

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Executive Committee Meeting
Wednesday, March 20, 2019

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Executive Committee (Committee) Vice Chairperson, Rod Sinks, called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Committee Vice Chair Rod Sinks; and Directors Cindy Chavez, John Gioia, Carole Groom, David Hudson, Jim Spering, and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Committee Chairperson Katie Rice; and Directors Teresa Barrett, Scott Haggerty, and Tyrone Jue.

Also Present: None.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54954.3

No requests received.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 19, 2018

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Wagenknecht made a motion, seconded by Director Hudson, to **approve** the minutes of November 19, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Gioia, Groom, Hudson, Sinks, Spering, Wagenknecht.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Barrett, Chavez, Haggerty, Jue, Rice.

4. HEARING BOARD QUARTERLY REPORT: OCTOBER - DECEMBER 2018

The Committee received and filed this report, which reflected no Hearing Board activity between October and December 2018.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. REPORT OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING FROM MARCH 11, 2019

Stan Hayes, Chairperson of the Air District's Advisory Council, gave the presentation *Report of the Advisory Council Meeting from March 11, 2019*, including: context; important questions; and best science.

Public Comments

Public comments were made by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments

The committee and staff discussed the reconfiguration of the United States Environmental Protection Agency's (US EPA) Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC) and disbandment of the CASAC's Particulate Matter (PM) Review Panel; the appreciation for the US EPA's presentation on *Conclusions of the Integrated Science Assessment for PM*; how the Air District's PM Symposium in the fall of 2019 should include state officials who are developing the Green New Deal, and representatives from the transportation sector who may not consider PM as a driver of climate change; potential limits of the Air District's capabilities and resources in developing and executing this event; the creation of an ad hoc committee consisting of Advisory Council members for the purpose of launching this event, and the Advisory Council meeting schedule for the remainder of 2019; the suggestion of having a woodburning panel at the PM Symposium; the potential PM Symposium agenda (science versus policy); the request to invite transit agency leaders and city traffic engineers to the PM Symposium; the fact that the Advisory Council believes that current ambient air quality federal standards are not sufficiently health protective; the suggestion to include the California Air Resources Board (CARB) at Advisory

Council meetings, as CARB has mobile source authority and shares the Air District's goal of reducing and eliminating PM; the suggestion that the Air District passes regulation to eliminate diesel emissions prior to focusing its efforts on advocating for more stringent federal standards; how to establish the Air District's clean air target, what levels of emissions are clean and safe enough for the public, how to measure when that target is reached, and how to convey to the public that risk may still remain when emissions are reduced; how land use conditions and permitting can be used to require electrification and subsequently eliminate PM in new buildings; and tradeoffs of traffic calming, which can create opportunities for idling engines.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Chavez was noted present at 9:51 a.m.

6. BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE (BARC) UPDATE

In the absence of Allison Brooks, Executive Director of BARC, Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, gave an update on recent BARC activities, including: Supervisor Cindy Chavez as the new BARC Governing Board Chairperson; BARC-member government agencies and partners are collaborating on the execution of a two-year work plan, which is to be presented to the BARC Governing Board in June 2019; BARC's recruitment for a new program coordinator; and BARC is sponsoring its third year cohort of cross-agency staff participation in the Government Alliance on Race and Equity Program.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed potential integration of BARC-member agency work plans; appreciation for the books recommended by Air District (Board of Directors) Chair Rice, that promoted cultural competency; and the suggestion that BARC-member agencies share best practices regarding this issue.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

7. CONSIDER RECOMMENDING THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS ACCEPT NEW GRANT PROGRAM REVENUE RESULTING FROM ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 617

Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, explained that CARB has allocated \$10 million to the (Bay Area) Air District for the Bay Area Community Health Protection Program (AB 617) for Program implementation costs and community incentives.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the need for the Air District to remain in correspondence with the Legislature about the need for continued funds for this program.

Committee Action

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Wagenknecht, to **approve** the Air District's acceptance of the Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2019, Community Air Protection Program funds; and authorize the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer to execute all necessary agreements with CARB to implement the program; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Hudson, Sinks, Spering, Wagenknecht.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Barrett, Haggerty, Jue, Rice.

8. CONSIDER RECOMMENDING THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS AUTHORIZE EXECUTION OF A MASTER SERVICES AGREEMENT (MSA) FOR AIR QUALITY MAPPING AND ASSOCIATED SERVICES

Mr. Nudd introduced Eric Stevenson, Director of Meteorology and Measurements, who gave the staff presentation *Utilizing Aclima Mobile Monitoring and Associated Services*, including: need for highly-localized monitoring; reasoning for this approach; Aclima's approach and experience; what is being proposed; why choose Aclima; funding; and recommended action.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed how this service is being deployed to assist the Air District meet the deadlines of the State-mandated AB 617 Community Health Protection Program; how this service would assist the Air District in identifying areas in need of additional, detailed air monitoring; whether Aclima was selected by the Air District via a sole source or competitive procurement process; whether the publicly-accessible data collected by Aclima can be extracted and improperly used by private entities; whether the Air District could use the data to comment on California Environmental Quality Act documents (Environmental Impact Reports); whether members of the West Oakland Community Action Plan Steering Committee will be involved in the implementation of this project, and whether Aclima will consider monitoring in areas that are recommended by the Steering Committee; how to relate concentration data to particular health outcomes; the request that Board members be allowed to accompany Aclima, to observe

monitoring and data collection, or see a vehicle demonstration; the request that the data be made publicly available to the community in which the monitoring was conducted as quickly as possible, in a manner that does not alarm, nor confuse, the public; whether the data will be in real time (live); whether Aclima will have access to private roads and property, and the request that signage is posted in areas that cannot be monitored; which party will manage the web portal's application programming interface changes and own the collected data, and whether the Air District will have control over how the data is presented to the public; other areas in the nation in which this technology is being deployed; and how often the Board will receive staff updates on this service.

Committee Action

Director Groom made a motion, seconded by Director Gioia, to **authorize** the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer to execute a two-year Master Services Agreement with Aclima, in the amount not to exceed \$5,980,000 over two years for hyperlocal, background air quality mapping of the entire Bay Area, a data repository and web portal, and community capacity building activities; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Hudson, Sinks, Spring, Wagenknecht.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Barrett, Haggerty, Jue, Rice.

9. **CONSIDER RECOMMENDING THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS AUTHORIZE EXECUTION OF CONTRACT AMENDMENTS FOR PRODUCTION SYSTEM OFFICE**

Mr. Broadbent introduced Blair Adams, Information Systems Manager, who gave the presentation *Authorization to Execute Contract Amendments for Production System Office*, including: Permitting and Compliance System - current features in production; conceptual approach – feature migration; remaining legacy features - Enforcement and Compliance and Permitting System; conceptual information flow diagram; parallel development tracks; schedule overview – legacy transition; budget and feature estimates; and recommended action.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the fact that the Air District finally has an end date for core functionality, which is exciting, as this has been in the developmental stage for several years.

Committee Action

Director Spring made a motion, seconded by Director Chavez, to **authorize** the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer to execute contract amendments for Production System Office; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Hudson, Sinks, Spering.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Barrett, Haggerty, Jue, Rice, Wagenknecht.

10. **CONSIDER RECOMMENDING THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS AUTHORIZE EXECUTION OF CONTRACTS FOR BUILD-OUT OF A PORTION OF THE RICHMOND, LAKESIDE DRIVE BUILDING**

At Mr. Broadbent's suggestion, the Board agreed to table this item until the Ad Hoc Building Oversight Committee meeting on April 3, 2019.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

11. **2018-2019 WINTER SPARE THE AIR PROGRAM OVERVIEW**

Mr. Broadbent introduced Mr. Stevenson and Lisa Fasano, Communications Officer, who gave the staff presentation *2018-2019 Winter Spare the Air Program Overview*, including: outline; Winter PM_{2.5} seasons; 20 worst PM_{2.5} days in the Bay Area since 1999; less rainfall equals more PM pollution; highest air quality readings; wood smoke enforcement; enforcement highlights and practices; advertising; media; outreach results; Wood Smoke Reduction Grant Program results; and summary and next steps.

Public Comments

Public comments were made by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed potential amendments to *Regulation 6: Particulate Matter and Visible Emissions, Rule 3: Wood-Burning Devices* by the end of 2019, expanding the Winter Spare the Air program from just four (4) winter months to 12 months of the year, simultaneously with the Summer Spare the Air Program; the suggestion of having the Winter Spare the Air program timeline match with the beginning and end dates of daylight savings time in California so that the timeline of the program will be easy for the public to remember; whether the Air District uses different metrics for the various types of burning activities; and whether correlations between weekend activities (when there is an absence in work commutes) and higher levels of PM and ozone exist.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

12. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

13. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

None.

14. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

The next Executive Committee meeting will be held at the Call of the Chair.

15. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:56 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards