other people's viewpoints.*
- **Timing:** *Respect time agreements and stay on topic.*
- **Facilitation:** *The facilitator will intervene to keep the conversation on track and on time and will remind members of these ground rules as necessary.*

The Facilitator will have limited authority to: Open the meetings, convey the agenda item(s), confirm the meeting has quorum of Members present after the Clerk takes roll call, facilitate the flow of the meeting in accordance with the Brown Act rules and Robert's Rules of Order, maintain order, and defer to the Air District Legal Representative or Staff (if needed).

Air District Staff facilitate Ad Hoc committee meetings, Co-Chair meetings, and other meetings as needed. The CAC, Staff, or the Co-Chairs may identify the need for facilitator or contractor support for any CAC meeting, as the budget allows.

Regular Meetings

In 2022, regular meetings of the CAC are held on the 3rd Thursday of every other month at 6:00 p.m. All meetings will be held in accordance with the Brown Act. Meeting schedule is subject to change, as necessary.

Special Meetings

A majority of the Co-Chairs or a majority of the Members of the CAC may call special meetings following the noticing guidelines set forth in the Brown Act.

Notice of Meetings

The agendas and notices must be posted at the meeting site and the website in compliance with all applicable laws, including but not limited to the Ralph M. Brown Act (Government Code Section 54950 et. seq.).

Agendas and notices shall be emailed to each CAC Member and any person who files a written request for such notice with the Air District.

Adjournment or Cancellation of Meetings

The presiding Co-Chair or Air District staff may adjourn or cancel a meeting if she or he is aware that a quorum of the body will not be present or if the meeting date conflicts with a holiday. Notices of adjournment or cancellation shall be emailed to the CAC and posted on the meeting site and [website](#).

Quorum Requirements

Effective March 1, 2023, at least 50% plus one of the CAC's appointed Membership must be present in-person to constitute a quorum and vote on issues. The CAC can hold discussions in the absence of a quorum, but cannot vote.

Action at a Meeting; Quorum and Required Vote

The presence of a majority of the members (nine members in 2022-2023) of the CAC shall constitute a quorum for all purposes. The affirmative vote of a majority of the members of the CAC shall be required for the approval of all substantive matters. Procedural motions require an affirmative vote of a majority of the members present (five out of nine votes in 2022-2023). If a quorum is not present, no official action may be taken, except roll call and adjournment. Agenda items that require no acting can still occur without quorum.

Voting and Abstention

CAC meetings will be conducted in compliance with the Brown Act (Government Code Section 54950 et. seq.), Robert's Rules of Order, CAC Charter, and state and local laws. Participation and voting is based on Brown Act requirements and current legislation. Staff will provide an updated summary of changes as required by law.

Conduct of Meetings

(a) All meetings shall be governed by the Ralph M. Brown Act (Government Code Section 54950 et. seq.), the CAC Charter, and Robert's Rules of Order for decorum and parliamentary procedure.

(b) Cell phones shall be turned off during all CAC meetings. The Co-Chairs may issue a warning to any member of the public who is disruptive during CAC meetings. In the event of repeated disruption of any kind, the Co-Chairs shall direct the offending member of the public to leave the meeting.

(c) The Chat feature will be unavailable for the full duration of every meeting due to accessibility limitations.

Agenda Items



Public Comment on Agenda Items: The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the CAC. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the CAC. Members of the public who are speaking through an interpreter, will have six minutes each to address the CAC. No speaker who has already spoken on an item will be entitled to speak to that item again.

Setting Agendas

Air District staff, at the direction of the CAC Leadership, will prepare and distribute the agenda and materials for CAC meetings.

Current Agenda Setting Process

Council Member proposes agenda item during a CAC meeting or via an email to Staff.

1. Staff keep track of all the proposed agenda items requests and brings the requests to the Co-Chairs.
2. Co-Chairs approve the items for the upcoming agenda.
3. Staff identify presenters and draft presentation and memo (materials).
4. Staff work with the Council Member(s) who requested the agenda item to create materials.
5. Staff finalizes materials.
6. Staff sends materials to Co-Chairs and Council Member(s) that requested the agenda item for final approval.
7. Staff update materials with final edits.

8. Executive Staff reviews materials.
9. Executive Staff provides edits, if needed. Staff update materials as necessary.
10. Executive Staff routes the materials for public distribution.

The Co-Chairs and Staff will work from the Work Plan developed by the Work Plan Ad Hoc once adopted by the CAC membership. New topics not included in the Work Plan may be added by the Co-Chairs. CAC Members or the public can make requests for new topics not included in the Work Plan. The Public can make requests for agenda items at CAC meetings during the Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items or by emailing staff at communityadvisorycouncil@baaqmd.gov.

Conflict of Interest Policy

Conflict-of-interest laws prohibit CAC members or immediate family from benefiting financially from their relationship to the Air District by way of the CAC. Any member or immediate family members of Council Members who could benefit financially from a contract must recuse themselves and not be present during a vote related to such contract to avoid influencing other CAC members.

Conflict Resolution

In the event a disagreement between CAC Members or between CAC Members and Air District staff regarding CAC matters arises, CAC Members agree to work in a collaborative fashion and to strive for consensus on the issues before the CAC. If consensus cannot be reached between CAC Members, Members agree to use staff for mediation, clarification of information, and the Air District Legal Representative to attempt to reach an expeditious and constructive resolution of disagreements. If agreement cannot be reached with staff or CAC Members, a mutually agreed upon third party mediator should be utilized to resolve the conflict.

Further, the CAC Members agree to postpone the Action or Agenda item of discussion until the next meeting, or within three-months from the date the issue arises to allow for a mediator to help resolve the issue. In the event of an impasse, the Co-Chairs shall work with the members in conflict and the mediator to prepare for the meeting. If during the meeting the mediator cannot help the CAC reach an agreement, then the Action or Agenda item in question will not proceed. In any event, individual Members cannot be compelled to participate in any action to which they do not agree. Individual Members may also abstain from participation in a decision when they believe it would be inappropriate for them to participate in that action or decision.

Meeting Minutes

Minutes shall be taken at every regular and special CAC meeting and shall comply with all applicable laws, including but not limited to the Ralph M. Brown Act (Government Code Section 54950 et. seq.) and the CAC Charter. Minutes shall be approved by the majority vote of the CAC Members in coordination with applicable statutes.

Land Acknowledgement

The CAC recognizes that California Native American and other communities have faced many environmental injustices and social inequities. These issues are hereby acknowledged as part of the CAC Charter. The CAC Land Acknowledgement will be included in all CAC meeting agendas and is available on the [CAC Webpage](#).

We begin by acknowledging that this land is unceded Indigenous land. The territories, or counties we represent, are of the Indigenous people. To acknowledge this history of our country - that this nation was built on genocide, the exclusion and erasure of Indigenous people - grounds our work in truth. We also acknowledge that our modern global economy was founded on the free and forced labor of enslaved Black people. And that exploited labor continuously perpetuates itself in disadvantaged communities of color, as we see in the treatment of farm workers, immigrant workers, prison labor, and domestic workers. This practice of land acknowledgment calls on us to recognize our violent history that is the foundation of white supremacy, and to recognize the longstanding and ongoing resistance of People of Color to dehumanization, repression, and homicide. And that the brilliance and leadership of People of Color in resistance, vision, wisdom, and love be honored and recognized as we work to dismantle ongoing legacies of settler colonialism and anti-blackness.

The Air District webpage for the CAC will be updated in preparation for each CAC Committee meeting with uploaded material for discussion and after each CAC Committee meeting, to include meeting summaries, presentations, background materials, requested information, and meeting recordings.

Dissemination of Materials

All documents, materials, and correspondence produced by or submitted to the CAC, CAC staff, or Facilitator, is considered public records and subject to the California Public Records Act regulations and procedures for disclosure and transparency. Information related to the operations of the CAC are made available to the public as requested.

Public Meetings

All CAC meetings will be noticed and open to the public in accordance with the Brown Act.

Attendance

The CAC requires active participation and attendance of at least 75% of all meetings during every year served. This applies to Co-Chair Meetings, Committee Meetings and overall CAC meeting attendance. CAC members will need to inform staff and CAC Leadership of any potential absences. As of March 1, 2023, per AB 2449 teleconferencing requirements, members joining remotely at CAC meetings that require a quorum must have a “just cause” or an emergency excuse approved by a majority of the CAC in order to participate and vote. CAC members joining CAC meetings remotely without a just cause or approved emergency excuse will not be able to vote and therefore will not be counted present in the meeting.

Absenteeism: CAC Meetings

CAC members are allowed to miss three (3) meetings in one calendar year. Continued absenteeism from CAC Meetings constitutes voluntary abandonment. After two (2) CAC meetings have been missed, staff will send a courtesy letter reminding the absentee member of the attendance requirements of the CAC and reminding them they are at risk of losing their seat. Staff will be responsible for informing the Co-Chairs of absentee members. Staff will inform a member that has lost their seat on the CAC after three meetings are missed. The CAC shall vote to confirm removal of an absentee member. Vacant seats of the CAC membership will be filled as described in the Appointment section above.

Absenteeism: Co-Chair Meetings

Co-Chair meetings occur every week up to four hours per month.

Co-Chairs are allowed to miss three (3) meetings every two (2) consecutive months. Continued absenteeism from Co-Chair Meetings constitutes voluntary abandonment. After two (2) Co-Chair meetings have been missed, staff will send a courtesy letter reminding the absentee Co-Chair of the attendance requirements of the Co-Chairs and reminding them they are at risk of losing their seat. Staff will be responsible for informing the Co-Chairs and the CAC of absentee Co-Chairs. Staff will inform a Co-Chair that has lost their seat on the CAC after three (3) meetings are missed within a

two (2) month period. The Co-Chairs reserve the right to jointly adjust the meeting schedule around holidays.

Any vacant Co-Chair Appointment shall be filled within two (2) meetings of the CAC after the vacancy occurs through a nomination, selection process, and selection by a voting process.

Absenteeism: Ad Hoc Committee Meetings

Ad Hoc Committee meetings generally occur every other week (bi-weekly). Each Committee sets its own schedule.

Ad Hoc Committee Members are allowed to miss three (3) meetings every two (2) consecutive months. Continued absenteeism from Ad Hoc Meetings constitutes voluntary abandonment. After two (2) Ad Hoc meetings have been missed, staff will send a courtesy letter reminding the absentee Ad Hoc Member of the attendance requirements of the Ad Hoc Members and reminding them they are at risk of losing their seat. Staff will be responsible for informing the Council Members and the CAC of absentee Members. Staff will inform Council Members that have lost their seat on the CAC after three (3) meetings are missed. The Co-Chairs reserve the right to jointly adjust the schedule around holidays.

Any vacant seats shall be filled within two (2) meetings after the vacancy occurs through a nomination, selection process, and selection by a voting process.

Amendment of CAC Governance Document

Amendment of the CAC Charter may be initiated by a vote of a majority of the members of the CAC after presentation of the reasoning to amend the Charter. The CAC shall provide thirty (30) days notice for public comment before adopting any amendments to the CAC Charter.

Compensation

Compensation for CAC Members will be subject to attendance and in accordance with the CAC's Compensation Policy and Procedures.

Appendix A

Delegates to the First National People of Color Environmental Leadership Summit held on October 24-27, 1991, in Washington DC, drafted and adopted these 17 principles of Environmental Justice. Since then, the Principles have served as a defining document for the growing grassroots movement for environmental justice. Environmental Justice Principles¹:

- 1) **Environmental Justice** affirms the sacredness of Mother Earth, ecological unity and the interdependence of all species, and the right to be free from ecological destruction.
- 2) **Environmental Justice** demands that public policy be based on mutual respect and justice for all peoples, free from any form of discrimination or bias.
- 3) **Environmental Justice** mandates the right to ethical, balanced and responsible uses of land and renewable resources in the interest of a sustainable planet for humans and other living things.
- 4) **Environmental Justice** calls for universal protection from nuclear testing, extraction, production and disposal of toxic/hazardous wastes and poisons and nuclear testing that threaten the fundamental right to clean air, land, water, and food.
- 5) **Environmental Justice** affirms the fundamental right to political, economic, cultural and environmental self-determination of all peoples.
- 6) **Environmental Justice** demands the cessation of the production of all toxins, hazardous wastes, and radioactive materials, and that all past and current producers be held strictly accountable to the people for detoxification and the containment at the point of production.
- 7) **Environmental Justice** demands the right to participate as equal partners at every level of decision-making, including needs assessment, planning, implementation, enforcement and evaluation.
- 8) **Environmental Justice** affirms the right of all workers to a safe and healthy work environment without being forced to choose between an unsafe livelihood and unemployment. It also affirms the right of those who work at home to be free from environmental hazards.
- 9) **Environmental Justice** protects the right of victims of environmental injustice to receive full compensation and reparations for damages as well as quality health care.
- 10) **Environmental Justice** considers governmental acts of environmental injustice a violation of international law, the Universal Declaration On Human Rights, and the United Nations Convention on Genocide.
- 11) **Environmental Justice** must recognize a special legal and natural relationship of Native Peoples to the U.S. government through treaties, agreements, compacts, and covenants affirming sovereignty and self-determination.
- 12) **Environmental Justice** affirms the need for urban and rural ecological policies to clean up and rebuild our cities and rural areas in balance with nature, honoring the cultural integrity of all our communities, and provided fair access for all to the full range of resources.

¹ Principles of Environmental Justice, <https://www.ejnet.org/ej/principles.html>. Accessed December 19, 2022.

13) **Environmental Justice** calls for the strict enforcement of principles of informed consent, and a halt to the testing of experimental reproductive and medical procedures and vaccinations on people of color.

14) **Environmental Justice** opposes the destructive operations of multinational corporations.

15) **Environmental Justice** opposes military occupation, repression and exploitation of lands, peoples and cultures, and other life forms.

16) **Environmental Justice** calls for the education of present and future generations which emphasizes social and environmental issues, based on our experience and an appreciation of our diverse cultural perspectives.

17) **Environmental Justice** requires that we, as individuals, make personal and consumer choices to consume as little of Mother Earth's resources and to produce as little waste as possible; and make the conscious decision to challenge and reprioritize our lifestyles to ensure the health of the natural world for present and future generations.

Jemez Principles²:

1. Be Inclusive
2. Emphasis on Bottom-Up Organizing
3. Let People Speak for Themselves
4. Work Together In Solidarity and Mutuality
5. Build Just Relationships Among Ourselves
6. Commitment to Self-Transformation

² Sierra Club. *Jemez Principles*. <https://www.sierraclub.org/sites/www.sierraclub.org/files/sce/grand-canyon-chapter/misc-pdf/Jemez%20Principles%20Poster.pdf>. Accessed December 19, 2022.

Appendix B

References

^{i i} United States Environmental Protection Agency. *Guidance on Considering Environmental Justice During the Development of Regulatory Actions*.

<https://19january2021snapshot.epa.gov/sites/static/files/2015-06/documents/considering-ej-in-rulemaking-guide-final.pdf>. Accessed January 3, 2023.

ⁱⁱ Bay Area Air Quality Management District, *Regulation 2, Permits Rule 1, Section 2-1-243*.

ⁱⁱⁱ United States Environmental Protection Agency. *Guidance on Considering Environmental Justice During the Development of Regulatory Actions*.

<https://19january2021snapshot.epa.gov/sites/static/files/2015-06/documents/considering-ej-in-rulemaking-guide-final.pdf>. Accessed January 3, 2023.

The CAC Charter was developed using information from various sources, including:

California Air Resources Board. *Partnering Agreement-West Oakland Toxic Reduction Collaborative*. (2018, February 14). https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2020-04/collaborative_partnering_agreement_west_oakland_acc.pdf. Accessed January 3, 2023.

City and County of San Francisco: *Power Plan Task Force By Laws*. https://sfgov.org/sfc/pppcatf/index_162_2134.html?page=162. Accessed January 3, 2023

Metropolitan Transportation Commission. *Metropolitan Transportation Commission Resolution No. 3931*. (2009, November 18). https://mtc.ca.gov/sites/default/files/documents/2022-01/RES-3931_approved.pdf. Accessed January 3, 2023.

Partnering Agreement-West Oakland Toxic Reduction Collaborative “Collaboration on Call.”

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission. *Environmental Justice Advisors Charter*. <https://bcddc.ca.gov/ejwg/environmental-justice-advisors-charter.html>. Accessed January 3, 2023

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission. *San Francisco Bay Plan*. https://www.bcdcc.ca.gov/plans/sfbay_plan.html. Accessed January 3, 2023

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District. *The Path to Clean Air in the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Area Community Steering Committee Charter and Participation Agreement*. <https://www.baaqmd.gov/~/media/files/ab617-community-health/richmond/ptca-charter-agreement-pdf.pdf?la=en>. Accessed January 3, 2023.