

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5000

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
10:00 a.m., Wednesday, September 10, 2008

Call To Order

Opening Comment: Chairperson Bedsworth called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m.

Roll Call: Susan Adams, Sam Altshuler, P.E., Ken Blonski, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Jeffrey Bramlett, Harold Brazil, Irwin Dawid, Emily Drennen, Fred Glueck, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Robert T.P. Huang, Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Karen Licavoli Farnkopf, MPH, Kendal Oku, Virginia Smyly, Linda Weiner and Brian Zamora.

Absent: William Hanna and Steven T. Kmucha.

Public Comment Period – There were no public comments.

Consent Calendar

1. Approval of Minutes of July 9, 2008

- Council Member Kurucz requested minor edits be made to the Technical Committee report.

Committee Action: Council Member Holtzclaw moved to approve the Minutes of July 9, 2008, as amended; seconded by Council Member Zamora; abstained by Mr. Dawid as he was not in attendance for the July 9th meeting; carried unanimously without objection.

Committee Reports

2. **Technical Committee Meeting of August 4, 2008**

Committee Chair Kurucz reported that the Committee had a discussion on presentations received from speakers over the past year. Speakers included Saffet Tanrikulu, David Fairley, both from the Air District, informing the Committee of the data analysis conducted on local pollution and particulate matter. In addition, Professor Rob Harley addressed the Committee on the consequences of changes in temperature, inflow boundary conditions, local emissions on air quality and a presentation from Dr. Phil Duffy on past and future temperature worldwide. Information from these presentations has been synthesized and the Committee is now working

towards a recommendation to the full Council. Mr. Kurucz reviewed the Committee's discussion on climate change and regional pollution. Inter-related subjects discussed include: regional reactions to global climate change; implications of renewable energy involving energy conservation and health; and land use planning strategies. Mr. Kurucz continued stating that the Air District should include climate change issues in its multi-pollutant, multi-scale air quality management planning process, including applying and validating the best available multi-scale, multi-pollutant models to local linkages between air quality and climate change. It was also requested that the Air District stay current and get the best tools available for experts to use in their air quality planning efforts in proposing new regulations.

The Committee discussed whether the Air District should have a Climate Protection Officer, which will be revisited at a future meeting. Mr. Kurucz concluded his reported.

Chairperson Bedsworth stated that Ms. Drennen would provide the Air Quality Planning Committee report with recommendations to AB32 Draft Scoping Plan.

3. Air Quality Planning Committee Meeting of August 11, 2008

Committee Chair Drennen reported that for agenda planning purposes, October 2nd or October 16th, will be considered as potential dates for the next Air Quality Planning Committee meeting. The topic will include High Occupancy Toll Lanes (HOT Lanes) and congestion pricing policies.

Chair Drennen continued with AB32, stating that at the August 11th meeting the Committee decided to tackle this issue due to time sensitivity. Ms. Drennen provided the Council with a brief overview of AB32, stating that the goal of AB 32 is to reduce greenhouse gas emission to 1990 levels by 2020. Ms. Drennen stated that transportation provides the largest amount of emissions of any sector. The California Air Resources Board (CARB) has put together a draft scoping plan. Chair Drennen stated that the plan leaves out some general ideas of measures that might be implemented in the future, to meet the goal of 1990 levels. Ms. Drennen noted that Air District staff provided the Committee with a presentation on AB32 and its implementation plan; in addition the Committee reviewed information materials from a group called Climate Plan. Chair Drennen continued that recommendations from the Air Quality Planning Committee would then to go the Board of Directors' Executive Committee; and if approved would move to the Board of Directors and then to CARB for comment.

In addition, Chair Drennen noted that Air District staff worked on a comment letter. Chair Drennen requested that Ms. Roggenkamp provide the Committee with a summary. Ms. Roggenkamp stated the comment letter focuses primarily on two main aspects of the Scoping Plan; 1) how the Scoping Plan treats stationary sources, which is historically the Air District's regulatory purview for greenhouse gases and climate protection; AB32 provides this authority to ARB, as there is a significant need for coordination on stationary source regulations; and 2) The cap and trade program that is being proposed, there is not much detail about the cap and trade program in the Scoping Plan, so there were several issues raised in particular, how the cap and trade program would be designed in order to make sure it is set up in a way that would not adversely affect the commercial industry. There are also measures that address stationary sources that were in a category that called for further evaluation. The Air District felt that those should be brought forward into the recommended strategies for refineries, cement plants, dock plants and others.

The other topics that the Advisory Council Air Quality Planning Committee addressed in its proposed comments were the linkage between land use, transportation, air quality and greenhouse gases.

Council Member Drennen commented that part of the reason for taking on this issue; is because many felt the Draft Scoping Plan does a pretty good job of looking at fuels and vehicle efficiency, but it leaves the other part nebulous and not completely fleshed out. Council Member Drennen thanked staff for implementing some of the Committee's questions into the letter. Council Member Drennen continued, providing the Committee with an overview of the recommendations.

Council Member Weiner commented that the memo seems to focus on transportation land use, which is fine because the Air District deals with air quality, she was not sure it should be under the same category of cap and trade. In addition, Council Member Weiner stated that whatever measures are taken whether it be cap and trade, or regulatory that they do not increase hot spots in those areas that include multiple sources of pollution; as that is an issue that all are concerned about.

Ms. Roggenkamp outlined the timeframe for document submittal to the Air Resources Board, as the next Executive Committee of the Board of Directors will be held on September 29, 2008. Assuming the Council agrees to move items to the Executive Committee, that would be September 29, 2008; Board of Directors meeting is October 1, 2008 and the Proposed Scoping Plan will be released on October 3, 2008. Ms. Roggenkamp continued stating that CARB is expected to take on this issue at their November 20, 2008 Board Meeting.

After a lengthy discussion Committee members provided their recommendations on the AB 32 Draft Scoping Plan comment letter.

Committee Action: Council Member Altshuler moved to approve the recommended changes to the proposed comments to CARB's Draft AB 32 Scoping Plan and forwarding to the Executive Committee for Board of Director approval; seconded by Council Member Holtzclaw; carried unanimously without objection.

PRESENTATION

4. Transportation 2035: Change in Motion

Chairperson Bedsworth introduced Ms. Ursula Vogel.

Ursula Vogel, Metropolitan Transportation Commission Public Information Officer, provided an overview and update on MTC's long-range regional transportation plan: Transportation 2035: Change in Motion.

Ms. Vogel presented MTC's RTP Transportation 2035 and addressed the financially constrained investment plan. Ms. Vogel noted that the total Plan revenue amount over the next 25 years is \$223 billion. Transportation funds equal about 90% or \$191 billion. Ms. Vogel stated that MTC looked into revisiting its commitments as asked, but determined that since most of the projects

are mandates or have already had substantial investments made in them, MTC would not uncommit any funds as part of this plan.

Ms. Vogel continued that the revenue is dispersed with:

48% Local - funds come from sales taxes, transit fares, and county sales taxes.

14% Regional – funds come from bridge tolls.

20% State – funds come from gas taxes.

12% Federal

6% Anticipated/Unspecified

Efficiency requests include:

- Lifeline - \$0.4 million;
- Bike - \$1.0 million;
- Climate - \$0.4 million;
- Planning - \$0.3 million;
- TLC - \$2.2 million; and
- FPI - \$1.6 million

MTC is in the process of working on eliminating shortfalls over the upcoming months.

Ms. Vogel continued the presentation showing existing, funded and proposed Freeway Performance Ramp Metering, which was launched in 2007. The Commission is eager to pursue HOT lanes and recognizes that goal can be better met by implement to the program regionally.

Ms Vogel continued her presentation by describing HOT Network Principles that include:

1. Collaboration and cooperation – CMAs, Caltrans, CHP, BATA
2. Corridor-based focus and implementation – user orientation
3. Reinvestment within the corridor – capital and operating
4. Corridor investment plans – guide reinvestment
5. Simple system – consistent design, signage, marketing
6. Toll collection – BATA
7. Financing – could include BATA toll bridge enterprise

Council Member Bramlett requested clarification on whether or not existing HOV lanes are being converted to HOT lanes and asked about taking existing lanes from 101 northbound and converting them directly to a HOT lane. Council Member Bramlett stated that he is extremely surprised and opposed to the continuation of pouring billions of dollars of concrete for these types of projects.

Ms. Vogel continued with the presentation and noted the following:

- Plan Expenditures by Mode - 65% transit and 35% roads;
- Plan Expenditures by Function - 81% maintenance and operations and 19% expansion;
- Plan Expenditures Supporting Focused Growth – 81% maintenance and operations, 12% transit expansion and 7% road expansion;

- Plan Expenditures Supporting Lifeline – 52% transit maintenance and operations, 36% roads and 12% transit expansion; and
- Plan Expenditures Supporting Climate Protection – 81% maintenance and operations, 12% transit expansion and 7% road expansion

Next steps include:

- Identify “Future Actions”, and solicit input from partners and the public through Phase 3 outreach (October/November 2008)
- Conduct environmental assessment (EIR) and transportation/air quality conformity analysis (August-November 2008)
- Release Draft Transportation 2035 Plan & EIR (December 2008)
- Adopt Final Transportation 2035 Plan & EIR (March 2009)

Ms. Vogel concluded her presentation.

Chairperson Bedsworth thanked Ms. Vogel for her presentation.

AIR DISTRICT OVERVIEW

5. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO

Ms. Roggenkamp provided an update on pending and planned Air District activities, policies and initiatives.

Ms. Roggenkamp gave an overview of the Summer Ozone Season stating that there were 11 Spare the Air Public Health advisories; 11 exceedances were above the national 8-hour ozone standard; 16 days over the California 8-hour ozone standard; and 9 days over the California one-hour standard. Ms. Roggenkamp continued stating that the season will run through the beginning of October.

Ms. Roggenkamp continued that the Air District is gearing up for the Wintertime STA season, which starts in early November and stated that the Wood Smoke rule was adopted and thanked the Council for its help. The Regulation 6; Rule 3: Wood Smoke Devices is effective November 1, 2008. When there is STA Alert announced the public will be informed that this is not a night when you can burn solid fuels in your fireplace or woodstoves, as there will be extensive outreach. In addition, Ms. Roggenkamp informed the Council that there will be another round of rebates for change-outs to inserts and stoves.

Ms. Roggenkamp said that the state has recommended to EPA that the Bay Area be a non-attainment area for the 35 micrograms per cubic meter Federal 24-hour PM 2.5 standard. EPA has indicated that they plan to accept the states’ recommendations that are currently out for public comment and EPA will make determinations of attainment and non-attainment areas by mid December, as the Air District is expected to be designated as a non-attainment area for PM 2.5, 24-hour standard.

Council Member Licavoli-Farnkopf inquired about the criteria for attainment/non attainment designations; Ms. Roggenkamp responded that it is based on a three year average; depending on the pollutant. As an example, Ms. Roggenkamp stated that for the 24-hour PM 2.5 standard, the last three year period indicates that the Air District will be non-attainment.

Ms. Roggenkamp continued that the Air District has conducted a truck count project in the West Oakland area, working with community members through Pacific Institute in the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project. Truck count data was collected somewhere between 15 and 20 sites in West Oakland. Community members assisted with this project, the collection is completed and being analyzed. This information is relevant to the work of the Air District, Port of Oakland and ARB's work on health risks.

Ms. Roggenkamp concluded that the State Budget has not passed, and that it did not seem that things would particularly affect the Air District's budget, but until the budget is passed the Air District is uncertain.

Council Member Holtzclaw thanked Ms. Roggenkamp for being well informed and for her report.

OTHER BUSINESS:

6. Council Member Comments/Other Business

Council Member Bornstein stated that he just returned from two days at the 5th Annual California Climate Change Conference, sponsored by the California Energy Commission and the conference evolved into a powerful conference with 400+ attendees and 500-600 people participating via webcast.

Dr. Bornstein continued that the images of melting ice caps were dramatic. Most attendees were research and policy individuals. Discussions included climate change and policy, a keynote on transportation, resiliency to climate change and another keynote on the health of ecological systems. That speaker believed we would have to move species so that they can continue to survive, as they are unable to move themselves to regions with the correct climate; in addition the speaker stated that 1/3 of all the species in the world will be extinct. Council Member Bornstein presented a paper on coastal cooling related to per capita energy consumption.

7. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, November 12, 2008, to be held at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:55 a.m.

/s/ Vanessa Johnson
Executive Secretary