

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, California 94105  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Community Advisory Council  
Thursday November 17, 2022

**This meeting was conducted pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361 (Rivas 2021). Members of the Council participated by teleconference.**

### **1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

Randolph Belle of Randolph Belle, Artist (RBA) Creative, called the meeting to order at 6:02 p.m.

Present: Council Co-Chairpersons Ms. Margaret Gordon, Kevin John Jefferson, and Latasha Washington; and Council Members Fernando Campos, William Goodwin, Arieann Harrison, Joy Massey, Cecilia Mejia, Hana Mendoza, Rio Molina, Mayra Pelagio, Charles Reed, Dr. Jeff Ritterman, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Violet Saena, and Ken Szutu.

Absent: Council Member Dr. Juan Aguilera.

### **2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE**

The Public Meeting Procedure video was played.

## **CONSENT CALENDAR**

### **3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 8, 2022**

None of the Council Members requested edits to the Meeting Minutes of September 8, 2022.

#### Public Comments

No requests received.

#### Council Comments

None.

#### Council Action

Co-Chair Washington made a motion, seconded by Co-Chair Jefferson to **approve** the Meeting Minutes of September 8, 2022, and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Campos, Jefferson, Massey, Mejia, Mendoza, Molina, Pelagio, Reed, Ritterman, Saena, Szutu, Washington.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: Goodwin.  
ABSENT: Aguilera, Gordon, Harrison, Ruano Hernandez.

Motion Approved

## **PRESENTATION**

### **4. COMMUNITY-FOCUSED AIR MONITORING AND DATA ASSESSMENTS: ACLIMA, LONG-TERM MONITORING, MOBILE MONITORING, AND SENSOR NETWORKS**

Dr. Kate Hoag, Assistant Manager of the Air District's Meteorology and Measurement Division, gave the staff presentation *Community-Focused Air Monitoring and Data Assessments: Aclima, Long-Term Monitoring, Mobile Monitoring, and Sensor Networks*, including: outcomes; outline; presentation for information only; recap – air pollution; why do ambient air monitoring?; examples of air monitoring methods; tailoring a monitoring plan for community conditions; Monitoring Example #1 – Aclima mobile monitoring; Aclima annual air pollution maps; Monitoring Example #2 – community air quality sensor networks; Monitoring Example #3 – source oriented mobile monitoring; other monitoring approaches; tailored local-scale monitoring plans developed with community members; using existing monitoring data; and questions.

NOTED PRESENT: Council Member Ruano Hernandez was noted present at 6:02 p.m.

The Air District requested guidance from the Council on the Air District's Draft Plan to conduct local-scale monitoring data analyses for overburdened communities, using the following prompts:

- A. How do you want to use air monitoring data for your work?
- B. How can the Air District help make existing monitoring data easier to understand and use?
- C. How should we engage with the CAC and each community on monitoring data analyses or draft reports?

### **Public Comments**

Public comments were given by Floy Andrews, Richmond resident.

NOTED PRESENT: Co-Chair Ms. Margaret Gordon was noted present at 7:16 p.m.

### **Council Comments**

The Council and staff discussed the request for the Notices of Violation that have been issued; Air District mobile testing (van) capabilities, whether the vans that are conducting the mobile testing compare the air quality of overburdened communities with that of non-overburdened communities, and whether Aclima is monitoring the same pollutants and/or showing different readings than the Air District; a Council Member's perception that the Air District is hesitant to perpetuate the data collected by Aclima; the public's desire for real-time air quality data; the suggestion of making available to the public a sensor application for smartphones that monitors indoor and yard air quality; whether the

residents of overburdened communities that are monitored have access to/are being trained to process the data, and whether this can be incentivized with stipends; the suggestion that the Air District makes regular appearances on local news stations to tell the public about air monitoring efforts; whether the Air District is partnering with existing workforce programs to engage youth in their communities; whether the Air District has jurisdiction over radiological pollution/radioactive contamination; a request for the status of a specific gasoline dispensing facility in Richmond that was supposed to be removed; whether the Air District would consider utilizing autonomous drones for air monitoring; whether communities that are identified by the Air District as “overburdened” can receive funding to reverse the health impacts there; the desire of the Council to take action on this item, versus receive an update on monitoring efforts; a request for an ambient air monitoring reference guide tailored to San Francisco; the development of the Air District’s Clean Air Center Program; and the suggestion that the Air District builds partnerships with other sectors, especially non-profit organizations and junior/community colleges.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

**THE COUNCIL RECESSED AT 7:23 P.M., AND RESUMED AT 7:27 P.M.**

#### ACTION ITEM

##### **5. IDEAS FOR COMMUNITY ENGAGED INCIDENT RESPONSE AND ENFORCEMENT**

Council Member Ken Szutu had requested Air District staff to proactively involve community residents to collaborate and enhance enforcement activities in impacted communities in a concept he calls “Community Engaged Enforcement (CEE).” This presentation featured ideas on how to engage the community in enhancing monitoring and enforcement work.

Council Member Ken Szutu, Dr. Hoag, and Compliance & Enforcement Manager Tracy Lee, gave the joint presentation *Ideas for Community Engaged Incident Response and Enforcement*, including: framing by Council Member Szutu; Part 1: Discuss Suggestions from Council Member Szutu – outcomes; outline; Part 2: Begin Council Discussions Regarding Incident Monitoring – outline; definition of “incident”; Air District’s role during incidents; discussion with Board of Directors (proposed goals and phases); which types of incidents are you most concerned about; what questions and goals do you have related to incidents; Part 3: Begin Council discussions on the idea of “Community Engaged Enforcement” to utilize community help to enhance enforcement in specific areas and sources of concern - outline; requested action; bi-monthly community meetings; and “Community Engaged Enforcement.”

#### Public Comments

No requests received.

#### Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the desire to see residents of overburdened communities educated, empowered, and employed; whether workforce or certification program components exist for members

of the public who wish to engage in reporting incidents/sources of concern in their neighborhoods; the suggestion that the Air District reaches out to high school environmental classes, and the need to brainstorm additional ways to bring young people's voices into CEE meetings; whether qualitative or quantitative data would be collected; the suggestion that the Air District obtains baseline data regarding which communities have been making complaints and the results of any subsequent investigations before attempting to implement CEE; concerns about Air District Compliance & Enforcement staff's community engagement skills; the request that the bi-monthly community meetings not be held during business hours; the public's desire to know what are the levels of the toxins in their community, and what levels are unhealthy; who would be participating in the CEE meetings, and whether the Council Members' presence would be required; the importance of respecting the community and providing time for people to digest the shared information and prepare their feedback; reasons why people do not report incidents; and the suggestion of prioritizing communities in which the most complaints occur (for CEE meetings).

### Council Action

Council Member Ruano Hernandez made a motion, seconded by Council Member Goodwin, to **endorse** the following motion:

- **Endorse** the Air District's Compliance and Enforcement Division's scheduling of bi-monthly community meetings;
- **Request** baseline complaint data from 2018 to present day, noting who is making those calls and which communities are most frequently identified;
- **Request** that a system be implemented to publicly report outcomes and resolutions of complaints; and
- **Request** that Compliance and Enforcement staff be trained to engage the public and build capacity in a given community.

The motion **carried** by the following vote of the Council:

AYES:	Campos, Goodwin, Gordon, Harrison, Jefferson, Massey, Mejia, Mendoza, Molina, Pelagio, Reed, Ritterman, Ruano Hernandez, Szutu, Washington.
NOES:	None.
ABSTAIN:	None.
ABSENT:	Aguilera, Saena.

Motion Approved

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

### **6. WORK PLAN AD HOC COMMITTEE UPDATE**

Council Member Szutu, Chair of the Council's Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee, gave an update on the Work Plan Ad Hoc Committee's activities since it first met on August 19, 2022:

- This ad hoc committee's leadership structure consists of a Vice Chair (Council Member Goodwin) and a Chair (Council Member Szutu). Meetings are held bi-weekly.
- The focus of this ad hoc committee is to select and prioritize Community Advisory Council agenda items that are requested/submitted by Council Members and members of the public.

- Members of this ad hoc committee recall their experiences as members of the public providing public comment at Air District Board and committee meetings, and hope to address concerns regarding: the way in which agendas are created, the development of memos and reports pertaining to agenda items, the publishing schedules of agenda packets, the amount of time that the public are allowed to speak, and regular status reports from Air District staff regarding presented programs and projects that take years to implement.
- Council Members and members of the public are encouraged to submit their requests/suggestions (regarding the Community Advisory Council agenda-setting process or actual agenda items) to Air District Community Engagement staff by November 30, 2022.

#### Public Comments

No requests received.

#### Council Comments

None.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

### **7. GOVERNANCE AD HOC COMMITTEE UPDATE**

Council Member Goodwin, Chair of the Council's Governance Ad Hoc Committee, gave an update on the Governance Ad Hoc Committee's recent activities since it first met on August 31, 2022:

- This ad hoc committee's leadership structure consists of two co-leads (Council Member Reed and Co-Chair Ms. Margaret Gordon.) Meetings are held bi-weekly.
- The Community Advisory Council's charter has been drafted by this ad hoc committee and edits are to be completed by early 2023.

#### Public Comments

No requests received.

#### Council Comments

None.

#### Council Action

None; receive and file.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

### **8. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER / AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER (APCO)**

Interim Executive Officer/APCO, Sharon L. Landers, gave the following updates:

- The Air District partnered with Communities for a Better Environment to create a community-based Steering Committee to develop the East Oakland Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP). The Committee's first meeting was held on September 15, 2022, and the next will be held on December 8, 2022. This body is not subject to the Ralph M. Brown Act.
- On November 2, 2022, the Board ratified the selection of the community of Bayview Hunters Point for the development of a CERP, pursuant to AB 617. The California Air Resources Board will vote on the Air District's Board's recommendation on February 22, 2023. This would be the 4<sup>th</sup> CERP in the Bay Area.
- New members elected to California Legislature will be sworn in on Dec 5, 2022, and Air District staff is preparing for the upcoming Legislative Session, beginning Jan 2023.
- No Spare the Air alerts have been issued between September 8 and November 17, 2022.
- Regarding recruitment for the new Executive Officer/APCO, the Council's participation in the interview process (on November 9) was appreciated. Air District staff anticipates that the Board will make an offer for the position by December 21, 2022.

#### **Public Comments**

No requests received.

#### **Council Comments**

The Council and staff discussed the Council's appreciation for being involved in the Executive Officer/APCO recruitment process; whether the Air District has jurisdiction over radiological pollution/radioactive contamination; and appreciation for community participation in the development of the Community Advisory Council agendas.

### **9. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

No requests received.

### **10. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Co-Chair Jefferson announced that the Co-Chairs are planning to hold a training for Council Members, regarding grant and funding opportunities, specific to CAC matters.

Council Member Ruano Hernandez, who also serves as a member of the Air District's Richmond Area Community Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee, reported that one of his fellow Steering Committee members had circulated several letters of concern, and requested that those letters be shared with the Council, Air District Community Engagement staff, and added to the public record. Suma

Peesapati, Air District Environmental Justice and Community Engagement Officer, responded that Air District management has spoken to the writer of the letters.

Council Member Reed requested that engagement of youth in Air District programs be agendaized at future Council meetings.

Co-Chair Ms. Margaret Gordon requested a presentation explaining ways in which the Air District already engages with youth, to avoid duplicative efforts.

#### **11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the end of the meeting, the next Council was to be scheduled at the Call of the Co-Chairs. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Thursday, January 19, 2023, at 6:00 p.m., via webcast, teleconference, or Zoom, pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361 (Rivas 2021.)

#### **12. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 9:01 p.m.

*/s/ Marcy Hiratzka*

Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards