

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Meeting
Wednesday, July 1, 2020

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

The Ad Hoc Committee (Committee) on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Chairperson, Davina Hurt, called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.

Present: Chairperson Davina Hurt; and Directors John Bauters, John Gioia, Carole Groom, Tyrone Jue, Nate Miley, Mark Ross, Shamann Walton, Lori Wilson, and Shirlee Zane.

Absent: Director Katie Rice.

Also Present: Board Chair Rod Sinks.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MARCH 25, 2020

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Bauters made a motion, seconded by Director Wilson, to **approve** the Minutes of March 25, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Gioia, Groom, Hurt, Miley Ross, Sinks, Walton, Wilson, Zane.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Jue, Rice.

3. REPORT BACK FROM COMMITTEE CHAIR DAVINA HURT'S MEETING WITH BAY AREA ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LEADERS

Ad Hoc Committee Chair Hurt reported on the May 26, 2020 virtual meeting attended by herself (in her capacity as Chair of this committee), Chair Sinks, and Bay Area environmental justice advocates representing Vallejo, Bayview/Hunters Point, Richmond, and East and West Oakland and other Assembly Bill (AB) 617 priority community representatives. Attendees shared past and present air quality concerns, aspirations for integration with the Ad Hoc Committee, and expressed the need to coordinate comprehensive solutions to their concerns.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the manner in which the Air District/the Ad Hoc Committee will continue to solicit community representatives' feedback and input; the suggestion of appointing one Board member from each Bay Area county to the proposed Community Advisory Council and concerns about this approach; and the suggestion of including the Mayor of Pittsburg, Jelani Killings, in future group discussions.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

4. CONSIDERATION OF REVISED AD HOC COMMITTEE ON EQUITY, ACCESS, AND INCLUSION CHARTER

Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Mary Ann Okpalaugo, Acting Director of the Air District's Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion, who gave the staff presentation *Consideration of Revised Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Charter*. The Committee was presented with revised language for its charter and suggested various revisions to the language.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Andrés Soto, Communities for a Better Environment (CBE).

NOTED PRESENT: Director Jue was noted present at 10:30 a.m.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the suggestion of adding "immigration status" after "national origin"; and directed staff to consider public comments received today regarding the Richmond Community Emission Reduction Plan (CERP) Community Design Team.

Proposed Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Charter (based on revisions that Committee members made on March 25 and July 1, 2020):

“The Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion will advise the Board of Directors regarding equitable and inclusive actions the Air District takes to create a healthy breathing environment for all people of the Bay Area, regardless of race, ethnicity, age, gender identity, national origin, immigration status, or sexual orientation. The Ad Hoc Committee will oversee staff efforts in developing policies for both internal and external operations, which impact the Bay Area.

Internal operations include applying an equity lens to programs, policies, practices and procedures related to staffing, recruitment, promotions, inclusive practices in the workplace, contracting for capital projects and services, and continuous racial equity training. External operations include addressing disparities by applying an equity lens to Air District programs, policies, practices, and procedures. The Committee will prioritize traditionally marginalized and disinvested communities for investment opportunities to ensure communities highly impacted by air pollution receive program and policy prioritization.”

Committee Action

Director Hurt made a motion, seconded by Director Hudson, to **approve** the amended Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Charter; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Bauters, Gioia, Groom, Hurt, Jue, Miley, Ross, Sinks, Walton, Wilson, Zane.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Rice.

5. DISCUSSION OF KEY DELIVERABLES OF THE AD HOC COMMITTEE ON EQUITY, ACCESS, AND INCLUSION

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, gave the staff presentation *Discussion of Key Deliverables of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion*, including key deliverables; and proposed workplan elements.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Andrés Soto, CBE; Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance, Janet Johnson, Sunflower Alliance; and Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Clean Air Health Alliance.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed appreciation for the new Community Benefits program described in the presentation, the request for its acceleration, and the desire for the Air District’s focus to be prevention vs remediation; the suggestion of having one representative from each Bay

Area county on the proposed Community Advisory Council; the need to take into account pollution burden in communities where new or modified sources are seeking permits; the composition of other air districts' governing boards, some of which have a designated seat for a community member, and the legislative action that the Air District would need to take to have similar community representation on its governing board; whether the Air District has the authority to increase the amounts of the fines and penalties that it may collect; and the community's request for a youth element integrated into the workplan, as well as metrics with which to measure success of the plan's implementation.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

6. CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD'S (CARB) ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE WORK

Veronica Eady, Assistant Executive Officer for Environmental Justice at the California Air Resources Board, gave the presentation *Environmental Justice*, including: addressing air pollution disparities; framing environmental justice in California – AB 1628 and civil rights; history of environmental justice at CARB – policies and actions, California Global Warming Solutions Act, impacts from Cap and Trade, AB 617, we meet communities, we share capacity, we provide financial support; Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund – Cap and Trade funds; Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion – Government Alliance on Race and Equity and plan of action for racial equity; and what's next – emerging environmental justice issues for the new decade.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Kevin Mathieu; Janet Johnson, Sunflower Alliance; and Andrés Soto, CBE.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed challenges that they have faced doing this work at the state level; the importance of acknowledging uncomfortable feelings regarding inequality; the need to utilize the Bay Area's environmental justice community in an advisory role; Assemblyman Rob Bonta's new legislation that would address discriminatory 911 calls motivated by an individual's race, religion, sex, or any other protected class by designating such reports as a hate crime; and a previous Air District Public Hearing at which, Dr. Henry Clark experienced disrespectful and unacceptable treatment while providing public testimony.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

7. UPDATE ON OFFICE OF DIVERSITY, EQUITY & INCLUSION | INTERNAL EFFORTS TO ADVANCE RACIAL EQUITY

Mary Ann Okpalauugo, Acting Director of the Air District’s Office of Diversity, Equity & Inclusion, introduced Tim Williams, Staff Specialist, who gave the staff presentation *Update on Office of Diversity, Equity & Inclusion Internal Efforts to Advance Racial Equity*, including: 2020 priorities; demographics by gender and race/ethnicity; and demographic opportunities 2019.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Dr. Raymond Tompkins, Clean Air Health Alliance.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the desire to see more racial diversity among Air District staff; appreciation for the Air District’s targeted recruitment to black students and intentionally inviting them to apply for Air District jobs; and the observation of gender imbalance among Air District executives.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments, received via electronic mail, and read aloud by Vanessa Johnson, Manager of Executive Operations, were submitted by Alissa Meleyco, CBE.

9. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Director Zane quoted Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. by saying, “In the end, we will remember not the words of our enemies, but the silence of our friends.”

10. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the conclusion of the meeting, the next meeting date was to be at the Call of the Chair. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Thursday, September 10, 2020, at 9:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 12:34 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards