



BOARD OF DIRECTORS
STATIONARY SOURCE AND CLIMATE IMPACTS COMMITTEE

BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

LYNDA HOPKINS – CHAIR
KEN CARLSON
JOHN GIOIA
OTTO LEE
MARK ROSS

DAVID HAUBERT – VICE CHAIR
NOELIA CORZO
TYRONE JUE
MYRNA MELGAR
VICKI VEENKER

**MEETING LOCATION(S) FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE BY
COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC**

**Bay Area Metro Center
1st Floor Board Room
375 Beale St.
San Francisco, CA 94105**

**Office of Contra Costa County
Supervisor John Gioia
Conference Room
11780 San Pablo Ave., Suite D
El Cerrito, CA 94530**

**City of Palo Alto City Hall
250 Hamilton Ave.
Palo Alto, CA 94301**

**Office of Alameda County Supervisor
David Haubert
4501 Pleasanton Avenue
Pleasanton, CA 94566**

**Office of Santa Clara County
Supervisor Otto Lee
70 W Hedding St
East Wing, 10th Floor
San Jose, CA 95110**

**Santa Rosa Junior College Campus
Doyle Library, Room 148
1501 Mendocino Ave.
Santa Rosa, CA, 95401**

THE FOLLOWING STREAMING OPTIONS WILL ALSO BE PROVIDED

These streaming options are provided for convenience only. In the event that streaming connections malfunction for any reason, the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee reserves the right to conduct the meeting without remote webcast and/or Zoom access.

The public may observe this meeting through the webcast by clicking the link available on the air district's agenda webpage at www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas.

Members of the public may participate remotely via Zoom at <https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/87288073516>, or may join Zoom by phone by dialing (669) 900-6833 or (408) 638-0968. The Webinar ID for this meeting is: 872 8807 3516

Public Comment on Agenda Items: The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on a matter on the agenda will have two minutes each to address the Committee on that agenda item, unless a different time limit is established by the Chair. No speaker who has already spoken on an item will be entitled to speak to that item again.

STATIONARY SOURCE AND CLIMATE IMPACTS COMMITTEE MEETING AGENDA

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 21, 2023

11:00 AM

1. Call to Order - Roll Call

The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

CONSENT CALENDAR (Item 3)

3. Approval of the Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee Meeting of May 10, 2023.

The Committee will consider approving the Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee Meeting of May 10, 2023.

INFORMATIONAL ITEM(S)

4. Health and Equity Assessments for Rulemaking

This is an informational item to provide the Committee with an overview of modeling-based, health and equity assessments that may be provided as supplemental information for Air District rulemaking. This item will be presented by Song Bai, Manager in the Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling Division.

5. Overview of Socioeconomic Analyses for Air District Rulemaking

This is an informational item to provide the Committee an overview of the socioeconomic analysis used in Air District Rulemaking. This item will be presented by David Joe, Assistant Manager in the Rules in Strategic Policy Division.

OTHER BUSINESS

6. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda will be given an opportunity to address the Committee. Members of the public will have two minutes each to address the Committee, unless a different time limit is established by the Chair.

7. Committee Member Comments

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

8. Time and Place of Next Meeting

Wednesday, July 12, 2023, at 10:00 a.m. at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. The meeting will be in-person for the Committee members and members of the public will be able to either join in-person or via webcast.

9. Adjournment

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the Air District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Suma Peesapati, at (415) 749-4967 or by email at speesapati@baaqmd.gov.

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS**

JUNE 2023

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	21	9:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Wednesday	21	11:00 a.m.	1 st Floor, Board Room
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee	Wednesday	21	1:00 p.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

JULY 2023

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	5	9:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Finance & Administration Committee	Wednesday	5	1:00 p.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Wednesday	12	10:00 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room

Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee - Cancelled	Wednesday	12	1:00 p.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room
---	-----------	----	-----------	---

Board of Directors Meeting	Monday	19	9:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee	Wednesday	19	1:00 p.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Community Advisory Council	Thursday	20	6:00 p.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

MB 6/15/23 5:07 p.m.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Lynda Hopkins and Members
of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee

From: Philip M. Fine
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: June 21, 2023

Re: Approval of the Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts
Committee Meeting of May 10, 2023.

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee Meeting of
May 10, 2023.

BACKGROUND

None.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source and
Climate Impacts Committee Meeting of May 10, 2023.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Philip M. Fine
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee Meeting of May 10, 2023

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

Stationary Source & Climate Impacts Committee
Wednesday, May 10, 2023

DRAFT MINUTES

This meeting was webcast, and a video recording is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas

CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments:** Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Lynda Hopkins, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present, In-Person (Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, Yerba Buena Room, San Francisco, California, 94105): Committee Chairperson Lynda Hopkins; Board Chairperson John J. Bauters; and Directors Ken Carlson, Noelia Corzo, Tyrone Jue, and Myrna Melgar.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (County of Santa Clara, 70 West Hedding Street, 10th Floor, East Wing Conference Room, San Jose, California, 95110): Director Otto Lee.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (Office of Alameda County Supervisor David Haubert, 4501 Pleasanton Ave., Pleasanton, California, 94566): Vice Chairperson David Haubert.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (Office of Contra Costa County Supervisor, John Gioia, Conference Room, 11780 San Pablo Ave., Suite D, El Cerrito, CA 94530): Directors John Gioia and Mark Ross.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (City of Palo Alto City Hall, 250 Hamilton Ave., 7th Floor, Palo Alto, CA 94301): Director Vicki Veenker.

Absent: None.

2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

CONSENT CALENDAR

3. APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE STATIONARY SOURCE AND CLIMATE IMPACTS COMMITTEE MEETING OF APRIL 12, 2023

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Board Chair Bauters made a motion, seconded by Director Carlson, to **approve** the Minutes of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee Meeting of April 12, 2023; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Carlson, Corzo, Gioia, Haubert, Hopkins, Jue, Melgar, Ross, Veenker.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Lee.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

4. PRESCRIBED BURNING IN THE BAY AREA

Patrick Wenzinger, Supervising Air Quality Specialist, gave the staff presentation *Prescribed Burning in the Bay Area*, including: outcome; outline; presentation for information only; Regulation 5: Open Burning; prescribed burning; Smoke Management Plan (SMP); SMP process; burn allocation/ignition process; approved SMPs (2014-2023); acres burned (2014-2023); permissive burn days (2014-2023); program enhancements; and feedback requested.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Lee was noted present at 10:07 a.m.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Sarah Collamer, California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (Cal Fire); Garrett Gradillas; and Dennis Rein, Moraga-Orinda Fire District

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed which entities most frequently request SMPs; the cost of a prescribed burn; Regulation 5's *Limited Exemption, Public Agency Wildfire Prevention – Any public agency conducting a prescribed burn for the purpose of wildfire prevention, pursuant to a smoke management plan approved by the Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), is exempt from the operation fees*, and which entities then absorb the cost burdens of prescribed burns; whether Regulation 5's

Limited Exemption can be extended to private entities, concerns that operation fees may deter potential private burners from conducting prescribed burns, and whether the Air District can identify such entities (who wish to participate in the Open Burn Program but cannot afford the associated fees); the number of unapproved burns that have been brought to the Air District's attention, and whether there has been a decrease in unapproved burns; whether the Air District reaches out to rural property owners regarding Regulation 5 and alternatives to prescribed burning; high-risk wildfire areas in the Bay Area and whether the Air District provides targeted outreach to those communities; the fact that Pacific Gas & Electric Company (PG&E) has conducted unapproved burns, and the desire to see them held accountable; the number of prescribed burns that have been cancelled or rescheduled at the last minute; whether the Air District plans to propose amendments to Regulation 5; ways in which Board members can advocate for additional prescribed burning funding/incentives and encourage prescribed burning; whether the Air District has engaged with indigenous tribes regarding burning practices; the desire to see prescribed fire councils and networks, that were active prior to the pandemic, become active again; and the Alameda County Fire Department's Fuels Reduction Program.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. AIR DISTRICT LEGAL AUTHORITIES FOR REGULATING AIR POLLUTION

Alexander Crockett, District Counsel, gave the staff presentation *Overview of Air District Legal Authorities*, including: outline; outcome; conceptual framework; institutional roles within the Air District; principal statutory authorities; regulation of Criteria Air Pollutants, Toxic Air Contaminants, and Greenhouse Gases; "indirect" air pollution sources; addressing other air quality problems; permit programs; California Environmental Quality Act; and environmental justice.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Charles Davidson, Hercules resident.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed whether indirect source authority and fuel types should be addressed by the Board's *Stationary Source* and *Climate Impacts Committee* or *Mobile Source* and *Climate Impacts Committee*; whether the Air District (which lacks land use authority) can partner with cities and counties that have warehouses within their jurisdictions to encourage electrification and/or emission reductions, and whether it would be appropriate to ask the Association of Bay Area Governments or League of California Cities to get involved with that effort; requirements for socioeconomic analyses during Air District rulemakings; the suggestion that the Air District proposes model land use conditions that jurisdictions can choose to implement; and the status of the Air District's development of an indirect source rule.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

OTHER BUSINESS

6. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

7. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Director Melgar spoke about her involvement with the City/County of San Francisco's Land Use and Transportation Committee and encouraged the Air District to monitor the impacts of the Air District's new CEQA guidance for construction dust to see how it impacts the development of infill housing for example in the west side of San Francisco, as higher density (increased housing) is anticipated in that area. There is some concern that this more stringent CEQA guidance may discourage infill housing and, as a result, increase total emissions due to greater pollution from transportation sources.

Director Gioia spoke of the soil sampling being conducted in Benicia, El Sobrante, and Martinez to Assess Health Risks from "Spent Catalyst" Release. Samples were being taken from more than a dozen sites where ash was observed and mapped following the November 24, 2022, release of hazardous materials from the Martinez Refining Company (MRC), formerly the Shell Oil refinery. Collected samples will be sent to a lab to analyze for concentrations of metals associated with the catalyst that may pose risks to human health through skin contact, inhalation or from consuming produce grown in the contaminated soil. Lab results of the soil samples are expected in late May or early June.

Director Ross reported that Contra Costa Health Services issued an advisory on May 9, 2023, for areas of downtown Martinez near the Amtrak station, where a mercury spill occurred on Monday. Officials found "minor" mercury contamination in the street from Marina Vista Avenue to Alhambra Avenue to Buckley Street to Berrellesa Street.

8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the end of the meeting, the next meeting of the Committee was scheduled for Wednesday, June 14, 2023, at 10:00 a.m. at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. After the meeting adjourned, the next Committee meeting was scheduled for Wednesday, June 21, 2023, at 11:00 a.m. The meeting will be in-person for the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee members and members of the public will be able to either join in-person or via webcast.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 11:32 a.m.

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Lynda Hopkins and Members
of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee

From: Philip M. Fine
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: June 21, 2023

Re: Health and Equity Assessments for Rulemaking

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

To provide supplemental information on the benefits of proposed rule amendments, Air District staff have applied modeling-based methods to quantify reductions in health impacts from reduced air pollution emissions. Modeling-based methods have also been applied to quantify the changes in the equity of impacts resulting from the proposed rule changes. In such cases, equity was evaluated in terms of population exposures, and exposures per capita, for Bay Area residents across subgroups of race and ethnicity. Recent examples of such modeling-based methods are presented and discussed as options for future rule development efforts so that the Board of Directors and the public understand the health and equity benefits of proposed new or amended regulations.

DISCUSSION

Air quality models can be applied to provide a link between air pollution emissions, which rules and regulations reduce, and exposures and health impacts, which are more immediately relevant to public concerns.

One example of the application of modeling was the supplemental information developed to support amendments to Regulation 6, Rule 5: Particulate Emissions from Petroleum Refinery Fluidized Catalytic Cracking Units (Rule 6-5). The Air District conducted modeling analyses to assess the air quality and health impacts of fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) emissions from two Bay Area refineries that would be required to implement additional PM_{2.5} emissions controls. Applying the U.S. EPA's health benefits model (BenMAP), Air District staff found that the proposed rule amendment would avoid between 2.6 and 5.9 premature deaths annually. Health benefits evaluated also included reductions in many non-fatal adverse health outcomes, such as heart attacks, strokes, and asthma exacerbations and symptoms. Overall, the modeled annual valuations of health benefits were found to be between \$26 million to \$59 million for residents

living near the refineries. The range in estimates was due to the application of different options within BenMAP for health impact functions, which link PM2.5 concentrations to health outcomes.

The assessment of the equity benefits from amendments to Rule 6-5 found that Hispanic/Latino and African American/Black residents are exposed to more PM2.5 per capita for the two refineries modeled (the Chevron Richmond Refinery and the Martinez Refining Company). Emissions from modeled refinery sources other than fluidized catalytic cracking units covered by Rule 6-5 were found to drive most of these disparities.

Similar methods were applied in support of amendments to Regulation 9, Rule 4: Nitrogen Oxides from Fan Type Residential Central Furnaces (Rule 9-4) and Regulation 9, Rule 6: Nitrogen Oxides Emissions from Natural Gas-Fired Boilers and Water Heaters (Rule 9-6). These rules introduce a zero-NOx requirement and, given the current development trajectory of such equipment, would likely encourage adoption and development of electric technology for Bay Area building appliances and eliminate combustion emissions from these Bay Area building appliances.

Modeled benefits of eliminating primary and secondary PM2.5 generated by natural gas-fired combustion from the building appliances targeted by proposed amendments to Rules 9-4 and 9-6 included avoiding 37 to 85 premature deaths annually. Health benefits also included reductions in many non-fatal adverse health outcomes, such as heart attacks, strokes, and asthma onset (new cases of asthma) and symptoms. The modeled total annual valuation of health benefits was between \$400 to \$890 million. Modeling indicated that the largest reductions in PM2.5 exposure would accrue to the Bay Area's Asian/Pacific Islander population. The counties most affected by these sources, like Santa Clara, tend to be a higher percent Asian/Pacific Islander. This explained most of the regional pattern across the Bay Area. Within individual counties, modeling results were found to differ, but it was always people of color who experienced the greatest benefit.

To conclude this agenda item, staff will engage Committee members in a discussion of the types of future rule development efforts where similar modeling-based assessments of health and equity may be usefully applied.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Philip M. Fine
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Song Bai and Phil Martien
Reviewed by: Greg Nudd

ATTACHMENTS:

None

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Lynda Hopkins and Members
of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee

From: Philip M. Fine
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: June 21, 2023

Re: Overview of Socioeconomic Analyses for Air District Rulemaking

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District is responsible for creating and modifying rules and regulations that cover sources of pollution that fall within the Air District's regulatory authority. California Health and Safety Code section 40728.5 requires that the Air District consider the socioeconomic impact of rules and rule amendments brought before the Board of Directors for adoption. Section 40728.5 includes requirements for the Board of Directors to actively consider the socioeconomic impact of these rules and regulations and to make a good faith effort to minimize the socioeconomic impacts, and includes details on the socioeconomic impacts to be considered.

DISCUSSION

The purpose of this presentation is to provide the Committee and the public with an overview of the socioeconomic impact analyses conducted for Air District rulemaking activities. This includes an overview of the related statutory requirements, as well as examples and details of the types of information, assessments, and tools used in these analyses.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Philip M. Fine
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: David Joe and Leonid Bak

Reviewed by: Elizabeth Yura

ATTACHMENTS:

None