

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Joint Meeting of the Board of Directors and Advisory Council
Wednesday, December 16, 2020

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

CALL TO ORDER

1. Board of Directors (Board) Chairperson, Rod Sinks, called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Board Members: Committee Chairperson Rod Sinks; Vice Chairperson Cindy Chavez; Secretary Karen Mitchoff; and Directors Teresa Barrett, John Bauters, Pauline Russo Cutter, John Gioia, Carole Groom, David Hudson, Davina Hurt, Liz Kniss, Nate Miley, Katie Rice, Mark Ross, Brad Wagenknecht, Lori Wilson, Shirlee Zane.

Advisory Council (Council) Members: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chairperson Dr. Michael Kleinman; and members Dr. Tim Lipman, Dr. Jane Long, Dr. Linda Rudolph, and Dr. Gina Solomon.

Absent: Board Members: Margaret Abe-Koga, David Canepa, Scott Haggerty, Tyrone Jue, Jim Spering, and Shamann Walton.

Advisory Council Members: None.

Also Present: None.

2. **PRESENTATION OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL'S PARTICULATE REDUCTION STRATEGY REPORT AND AIR DISTRICT STAFF PRESENTATION OF NEXT STEPS**

Chair Sinks gave opening remarks about the Advisory Council's (Council) development of its Particulate Matter Reduction Strategy Report, which took eighteen months to complete. He introduced Council Chairperson, Stan Hayes, who gave the presentation *Advisory Council Particulate Matter (PM) Reduction Strategy Report*, including: PM Symposium Series – timeline; October 28, 2019 event, PM community design team members, February 27, 2020 event, and community and industry

presentations to the Council; and PM Reduction Strategy Report contents – Council Findings, PM Reduction Statements, Framework for Evaluations, and Recommended Actions.

Then, Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, introduced Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, who gave the staff presentation *Advisory Council PM 1 Strategy Report: Next Steps*, including: importance of the PM Reduction Strategy Report; developing an equity framework; exposure per capita assessed to supplement rulemaking; and PM proposed response – new and future initiatives, planned initiatives, and next steps.

Then, Chair Sinks invited the Council members to introduce themselves to the Board members, also acknowledging the contributions of Professor Severin Borenstein, who was formerly a member of the Council, but resigned due to schedule conflicts.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Bayview Hunter’s Point resident; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Dr. Stephen Rosenblum, Palo Alto resident; Tony Fisher, Coalition for Clean Air; Mary Gabriel; Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance; and Charles Davidson, Hercules resident.

Board Comments

The Board, Council, and staff discussed the convergence of COVID-19 and air pollution in low-income communities, and whether N-95 respirators are effective at preventing the spreading of COVID-19; the suggestion that Air District staff speak with Carol Hart, the new Interim General Manager of the Sonoma County Agricultural and Open Space District, regarding using Pacific Gas & Electric settlement funding to mitigate wildfires; the need for legislation to ban wood burning; the request for an action plan from the Air District regarding how to implement the Council’s recommended actions; the study, “The Effect of Air Pollution on Lung Development from 10 to 18 Years of Age”, published in 2004 in the *New England Journal of Medicine*; the suggestion that the Air District provides comments on city/county projects that increase PM and other harmful pollution; which pages of the Particulate Matter Reduction Strategy Report would most benefit Assembly Bill (AB) 617 communities; whether the Council considered an addendum in its Report to address the highly-impacted Bay Area AB 617 communities; the strength of study in highly-impacted communities; intended and actual activities of the PM Community Design Team; the suggestion for a summary of the Report that addresses the need for community input and involvement as a next step; the impact of PM on the development of children’s’ lungs, and whether there is a specific age bracket during which PM is more detrimental to young people; opportunities for mitigation of stationary source pollution that will have measurable impacts and reduce length PM exposure; whether PM impacts the cognition of seniors; whether time lost, mortality and health care costs associated with air pollution exposure can be calculated, and the study, “The Mortality and Medical Costs of Air Pollution: Evidence from Changes in Wind Direction”, published in 2019 in the *American Economic Review*; the suggestion that Air District staff arrange for Dr. Raymond Tompkins to give his presentation, *True Science*, at an upcoming Board or Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion meeting; and the request for sensitivity training for Air District staff to enhance the productivity of exchanges with community members.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

3. BOARD OF DIRECTORS CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chair Sinks had nothing to report.

4. ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chair Hayes thanked Chair Sinks for serving as the Council's Board Liaison and Ex-Officio member for the previous five years.

5. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER

Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, thanked the Council for spending eighteen months developing and finalizing the *Draft Report*, and for the Board members who participated in this joint meeting.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were made by Ladonna Williams; All Positives Possible; and Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Bayview Hunter's Point resident.

7. BOARD AND COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

None.

8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting will be held at the Call of the Chair.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 1:33 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hirtzka

Marcy Hirtzka
Clerk of the Boards