



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

AD HOC COMMITTEE
ON EQUITY, ACCESS, AND INCLUSION

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

DAVINA HURT – CHAIR
JOHN GIOIA
TYRONE JUE
KATIE RICE
SHAMANN WALTON
SHIRLEE ZANE

JOHN BAUTERS
CAROLE GROOM
NATE MILEY
MARK ROSS
LORI WILSON

**THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY
EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY
GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM**

- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT’S AGENDA WEBPAGE AVAILABLE AT**

www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://zoom.us/j/92975666414>

(669) 900-6833 or (408) 638-0968

WEBINAR ID: 929 7566 6414

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENT CAN USE THE “RAISE HAND” FEATURE BY DIALING “*9”. IN ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**

**MONDAY
DECEMBER 14, 2020
9:30 A.M.**

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.

***Public Comment on Agenda Items** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Committee. No speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 5, 2020

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Committee will consider approving the attached draft minutes of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion meeting of November 5, 2020.

3. REPORT BACK FROM COMMITTEE CHAIR DAVINA HURT'S COMMUNITY MEETING

J. Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

Committee Chair Davina Hurt will provide a report on a community meeting held on December 1, 2020.

4. COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVE

J. Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive community perspective from community advocates.

5. **CONSIDER RECOMMENDING FORMATION OF A BOARD-APPOINTED COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE FOR THE RICHMOND-NORTH RICHMOND-SAN PABLO COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN**

J. Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive a presentation to consider recommending a Board-appointed Community Steering Committee for the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan.

6. **COMPOSITION OF THE RICHMOND-NORTH RICHMOND-SAN PABLO ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 617 COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN (CERP) COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE**

J. Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive a presentation to discuss the composition of the Community Steering Committee for the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Assembly Bill (AB) 617 Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Community Steering Committee.

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have three minutes each to address the Committee.

8. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

9. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the Call of the Chair.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Terri Levels, at (415) 749-4667 or by email at tlevels@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

DECEMBER 2020

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion	Monday	14	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Special Meeting	Wednesday	16	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors & Advisory Council Joint Meeting	Wednesday	16	10:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee	Thursday	17	11:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

JANUARY 2021

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Meeting - CANCELLED	Wednesday	6	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Community and Public Health Committee - CANCELLED	Thursday	7	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Legislative Committee	Monday	11	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Special Meeting/Retreat	Wednesday	20	8:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee	Thursday	21	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee - CANCELLED	Thursday	28	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Davina Hurt and Members
of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 9, 2020

Re: Approval of the Minutes of November 5, 2020

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion (Committee) meeting of November 5, 2020.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Committee meeting of November 5, 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Committee Meeting of November 5, 2020

AGENDA: 2A – ATTACHMENT

Draft Minutes – Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Meeting of November 5, 2020

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Meeting
Thursday, November 5, 2020

This meeting was conducted under procedures authorized by executive order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom. Members of the committee participated by teleconference.

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

The Ad Hoc Committee (Committee) on Equity, Access, and Inclusion Chairperson, Davina Hurt, called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

Present: Chairperson Davina Hurt; and Directors John Bauters, Tyrone Jue, Nate Miley, Mark Ross, Shamann Walton, Lori Wilson, and Shirlee Zane.

Absent: Directors John Gioia, Carole Groom, and Katie Rice.

Also Present: Board Chair Rod Sinks.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 10, 2020

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Board Chair Sinks made a motion, seconded by Director Bauters, to **approve** the Minutes of September 10, 2020; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Hurt, Jue, Ross, Sinks, Wilson, Zane.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Gioia, Groom, Miley, Rice, Walton.

3. COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVE

The Committee welcomed Ms. J. Michelle Pierce, Executive Director of the Bayview Hunters Point Community Advocates, and asked her to share her experiences in analyzing and advocating for the air quality in eastern San Francisco. Ms. Pierce shared about the challenges she has experienced when working with the Air District over the years, and urged the Air District to expedite its activities in Bayview Hunters Point to regain the community’s trust. Ms. Pierce said that she feels that there has been a lack of cultural competency at the Air District, that the Air District has been reluctant to examine the activity of the nuclear radiological lab at the Hunters Point Naval Shipyard, and requested more stringent regulations for polluting facilities and/or the denial of Air District permits in Bayview Hunters Point. Ms. Pierce also observed a disconnect between Air District management and the members of her community, who only interface with the Air District’s Community Engagement staff and consultants.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Walton was noted present at 9:11 a.m.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Esther Goolsby, Communities for a Better Environment (CBE); Dr. Henry Clark, West County Toxics Coalition; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Ernesto Arevalo, CBE; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and Dr. Raymond Tompkins.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed how the Air District plans to show cultural competency when interacting with communities of color; what can be done to improve the community engagement experience at the Air District; the need for improved listening and quicker responses from the Air District; and the call to make “Community Perspective” a standing item on the Committee’s meeting agendas.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

4. DISCUSSION ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF A COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL

The Committee continued its discussion on the development of the Air District’s first Community Advisory Council (CAC). Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, explained the intended purpose of the CAC and differentiated its role from that of the Air District’s existing Advisory Council. Ms. Eady gave the staff presentation *Development of a Community Advisory Council*, including: CAC overview; background and purpose; initial proposed structure and membership; and next steps.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Miley was noted present at 10:06 a.m.

Public Comments

Public Comments were given by LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; Michelle Pierce, Bayview Hunters Point Community Advocates; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Esther Goolsby, CBE; Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area; and Ernesto Arevalo, CBE.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed which individuals from Oakland (East and West) the Air District staff reached out to for input on the formation of the CAC; the potential appointment process; whether all impacted/disadvantaged communities in the Bay Area will be represented on the CAC, and how to define “impacted” and “disadvantaged”; the request to stop using consultants for uncomfortable conversations that are meant to be had with Air District staff, and to use the consultants’ compensation to pay the CAC members; the request that ongoing training, corrective action, and rehabilitation be a priority of Air District staff; whether CAC members will be financially compensated for their time and travel to meetings; claims from the public that the formation of such a body was proposed in 2018, but that no action was taken by the Air District; the desire to have ethnic and cultural diversity amongst those selected to serve on the CAC; and the fact that this item will be presented to the Board in November.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. DISCUSSION ON THE ADVISORY COUNCIL RECRUITMENT

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, gave the staff presentation *Discussion on the Advisory Council Recruitment Process*, including: Advisory Council charter; discussion; and Advisory Council opening process.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; and Esther Goolsby, CBE.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the request that the Air District actively recruits diverse candidates (especially those in health care, non-profit organizations, laborers, and environmental justice organizations); and whether Advisory Council members need to reside in the Bay Area.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

6. DISCUSSION ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF A COMMUNITY BENEFIT FUND

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, gave the staff presentation *Discussion on the Development of a Community Benefit Fund*, including: overview; similarities with the California Air Resources Board Community Air Grants program; structure and prioritization of funding; budget and financial impact; discussion; and recommendation.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Esther Goolsby, CBE; Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area; Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible; and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed how the Air District determined the amount of funding for program (initially and in subsequent years); whether the program’s funds will be restricted to Assembly Bill (AB) 617 communities, and how long the funding allocations will last; ways to approach the challenge of putting monies from settlements and fees back into impacted communities; the request for an update on data requests from the public; the amount of time Air District staff spends on recovery of fees for facilities; and the importance of informing impacted communities about their options within this program, including putting forth their own candidates for the Community Advisory Council.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

7. UPDATE ON ASSEMBLY BILL 617 EFFORTS

Mr. Nudd gave the staff presentation *Update on AB 617 Budget*, including: current Fiscal Year; Owing Our Air; and Richmond-San Pablo update.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

8. UPDATE ON OFFICE OF DIVERSITY, EQUITY & INCLUSION | INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL EFFORTS TO ADVANCE RACIAL EQUITY

Mary Ann Okpalaugo, Acting Director of the Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion, gave the staff presentation *Update on Office of Diversity Equity and Inclusion - Internal and External Efforts to Advance Racial Equity*, including: key priorities for 2020; ongoing and future areas of work; framework for racial equity; workforce development; timeline of activities; demographics by gender and race/ethnicity; community health; public investment; and learning by example.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

9. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible.

10. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Director Bauters acknowledged Chair Hurt and Veronica Eady, Senior Deputy Executive Officer, for consistently taking the time to consider what needs to be brought before this committee.

Board Chair Sinks suggested that this committee become a standing committee, and no longer ad hoc.

11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the conclusion of the meeting, the next meeting date was to be at the Call of the Chair. After the meeting adjourned, the next meeting was scheduled for Monday, December 14, 2020, at 9:30 a.m., via webcast, pursuant to procedures authorized by Executive Order N-29-20 issued by Governor Gavin Newsom.

12. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Hurt adjourned the meeting at 12:41 p.m., in memory of Thomas C. Mohr, a long-time educator, community leader, and San Mateo County resident.

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Davina Hurt and Members
of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access and Inclusion

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 9, 2020

Re: Report Back from Committee Chair Davina Hurt's Community Meeting

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Air District staff arranged a second meeting between Committee Chair, Hurt and Community Advocates on Tuesday, December 1, 2020. Representatives from organizations and groups from Vallejo, Bayview/Hunters Point, Richmond, and East and West Oakland attended the meeting. The meeting format provided an open forum for a candid conversation with community.

DISCUSSION

Discussion topics with Community Advocates in attendance at the meeting included comments on the structure of the proposed Community Advisory Council, questions and comments on the Community Benefit Fund. The group shared concerns with the Richmond/San Pablo Community Design Team process and the spirit of Assembly Bill 617 not being met. A request for revisions to the scientific Advisory Council's Draft PM Report to include equity terms and criteria in the report. The meeting concluded with the need for continued discussions.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Tim Williams
Reviewed by: Mary Ann Okpalaugo

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Davina Hurt and Members
of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 9, 2020

Re: Community Perspective

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

The Committee seeks to ensure that all residents of the Bay Area benefit equitably from the Air District's air quality and climate efforts, especially communities who live in areas most impacted by air pollution.

The Community Perspective provides community environmental justice advocates and community-based organizations a platform to participate in meaningful dialogue with the Air District Board of Directors and to build capacity in partnering with the Air District.

The Rose Foundation for Communities and the Environment is a current recipient of a James Cary Smith Community Grant from the Air District. The Rose Foundation is engaging Oakland youth of color on air quality issues while educating youth about environmental justice and building youth leadership through meaningful work experience. Their efforts include the creation of a West Oakland Tree Planting Blueprint, a map and report that will pinpoint air quality hot-spots in the West Oakland neighborhood that would benefit from, and are suitable for, tree plantings.

DISCUSSION

Ms. Katherine Funes, Acting Program Director of the New Voices Are Rising project of the Rose Foundation for Communities and the Environment, will discuss aspects of her work. Ms. Funes is a member of the Particulate Matter Community Design Team and has also been involved in Assembly Bill (AB) 617 implementation efforts.

New Voices Are Rising seeks to increase civic participation within under-represented communities, increase young people's commitment to environmental justice, and reduce air and water pollution that severely impact both human health and the health of the San Francisco Bay. The program helps young people gain the skills and experience in civic engagement that they need to begin to tackle the problems, including environmental health problems that disproportionately impact their communities.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Tim Williams and Elinor Mattern
Reviewed by: Mary Ann Okpalaugo

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Davina Hurt and Members
of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 9, 2020

Re: Consider Recommending Formation of a Board-Appointed Community Steering
Committee for the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Community Emissions
Reduction Plan

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Recommend the Board of Directors:

Form a Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Steering Committee to be governed by the Brown Act.

BACKGROUND

A team of 10 Community Design Team (CDT) members from the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Area have been meeting with Air District staff since March 2020 to guide development of a Steering Committee for the CERP development process in accordance with the California Air Resources Board Blueprint. At its November 11, 2020 meeting, the Community Design Team voted to recommend the Air District Board appoints a CERP Steering Committee that adheres to the Brown Act.

DISCUSSION

This is the first instance in the Bay Area of a community recommendation to the Board for a Brown Act Assembly Bill 617 Community Steering Committee. Air District staff recommends approving the CDT recommendation to create a Brown Act committee. Once created by the Air District's Board, candidates will be sought and selected for the Committee incorporating community input. At the end of the selection process, the Board will appoint Committee members.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Kevin Olp
Reviewed by: Greg Nudd

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Davina Hurt and Members
of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 9, 2020

Re: Composition of the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Assembly Bill (AB) 617
Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Community Steering Committee

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

A team of 10 Community Design Team members from the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo Area have been meeting with Air District staff since March 2020 to guide development of a Steering Committee for the Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) development process in accordance with the California Air Resources Board (CARB) Blueprint. The Community Design Team has discussed preferred criteria and balance for Steering Committee membership. For example, Community Design Team Members would like the Steering Committee to include youth, individuals with health complications that could be impacted by air pollution, and health care providers, and to reflect the demographic and geographic representation of the area.

DISCUSSION

The Ad Hoc Committee on Equity, Access, and Inclusion will benefit from this process by weighing in on the following issues:

- **Role of Industry and Business:** The Committee will discuss the role of industry and business in developing the CERP, including expectations for industry and business participation on the Steering Committee.
- **Definition of Community Representative:** The Committee will discuss how to define community representatives since CARB's Blueprint states that the majority of the Steering Committee should be comprised of community representatives.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Kevin Olp
Reviewed by: Greg Nudd