

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Community Equity, Health & Justice Committee Meeting
Thursday, February 4, 2021

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Community Equity, Health & Justice Committee (Committee) Co-Chairperson, Davina Hurt, called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

Present: Co-Chairpersons Davina Hurt and Tyrone Jue; Vice Chair Nate Miley; and Directors John Bauters, Rich Constantine, John Gioia, Katie Rice, Brad Wagenknecht, and Lori Wilson.

Absent: Directors Carole Groom and Shamann Walton.

Also Present: None.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE COMMUNITY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 17, 2020

NOTED PRESENT: Director Rice was noted present at 9:37 a.m.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Bauters made a motion, seconded by Director Constantine, to **approve** the Minutes of the Community and Public Health Committee meeting of September 17, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Gioia, Hurt, Jue, Wagenknecht.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: Rice.
ABSENT: Groom, Miley, Walton, Wilson.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE AD HOC COMMITTEE ON EQUITY, ACCESS, AND INCLUSION MEETING OF DECEMBER 14, 2020

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Gioia made a motion, seconded by Director Bauters, to **approve** the Minutes of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Meeting of December 14, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Gioia, Hurt, Jue, Rice, Wagenknecht.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Groom, Miley, Walton, Wilson.

4. DETERMINE MEMBERSHIP SIZE AND RESIDENT REPRESENTATION FOR THE RICHMOND - NORTH RICHMOND - SAN PABLO COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE (CERP CSC)

NOTED PRESENT: Director Wilson was noted present at 9:39 a.m.

Due to a technical difficulty, the Committee RECESSED from 9:54 a.m. to 10:16 a.m.

Veronica Eady, Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy and Equity, gave the staff presentation *Membership Size and Resident Representation on Richmond – North Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee*, including; outcome; requested action; outline; role of CERP CSC; balance and structure of CERP CSC; size of CERP CSC; resident representation on CERP CSC; and feedback requested/prompt.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Andres Soto, Communities for a Better Environment (CBE); Janis Hashe, Richmond resident; Y’Anad Burrell, Richmond resident; Willie Robinson, National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP); LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Dr. Raymond Tompkins, African-American Community Health Equity Council; Oscar Garcia, Chevron; Frances Keeler, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance; Cheryl Maier; and Bob Brown, Western States Petroleum Association.

NOTED PRESENT: Vice Chair Miley was noted present at 10:01 a.m.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed whether the recommendation of 17 residents (versus 8 non-residents) of the total 25 CERP CSC members is a *minimum*; reasons to expand the total number for

members beyond 25 and to expand the resident participation from 66% to 70%; how candidates were identified, how outreach for candidates was conducted within the affected communities, and what steps were taken to ensure that the pool of candidates would be as diverse as possible; and how Air District staff decided to recommend 25 participants, and why staff believes that number will be sufficient to carry out the CERP CSC's intended scope of work.

Committee Action

Motion: Director Gioia made a motion, seconded by Director Bauters, to recommend that the Board forms the CERP CSC, consisting of 29 members, 70% of which must be residents of the communities of Richmond, North Richmond, and San Pablo.

Substitute Motion: Director Bauters made a motion, seconded by Director Gioia, to recommend that the Board forms the CERP CSC, consisting of 27, 29, or 31 members, 70% of which must be residents of the communities of Richmond, North Richmond, and San Pablo; the substitute motion carried by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Gioia, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Rice, Wagenknecht, Wilson.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Groom, Walton.

Because the substitute motion was approved, the main motion was no longer needed and was not voted upon.

5. CONSIDER ROLE OF INDUSTRY ON THE COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE FOR THE RICHMOND - NORTH RICHMOND - SAN PABLO COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN

Ms. Eady gave the staff presentation *Consider Role of Industry on the Community Steering Committee for the Richmond - North Richmond - San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan*, including; outcome; requested action; outline; Assembly Bill (AB) 617 statutory requirement; California Air Resources Board (CARB) Blueprint; role of industry; and feedback requested/prompt.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Andres Soto, CBE; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Dr. Raymond Tompkins, African-American Community Health Equity Council; Matt Holmes, Groundwork Richmond; Willie Robinson, NAACP; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Oscar Garcia, Richmond resident; Lonnie Mason, Bayview Hunters Point resident; Hakim Johnson, Chevron; Margaret Gordon, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project;

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed whether all of the 72 CERP CSC applicants submitted a 'Conflict of Interest' form; whether industry members should have designated seats on the CERP CSC, and whether those seats should be voting positions; whether the CARB Blueprint addresses the issue of voting versus non-voting CERP CSC membership; and the suggestion for more than one designated industry seat on the CERP CSC.

Committee Action

Director Gioia made a motion, seconded by Director Wilson, to recommend that the Board creates two designated seats for members of local, industrial companies (not associations), both of which will be non-voting members; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Gioia, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Rice, Wilson.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Groom, Wagenknecht, Walton.

6. PROCESS TO DEVELOP A RECOMMENDED SLATE OF CANDIDATES FOR THE RICHMOND - NORTH RICHMOND - SAN PABLO COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE

Ms. Eady gave the staff presentation *Process to Develop a Recommended Slate of Candidates for the Richmond - North Richmond - San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee*, including; outcome; requested action; timing to select and seat a CSC; and feedback requested/prompt.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Andres Soto, CBE; and Janet Johnson, Sunflower Alliance.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the Committee Co-Chairs’ decision to include *all* eleven Community Equity, Health & Justice Committee members to form the final list of CERP CSC candidates; whether the ‘Conflict of Interest’ forms for these candidates were mandatory, whether an application that didn’t have a corresponding ‘Conflict of Interest’ form should be disqualified, and the request that Air District staff reach out to the applicants that did not submit the ‘Conflict of Interest’ form and try to retrieve one before February 11; the request that staff provide a chart listing the applicants’ neighborhoods, their employers, how long they have lived in the CERP area, and links to their applications on the chart; the request for a map plotting the geographic representation of the applicants, by neighborhood, as it would not be safe to disclose the applicants’ addresses; and whether Air District staff will have time to complete the requested information in time for the next meeting, on February 19, 2021.

Committee Action

Director Gioia made a motion, seconded by Director Wilson, to direct Air District staff to compile a list of those applicants who received six or seven recommendations out of ten for CERP CSC membership (by the CERP CSC Design Team) and put those applicants in a table with the following information: neighborhood, employer, whether they submitted a ‘Conflict of Interest’ form, how long the applicant has lived in the CERP area, and a link to their application. Staff is also to create a separate list of applicants who are employed by the industry, as it was observed that they may have not received as many recommendations from the CERP CSC Design Team as applicants who do not work for the industry. These lists are due by February 11 for the 2/19 packet.

The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Constantine, Gioia, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Wilson.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Bauters, Groom, Rice, Wagenknecht, Walton.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Ms. Margaret Gordon, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project; and Andres Soto, CBE.

8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Co-Chair Hurt announced that the Committee will resume its focus on the 2021 Work Plan after the Committee has made its recommendations to the Board, regarding the Richmond – North Richmond – San Pablo CERP CSC at the beginning of March. She added that ‘Community Perspective’, which was a standing item on the former Ah Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion, will be added to this new Committee’s agendas after the March Board meeting.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Friday, February 19, 2021 at 1:00 p.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 12:23 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hirtzka
Marcy Hirtzka
Clerk of the Boards