

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, May 14, 2014

*Note: Audio and webcast recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>.*

**CALL TO ORDER:** Chairperson Sam Altshuler called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m.

### **Roll Call:**

Present: Chairperson Sam Altshuler, P.E.; Vice-Chairperson Liza Lutzker, M.P.H.; Secretary Jessica Range, LEED A.P.; and Members Ana M. Alvarez, D.P.P.D., Benjamin Bolles, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Harold Brazil, Heather Forshey, Stan Hayes, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Frank Imhof, Kraig Kurucz, Bruce Mast, SaraT L. Mayer, M.P.P., Timothy O'Connor, Esq., and Laura E. Tam.

Absent: Members Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., and Estes Al Phillips.

Also Present: None.

### **RECOGNITION**

#### **1. Recognition of New Advisory Council (Council) Member (Agenda Item #2 Taken Out of Order)**

Chairperson Altshuler introduced newly appointed Member Frank Imhof (*Agriculture*) and welcomed him to the Council. Member Imhof made introductory remarks.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; informational only.

NOTED PRESENT: Member O'Connor was noted present at 9:08 a.m.

## **CONSENT CALENDAR**

### **2. Approval of the Minutes of the April 9, 2014 Council Meeting (Agenda Item #1)**

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action:

Member Holtzclaw made a motion to approve the minutes of April 9, 2014; Member Lutzker seconded; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Alvarez, Bolles, Bornstein, Bramlett, Forshey, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Kurucz, Lutzker, Mayer, O'Connor and Range.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Imhof, Mast and Tam.

ABSENT: Brazil, Cherry, Marshall and Phillips.

### **Opening Comments (Out of Order):**

Chairperson Altshuler gave opening comments regarding the meeting agenda and outstanding action items, including year-end event planning and the delivery of an organization chart from staff, and announced the appointment of Members Forshey, Mast, Range and Tam to the report writing work group for the next report of the Council.

NOTED PRESENT: Member Brazil was noted present at 9:13 a.m.

## **PRESENTATIONS**

### **3. California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Goals**

Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, introduced Jane C.S. Long, Ph.D., and provided a brief description of her background.

#### **A. California's Energy Future**

Jane C.S. Long, Ph.D.

Contributing Scientist

Environmental Defense Fund

Former Principal Associate Director at Large and Associate Director for Energy and Environment

Fellow, Center for Global Strategic Research

Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

Dr. Long gave a presentation entitled *California's Energy Future* (a copy of which is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>).

**B. Reducing GHG Emissions through Energy and Innovation**

Emilio Camacho, Esq.

Advisor to California Energy Commissioner Hochschild

Former Attorney with the Office of the Legislative Council

Mr. Camacho gave a presentation entitled *Reducing GHG Emissions through Energy and Innovation* (a copy of which is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>).

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments:

Carl Weinberg, Regulatory Assistance Project, addressed the Council regarding the long-standing awareness among industry leaders of the need for change and the need for comprehensive work and collaboration among all those involved.

Claire Broome addressed the Council regarding the difficult task of applying the information from today's presenters and the importance of identifying goals and recognizing the urgency of the situation; to encourage work on issues within the purview of the Air District and that the Air District become a thoughtful and creative leader towards their resolution; in support of a move to 100% renewable generation of electricity; and to encourage moving forward with experimental solutions despite a possible absence of certainty about outcomes.

Floyd Earl Smith, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Council to inquire about its receipt of a letter to the Council from 350 Bay Area, delivered May 13, 2014; to provide an update of events and efforts, as well as past engagement with the Board of Directors (Board), by 350 Bay Area; to provide information relative to the harm caused by the Fukushima nuclear disaster in Japan; and to express support for the draft Council report discussed on April 9, 2014.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

**PANEL DISCUSSION**

**4. California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 GHG Goals**

Council Comments:

The Council, speakers and staff discussed the role of methane gas as a GHG; what was taken into account by the presenters in consideration of the leakage issue; what level of optimism is appropriate given the data; the role of geoengineering; whether and in what form interagency workgroups exist which are addressing these issues; whether the nuclear storage issue is truly a technological or legal/political one; why biomass was presented as a viable solution in contrast to

information received in the past; what might be the proper policy action for a regional agency within the broader network of governments and regional agencies; specific examples of actions or strategies that have been attempted and met with success; importance of decarbonizing electricity generation, reducing automobile emissions and increasing energy efficiency; the cost of implementing the measures proposed by Dr. Long and, similarly, the measures proposed to the Council by Professor Mark Jacobson, Ph.D., on February 13, 2014, and the proper role of the Bay Area in their implementation; the industrial ecology approach and the advantages of experimenting with outcomes to better determine their actual effectiveness before implementation; how the Air District does and can improve its coordination with the California Energy Commission (CEC) relative to advancing the market penetration of renewable energy generation and siting considerations regarding facilities with GHG emissions; the relevance of carbon capture technology as a realistic solution, both now and in the future; written materials available regarding California's energy future, particularly that were drawn upon for today's presentations; the viability of emerging nuclear technology to offset the safety issues inherent to their development and implementation and the public perception of the same; that capital expenditures and public perception are the reasons so many of these issues are more complicated than they appear on their face; the importance of and challenges inherent to implementation of advanced energy efficiency and smart growth concepts in all construction; the possible involvement of the CEC in the regulation of the transportation sector; and proposed recommendations for the Council to carry forward to the Board.

Member Mast asked staff to help facilitate the distribution to the Council of the written material identified by the presenters as source material.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:** No requests received.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

**5. Chairperson's Report:** None.

**6. Council Member Comments/Other Business:**

Member O'Connor reported that he, on behalf of his employer, will be releasing a large report next week regarding the value of advancing market penetration of renewable energy generation and then provided an update on Senate Bill 1415 (Hill).

**7. Report of the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO):** None.

**8. Time and Place of Next Meeting:**

Wednesday, June 11, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

9. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:58 a.m.

*/s/ Sean Gallagher*

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards