

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Community and Public Health Committee Meeting
Thursday, March 5, 2020

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Community and Public Health Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Shirlee Zane, called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Shirlee Zane; Vice Chairperson Mark Ross; and Directors Teresa Barrett, David Canepa, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, Liz Kniss, and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Directors Davina Hurt and Nate Miley.

Also Present: Board Chair Rod Sinks.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS, PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54954.3

No requests received.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 9:36 a.m.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 30, 2019

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Barrett made a motion, seconded by Vice Chair Ross, to **approve** the Minutes of October 30, 2019; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Canepa, Gioia, Haggerty, Kniss, Sinks, Ross.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: Zane.
ABSENT: Hurt, Miley, Wagenknecht.

4. BAY AIR CENTER: TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR COMMUNITY AIR QUALITY PROJECTS

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, introduced Michael Flagg, Principal Air Quality Specialist, who gave the staff presentation *Bay Air Center: Technical Assistance for Community Air Quality Projects*, including: outline; types of air quality monitoring; many needs for technical assistance; purpose and guiding principles; types of expertise offered; types of support; project examples; and Bay Air Center phases and next steps.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed how technical support is being offered to pilot air quality projects that may be located in Assembly Bill (AB) 617 communities, as the Air District is already initiating community air monitoring plans there; how the Air District prioritizes communities for pilot projects; what next steps would occur after monitoring data is collected in pilot communities, and the suggestion that solutions be applied/implemented in tangible ways that the public can see; the costs for the pilot projects and their funding sources; the need to clarify to the public that the “Bay Air Center” is actually a service, not a physical building; whether the Bay Air Center would be involved in the Air District’s public notice process regarding projects, facilities, and permits that are under review, or address increasing levels of pollution due to population growth and additional residential construction in a given community; whether real-time data will be publicly available; the availability of low-cost monitors, whether that technology is something the Air District would want to accumulate, and whether the Air District plans to recommend particular brands or models to the public; concerns about the conflicting data between Air District and low-cost monitors; the scope of the “Air Quality and Air Sensors 101” training and technical support program being offered to community schools; the suggestion of holding a resource fair for the communities in which projects are being piloted; anticipated concerns from the public about the delays in the Air District’s rulemaking schedules; and the anticipated timeframe of the Air District’s Aclima data release.

NOTED PRESENT; Director Wagenknecht was noted present at 9:51 a.m.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN STATUS UPDATE

Mr. Nudd introduced Aneesh Rana, Public Information Officer, and Kristen Law, Community Engagement Specialist, who gave the staff presentation *Public Participation Plan Status Update*, including: Air District’s mission; what do we mean by public participation; why do we engage the

public; Public Participation Plan (Plan) overview; Plan implementation; Plan status; 2013 spectrum of participation; and what's next.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed how the Air District measures the success of its public engagement methods, and a request for a “lessons learned” summary that indicates what has not worked well; the suggestion that this presentation be given to the Board’s new Ad Hoc Committee on Equity and Environmental Justice; the opinion that the success of the (AB 617) West Oakland Community Action Plan was due to the Air District’s collaboration with its partner, the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project staff, as opposed to one partner dominating the other; whether the Air District’s new community engagement guide will be published in multiple languages, and how the Air District plans to utilize focus groups as the development of this guide commences; the suggestion that Board members engage with their constituents about air quality as an extension of Air District outreach; the process for filing an air quality complaint with the Air District’s complaint system; and whether a lack of the public’s presence at committee and Board meetings indicates approval or criticism.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

6. CHALLENGE OF HEALTH DATA ANALYSIS

Mr. Nudd introduced Dr. Judith Cutino, Health Officer, who gave the staff presentation *Challenges of Health Data Analysis*, including: overview; why the interest in collecting health data; who collects health data and what data are collected; health data analysis is complex; air pollution exposure is not the sole risk factor contributing to health outcomes; asthma hospitalizations have gone down, but asthma emergency room visits went up; multiple factors may be contributing to the declining trend in asthma hospitalizations; and next steps for community action plans.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed whether the Air District includes the Centers for Disease Control and Protection as a source from which to collect health data; an article from the *Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association*, entitled “Emissions Reduction Policies and Recent Trends in Southern California’s Ambient Air Quality,” with the suggestion that a similar study be conducted in the Bay Area, and the request for a presentation indicating whether the Air District’s regulations have resulted in less emissions and health impacts; the fact that health data may not take undocumented individuals or those who cannot afford health insurance into account; the need for proper conveyance of an understandable interpretation of health data; the need to be able to quantify potential savings of

time and money due to emission reductions, and how to confirm that reducing emissions will reduce health impacts; the anticipated timelines of when health data results will be published; whether counties' historical health data is a reliable or appropriate resource; the suggestion of reciting the Air District's mission statement after the Pledge of Allegiance at committee and Board meetings; the suggestion that the Committee meets monthly; the need for an enhanced public engagement strategy regarding the correlation between exposure to emissions and health impacts; the suggestion of focusing on filtration systems and indoor air quality this year; and the Advisory Council's upcoming Particulate Matter (PM) Symposium, and how best to avoid future scheduling conflicts of the Board members.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

None.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Although the next meeting had been scheduled for Thursday, May 7, 2020, at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105 at 9:30 a.m., after further discussion, the next meeting was scheduled for Wednesday, May 20, 2020, at 2:30 p.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:56 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards