

# Community Steering Committee Members Recommendations and Input for Path to Clean Air CERP Steering Committee

THIS DOCUMENT CONTAINS THE RECOMMENDATIONS AND REVIEW SUMMARIES OF THE PATH TO CLEAN AIR CERP STEERING COMMITTEE APPLICANTS FROM THREE VOLUNTEER COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBERS. ALL APPLICANTS WERE ANONIMIZED AND RANKED BY MEMBERS ALFREDO ANGULO CASTRO, NANCY AGUIRRE, AND KEVIN G RUANO HERNANDEZ. THESE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE FOR THE CONSIDERATION OF THE COMMUNITY EQUITY, HEALTH, AND JUSTICE COMMITTEE OF THE AIR DISTRICT BOARD.

	COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS		MEMBER/LIVE/WORK IN STUDY AREA					SECTOR		DEMOGRAPHICS		
Applicant Name	Average Score	Community Steering Committee Comments	Applicant City / Town	Neighborhood (if applicable)	Live in Study Area?	Work in Study Area?	Employer	Primary Sector Represented	Secondary Sector Represented (if applicable)	Gender	Ethnicity	COI Form yes / no
Simren Sandhu	8.3	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	San Pablo	San Pablo (Contra Costa College)	Yes	Yes	Youth V. Apocalypse	Youth	N/A	Female	Asian	Yes
Marisol (Noell) Cantú	7.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Richmond Heights Neighborhood Council	Yes	Yes	Contra Costa College	People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	N/A	Female	Hispanic / Latinx	Yes
Daniella Zacky	7.3	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Alameda	Not applicable	No	Yes	Richmond Progressive Alliance	Community-serving organization	N/A	She / They	Hispanic / Latinx, Jewish	Yes
Michelle Gomez Garcia	7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	North Richmond	North Richmond (Unincorporated Contra Costa County)	Yes	No		People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	N/A	Female	Hispanic / Latinx	No
Andres Soto	7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	No answer	No	Yes	Communities for a Better Environment	Community-serving organization	N/A	Male	Chicano / Mestizo / Latino	Yes
Joann Pavlinec	6.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	East Richmond Heights	Yes	No	N/A - Retired	Neighborhood group	Government – Land Use	Female	Caucasian / White	Yes
Floy Andrews	6	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Point Richmond Neighborhood Council	Yes	Yes	Self-employed, Contra Costa County	People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	Community-serving organization	Female	Caucasian / White	Yes
Manuel Gomez	6	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Park Plaza Neighborhood Council	Yes	Yes	Lifelong Medical Clinic	Youth	N/A	Male	Hispanic / Latinx	No

	COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS		MEMBER/LIVE/WORK IN STUDY AREA					SECTOR		DEMOGRAPHICS		
Applicant Name	Average Score	Community Steering Committee Comments	Applicant City / Town	Neighborhood (if applicable)	Live in Study Area?	Work in Study Area?	Employer	Primary Sector Represented	Secondary Sector Represented (if applicable)	Gender	Ethnicity	COI Form yes / no
Julia Walsh	5.3	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Piedmont	Not applicable	No	No	N/A - Retired	Community-serving organization	N/A	Female	Caucasian / White	Yes
Matt Renner	5.3	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	East Richmond Heights	Yes	Yes	The Climate Mobilization	People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	N/A	Male	Caucasian / White	Yes
Bethany Lourie	5	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	North & East Neighborhood Council	Yes	No	Berkeley Unified School District	People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	Other – Education Provider	Female	Caucasian / White	Yes
Lea Murray	5	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	No answer	No	Yes	Collaborising	Other -	N/A	Female	Black / African	Yes
James Becker	4.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Not applicable	No	Yes	Richmond Community Foundation	Community-serving organization	Other – Foundation/Philanthropy	Male	Caucasian / White	Yes
Troy Almeida	4.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	El Sobrante	El Sobrante	No	No	SFGH	Health care provider	N/A	Male	Black / African	Yes
David Tucker	4.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	No Answer	No	No	Self-employed	People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	Industry/business	Male	Black / African	Yes
Brian Gillis	4.3	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Pullman Neighborhood Council	Yes	No	N/A - Student	People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	N/A	Male	Caucasian / White	Yes

	COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS		MEMBER/LIVE/WORK IN STUDY AREA					SECTOR		DEMOGRAPHICS		
Applicant Name	Average Score	Community Steering Committee Comments	Applicant City / Town	Neighborhood (if applicable)	Live in Study Area?	Work in Study Area?	Employer	Primary Sector Represented	Secondary Sector Represented (if applicable)	Gender	Ethnicity	COI Form yes / no
Adam W Oliver	4	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Marina Bay Neighborhood Council	Yes	No	N/A - Retired	People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	N/A	Male	Black/ African, Caucasian / White	Yes
Oscar Garcia	4	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Iron Triangle Neighborhood Council	Yes	Yes	Chevron	Neighborhood group	N/A	Male	Hispanic / Latinx	Yes
Allan Moskowitz	3.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	San Pablo	San Pablo	Yes	Yes	Self-employed	Industry/ business	N/A	Male	Caucasian / White	Yes
Maria Hernandez	2.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	San Pablo	No Answer	No	No		People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	N/A	Female	Hispanic / Latinx	No
Whitney Richardson	2	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Marina Bay Neighborhood Council	Yes	Yes	State of California	People who live in the Richmond-San Pablo Area	N/A	No Answer	No Answer	Yes
Antoinette Bailey-Nesbitt	1	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	Park Plaza Neighborhood Council	Yes	No		N/A	N/A	No Answer	No Answer	No
Rae Jones	0.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Berkeley	No Answer	No	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	No Answer	No Answer	No
Susan Nishizaka	0.7	<a href="#">See Comments</a>	Richmond	No Answer	No	No	N/A	Neighborhood group	N/A	No Answer	No Answer	No

## Community Steering Committee Comments on Path to Clean Air CERP Steering Committee Applicants

### Adam W Oliver

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Impacted by air/study area</li> <li>• From impacted air/study area</li> <li>• Seemed knowledgeable with air pollution</li> </ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	2	The applicant identified "I'm not sure" under a member of the committee. Also, under question 16, the applicant stated that he is knowledgeable on "air pollution control equipment and industrial processes within the area of interest" however, did answer later identified that they did not know if anyone in their household is being impacted by poor air quality. This application does not meet the criteria.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	4	Retiree, knowledgeable about air pollution control equipment as it relates to industrial processes. Doesn't present many community ties or contribute any of the criteria we're looking to expand on.
<b>Average Score</b>	4	

## Allan Moskowitz

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Investment advisor, wealth management</li><li>• Represents San Pablo</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	5	I believe that the applicant does show promise and considering their business, it may be great to have their perspective on the committee. I believe that the applicant should expand more about their interests and why they would like to join.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	1	Very little effort put into application, nearly incomplete.
<b>Average Score</b>	3.7	

## Andres Soto

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	8	Diverse: latinx *works, lives and outreach in impacted study area
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	10	Andres Soto is more than a community organizer from one of the solid Environmental Justice nonprofits in California; he is a mentor to several of us on the committee and the community. His wisdom and work have impacted us to focus on several topics, not just the local refineries. Now, though Mr. Soto did not include any additional information, I can tell of his intentions by his commitment to the CERP AB 617 process here for not only Richmond and San Pablo but California as well. If anyone deserves to be on the committee, it is him; I believe we envision us to be. Also, we need more Communities for a Better Environment representatives considering they received the AB 617 Community Grant and have been active in public comment discussions and activities.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	3	Incomplete application.
<b>Average Score</b>	7	

## Antoinette Bailey-Nesbitt

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	2	Does not have enough information for an informed score
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	0	Insignificant information.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	1	Incomplete application.
<b>Average Score</b>	1	



## Bethany Lourie

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Teacher</li><li>• Seems to represent several neighborhoods</li><li>• Lives in impacted air/study</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	4	Recently moved to study area, wants to to be involved in local air quality issues. Mentions interest in environmental conservation. Works directly with youth though mostly in Berkeley. Does not add much from the criteria selected by CSC.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	4	Not much general knowledge about the community. She wants to make a difference, however, she is vague and needs more detail on her responses. Also, answered I don't know to question 20.
<b>Average Score</b>	5	

## Brian Gillis

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Environmental law student</li><li>• Represents other neighborhood</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	2	It is great that this applicant is studying environmental law however, it is a concern that he does not know that he is being affected by air pollution but also that his wife is the former executive director of the Richmond Promise. Which takes money from Chevron, as a result, it makes me concerned and wonders if there are still ties.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	5	Lives in Pullman Neighborhood. Law student focussed on environmental law, interested in engaging with the community on local community health efforts.
<b>Average Score</b>	4.3	

## Daniella Zacky

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Diverse: represents latinx needed for our committee</li><li>• Environmental studies and policy student</li><li>• Represents several neighborhoods/communities in study area</li><li>• Works in study area</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	9	Although some may argue that the applicant is not born and raised in Richmond, they acknowledge that they have some history with air pollution and is a community organizer for the Richmond Progressive Alliance. Their educational background in geography and their knowledge about environmental justice and policy may come into use in the future in the CERP steering committee process moving forward. They are a student and has shown that although they are originally from a different city, they can bring a different perspective and valuable insight.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	5	Lives in Alameda but works in study area with local organization. Young person with environmental justice background.
<b>Average Score</b>	7.3	

## David Tucker

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Does not live, work or has business in impacted area</li><li>• Volunteer with planning committee</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	3	Though I do believe we should have those from the City of Richmond on the committee, we have a significant amount of members on the committee. As a result, I would like to lower my vote because of the industrial affiliations that the applicant has. I believe we need more diverse community members on the committee with perspectives that aim for a better future.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	6	Local long-time resident; involved in local planning commission in the past;
<b>Average Score</b>	4.7	

# Floy Andrews

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Impacted by air/study area</li><li>• Seems to represent neighborhoods across our area and county</li></ul> Environmental attorney
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	6	As a person that has an officer position for the Richmond Progressive Alliance and a background not only in environmental education and law would make her a good candidate for this committee. However, it is important to consider the demographics of the committee itself. However, with their background in environmental law and her affiliations with the county, she would be a good candidate.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	6	This person lives near a high pollution source, used to work as an environmental attorney and has experience working directly with air district. They mention work with local community-serving organizations and an understanding of the health impacts from local pollution sources.
<b>Average Score</b>	6	

## James Becker

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	6	*works in impacted area *creates homes with environmental forward energy design
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	2	Though this candidate has shown that they have a good list of experience, I scored them low because it is not the experience that the committee needs. Also, the candidate included Richmond as their city while later on, the candidate mentioned they do not live in Richmond. It is also unusual that the applicant is also a part of the Santa Fe Neighborhood Council while not living in Richmond. Also, there has been some concern that the Kiwanis Club, Galileo Club, and Richmond Community Foundation receive money from industrial companies such as Chevron. I believe this would be a conflict of interest.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	6	Resident of Santa Fe neighborhood, represents neighborhood highly impacted by air pollution. Does work in renovating homes to carbon neutral standards, plus has knowledge of local-level electrification. Mentions deep community ties and a respect for data-driven decision making.
<b>Average Score</b>	4.7	

## Joann Pavlinec

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Represents a balance of neighborhoods</li><li>• Environmental/green building background</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	7	Shows great potential in becoming a member of the steering committee considering their enthusiasm and their educational background. Would like to know more about their views on not only sustainability but also air pollution, and public health.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	7	Resident of East Richmond Heights, represents neighborhood groups and has experience working with local government on land use. Retired city planner with experience on renovating existing buildings to meet greener standards. Deep community ties and and much experience on sustainability and environmental policy development. Does not add much in terms of the criteria highlighted by CSC, but is overall a good fit.
<b>Average Score</b>	6.7	

## Julia Walsh

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Volunteers in several environmental studies/committees</li><li>• Does not work, live or own a business in impacted study area</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	8	Seems to be very knowledgeable about Public Health considering they were a professor at UCB. Very knowledgeable on the AB617 process and have been a community ally for a long time. The only thing that is holding me back is where she is living. However, other than that, she is an ideal candidate for the committee considering her education and knowledge about the CERP and BAAQMD.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	3	Does not live or work in study area. Great fit for our work overall, very familiar with CERP process, member of MOT and extensive knowledge in public health. but again, does not live or work in study area.
<b>Average Score</b>	5.3	



## Lea Murray

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Unique perspective for the unhoused/homeless population</li><li>• Executive Dir of nonprofit</li><li>• Represents several neighborhoods/ communities</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	4	The candidate shows so much promise to this committee through her perspective on unhoused people and her nonprofit, however, does not meet the desired skills we need on this committee such as air quality knowledge and environmental justice principles.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	3	Does not live in study area but owns local non-profit focused on working with unhoused resident in encampments; could provide direct ties to work with unhoused population.
<b>Average Score</b>	5	

## Manuel Gomez

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	6	Works with medical clinic In impacted area
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	8	The applicant is a Latinx youth member who is working on a research study. They haven't mentioned anything related to air quality however, this would be a good candidate.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	4	Youth working in local healthcare; very little information put into application.
<b>Average Score</b>	6	

## Maria Hernandez

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Volunteers in study area</li><li>• Diverse: latinx voice needed on our committee</li><li>• Willing to learn &amp; get involved</li><li>• Represents San Pablo area</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	1	Doesn't show strong responses, poor answers.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	0	Incomplete application
<b>Average Score</b>	2.6	

## Marisol (Noell) Cantú

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Diverse: latinx, ESL professor at CCC, voice needed in our committee</li><li>• Lives and works in impacted study area</li><li>• Represents other neighborhoods</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	9	Hailing from East Richmond Heights and has a title as an ESL professor at one of the local community colleges that our community members attend, it is important to capture their voices and invite a seat at a table for professors to speak. In their application, it seems that they value the community perspective and capturing voices considering her area is uplifting and teaching communication skills to undocumented students. She speaks on Public Health principles and shows (if chosen) to assist the community engagement team in the future with her connections to not only the college but, her community that we are focusing on.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	6	Educator at Contra Costa college; works directly with undocumented community and could provide a direct connection for involvement in process.
<b>Average Score</b>	<b>7.7</b>	

## Matt Renner

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Impacted by the air quality</li><li>• Works in climate change</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	5	Being the executive director of a climate action movement is very admirable however when you are the executive director you can't just be "interested in the subject." It is your job and focuses on sustainability and environmental justice practices. As a result, I like his views and how he expresses his purpose of applying but, don't believe he would be a good candidate just to be interested in joining.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	5	Lives and works in study area. Lives near high pollution source, has children and community ties in the Study Area. Demonstrates understanding of local health disparities.
<b>Average Score</b>	5.3	

## Michelle Gomez Garcia

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Diverse: latinx voice needed on our committee</li><li>• Works within clean air study</li><li>• Represents several neighborhoods/ communities</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	7	The applicant shows promise considering they live in an unincorporated area we are also focusing on, and they bring a different perspective since their profession seems to be distributing food to community members. Also, they seem very passionate about uplifting unrepresented community members' voices I believe the applicant would be a good addition.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	6	Interested in volunteering on clean air efforts; lives in North Richmond.
<b>Average Score</b>	7	

## Oscar Garcia

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Works for Chevron as an engineer</li><li>• Represents missing neighborhood on committee</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	3	Though the applicant does show some potential in some areas, it is a big conflict that this candidate is an engineer for a refinery that we already have a non-voting seat for. Though this applicant's experience has shown so much potential, it concerns me to have another Chevron employee on the committee.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	4	Lives and works in Study Area. Longtime resident involved with many local community organizations. They do fit some of the criteria the CSC highlighted (Latinx, from under-represented part of Study Area). Possible conflict of interest seeing as they are an employee of Chevron and would serve as a voting member.
<b>Average Score</b>	4	

## Rae Jones

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	2	Not enough information to give an informed score
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	0	Not enough information.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	0	incomplete application.
<b>Average Score</b>	<b>.7</b>	



## Simren Sandhu

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Diverse: Asian voice missing on our committee</li><li>• Youth representative</li><li>• Represents San Pablo</li><li>• Represents the people impacted in area of study</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	9	The candidate is a young, Asian, woman who attends a local high school and is an activist with one of the biggest environmental justice organizations in the Bay Area and she holds a decision-making power position within CA Youth Vs Big Oil, which expands all over California. This applicant shows great potential and would be a good asset from the youth perspective.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	8	Lives and works in Study Area; young person very involved in local community organizations; Presents understanding of the intersection between climate change and air quality concerns; fits some of the criteria highlighted by CSC (youth; more Asian representation; San Pablo representation).
<b>Average Score</b>	8.3	

## Susan Nishizaka

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	2	Not enough information to give an informed score
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	0	Insignificant information.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	0	Incomplete application.
<b>Average Score</b>	<b>.7</b>	

## Troy Almeida

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Nurse</li><li>• Representative from other neighborhoods</li><li>• Diverse: person of color, voice needed from our community/committee</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	3	Resident of El Sobrante with experience in health care, though the application is pretty empty.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	4	employed as a nurse for SFGH and claims to have witnessed the effects of poor air quality but stated that they are not being affected by air pollution. Also, being interested in this committee isn't essentially the criteria for becoming a member.
<b>Average Score</b>	4.7	

## Whitney Richardson

Community Steering Committee Reviewer	Score	Please describe the reasons for your score
Nancy Aguirre	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Analyst for state of CA</li><li>• Represents neighborhood impacted</li></ul>
Kevin G Ruano Hernandez	0	The applicant provided insignificant information about themselves.
Alfredo Angulo Castro	1	incomplete application.
<b>Average Score</b>	2	