

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 749-5073

Board of Directors Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, February 19, 2020

### **APPROVED MINUTES**

*Note: Audio recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the  
Bay Area Air Quality Management District at  
[www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas](http://www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas)*

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

1. **Opening Comments:** Board of Directors (Board) Chairperson, Rod Sinks, called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

#### **Roll Call:**

Present: Chairperson Rod Sinks; Vice Chairperson Cindy Chavez; Secretary Karen Mitchoff; and Directors Margaret Abe-Koga, Teresa Barrett, John J. Bauters, David J. Canepa, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, David Hudson, Davina Hurt, Tyrone Jue, Katie Rice, Mark Ross, Jim Spring, Brad Wagenknecht, and Shirlee Zane.

Absent: Directors Pauline Russo Cutter, Carole Groom, Liz Kniss, Nate Miley, Shamann Walton, and Lori Wilson.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

2. **Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3**

No requests received.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 9:33 a.m.

#### **CONSENT CALENDAR (OUT OF ORDER, ITEMS 4-9)**

3. Minutes of the Board of Directors Special Meeting/Retreat of January 29, 2020
4. Board Communications Received from January 29, 2020 through February 18, 2020
5. Notices of Violations Issued and Settlements in Excess of \$10,000 in the month of January 2020
6. Air District Personnel on Out-of-State Business Travel
7. Quarterly Report of the Executive Office and Division Activities for the Months of October 2019 – December 2019

8. Authorization to Execute a Contract to Fund Improvements to Estimates of Air Pollution Emissions from Residential Wood Burning in the San Francisco Bay Area

Public Comments

No requests received.

Board Comments

None.

Board Action

Director Bauters made a motion, seconded by Director Hudson, to **approve** the Consent Calendar Items 4 through 9, inclusive; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Abe-Koga, Barrett, Bauters, Canepa, Chavez, Haggerty, Hudson, Hurt, Jue, Mitchoff, Rice, Ross, Sinks, Spering, Wagenknecht, Zane.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Cutter, Gioia, Groom, Kniss, Miley, Walton, Wilson.

**COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS (ITEM 3)**

9. The Board of Directors recognized Ms. Margaret Gordon and Mr. Brian Beveridge, from the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project, for their work on the West Oakland Community Action Plan. Ms. Gordon and Mr. Beveridge were awarded with the Air District's first Community Leadership Award and gave remarks about their experience working with the Air District on Assembly Bill (AB) 617 in West Oakland. The Board thanked Ms. Gordon and Mr. Beveridge for their stewardship of an innovative and exemplary model to other communities.

**10. Update on Advancing Racial Equity at the Air District (ITEM 12)**

Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Mary Ann Okpalaugo, Manager of the Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion. With Tim Williams of the Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion, Kristen Law of Community Engagement, and Derrick Tang of the Technology Implementation Office, Ms. Okpalaugo gave the staff presentation *Update on Advancing Racial Equity at the Air District*, including: outline; normalize; organize; operationalize; framework for racial equity; workforce development; demographics; highlight – demographic opportunities; Community Health AB 617: leading with equity; public investment: equity in incentive programs; ongoing efforts and future areas of work; key priorities for 2020; and recognition of 2019 Government Alliance on Race and Equity (GARE) Learning and Implementation Cohorts.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Board Comments

The Board and staff discussed the formation of a new Board committee (Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Environmental Justice); the demographics of Air District promotions in 2019; whether the Air District’s Clean Cars for All program analyzes racial demographics of the program’s awardees; how the Air District educates stationary/magnet sources of pollution about the health risks that impact the residents within their communities; community partners (organizations) of the Air District that analyze emissions impacts to disadvantaged communities; the gender and racial composition of “Executive Management” at the Air District, and the request for a chart indicating number of positions and genders in each presented class; the suggestion that the Air District offers continuing education and training opportunities to its employees, to refresh messaging on equity and inclusion; how proactive the Air District is at seeking and developing a pipeline of employee candidates who are of color, female, or those who have been underrepresented in science, technology, engineering and math (STEM) careers; to what extent the Air District’s job requirements may be impacting potential candidates; whether the Air District analyzes the ethnicity of its job applicants; promotional opportunities and the Air District’s mentoring and leadership development programs; the request for a chart showing trends and comparisons in demographics at the Air District over several years (as opposed to a snapshot of one calendar year); Air District staff’s opinion of the formation of the proposed Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Environmental Justice; ways in which Board members can be more engaged and support the advancement of equity at the Air District; investments the Air District can make/have made to improve the air quality in disadvantaged communities; reasons that may deter women and minority groups from pursuing employment in particular sectors; the need to accelerate policy and behavioral change in this area; the Air District’s intern program, and how the Air District follows up with the interns once internships end; the suggestion that the Air District physically send employees who are female and/or people of color to recruit for Air District employment at universities, intentionally seeking other women and people of color; how the Air District establishes the manner/attitude in which its GARE cohorts are conducted; the history of the Air District’s short-lived Environmental Justice Working Group in 2001; and the suggestion that the Air District becomes a field trip destination for students.

Board Action

Director Bauters made a motion, seconded by Vice Chair Chavez, to **approve** the formation of an Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Environmental Justice, for a period of one year and, in the event the Board is not ready to make the Committee permanent, there is an option to extend for one additional year.; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

- AYES: Abe-Koga, Barrett, Bauters, Canepa, Chavez, Gioia, Haggerty, Hudson, Hurt, Jue, Mitchoff, Rice, Ross, Sinks, Spering, Wagenknecht, Zane.
- NOES: None.
- ABSTAIN: None.
- ABSENT: Cutter, Groom, Kniss, Miley, Walton, Wilson.

**11. The State Air Resources Board’s Environmental Justice Work (ITEM 13)**

Mr. Broadbent introduced Veronica Eady, Assistant Executive Officer for Environmental Justice at the California Air Resources Board (CARB), who gave the presentation *Environmental Justice*,

including: addressing air pollution disparities; framing environmental justice in California; AB 1628; civil rights; history of environmental justice at CARB; California's Global Warming Solutions Act; impacts from the Cap and Trade program; AB 617; how CARB meets communities, shares capacity, and provides financial support; Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund; Cap and Trade program funds; diversity, equity, and inclusion; GARE; plan of action for racial equity; what's next; and emerging environmental justice issues for the new decade.

#### Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

#### Board Comments

The Board and staff discussed CARB's utilization of the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's mapping tool, CalEnviroScreen; the importance of CARB's allocation of funds to air districts to execute AB 617 implementation; the request that the Board agendaize the Phillips 66 Refinery Expansion project in Rodeo for an upcoming Board meeting; locations of employers of the participants from CARB's Agricultural Worker Vanpool Pilot Project; and whether any legislation similar to AB 617 and AB 1628 currently exists in California.

#### Board Action

None; receive and file.

### **COMMITTEE REPORT**

#### **12. Report of the Personnel Committee Meeting of February 5, 2020 (ITEM 10)**

Personnel Committee Chair, Jim Spring, read the following Committee report:

*The Committee met on Wednesday, February 5, 2020, and approved the minutes of October 16, 2019.*

*The Committee then met in Closed Session to conduct performance evaluations for the Executive Officer and General Counsel. Following the Closed Session, the Committee announced that it had spent time discussing the Board members' evaluations of the Executive Officer and General Counsel, as well as the performance review process.*

*The next meeting of the Personnel Committee will be held at the call of the Chair. This concludes the Chair Report of the Personnel Committee.*

#### Public Comments

No requests received.

Board Comments

None.

Board Action

None; receive and file.

**CLOSED SESSION (ITEM 11) THIS ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE MARCH 4, 2020 BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING**

**13. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATIONS - (Government Code Section 54957 and 54957.6)**

*Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957 and 54957.6, the Board will meet in closed session to conduct performance evaluations of the Executive Officer and General Counsel.*

**PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

**14. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3**

No requests received.

**BOARD MEMBERS' COMMENTS**

**15. Board Members' Comments**

- Director Spering said that he was in favor of holding multiple Board committee meetings on the same day, rather than having each meeting on a separate day, and asked that staff propose such a schedule for the Board to consider. The Board and staff discussed the request that this issue be agendized for the upcoming Legislative Committee meeting, and the need for a tactful approach, should this issue be brought to the attention of the Legislature; how Board member compensation may need to be changed, should this scheduling change be implemented; the Air District's support of this proposed scheduling change; reasons to leave the Board member compensation structure as it currently is; the suggestion that Board members who use active transit to attend Board and committee meetings receive the same compensation as those who drive in hybrid or electric vehicles, while those who drive gasoline-powered vehicles receive less.
- Director Spering discouraged further use of the metal detector in the lobby of the Bay Area Metro Center that Air District meeting attendees must use.
- Director Rice reported that, in her capacity as a California Coastal Commissioner, she attended a meeting at the Port of Long Beach, at which, the Port discussed its goals of reaching zero emissions for terminal equipment by 2030 and for trucks by 2035. Also discussed was the City of Long Beach's first Climate Action and Adaptation Plan.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

**16. Report of the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer**

Mr. Broadbent had nothing to report.

**17. Chairperson's Report**

Chair Sinks had nothing to report.

**18. Time and Place of Next Meeting**

Wednesday, March 4, 2020, at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

**19. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 12:20 p.m.

*/s/ Marcy Hiratzka*  
Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards