

BOARD OF DIRECTORS EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE AND ADVISORY COUNCIL JOINT MEETING

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT

COMMITTEE CHAIR

COUNCIL CHAIR

DAVE HUDSON

STAN HAYES

DISTRICT

MONDAY MARCH 26, 2018 9:30 A.M. 1ST FLOOR BOARD ROOM 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL – PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE – PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members. The Committee Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

This meeting will be webcast. То the webcast, please visit see http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports the at time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain errors and omissions, and are not certified for their content or form.

Public Comment on Agenda Items: The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Public Comment Cards for items on the agenda must be submitted in person to the Clerk of the Boards at the location of the meeting and prior to the Board taking up the particular item. Where an item was moved from the Consent Calendar to an Action item, no speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.

Speakers may speak for up to three minutes on each item on the Agenda. However, the Chairperson or other Board Member presiding at the meeting may limit the public comment for all speakers to fewer than three minutes per speaker, or make other rules to ensure that all speakers have an equal opportunity to be heard. The Chairperson or other Board Member presiding at the meeting may, with the consent of persons representing both sides of an issue, allocate a block of time (not to exceed six minutes) to each side to present their issue.

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 7, 2018

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Committee will consider approving the draft minutes of the Executive Committee meeting of February 7, 2018.

3. OVERVIEW OF THE AIR DISTRICT'S ADVISORY COUNCIL

J. Broadbent/5052 jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

The Committee and Council will receive an overview of the Air District's Advisory Council membership.

4. **REVIEW OF AIR DISTRICT PRIORITIES**

J. Broadbent/5052 jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

The Committee and Council will have a discussion and review the Air District's priorities.

5. UPDATE ON ASSEMBLY BILL 617 (AB 617)

J. Broadbent/5052 jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive an update on Assembly Bill 617 (AB 617) and how this law refocuses the Air District's efforts on local health versus attainment of criteria pollutant standards.

6. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3 Speakers wishing to address the Board on non-agenda matters will be heard at the end of the agenda, and each will be allowed up to three minutes to address the Board at that time.

Members of the Board may engage only in very brief dialogue regarding non-agenda matters, and may refer issues raised to District staff for handling. In addition, the Chairperson may refer issues raised to appropriate Board Committees to be placed on a future agenda for discussion.

7. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2).

8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Monday, April 18, 2018, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.

CONTACT: ACTING MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105 vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the "Members of the Executive Committee and Advisory Council" and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Board meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Board at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at <u>www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility</u> to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at <u>rsanders@baaqmd.gov</u>.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE: MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

MARCH 2018

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Legislative Committee (At the Call of the Chair)	Thursday	22	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee & Advisory Council Joint Mtg. (EC Meets on the 3 rd Monday of each Month) and (AC Meets At the Call of the Chair)	Monday	26	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Advisory Council Mtg. (At the Call of the Chair)	Monday	26	12:00 p.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets on the 4 th Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	28	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109

APRIL 2018

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Public Engagement Committee (At the Call of the Chair)	Monday	2	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	4	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Ad Hoc Refinery Oversight Committee (At the Call of the Chair	Monday	9	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Monday of each Month)	Monday	16	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Mtg. (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	18	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets on the 4 th Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	25	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 th Thursday of each Month)	Thursday	26	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

MAY 2018

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	2	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Personnel Committee (At the Call of the Chair)	Monday	7	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Mtg. (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	16	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Thursday of every other Month)	Thursday	17	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Monday of each Month)	Monday	21	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Monday of every other Month)	Monday	21	10:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets on the 4 th Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	23	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 th Thursday of each Month)	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

MV – 3/21/18 – 3:58 p.m.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

- To: Chairperson David Hudson and Members of the Executive Committee
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO
- Date: March 12, 2018

Re: <u>Approval of the Minutes of February 7, 2018</u>

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Executive Committee (Committee) meeting of February 7, 2018.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Committee meeting of February 7, 2018.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by:Marcy HiratzkaReviewed by:Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Committee Meeting of February 7, 2018

Draft Minutes - Executive Committee Meeting of February 7, 2018

Bay Area Air Quality Management District 375 Beale Street, Suite 600 San Francisco, California 94105 (415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors Executive Committee Meeting Wednesday, February 7, 2018

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Executive Committee (Committee) Chairperson, David Hudson, called the meeting to order at 11:25 a.m.

Roll Call:

- Present: Committee Chairperson David Hudson; Vice Chairperson Katie Rice; and Directors Scott Haggerty, Mark Ross, Rod Sinks, and Brad Wagenknecht.
- Absent: Directors John Gioia, Carole Groom, and Nate Miley.

Also Present: Director Liz Kniss.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 14, 2017

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

None.

Committee Action:

Director Kniss made a motion, seconded by Director Ross, to approve the minutes of December 14, 2017; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES:Hudson, Kniss, Rice, Ross, Sinks, and Wagenknecht.NOES:None.ABSTAIN:Haggerty.

ABSENT: Gioia, Groom, and Miley.

4. HEARING BOARD QUARTERLY REPORT: OCTOBER – DECEMBER 2017

Hearing Board Chairperson, Valerie J. Armento, Esq., presented this report.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

None.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

5. ADMINISTRATIVE CODE UPDATE

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Brian Bunger, District Counsel, who described the three proposed amendments to the District's Administrative Code (Division I: Operating Policies and Procedures) that will be first presented to the Board on February 21, 2018:

- Section 1: Board of Directors, Meetings, Section 1.1: Meeting Dates (*New proposed start time of 9:30 a.m. for Board meetings*)
- Section 1: Board of Directors, Meetings, Section 1.2A: Compensation Meeting Attendance (Board members shall not receive compensation for attending any meetings other than Air District Board/Committee meetings unless compensation for attendance at such meeting(s) is approved by the Chairperson in an open session prior to attendance at the meeting)
- Section 6: Board of Directors, Committees, Section 6.2: Standing Committees (Increase the size of standing committees from (9) to (11) committee members, but retain the definition of a quorum at 5 members)

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed how adding more Board members to the committees would be advantageous to the Board members because they would be able to experience regional policymaking at a more intricate level; whether compensation for attending non-Air District Board/Committee meetings should be considered on a case-by-case basis; and the District's budget that covers travel expenses for Board members.

Committee Action:

Director Haggerty made a motion, seconded by Director Wagenknecht, to recommend that the Board of Directors adopt amendments to the Air District's Administrative Code, Division I: Operating Policies and Procedures, Section 1: Board of Directors, Meetings, Section 1.1: Meeting Dates; Section 1: Board of Directors, Meetings, Section 1.2A: Compensation – Meeting Attendance; and Section 6: Board of Directors, Committees, Section 6.2: Standing Committees; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES:Haggerty, Hudson, Kniss, Rice, Ross, Sinks, and Wagenknecht.NOES:None.ABSTAIN:None.ABSENT:Gioia, Groom, and Miley.

6. UPDATE ON ASSEMBLY BILL 617 AND RELATED INCENTIVES FUNDING PROGRAM

Mr. Broadbent introduced Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer on Policy, who gave the staff presentation *Assembly Bill (AB) 617: Protecting Community* Health, including: overview; Ab 617 components; community selection; criteria under consideration; getting started; incentives; West Oakland Action Plan; Richmond monitoring; outreach; January 31, 2018 regional workshop; outreach plan; Air Resources Board (ARB) coordination; and what's next.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the request that County Public Health Officers of communities who may be identified as having a "high cumulative exposure burden" be informed of lessons learned from implementing community monitoring and action plans in communities that were previously selected; the request that staff be mindful of Board members' schedules when planning public engagement/community stakeholder meetings so that the Board members can attend and show the public their involvement; and the concern that some hospitals are not forthcoming or cooperative in reporting accurate data.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

7. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

None.

8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Monday, March 26, 2018, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 12:03 p.m.

Marcy Hiratzka Clerk of the Boards

- To: Chairperson David Hudson and Members of the Executive Committee Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members of the Advisory Council
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 15, 2018

Re: Overview of the Air District's Advisory Council

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Senate Bill 1415 (SB1415), effective July 1, 2015, reconstituted the membership of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) Advisory Council to include seven appointed members "skilled and experienced in the fields of air pollution, climate change, or the health impacts of air pollution. Members shall be selected to include a diversity of perspectives, expertise and backgrounds." The Council is "to advise and consult with the bay district board and the bay district air pollution control officer in effectuating the purposes of" the Air District.

ADVISORY COUNCIL OPINION

The Council deliberated during six full-day meetings on its first question regarding the efficacy of greenhouse gas emissions caps at local refineries.

Speakers representing a variety of viewpoints addressed the Council, including:

- California Air Resources Board
 - Richard Corey, Executive Officer
 - Sam Wade, Chief, Transportation and Fuels Branch
 - Jason Gray, Manager, Climate Change Market Monitoring Section
- California Energy Commission
 - Gordon Schremp, Senior Fuels Specialist
- Stakeholders
 - Communities for a Better Environment (CBE) Greg Karras
 - 350 Bay Area Letter
 - Gary Rubenstein, Sierra Research on behalf of CCEEB and WSPA

Based on the material that it considered, its deliberations, and its collective expertise and experience, the Council reached the following conclusions:

- Conclusion on Key Question: The Council concluded that facility-level caps on Bay Area refinery GHG emissions are unlikely to be effective in mitigating global climate change. GHG reduction policies are effective in providing climate protection only if total global GHG emissions are reduced, and if leakage occurs (that is, GHG emissions are shifted outside of the Bay Area to other locations instead of being reduced), which is likely with refinery GHG caps, such caps would not provide such protection.
- Policy Recommendation: The Council recommended that the Air District identify, systematically evaluate, prioritize, and adopt Bay Area GHG reduction policies and measures, including ones directed at refineries as appropriate, that are effective in reducing total global GHG emissions, minimize leakage risk, and complement and reinforce GHG reduction measures adopted by CARB (e.g., GHG cap-and-trade and methane reduction programs), USEPA, and others.
- Policy Recommendation: The Council recommended that the Air District address community concerns about toxics and criteria pollutants directly, through established programs, rather than indirectly as co-benefits of GHG reduction policies. The approach embodied in proposed rule 11-18 is consistent with this recommendation.

ADVISORY COUNCIL NEXT AREA OF FOCUS

The Council has been focused on identifying strategies that will be most effective in improving air quality related health outcomes in the Bay Area. In particular, the Council is focusing on local effects, as opposed to basin-wide criteria pollutants, and especially on the effects of fine particulate matter. This focus is consistent with the Air District's work related to Rule 11-18, and to AB 617.

<u>MEMBERSHIP</u>

The current five members of the Air District's Advisory Council represent an extraordinary resource to the District, and have provided invaluable service over the last two years. The members' backgrounds are provided below.

Stan Hayes (Current Chair)

Principal, Environ (Emeritus)

M.S., Aeronautics & Astronautics, Stanford University B.S., Mechanical Engineering, Stanford University

- More than 40 years' experience, air pollution science and engineering, including air quality modeling and health risk assessment
- Fellow, Air & Waste Management Association

- Chair, Advisory Council, Bay Area Air Quality Management District (member: 1995-2007, 2009-)
- Member, U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board panel on EPA risk assessment methods
- Several hundred air dispersion and HRAs of a wide range of industrial facilities
- More than seventy scientific papers and presentations
- Several hundred technical reports on air-related topics

Severin Borenstein

E.T. Grether Professor of Business Administration and Public Policy, Haas School of Business Research Associate of the Energy Institute at the Haas School of Business Affiliated Faculty, Energy & Resources Group, UC Berkeley Research Associate of the National Bureau of Economic Research

Ph.D., Economics, MIT

B.S., UC Berkeley

- Research focuses broadly on business competition, strategy, and regulation
- Published extensively on oil, gasoline, and electricity markets, and other industries
- Recent research on the impact of oil prices on gasoline markets, alternative models of retail electricity pricing, and the economics of renewable energy and climate change
- Past member of the editorial board of the Journal of the Association of Environmental and Resource Economists
- 1997-2003, member of the Governing Board of the California Power Exchange
- Served on the Emissions Market Assessment Committee, which advised the California Air Resources Board on the operation of California's Cap and Trade market
- Chaired California Energy Commission's Petroleum Market Advisory Committee from 2015 until 2017

Michael T. Kleinman (Current Vice Chair)

Professor Environmental Toxicology Co-Director of the Air Pollution Health Effects Laboratory Adjunct Professor in College of Medicine University of California, Irvine

Ph.D., Environmental Health Sciences, New York University, NY

- Expertise in the health effects of air pollution on animals and humans
- Development of analytical techniques for assessing biological and physiological responses to exposure to environmental contaminants
- Studies of the effects of ambient particles on blood pressure and heart rate
- Studies of the link between asthma and environmental exposures to ambient particles
- Mechanisms of cardiopulmonary injury following inhalation of toxic compounds
- Studies of inhalation exposures to manufactured and combustion-generated nanomaterials
- Biological mechanisms by which particulate matter exposure affects pathological and physiological changes in the heart and lungs

Tim Lipman

Co-Director UC Berkeley Transportation Sustainability Research Center Lecturer and Researcher: Energy and environmental technology, economics, and policy University of California - Berkeley.

Ph.D., Environmental Policy Analysis, Graduate Group in Ecology at UC Davis M.S., Graduate Group in Transportation Technology and Policy at UC Davis B.A., Stanford

- Co-Director for the campus' Transportation Sustainability Research Center
- Past Director: U.S. Department of Energy Pacific Region Clean Energy Application Center
- Research on the transformation of energy systems to support motor vehicles and buildings while reducing greenhouse gas emissions
- Research on electric-drive vehicles, fuel cell technology, combined heat and power systems, biofuels, renewable energy, and electricity and hydrogen energy systems infrastructure
- 2005 Climate Change Fellow with the Woods Institute at Stanford University

Jane CS Long

Senior Fellow and Council Member of the California Council on Science and Technology Associate Director for Energy and Environment, retired, Lawrence Livermore National Lab

Ph.D., UC Berkeley

B.S., Engineering, Brown University

- Chairman of the California Council on Science and Technology's committee on California's Energy Future
- Current work involves strategies for dealing with climate change including reinvention of the energy system, geoengineering, and adaptation
- Past Dean of the Mackay School of Mines, University of Nevada, Reno
- Past Department Chair for the Energy Resources Technology and the Environmental Research Departments at Lawrence Berkeley National Lab.
- Fellow of the American Association for the Advancement of Science

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Jeff McKay

- To: Chairperson David Hudson and Members of the Executive Committee Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members of the Advisory Council
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 15, 2018

Re: <u>Review of Air District Priorities</u>

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District operates within a complex framework of regulatory authorities and other mandates that promote a healthy breathing environment.

DISCUSSION

Mr. Broadbent will provide an update on pending and planned Air District activities, and discuss priorities for the Air District with a focus on anticipated Advisory Council areas of focus.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Jeff McKay

- To: Chairperson David Hudson and Members of the Executive Committee Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members of the Advisory Council
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 15, 2018

Re: Update on Assembly Bill 617 (AB 617)

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

The California Legislature passed, and Governor Jerry Brown signed, a number of key legislative actions that included AB 617. This bill specifically addresses concerns about local air quality by requiring:

- Emission reduction plans for overburdened communities;
- Additional air monitoring in impacted communities;
- A state-wide clearing house for Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT);
- Adoption of rules requiring the latest BARCT for all criteria pollutants for which an area has not achieved attainment of California Ambient Air Quality Standards; and
- Uniform state-wide reporting of emissions inventories.

DISCUSSION

Staff will update the Executive Committee and Advisory Council on staff's initial work regarding AB 617 implementation, including discussions with the California Air Resources Board and how this moves the Air District's program beyond the target of attainment for criteria pollutants.

BUDGET CONSIDERATIONS/FINANCIAL IMPACTS

Staff has evaluated the impacts of AB 617 and has included a request for additional staffing and other resources in the Fiscal Year Ending 2019 proposed budget.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: <u>Jeff McKay</u>