



COMMUNITY EQUITY, HEALTH and JUSTICE COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

DAVINA HURT – CO-CHAIR
NATE MILEY – VICE CHAIR
RICH CONSTANTINE
CAROLE GROOM
LORI WILSON

TYRONE JUE – CO-CHAIR
JOHN BAUTERS
JOHN GIOIA
BRAD WAGENKNECHT
SHAMANN WALTON

**THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY
EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY
GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM**

- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S AGENDA WEBPAGE AVAILABLE AT**

www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://bayareametro.zoom.us/j/83192507220>

(669) 900 6833 or (408) 638 0968

WEBINAR ID: 831 9250 7220

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENT CAN USE THE “RAISE HAND” FEATURE BY DIALING “*9”. IN ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**

**THURSDAY
MAY 6, 2021
9:30 A.M.**

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Committee Co-Chairs shall call the meeting to order, and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.

***Public Comment on Agenda Items** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Committee. No speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF APRIL 1, 2021

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Committee will consider approving the attached draft minutes of the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee meeting of April 1, 2021.

3. COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVE

V. Eady/4646

veady@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive a presentation from Ms. Terea Macomber, Electric Vehicle Director, at GRID Alternatives, and members of the GRID team, who will discuss initiatives to make electric vehicles, electric vehicle charging and other clean mobility options more accessible to advance economic and environmental justice through renewable energy.

4. UPDATE ON THE AB 617 RICHMOND/SAN PABLO COMMUNITY AIR MONITORING PLAN

V. Eady/4646

veady@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive an update on AB 617 Richmond/San Pablo Community Air Monitoring Plan (CAMP) and how it will inform the Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) process.

5. **CONSIDERATION OF AB 617 RICHMOND-NORTH RICHMOND-SAN PABLO COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN STEERING COMMITTEE PROPOSED STIPEND FOR CO-CHAIRS**

V. Eady/4646

veady@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will consider the proposed Co-Chair stipend for the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo (Path to Clean Air) Area Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Community Steering Committee for Board of Directors' consideration and approval.

6. **UPDATE ON TRANSPARENT AND EQUITABLE FUNDING EXPENDITURES AND AB 617 COMMUNITY MONITORING**

V. Eady/4646

veady@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive an update on Transparent and Equitable Funding Expenditures and AB 617 Community Monitoring.

7. **ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 617 FISCAL YEAR ENDING (FYE) 2022 PROGRAM PLAN**

V. Eady/4646

veady@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive a presentation on the Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2022 Program Plan.

8. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Committee.

9. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

10. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Thursday, June 3, 2021 at 9:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Co-Chairs.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the Air District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Terri Levels, at (415) 749-4667 or by email at tlevels@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

MAY 2021

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Special Meeting Budget Hearing	Wednesday	5	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Special Meeting	Wednesday	5	10:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee	Thursday	6	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Monday	17	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Administration Committee	Wednesday	19	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Legislative Committee	Wednesday	19	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Thursday	27	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Technology Implementation Office (TIO) Steering Committee	Friday	28	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

JUNE 2021

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	2	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee	Thursday	3	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	16	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Legislative Committee	Wednesday	16	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Monday	21	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

MV – 4/27/2021 – 3:43 P.M.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Davina Hurt, Tyrone Jue, and Members
of the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: April 29, 2021

Re: Approval of the Minutes of April 1, 2021

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee (Committee) meeting of April 1, 2021.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Committee meeting of April 1, 2021.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Committee Meeting of April 1, 2021

AGENDA: 2A– ATTACHMENT

Draft Minutes – Community Equity, Health & Justice Committee Meeting of April 1, 2021

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee Meeting
Thursday, April 1, 2021

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee (Committee) Co-Chairperson, Davina Hurt, called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Present: Co-Chairpersons Davina Hurt and Tyrone Jue; Vice Chair Nate Miley; and Directors John Bauters, Rich Constantine, John Gioia, Carole Groom, Brad Wagenknecht, Shamann Walton, and Lori Wilson.

Absent: None.

Also Present: None.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MARCH 4, 2021

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Wagenknecht made a motion, seconded by Director Constantine, to **approve** the Minutes of March 4, 2021; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Gioia, Groom, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Wagenknecht, Walton, Wilson.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: None.

3. COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVE

The Committee received a presentation from Eddie Ahn, Executive Director of Brightline Defense, a public policy nonprofit dedicated to empowering communities and sustainable environments in traditionally underserved communities, to speak under the Committee’s standing agenda item “Community Perspective”. Mr. Ahn’s presentation featured Brightline Defense’s Air Quality Monitoring Program, and their collaborations with the Community Youth Center of San Francisco, and Central City Single Room Occupancy Collaborative.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Dr. Raymond Tompkins, African-American Community Health Equity Council; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; and Lonnie Mason, Bayview Hunters Point resident.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed how single room occupant dwellings are not meant to be permanent solutions but have become so; factors that contribute to perpetuate environmental racism; the request that the Air District (with legislators) submits a comment letter to the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment regarding Draft CalEnviroScreen 4.0; the need for voting members representing environmental justice to be appointed to regional government agencies; and how Brightline determines the sites and heights for their Clarity-Node S air sensors, and how the collected data is extrapolated.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

4. DISCUSSION ON THE COMMUNITY EQUITY, HEALTH & JUSTICE COMMITTEE’S MISSION STATEMENT AND DRAFT SCHEDULE FOR 2021

Veronica Eady, Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy and Equity, gave the staff presentation *Discussion on the Community Equity, Health & Justice Committee’s Mission Statement and Draft Schedule for 2021*, including: outcome; outline; requested action; background; mission statement; Committee calendar; and feedback requested/prompt.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the request that the first paragraph of the proposed mission statement of the Committee be revised to include “ability status”, so that it would read, “...regardless of race, ethnicity, age, gender identity, national origin, ability status, immigration status, or sexual orientation.”

Committee Action

Director Bauters made a motion, seconded by Director Wagenknecht, to **approve** the proposed calendar for the Community Equity, Health & Justice Committee’s 2021 meeting schedule; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Gioia, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Wagenknecht.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Groom, Walton, Wilson.

5. TRANSPARENT AND EQUITABLE FUNDING PROJECT

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, gave the staff presentation *Transparent and Equitable Funding Project*, including: outcome; requested action; outline; community request; purpose; goals; scope; roadmap and timeline; deliverables timeline; and feedback requested.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Dr. Raymond Tompkins, African-American Community Health Equity Council; Ms. Margaret Gordon, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project; and Lonnie Mason, Bayview Hunters Point resident.

Committee Comments

The Board and staff discussed requests regarding the allocation of funding in the Air District’s Fiscal Year Ending 2022 Proposed Budget, made by members of the public, specifically pertaining to allocations for the Community Air Risk Evaluation Program, AB 167, and disadvantaged communities; the way in which the Air District utilizes its data collection to produce information that the community is asking for; the Air District’s current public requests request process; concerns about not being able to find budget information on the Air District’s website; and the difference between what the public is asking for and what Air District believes the public is asking for.

Committee Action

While this was not originally an action item, Director Bauters made a motion, seconded by Director Constantine, to **continue** this item to the Committee’s May 6, 2021 meeting for further discussion; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Groom, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Wilson.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Gioia, Wagenknecht, Walton.

6. CONSIDERATION OF ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 617 RICHMOND-NORTH RICHMOND-SAN PABLO EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN STEERING COMMITTEE PROPOSED STIPEND

Ms. Eady gave the staff presentation *Consideration of Assembly Bill 617 Richmond - North Richmond - San Pablo Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee Proposed Stipend*, including: outcome; background; and requested action.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Constantine made a motion, seconded by Director Wilson, to **approve** that the stipend amounts for the Richmond - North Richmond - San Pablo Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee members be set to \$100 per meeting attended; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Wilson.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Gioia, Groom, Wagenknecht, Walton.

7. CONSIDERATION OF APPOINTMENT OF CONTRA COSTA HEALTH SERVICES REPRESENTATIVE TO AB 617 RICHMOND-NORTH RICHMOND-SAN PABLO EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN STEERING COMMITTEE

Ms. Eady gave the staff presentation *Consideration of Appointment of Contra Costa County Health Services Representative to Assembly Bill 617 Richmond - North Richmond - San Pablo Area Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee* including: outcome; background; and requested action.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Wilson made a motion, seconded by Director Constantine, to **appoint** Luz Gomez to the Richmond - North Richmond - San Pablo Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee, in her capacity as a Contra Costa County Health Services Agency representative; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Constantine, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Wilson.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: Groom.
ABSENT: Gioia, Wagenknecht, Walton.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Dr. Raymond Tompkins, African-American Community Health Equity Council; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; and Lonnie Mason, Bayview Hunters Point resident.

9. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Director Constantine suggested that the public, Air District staff, and the Board all need to “reset” their understanding and expectations of the Air District’s public record requests process and agree on a process that is more transparent. He said it is also important that Air District staff and the Board clarify what is being asked, if the public requests information directly at a meeting of any kind.

Co-Chair Hurt spoke about the recent increase in anti-Asian crimes and encouraged everyone to speak up if they witness such a crime.

10. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Thursday, May 6, 2021 at 9:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 12:21 p.m.

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Davina Hurt, Tyrone Jue, and Members
of the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: April 29, 2021

Re: Community Perspective

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

The Community Equity, Health & Justice Committee provides local and regional community environmental justice advocates a platform to present and share their expertise and/or lived experiences. Specific subjects/topics will vary based upon each community member's unique experience.

Founded in 2001, GRID Alternatives envisioned a rapid, equitable transition to a world powered by renewable energy that would benefit everyone. Their mission is to build community-powered solutions to advance economic and environmental justice through renewable energy.

Low-income families in the U.S. spend approximately \$75-\$78 billion every year on gasoline. Communities of color are disproportionately impacted by pollution from both gasoline consumption and gasoline production, including disproportionate exposure to airborne lead poisoning from the era of leaded gasoline. By pairing electric vehicles and other modes of transportation with solar power, GRID Alternatives is helping families replace gasoline with sunshine, saving them money and replacing local air pollution with clean energy.

DISCUSSION

Terea Macomber, Electric Vehicle Director, at GRID Alternatives, and members of the GRID team, will discuss Grid Alternatives initiative to make electric vehicles, electric vehicle charging and other clean mobility options more accessible to the communities they serve. Their efforts are initially focused on California, in conjunction with investments from the California Air Resources Board (CARB) in low-carbon transportation equity programs.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Tim Williams
Reviewed by: Mary Ann Okpalaugo

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Davina Hurt, Tyrone Jue, and Members of the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: April 29, 2021

Re: Update on the AB 617 Richmond/San Pablo Community Air Monitoring Plan

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Assembly Bill (AB) 617 was passed in 2017 to improve local air quality and health in disproportionately impacted communities. In September 2018, the California Air Resources Board (CARB) approved the Bay Area Air Quality Management District’s (Air District) recommendation to develop and implement a Community Air Monitoring Plan (CAMP) for the Richmond/San Pablo area. Following extensive engagement with the Richmond/San Pablo CAMP Steering Committee, the CAMP was finalized in summer 2020 and its implementation is ongoing. The CAMP is part of AB 617 efforts collectively known as the Richmond/San Pablo Path to Clean Air.

DISCUSSION

The Richmond/San Pablo CAMP consists of four air monitoring projects selected by the CAMP Steering Committee. The first three projects described in the table below were selected to collect data across the study area for purposes such as improving the overall understanding of air quality in Richmond/San Pablo, identifying locations where air pollution levels are persistently higher, or providing real-time air quality information. A fourth project, led by the Air District, will focus on air toxics monitoring near sources of concern and in nearby neighborhoods, and is expected to begin in the coming months following restrictions due to COVID-19.

Organization(s)	Monitoring Type	Pollutants Measured	Period
Aclima	Mobile monitoring	PM _{2.5} , NO ₂ , O ₃ , CO, CO ₂	Completed August-October 2019
Groundwork Richmond & Ramboll*	Sensor network	PM _{2.5} , NO ₂	Ongoing through 2021
PSE Healthy Energy & APEN*	Sensor network	PM _{2.5} , NO ₂ , O ₃	Ongoing through 2021
Air District	Mobile monitoring	Gas air toxics	Expected to begin summer 2021

*denotes CARB Community Air Grant projects

Data collected through the CAMP are in addition to data from existing regulatory and refinery-related monitoring systems and from other research or grant projects, such as the CARB Community Air Grant project focused on monitoring near coal-related operations in Richmond. Status reports on monitoring efforts, data availability, analyses, and findings are being made available via quarterly update reports. A Monitoring Outreach Team (MOT), comprised of five members of the CAMP Steering Committee, meets monthly with the Air District to help prepare and review these quarterly updates, and conducts ongoing community outreach about the air monitoring efforts. The Committee will receive an update about the most recent data, analyses, and findings from the monitoring efforts.

In February 2021, CARB approved the Air District's recommendation to develop and implement a Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) for the Richmond/San Pablo area. Collectively, the District expects to use the CAMP results along with other information to inform emission and exposure reduction efforts, both for the CERP process and for ongoing air quality improvement efforts outside of the AB 617 process.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT

Resources to implement AB 617 in the Richmond/San Pablo area are in the Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2021 budget.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Dan Alrick
Reviewed by: Ranyee Chiang

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Davina Hurt, Tyrone Jue and Members
of the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: April 29, 2021

Re: Consideration of AB 617 Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Community
Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee Proposed Stipend for Co-Chairs

RECOMMENDED ACTION

The Committee will consider proposed stipend for the Co-Chairs of the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo (Path to Clean Air) Area Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Community Steering Committee.

BACKGROUND

On March 3, 2021, the Air District Board of Directors voted to establish a 31-member community steering committee to help guide the development of a CERP for the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo area. On April 1, 2021, the Committee voted to approve the stipend amount set at \$100 per member. The Committee must now determine the stipend amount for Steering Committee Co-Chairs.

DISCUSSION

Air District staff recommend that the stipend amounts for Co-Chairs be set to \$300 per CERP Steering Committee meeting attended. Co-Chairs will meet multiple times with the Air District per month and will be responsible for facilitating Steering Committee meetings and reporting to the Air District Committees and Board. The stipend amount is commensurate with this increased level of responsibility and work.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None. Stipends will be paid from the current fiscal year AB 617 grant funds.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Kevin Olp
Reviewed by: Greg Nudd

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Davina Hurt, Tyrone Jue and Members
of the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: April 29, 2021

Re: Update on Transparent and Equitable Funding Expenditures and AB 617 Community
Monitoring

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Community members have requested that Air District staff, the Board of Directors and its various Committees provide increased transparency in Air District expenditures in specific communities and across various program areas, including Assembly Bill (AB) 617 implementation and community monitoring.

Additionally, Air District Board of Directors' Chairperson Cindy Chavez and Secretary John Bauters, in a March 1, 2021, memo addressed to the Administration Committee, requested that Air District staff respond to community stakeholder requests for additional information about "the revenues and expenditures related to local environmental monitoring programs and investments made by the Air District via a spreadsheet, or other suitable document for the public."

More specifically, the memo states that information should include:

- The sources of revenue, public and private, that the Air District received and used for community monitoring and affiliated work;
- Any restrictions, limitations or other requirements placed on those funds, or their subparts, that guide, require, or otherwise direct the Air District in the expenditure of those funds;
- Information that identifies whether the funding source is ongoing or one-time in nature;
- A breakdown of fund expenditure by county, accompanied by baseline population details about the communities served;
- The type of expenditure that was made in each county, including but not limited to capital investments, staff time, contract services, or operations & supplies, that illustrate how the investments were expended; and
- Any additional information staff deems necessary and appropriate to providing a holistic picture as to how district revenues are expended for the community's benefit.

The purpose of this memo is to provide information requested regarding revenue sources, funding restrictions and limitations, and Air District expenditures on community monitoring. Staff understands “community monitoring” to mean community-scale, local monitoring efforts related to the implementation of AB 617 (C. Garcia, Chapter 136, Statutes of 2017) and the Air Districts Community Monitoring Program, established in late 2016.

DISCUSSION

Community monitoring in the San Francisco Bay Area Air Basin is currently being implemented through the framework of AB 617. AB 617 requires local air districts to increase their focus on local air pollution in overburdened communities, rather than on traditional regionwide attainment of state and federal air pollution standards. Communities overburdened by air pollution are largely the same communities that have been historically overburdened by industrial water, soil, and air pollution. These same communities have been subjected to discriminatory federal, state, and local policies such as redlining, urban renewal, highway construction and local zoning codes that allow polluting industries to locate in, or alongside, residential neighborhoods, schools, and other sensitive land uses. As a result, these communities have experienced disinvestment, limited access to health services and healthy food, low quality education, and few local parks and open spaces. They are also most often low-income, communities of color.

Previous scientific work has shown that traditional, regional monitoring for determining compliance with regional air quality standards can miss localized hot spots of disproportionate air pollution exposure. One purpose of community monitoring is to identify these localized hot spots and to help determine what changes are needed to eliminate them.

Community Monitoring Funding Sources

There are three sources of funding provided to the Air District specifically for community air monitoring: 1) the Community Air Protection Program (CAPP) AB 617 implementation grants, 2) the Air District’s AB 617 Community Health Impact Fee and Regulation 3 and 3) Schedule X: Major Stationary Source Community Air Monitoring Fee.

Table 1. Community Monitoring Funding Source and Average Annual Revenue

Community Monitoring Funding Source	Estimated Average Annual Revenue
California Air Resources Board (CARB) CAPP Implementation Grants	\$9 million
AB 617 Community Health Impact Fee	\$1 million
Schedule X: Community Air Monitoring Fee	\$1 million
Total	\$11 million

Community Air Protection Program Implementation Grants

Community Air Protection Program implementation grants are provided by the state to local air districts to cover the costs of developing and implementing community emission reduction and/or monitoring plans, i.e., to implement AB 617. The first four grants were approved in California’s state budget bills passed in 2017, 2018, 2019 and 2020. The California Air Resources Board distributes and administers the CAPP grants.

The Air District has received three CAPP grants since the adoption of AB 617, the fourth grant has been approved by the state legislature but has yet to be distributed by CARB. The initial CAPP grant was expended in June 2019. The second grant was expended in December 2020. The third grant is covering current AB 617 implementation costs and is projected to cover costs through the end of the 2022 fiscal year. A fourth year of funding was approved by the state legislature but has not yet been distributed by the California Air Resources Board. The current Governor's budget proposal proposes an additional \$50 million statewide for this program; that funding has yet to be approved by the legislature.

- 17CAPP: \$4.8 million (expended June 2019)
- 18CAPP: \$10 million (expended December 2020)
- 19CAPP: \$9 million (currently spending)
- 20CAPP: \$9 million (total to Air District estimated, pending distribution)

Funding Restrictions

The CARB CAPP grants are intended to support local air districts' implementation of AB 617 only. In other words, funding can be used for actions that enable air districts to establish steering committees, and to develop and implement emissions reduction and/or monitoring programs. Funds can cover staffing, outreach, the development of emission/exposure reduction strategies, and enforcement costs, as well costs to deploy air monitoring, reporting emissions, and implementing new requirements regarding best available retrofit control technologies. The Air District has also used these funds to provide grants to community-based organizations to help prepare communities for development of emission reduction or monitoring plans.

AB 617 Community Health Impact Fee

To augment AB 617 implementation costs, on June 3, 2020 the Air District Board of Directors adopted an AB 617 Community Health Impact Fee, which went into effect on July 1, 2020. The fee applies to Title V facilities owners only. The fee brings in approximately \$1,000,000 per year to cover AB 617 related work, including community air monitoring.

Funding Restrictions

In 2010, Proposition 26 limited how government organizations, like the Air District, can assess and use fees. Specifically, fees can only be assessed to cover the costs associated with regulating the entities paying the fee. Some costs of the AB 617 program are attributable to the emissions of permitted sources. For example, community monitoring is designed to evaluate the impact of all the sources in the Bay Area, including permitted, fee-paying sources. Stationary sources can be large contributors to emissions in some communities (Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo is one example), and therefore the development of community emissions reductions plans for such communities is a necessary expense associated with regulating these sources. Other communities, such as West Oakland and San Jose, are overwhelmingly impacted by mobile sources and therefore, Air District cannot reasonably assess fees on stationary sources to recover costs for developing emission reduction plans in such communities.

Schedule X: Major Stationary Source Community Air Monitoring Fee

In May of 2016, the Air District adopted amendments to the Air District's Regulation 3: Fees. The 2016 amendments included a new Schedule X: Major Stationary Source Community Air Monitoring Fee. The fee covers costs associated with the Air District's Community Air Monitoring Program. The goal of the Community Air Monitoring Program is to establish air monitoring stations in areas where major stationary sources may contribute to impacts in local communities not fully represented by the Air District's current air monitoring network. Data from new monitoring locations would be used to compare air quality in potentially impacted communities with air quality measurements at other Air District sites.

For each major stationary source emitting 35 tons per year or more of organic compounds, sulfur oxides, nitrogen oxides, carbon monoxide and/or PM₁₀ within the vicinity of an Air District proposed community air monitoring location, a fee is charged based on tons of pollutants emitted per year. Fees are assessed based on emissions data reported for the most recent 12-month period prior to billing. The fee amount is \$60.61 per ton of each pollutant emitted over 35 tons per year. The first communities to have air monitoring stations will be in the vicinity of the five petroleum refineries in Richmond, Martinez, Rodeo, Crockett and Benicia. The specific primary stationary source contributors (shown in bold below), in addition to other significant facilities in the area that are subject to the Schedule X fee include:

- **Benicia: Valero Benicia Refinery**
- **Richmond/San Pablo: Chevron Richmond Refinery**, Levin Richmond, Chemtrade West US LLC, and West Contra Costa County Landfill
- **Martinez: Former Shell Martinez Refinery/Current PBF Energy**, NJ and Eco Services; **Former Tesoro Avon Refinery/Current Marathon Refinery**, Martinez Cogen, Plains Products Terminals LLC, Air Products and Chemical, and Central Contra Costa County Sanitary
- **Crockett/Rodeo: Phillips 66 Rodeo Refinery**, Phillips 66 Carbon Plant, Air Liquide, and Crockett Cogeneration

Funding Restrictions

Funds generated from the Schedule X fee can only cover costs associated with the evaluation of existing monitors and planning, siting, and designing new monitors for the Community Monitoring Program. Specifically, Schedule X fee can cover labor, professional services, capital costs and all indirect costs associated with any new monitor installed under the Community Air Monitoring Program, as designated by the Air District's cost recovery policy.

Community Monitoring Expenditures

Since the inception of the Community Monitoring and AB 617 programs, the Air District has spent an estimated \$5.9 million on community monitoring. This estimate is based on labor charges of all Air District staff working on the Community Monitoring Program and Air District monitoring staff implementing AB 617, as well as all contracts for monitoring-related equipment and professional services billed toward AB 617 and Community Monitoring accounts from November 2016 through February 2021.

A significant portion of the funds spent on community monitoring, 55 percent or over \$3.2 million, is associated with hyper-local air monitoring project conducted under an Air District contract with Aclima. In this work, Aclima is making air quality measurements along every publicly accessible roadway in all Bay Area counties, covering 5,000 square miles. The results will be displayed on maps showing estimated annual average concentrations of criteria pollutants and greenhouse gases at a highly localized scale. This information will allow the Air District and communities to make general comparisons about air quality in different locations around the Bay Area and may also help identify areas with persistently higher or lower air pollution.

Table 2. Community Monitoring Expenditures, November 2016 – February 2021

Expenditure Type	Total Community Monitoring Expenditure	Percent of Total Monitoring Expenditures¹
Capital Costs (equipment)	\$ 1.0 million	17%
Professional Services	\$ 3.4 million	57%
Staff Time	\$ 1.5 million	25%
Total Community Monitoring	\$ 5.9 million	100%

¹Percentages may not total to 100 due to rounding.

Community Monitoring Expenditures by County

Community monitoring expenditures, as well as all other Air District expenditures, are typically not tracked by county. Most Air District expenditures, including for community monitoring related to AB 617 and the Community Monitoring Program, are currently tracked at the regional level. However, in July of 2020 the Air District adopted new billing codes to track expenditures in West Oakland and Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo. Additionally, the hyper-local mobile monitoring work, contracted to Aclima, was billed by county, enabling staff to demonstrate some monitoring costs by county. Data that is available is summarized in Table 3. *The data in Table 3 represents only the best information we have; data is not a complete picture of total community monitoring expenditures by county.*

Table 3. Community Monitoring Expenditures by County¹

County	Monitoring Expenditures	Percent of Total Community Monitoring Expenditures
Alameda	\$ 440,000	7%
Labor	N/A	
Professional Services	440,000	
Contra Costa	\$ 621,548	10%
Labor	181,298	
Professional Services	440,000	
Marin/Sonoma	\$ 640,000	11%
Labor	N/A	
Professional Services	640,000	
Napa/Solano	\$ 640,000	11%
Labor	N/A	
Professional Services	640,000	
San Francisco	\$ 40,000	1%
Labor	N/A	
Professional Services	40,000	
San Mateo	\$ 280,000	5%
Labor	N/A	
Professional Services	280,000	
Santa Clara	\$ 760,000	13%
Labor	N/A	
Professional Services	760,000	
Total	3,421,298	58%

¹Because the Aclima project is focused on making measurements on all publicly accessible roadways in the Bay Area, the Aclima costs (nearly all costs in this table) for each county are related to the number and length of the roads in the county.

Transparent & Equitable Funding Project: Improving Location Specific Data

As part of Air District’s effort to demonstrate funding distribution to all communities via the *Transparent & Equitable Funding Project*, staff is collecting additional data to demonstrate, where possible, Air District expenditures by location. This effort would include all expenditures across all programs, not only community monitoring, i.e., the Community Monitoring Program and AB 617 implementation. The initial analysis will be for the most recent complete calendar or fiscal year. Funding distribution data would be shared via tables, narratives, and maps. Since the analysis will be retrospective, it will only include contracts, grants, supplies, and professional services, not labor costs. Currently, labor costs remain tracked only for AB 617-related work in West Oakland and Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo and the Aclima work.

Moving forward, staff is working to improve location specific data. For example, all expenditures, including equipment, professional services, and labor utilizing Schedule X Community Monitoring fees will be trackable by community location, i.e., Benicia, Crockett, Martinez, Richmond/San Pablo, and Rodeo. Other programs will be reviewed to determine if location data can be better tracked. Future analysis of funding distributions will include location specific data for the Community Monitoring Program and other location data where we are able to improve location data in specific programs.

More detailed information on the *Transparent & Equitable Funding Project* has been shared with this committee in an April 2021 report to this committee, and will be covered briefly in the May 6, 2021, staff presentation.

County Demographic Data

County-level demographic data for the San Francisco Bay Area is provided in Table 4 below. Data for Solano and Sonoma Counties is based on county-wide populations. The legal boundary of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District includes all of Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, Napa, San Francisco, San Mateo, and Santa Clara Counties, but only southwestern Solano County and southern Sonoma County.

Table 4. SF Bay Area County Demographic Data, 2019

	Total Population	White*	Black/ African American*	American Indian, Alaska Native*	Asian*	Native Hawaiian, Pacific Islander*	Two or More Races*	Hispanic or Latino (of any race)
Alameda	1,656,754	31.4%	10.3%	0.3%	29.9%	0.8%	4.5%	22.4%
Contra Costa	1,142,251	43.8%	8.4%	0.2%	16.5%	0.5%	4.7%	25.6%
Marin	259,943	71.2%	2.1%	0.2%	5.8%	0.1%	3.8%	16.0%
Napa	139,623	52.4%	2.0%	0.3%	8.0%	0.2%	2.6%	34.1%
San Francisco	874,961	40.5%	5.0%	0.2%	34.1%	0.3%	4.2%	15.2%
San Mateo	767,423	39.2%	2.2%	0.2%	28.3%	1.3%	4.0%	24.4%
Santa Clara	1,927,470	31.5%	2.3%	0.2%	36.3%	0.3%	3.6%	25.5%
Solano	441,829	38.0%	13.5%	0.3%	15.0%	0.9%	5.5%	26.5%
Sonoma	499,772	63.2%	1.5%	0.5%	4.0%	0.3%	3.3%	26.7%

Source: 2019 U.S. Census Bureau American Community Survey, 5-year estimates data profile

*Not Hispanic or Latino

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Christy Riviere
Reviewed by: Ila Perkins, Tim Williams, Greg Nudd, and Veronica Eady

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairpersons Davina Hurt, Tyrone Jue and Members
of the Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: April 29, 2021

Re: Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2022 Program Plan

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Since the passage of Assembly Bill (AB) 617 (C. Garcia, Chapter 136, Statutes of 2017), Air District staff has been dedicated to its implementation. AB 617 was signed into law alongside AB 398. Assembly Bill 398 extended California's cap-and-trade program for greenhouse gas emissions. AB 617 was intended to address environmental justice concerns regarding the extension of the cap-and-trade program. AB 617 requires the California Air Resources Board (CARB), with input from community groups, air districts and others, to select locations from around the state to prepare community-led plans to reduce emissions of toxic air contaminants and criteria pollutants. Communities can also be selected to do community-led monitoring. The primary requirement for community selection is a demonstrated high cumulative exposure burden to air pollution and associated health vulnerabilities. In the Bay Area, and around the state, these communities are often the same communities that are home to large industrial facilities covered under cap-and-trade; they are also often low-income communities of color.

Throughout 2018, Bay Area residents worked with the Air District to select communities for action under AB 617. Residents gave top priority to areas impacted by oil refineries and other large industries, odors and woodsmoke, as well as places near congested transportation corridors and those that have a history of air quality violations, contamination, and environmental injustice.

On September 27, 2018, the CARB approved the Air District's recommended communities for year one of the program, i.e. West Oakland for an emission reduction plan and Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo for a monitoring plan. Eastern Contra Costa County (East County), East Oakland, Eastern San Francisco, San Leandro, San Jose, the Tri-Valley, and Vallejo were selected to move forward with a monitoring and/or emission reduction plan over the next five years.

In September 2019, the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Community Air Monitoring Plan Steering voted to recommend that the California Air Resources Board formally select the Richmond-San Pablo area as a Community Emission Reduction Planning community. This nomination was approved by the California Air Resources Board in February 2021.

DISCUSSION

For Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2022, staff will be working to implement AB 617 through a wide variety of efforts. Efforts will focus on region-wide AB 617-related activities that benefit all AB 617 communities, activities specific to communities already designated for action by the state, communities pending designation, and a new community to be selected for action by the end of 2021. Staff will also work on overall AB 617 program changes intended to move the design and implementation of the overall program to be more community-led.

Regional/All Communities

Much of our work on AB 617 implementation in the next fiscal year can be considered “regional” as will benefit all AB 617 communities. This work includes emissions inventory and modeling, planning, air monitoring and rules-related work. Emissions inventory and modeling will focus on PM_{2.5} and air toxics to gain a better understanding of emissions across all communities. Staff will also perform a region-wide analysis of which sources contribute most to regional and local air pollution levels.

In planning, staff will develop improved local government assistance, refining support to AB 617 communities, and will develop best practices for developing environmental justice elements for local general plans, as required by Senate Bill 1000.

Monitoring efforts will focus on developing educational resources on monitoring techniques and data interpretation to build the technical capacity of community members. Staff will also document maintenance and enhancement of mobile and portable monitoring capabilities to improve transparency about new instruments and monitoring methods. Finally, hyper-local monitoring data will be made available to the public and emissions data from facilities will be used to fill in data gaps.

The Rules division will work on a variety of rules that will benefit all AB 617 communities. Key rules include a new permitting rule, several BARCT rules, rules regarding dust sources impacting communities, in addition to reducing toxic emissions from backup generators at sources such as data centers.

Designated Communities

Designated communities are those that have been recommended and selected for a community emission reduction plan and/or monitoring plan, i.e. West Oakland and Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo. In West Oakland, we will continue working to implement *Owning our Air*, the community’s adopted emission reduction plan. Enforcement efforts will also continue, including following up on complaints, conducting inspections, and issuing notices of violations. In Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo, we will be working with the community to develop the community emission reduction plan, as well as continue to implement the community monitoring plan.

New Community

In late 2021, the Air District may be recommending a third community to the CARB for selection to develop a community emission and/or monitoring plan. Therefore, staff will be working to develop a community selection process, including selection criteria and community participation in the selection. In the latter half of the fiscal year, staff will work with the newly selected community on designing the steering committee selection process and begin early stages of the planning process.

Communities Pending Designation (High Priority Communities)

Eastern Contra Costa County (East County), East Oakland, Eastern San Francisco, San Leandro, San Jose, the Tri-Valley, and Vallejo were selected to move forward with a monitoring and/or emission reduction plan over the next five years. Some of the work this coming fiscal year in communities pending designation, formally referred to as high priority communities, will include development of air quality fact sheets for communities, hot spots analysis, air quality 101 training via the Bay Air Center, the development of interim community boundaries, and an understanding of major pollution sources. We will also do early planning work in each community, including developing community profiles and performing an inventory of other planning efforts. Community capacity building grants will also continue to be implemented in each community pending designation.

Future AB 617 Program

This fiscal year, staff will be working to explore ways to transform the AB 617 implementation program to be more community-designed and led. Currently, only the community emission reduction and monitoring plans are community-led. The overall AB 617 program is largely developed by Air District staff. The current program is designed to support the development and implementation of community-led plans, and to meet state requirements, i.e. BARCT rules, enforcement plan and tracking progress and reporting requirements.

During this coming fiscal year, staff will be exploring ways to expand how the community may participate in the development of the overall program. For example, the community could play a larger role in prioritizing our work efforts, the community selection process, broader community input on the identification and prioritization of strategies and plan implementation. More community input on AB 617 program development and implementation is in keeping with ideas being considered by the statewide AB 617 Consultation Group.

Next Steps

Staff will continue to develop the detailed work plan for AB 617 implementation in FYE 2022. Additional details and budget information for the AB 617 program will be provided at the June 2021 Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Christy Riviere
Reviewed by: Greg Nudd and Veronica Eady