

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

Finance and Administration Committee
Wednesday, September 6, 2023

APPROVED MINUTES

This meeting was webcast, and a video recording is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas

CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments:** Finance and Administration Committee (Committee) Chairperson, John J. Bauters, called the meeting to order at 1:14 p.m.

Roll Call:

Present, In-Person (375 Beale Street, Board Room, San Francisco, California, 94105): Chairperson John J. Bauters; Vice Chairperson Davina Hurt; and Directors David Haubert, Tyrone Jue, and Sergio Lopez.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (Santa Rosa Junior College Campus, Doyle Library, 1501 Mendocino Ave., Room 148, Santa Rosa, California 95401): Director Brian Barnacle.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location: (Office of Contra Costa County Supervisor John Gioia, Conference Room, 11780 San Pablo Avenue, Suite D, El Cerrito, California, 94530): Director Mark Ross.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location: (County of Sonoma County Administrator's Office, 575 Administration Drive, Sunroom, Suite #110A, Santa Rosa, California, 95403): Director Lynda Hopkins.

Absent: Directors Abe-Koga, David Hudson, and Katie Rice.

2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

CONSENT CALENDAR (ITEMS 3 – 4)

3. **APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MEETING OF JULY 5, 2023**

4. **COMMITTEE AUTHORIZATION FOR CHAIR BAUTERS, VICE CHAIR HURT, DIRECTOR RICE, AND DIRECTOR VEENKER TO ATTEND THE AIR DISTRICT'S WASHINGTON D.C. ADVOCACY TRIP**

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Haubert made a motion, seconded by Director Jue, to **approve** the Consent Calendar, Items 3 and 4; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barnacle, Bauters, Haubert, Hopkins, Hurt, Jue, Lopez, Ross.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Abe-Koga, Hudson, Rice.

ACTION ITEMS

5. **CONDUCT INTERVIEWS AND CONSIDER RECOMMENDING BOARD OF DIRECTORS APPROVAL OF CANDIDATES FOR APPOINTMENT TO THE AIR DISTRICT'S HEARING BOARD**

The Committee conducted interviews of three candidates who were applying for various vacant seats on the Air District's Hearing Board. The candidates were asked the following questions by the Committee: how their experience and perspectives might assist the Hearing Board in reviewing and deciding cases; their knowledge and experience regarding air quality matters and environmental justice; their experience serving on other boards or commissions; why they became interested in this opportunity; whether things from their personal or professional backgrounds may conflict with serving on the Hearing Board; whether they has viewed or observed the Air District's Hearing Board meetings; and their availability to serve on the Hearing Board.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the general nature of the Air District's Hearing Board matters; appreciation for an applicant's interest learning about the Air District's permit appeal process; and how to garner more candidates for the Hearing Board's Medical category.

Committee Action

Vice Chair Hurt made a motion, seconded by Director Lopez, to recommend the Board **approve** the appointment of Dr. Sumeet Batra, as Alternate Member in the Medical category of the Hearing Board; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barnacle, Bauters, Haubert, Hopkins, Hurt, Jue, Lopez, Ross.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Abe-Koga, Hudson, Rice.

Chair Bauters made a motion, seconded by Director Haubert, to recommend the Board **approve** the appointment of Rajiv Dabir, as Principal Member in the Professional Engineer category of the Hearing Board, and of Jeffrey Maddox as Alternate Member in the Professional Engineer category of the Hearing Board; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barnacle, Bauters, Haubert, Hopkins, Hurt, Jue, Lopez, Ross.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Abe-Koga, Hudson, Rice.

After these Committee recommendations to the Board were voted upon, Chair Bauters explained that as of October 7, 2023 there would be two more Hearing Board vacancies (a Principal member and Alternate member in the Public category), and that there were over ten applications to consider. To fill the upcoming two vacancies as quickly as possible, so as not to disrupt Hearing Board proceedings that have already been scheduled, Chair Bauters recommended that an ad hoc committee be formed, comprised of the members of the Finance and Administration Committee, to narrow down the number of applications to five. **Director Hopkins, Hurt, and Ross volunteered to sit on an ad hoc committee, which would, over the next two weeks, identify the five applications that would result in interviews for the positions of Principal and Alternate members in the Public category of the Hearing Board. When asked by Air District staff to develop scoring criteria to identify the five applications, the Committee members present identified the following criteria:**

- applicants that do not qualify for the Hearing Board categories of Professional Engineer, Attorney, or Medical;
- diversity of professional experience
- demonstration of dedicated community service
- applications that were completed the most substantively; and
- geographic diversity throughout the Bay Area

6. **REMOTE TELECONFERENCING GUIDANCE**

Sharon L. Landers, Interim Chief Operating Officer, gave the staff presentation *Remote Teleconferencing Guidance*, including: outline; requested actions; often used locations; teleconferencing locations; Board and committee meeting preferences; and what should be included in a remote teleconferencing policy?

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee was asked to consider what elements should be included in a Remote Teleconferencing Policy, if the Committee was interested in continuing to allow remote teleconferencing for Committee meetings.

The Committee and staff discussed the need for accountability of the Board members hosting remote locations; the current remote attendance policies of other Bay Area regional agencies' Brown Act bodies; the feasibility of holding a monthly Board meeting instead of the current bi-weekly schedule, and the possibility of a later starting time; whether the Board's committee meetings would still utilize remote locations, if monthly Board meetings required full in-person participation; whether hybrid meetings should require an in-person participation minimum, or at least the in-person participation of the Chair and Vice Chair of the committees; the suggestion of having only four remote locations (North, South, East, and West Bay Area), and whether to rent, lease, or purchase office space; whether the Air District pays for use of the remote locations that are currently utilized for Board and committee meetings; how often Board members used to travel to 375 Beale Street for Board and committee meetings, prior to the COVID-19 pandemic; the perception that some Board members have taken advantage of remote meeting participation in ways it was not intended for, which can erode public trust of the Air District; the risk of attempting to attend Board meetings remotely while traveling; whether Board members who are experiencing health emergencies should be allowed to attend Board meetings remotely without notifying their location; and whether the Board members may have appointed alternate members to represent their jurisdictions if they cannot attend Air District Board or committee meetings.

Committee Action

Although no formal action was taken, there was consensus among the Committee members present to recommend that Board members attend one Board meeting per month (first Wednesday of the month) at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California, 94105, at the new start time of 10:00 a.m., in person, with no remote participation allowed except for testing positive for COVID-19. The Board's committee meetings may continue to utilize remote locations/satellite offices, but Air District staff will not staff those locations.

The Committee provided the following staff direction:

- Bring the Board a proposed plan for sharing permanently leased remote meeting locations with other Bay Area regional agencies, as agencies have expressed such interest.
- Survey the Board members regarding where they are willing to commute for Air District meetings and bring back a suggested maximum number of remote locations.
- Allow the Committee to bifurcate potential elements of a policy that Air District staff proposed, moving forward with the elements that the Committee *deemed acceptable*, and continuing to develop the others:

1. Only use Board members' offices available for free that can be staffed by their teams.
2. Limit teleconferencing to locations within the Air District's jurisdiction.
3. Require training with Executive Office staff for those assisting at remote locations.
4. Require notification of remote location a minimum of 30 days before meeting.
5. Require a primary and secondary point of contact (POC) for each remote Board location.
6. Require Board member staff to post meeting notices, open the space, connect with Beale St., and provide technical assistance as needed.
7. Require an agreement guaranteeing the selected requirements will be met.
8. Work on securing permanent satellite locations in the North Bay and South Bay.

OTHER BUSINESS

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

None.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Wednesday, October 4, 2023, at 1:00 p.m. at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. The meeting will be in-person for the Committee members and members of the public will be able to either join in-person or via webcast.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 3:33 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards