

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 749-5073

Stationary Source Committee Meeting  
Wednesday, November 13, 2024

### **APPROVED MINUTES**

*This meeting was webcast, and a video recording is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at [www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas](http://www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas)*

### **CALL TO ORDER**

1. **Opening Comments:** Stationary Source Committee (Committee) Vice Chairperson, Mark Ross, called the meeting to order at 10:12 a.m.

#### **Roll Call:**

Present, In-Person (Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, Yerba Buena Room, San Francisco, California, 94105): Vice Chairperson Ross; and Director John Gioia.

Present, In-Person (Office of Contra Costa County Supervisor John Gioia, 11780 San Pablo Ave., Suite D Conference Room, El Cerrito, CA 94530): Director Steve Young.

Present, In-Person (City of Palo Alto City Hall, 250 Hamilton Ave., Palo Alto, CA 94301): Director Vicki Veenker.

Present, In-Person (Office of Contra Costa County Supervisor Ken Carlson, 2255 Contra Costa Blvd., Suite 202, Pleasant Hill, CA 94523): Director Ken Carlson.

Absent: Directors Lynda Hopkins, Otto Lee, and Gabe Quinto.

2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

3. **APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE STATIONARY SOURCE COMMITTEE MEETING OF OCTOBER 9, 2024**

#### **Public Comments**

No requests received.

## Committee Comments

None.

## Committee Action

Director Carlson made a motion, seconded by Director Veenker, to **approve** the Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source Committee meeting of October 9, 2024; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Carlson, Gioia, Ross, Veenker, Young.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Hopkins, Lee, Quinto.

## INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

### 4. **IMPLEMENTATION OF PROGRAMS RELATED TO ZERO NOX BUILDING APPLIANCES (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 6)**

The committee heard two presentations from a group of speakers who are administering a range of programs that support implementation of zero nitrogen oxides (NOx) appliance replacement projects like those called for under amended Air District Rules 9-6 and 9-4 (“building appliance rules”).

Blake Herrschaft, Building Electrification Programs Manager with Peninsula Clean Energy (PCE), gave the presentation *The Future of Building Electrification Programs is Now*, including: agenda; story from last month; PCE overview; PCE power mix; remaining emissions; PCE building electrification programs; program investment; existing building electrification programs; PCE building electrification; Home Upgrades program (new); residential programs – building electrification; lessons learned; do we really need to upgrade electrical panels; three reasons panels are replaced; data shows 100A (amperes) is enough capacity for most homes; calculation summary; Whole Home pilot; what is the cost to electrify; heat pump water heater costs; and heat pump water heater rebate impacts.

A team representing the statewide heat pump incentive program called “TECH Clean California Program (TECH)”, consisted of Nate Dewart, Business Strategy Fellow with Energy Solutions; Bruce Mast, Principal with Ardenna Energy; and Amy Dryden, Senior Director of Strategic Innovation with Association for Energy Affordability. They gave a presentation entitled *TECH (+CalNEXT) Program Insights*, including: agenda; TECH Clean California overview and strategic approach; CalNEXT; addressing challenges overview; market engagement – Bay Area results to date; spectrum of electrification; addressing challenges (highlights); addressing installation time and costs; heat pump water heater adoption of a relatively recent and growing phenomenon in California, contractor survey; temporary equipment; avoiding panel upsizing; comprehensive barrier removal; California multifamily landscape; common retrofit scenarios; multifamily issues and strategies; how TECH pilots are uncovering multifamily opportunities and advancing the market; multifamily data collection to inform future planning and design; what’s on the horizon; major data flows and timeline; and snapshot of federal and state funded building decarbonization programs.

## Public Comments

Public comments were given by Marlyn Bardet, Benicia resident; Jed Holtzman, Rocky Mountain Institute (RMI); Angela Evans, Menlo Spark; Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice; Sam Fishman, San Francisco Bay Area Planning and Urban Research Association (SPUR); and Kathy Kerridge, Benicia resident.

## Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the suggestion that the Air District procures a future presentation from Sean Armstrong, Managing Principal of Redwood Energy, regarding panel upgrades; how quickly federal moneys are being exhausted as rebate and incentive programs; appliance rebate turnaround times; the average time it takes to replace a broken water heater; the anticipated number of homes that PCE plans to retrofit in 2025, and the estimated number of homes that will not; equity concerns regarding the fact that many low and middle-income households will not be able to participate in building electrification programs, due to a lack of available funds, even with provided incentives; whether new and cheaper technology is being developed that will help the Air District implement its appliance rules; the manner in which the presenting entities connect installers to potential customers; PCE's anticipated capacity limit, if many homes in its service area were to experience broken appliances at the same time; the number of annual water heater replacements in the Bay Area; the gap between available incentive funding (all levels) and appliance and installation cost; likelihood of the exhaustion of federal Inflation Reduction Act (2022) moneys; the need for quicker issuances of building permits from cities and counties; concerns regarding the availability of manufacturers/products and closets in which to house appliances for multifamily units; the average cost of appliances after rebates (like-for-like replacement); the status of the decision tool for electrical panel optimization (to avoid unnecessary panel upsizing) that is being developed by the California Energy Commission; the suggestion of having members of the Air District's Community Advisory Council address the Board regarding their experiences with building electrification in their communities at the December 2024 Board meeting; and whether the Air District is engaged with building trades councils, unions, and the Bay Area Regional Collaborative to help coordinate/streamline the issue of building electrification.

## Committee Action

No action taken.

### **5. UPDATE ON REFINERY CORRIDOR COMMUNITY AIR MONITORING (ITEM 4)**

Dr. Kate Hoag, Assistant Manager, Meteorology and Measurement Division, gave the staff presentation *Update on Refinery Corridor Community Air Monitoring*, including: outline; current refinery corridor air monitoring; other air and emissions monitoring; refinery fence line air monitoring; refinery community air monitoring; phases of air monitoring station development; opportunities to strengthen existing programs; upcoming – particulate sampling for incidents; program purpose; program components; Community Workgroup; timeline; and general information and updates.

## Public Comments

Public comments were given by Marilyn Bardet, Benicia resident; Wendy Ke, Healthy Martinez: A Refinery Accountability Group; Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa

County; and Jeffrey Kilbreth, Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Path to Clean Air Community Steering Committee.

### Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the establishment of the new Refinery Corridor Community Air Monitoring Workgroup that is intended to guide the program development and implementation; whether fenceline monitoring will include mobile monitoring; the number and locations of current air monitoring stations in areas where large sources of pollution may contribute to localized pollution sources that are not captured by the Air District's existing network; the accuracy of the data from the new Benicia-Fitzgerald air monitoring station (established in July 2024); the current status on the Air District's efforts to analyze air emissions and crude oil composition; and the desire to see real-time air quality monitor data for additional communities listed on the Air District's website.

### Committee Action

No action taken.

## **6. UPDATE ON INDIRECT SOURCES AND QUESTIONS ON MARINE SOURCE IMPACTS (ITEM 5 )**

Virginia Lau, Manager in the Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling Division, gave the staff presentation *Indirect Sources – Update*, including: outline; recap of September Stationary Source meeting; California Air Resources Board (CARB) regulations on marine sources; key takeaways; regional emissions inventory for the Bay area: Particulate Matter (PM)<sub>2.5</sub>, NO<sub>x</sub> (nitrogen oxide), and SO<sub>2</sub> (sulfur dioxide); Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Assessments; general AB 617 assessment methodology; West Oakland Highlights (based year 2017); West Oakland ocean-going vessel (OGV) PM<sub>2.5</sub> impacts; Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Path To Clean Air (PTCA) Recap (base year 2024); PTCA OGV PM<sub>2.5</sub> impacts; recent headlines for US Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA) Clean Ports Program; and follow-up meeting.

### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Katrina Tomas, Earthjustice; Imari "Mars" Keith, Sierra Club; and Marilyn Bardet, Benicia resident.

### Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the difference between the terms "berthing" and "maneuvering"; alternative pathways to tanker emission reductions; the desire for a breakdown of the types of ships that contribute to marine source impacts; and which agencies are in a position to offer financial assistance with jurisdictions that have ports that need to be electrified.

### Committee Action

No action taken.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

**7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

No requests received.

**8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Director Gioia thanked Committee Vice Chair Ross for leading this committee, as he will soon be retiring from the Air District's Board.

**9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the end of the meeting, the next meeting of the Stationary Source Committee was scheduled for Wednesday, December 11, 2024. However, due to the need for a sudden emergency Board of Directors meeting on December 11, the date of the next Stationary Source Committee meeting was moved to Wednesday, February 19, 2025, at 10:00 a.m. at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. The meeting will be in-person for the Stationary Source Committee members and members of the public will be able to either join in-person or via webcast.

**10. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 1:11 p.m.

*/s/ Marcy Hiratzka*  
Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Board