

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, California 94105  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Public Engagement Committee Meeting  
Thursday, February 21, 2019

### **1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL**

Public Engagement Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Shirlee Zane, called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer and Air Pollution Control Officer, stated Board of Directors Chairperson Rice’s intention to officially change the name of the Committee to “Community and Public Health Committee”, as she would like the Committee’s focus to shift to public health.

#### **Roll Call:**

Present: Chairperson Shirlee Zane; Vice Chairperson Mark Ross; and Directors Teresa Barrett, Scott Haggerty, Lori Wilson, and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Directors David J. Canepa, John Gioia, Liz Kniss, Nate Miley, and Hillary Ronen.

Also Present: Board of Directors Chairperson, Katie Rice

### **2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

No requests received.

### **3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 19, 2018**

#### Public Comments

No requests received.

#### Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Vice Chair Ross made a motion, seconded by Director Barrett, to **approve** the Minutes of October 19, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

- AYES: Barrett, Haggerty, Rice, Ross, Wilson, Zane.
- NOES: None.
- ABSTAIN: None.
- ABSENT: Canepa, Gioia, Kniss, Miley, Ronen, Wagenknecht.

**4. 2019 WORKPLAN FOR THE COMMUNITY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE**

Mr. Broadbent introduced Elizabeth Yura, Director of Community Engagement and Policy, who gave the staff presentation *2019 Workplan for the Community and Public Health Committee*, including: reimagining public engagement; 2019 Committee workplan; Assembly Bill (AB) 617 priority communities; why West Oakland and Richmond; building a community-led process in Richmond; capacity building; AB 617 2019 milestones; and wildfire response strategy.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed how the measured air quality in Richmond does not fully explain observed health issues there; upcoming source-apportionment studies and additional monitoring efforts in Richmond; the request for technology to alert the public of approaching plumes of pollutants; the suggestion that Air District staff makes recommendations to agencies that have authority where the Air District does not, regarding certain capacity-building strategies; the request for staff to use smoke transport from the 2018 Camp Fire to model general air transport in the basin, and determine whether air currents actually follow their predicted trends; the request for a presentation on how meteorology affects public health; whether proposed clean air centers will be regulated by the facilities themselves or by the Air District; and the feasibility of acquiring State funding for microsattellites.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Wagenknecht was noted present at 9:59 a.m.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

**5. OVERVIEW OF AIR POLLUTION AND HEALTH IMPACTS**

Chair Zane asked Air District Health Officer, Judith Cutino, to introduce herself and summarize what her position entails. Ms. Cutino did so, and then introduced Tammy Lee, Community Epidemiologist with the Alameda County Public Health Department, who gave the presentation *Air Pollution and Public Health*, including: what puts people at risk of health impacts from air pollution; air quality is influenced by multiple factors, including proximity to highways,

railways, truck routes, seaports, and airports; high levels of Diesel Particulate Matter concentrate near Port of Oakland and airport, along the Interstate-880 corridor, and where highways and truck routes meet in East County; West and East Oakland, as well as Emeryville, have a high burden of asthma emergency department visits; Emeryville, West, and East Oakland have the highest rates of asthma hospitalizations; West and East Oakland have the highest rates of children-under-five-years-old asthma hospitalizations; asthma hospitalizations have gone down, but asthma emergency department visits increased; multiple factors may be contributing to the declining trend in asthma hospitalizations; cancer death rates are especially high in areas of West and East Oakland, as well as other parts of the county; heart disease death rates are notably high in parts of West and East Oakland, as well as Cherryland and Hayward; stroke death rates are highest in parts of Emeryville, West and East Oakland; cancer, heart disease, stroke, and chronic lower respiratory disease are top five leading causes of death; reflecting cumulative health risks and impacts, life expectancy is especially low in West and East Oakland, as well as parts of unincorporated Central County; health inequities did not happen overnight – they have deep historical roots; long-standing disinvestment and persistent poverty means fewer resources and weaker infrastructure to support health; racism impacts who has to live in high-poverty neighborhoods with barriers to good health; African Americans are especially exposed to and impacted by cumulative health risks; and to improve air quality and health, we must reduce air pollution exposures and maximize health co-benefits in our most impacted communities.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed whether hospitals in the same sub-regions share data; the fact that a lack of medical services in one area can result in higher numbers of emergency department visits and hospitalizations in other areas; data suppression; correlations between cognitive health and air pollution exposure; factors that contribute to health impacts from air pollution; the suggestion that a future Committee meetings be held at the Port of Oakland; and the request for a staff report on data from the Air District’s Livermore monitoring station.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

**6. CONSIDERATION OF THE PRIORITIZATION FRAMEWORK FOR SCHOOL AIR FILTER SUPPLEMENTAL ENVIRONMENTAL PROJECT**

Ms. Cutino gave the staff presentation *Prioritization Framework for School Air Filter Supplemental Environmental Project (SEP)*, including: background; IQAir North America (IQAir); screening criteria; other considerations; example; Pittsburg-Bay Point; timeline; and next steps.

Public Comments

No requests received.

## Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the request that Air District staff includes refineries on maps of community-based projects, to display the proximity of such stationary sources; the cost to build air filtration systems into the new construction of schools (versus retrofitting existing buildings); the request that Air District staff considers Lawrence Elementary and Junction Avenue Middle Schools as potential sites for retrofitting of air filtration systems; the anticipated life of the air filtration systems, and how extreme smoke events can shorten the life of the technology; concerns that school staff having to learn how to replace and maintain the new filtration systems would impact their regular tasks and school budgets; how to ensure that schools will continue to replace the filters in the new systems, and continue their maintenance contracts; and the consideration of different minimum efficiency reporting value ratings of the filters, depending on the needs of the area.

## Committee Action

Director Wilson made a motion, seconded by Director Wagenknecht, to **approve** the Air District's entering into contract with IQAir North America for the installation of air filtration systems in sensitive receptor facilities, specifically local schools, in Bay Area communities; and criteria that will be used to select local schools for installation of air filtration systems; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Haggerty, Rice, Ross, Wagenknecht, Wilson, Zane.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Canepa, Gioia, Kniss, Miley, Ronen.

## **7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 6)**

No requests received.

## **8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Director Wilson asked if this committee would be the appropriate one to reach out to youth, and if so, whether the Committee could meet on days when they could attend. Air District staff responded that the Air District will hold two "Youth for the Environment and Sustainability" (YES) Conferences in 2019; one for youth and one for educators. Director Haggerty suggested that the Committee hold a meeting at the YES Conference to give the youth an opportunity to see a public meeting and give public comments.

Board Chair Rice asked Air District staff for a status update on the March 6 presentation that will be given by author Richard Rothstein.

**9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Chair Zane announced that the next meeting will take place on Thursday, March 14, 2019, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

**10. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:15 a.m.

*/s/ Marcy Hiratzka*  
Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards