



BOARD OF DIRECTORS
CLIMATE PROTECTION COMMITTEE MEETING

BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

TERESA BARRETT – CHAIR
SCOTT HAGGERTY
DOUG KIM
KATIE RICE
BRAD WAGENKNECHT
SHIRLEE ZANE

JOHN GIOIA – VICE CHAIR
DAVE HUDSON
LIZ KNISS
MARK ROSS
LORI WILSON

MONDAY
JUNE 10, 2019
9:30 A.M.

1ST FLOOR BOARD ROOM
375 BEALE STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members. The Committee Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas at the time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain errors and omissions, and are not certified for their content or form.

Public Comment on Agenda Items *The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Public Comment Cards for items on the agenda must be submitted in person to the Clerk of the Boards at the location of the meeting and prior to the Board taking up the particular item. Where an item was moved from the Consent Calendar to an Action item, no speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3 *For the first round of public comment on non-agenda matters at the beginning of the agenda, ten persons selected by a drawing by the Clerk of the Boards from among the Public Comment Cards indicating they wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Board on matters not on the agenda. For this first round of public comments on non-agenda matters, all Public Comment Cards must be submitted in person to the Clerk of the Board at the location of the meeting and prior to commencement of the meeting.*

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

3. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF APRIL 22, 2019**

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Committee will consider approving the attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of April 22, 2019.

4. **UPDATE ON COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY STUDY**

J. Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

Staff from KyotoUSA will update the Committee on the findings from a completed study evaluating the potential for Community Choice Energy (CCE) programs, to offer 100% renewable energy as the default product offered to their customers.

5. **DIESEL FREE BY '33 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN**

J. Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive an update on the Air District's Diesel Free by '33 Implementation Plan.

6. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Speakers who did not have the opportunity to address the Board in the first round of comments on non-agenda matters will be allowed two minutes each to address the Board on non-agenda matters.

7. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Any member of the Board, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

8. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Thursday, September 19, 2019, at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the “Members of the Climate Protection Committee” and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Committee meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Committee at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District’s policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District’s Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at rsanders@baaqmd.gov

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT ANTICIPATED MEETINGS

JUNE 2019

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting	Wednesday	5	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee	Monday	10	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (CANCELLED)	Wednesday	19	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Community and Public Health Committee	Thursday	20	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget and Finance Committee (CANCELLED)	Wednesday	26	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (CANCELLED)	Thursday	27	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

JULY 2019

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (CANCELLED)	Wednesday	3	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source	Monday	8	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Stationary Source (Cancelled and Rescheduled to July 8 th)	Monday	15	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Personnel Committee (CANCELLED)	Wednesday	17	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Legislative Committee (CANCELLED)	Wednesday	24	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee	Thursday	25	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Advisory Council Meeting	Monday	29	10:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Special Meeting as the Sole Member of the Bay Area Clean Air Foundation	Wednesday	31	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Special Meeting	Wednesday	31	10:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Teresa Barrett and Members
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: June 4, 2019

Re: Approval of the Minutes of April 22, 2019

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee (Committee) meeting of April 22, 2019.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Committee meeting of April 22, 2019.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 3A: Draft Minutes of the Committee Meeting of April 22, 2019

AGENDA: 3A – ATTACHMENT

Draft Minutes – Climate Protection Committee Meeting of April 22, 2019

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Monday, April 22, 2019

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Teresa Barrett, called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m.

Present: Chairperson Teresa Barrett; Vice Chair John Gioia; and Directors Scott Haggerty, Doug Kim, Liz Kniss, Mark Ross, Lori Wilson, and Shirlee Zane.

Absent: Directors Hilary Ronen, Brad Wagenknecht, and Katie Rice.

Also Present: None.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS, PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54954.3

No requests received.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2018

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Haggerty made a motion, seconded by Director Ross, to approve the Minutes of September 20, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Gioia, Haggerty, Kim, Kniss, Ross, Wilson, Zane.

NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Rice, Ronen, Wagenknecht.

4. UPDATE ON METHANE STRATEGY RULE DEVELOPMENT EFFORTS

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, introduced Jacob Finkle, Senior Air Quality Specialist, who gave the staff presentation *Update on Methane Strategy Rule Development Efforts*, including: outline; Air District’s Methane Strategy – quantification and reduction efforts; methane emissions inventory – bottom-up versus top-down scaling; organics recovery strategy; Climate and Organics rule development; regulatory update: Methane Strategy – Regulations 13-2, 13-3, 13-4, 8-34, 8-37, Senate Bill 1371; and rule development timeline.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and Bruce Nilles, Rocky Mountain Institute.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the Air District’s objective of implementing best practices across all Bay Area composting facilities in order to properly process the voluminous amounts of green waste being diverted from landfills; whether enclosures at composting facilities will be required; methane-capture and reuse requirements built into Air District regulations; whether landfills are required to use alternative daily cover technology under Air District regulations; how the Air District’s authority over monitoring methane emissions at composting facilities indirectly mitigates methane odors; the request that the Air District prioritizes holding government facilities accountable for complying with methane-related Air District regulations, to demonstrate the standards for best practices to private sector facilities; the fact that methane is not regulated under the Air District’s Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT) framework; the likelihood that the proposed rule development will move forward, on schedule, and the Air District’s priority of passing regulation that is pragmatically enforceable; the request for a chart of the composition of organic materials that get diverted to composting facilities; methane reduction efforts and strategies in other countries; benefits of different aeration techniques; the request that future presentations on this topic include detailed public health consequences of methane exposure; the locations of anaerobic digestors in the Bay Area and which sub-regions in the Bay Area generate the most odor complaints; how changing recycling trends may affect composting operations and needs; the request to revisit the issue of natural gas versus electrification, and whether it is best to utilize scarce funding in the Air District’s Wood Smoke Reduction Incentive Program by eliminating the fossil fuel-based project incentives (natural gas or propane-fueled devices).

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. UPDATE ON REGION-WIDE CARBON DIOXIDE (CO₂) STRATEGY

Mr. Nudd introduced Jakub Zielkiewicz, Advanced Projects Advisor, who gave the staff presentation *Update on Region-Wide Carbon Dioxide Reduction Strategy*, including: outline; CO₂ in context; decarbonizing buildings; building decarbonization; transportation grants; decreasing local CO₂ across all sectors; Air District tools and the value they add; and next steps.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and Bruce Nilles, Rocky Mountain Institute.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the request for a breakdown of major area sources of CO₂ (residential, industrial, commercial); whether the Air District’s objective of targeting sources of natural gas and moving them to electricity are in alignment with those of Pacific Gas & Electric; if/how the Air District can help link residential building requirements and appliance electrification requirements; and the Air District’s interaction with the Bay Area Regional Energy Network (BayREN) regarding efforts to support local governments accelerating the decarbonization of existing building stock.

Committee Actions

None; receive and file.

6. UPDATE ON COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY STUDY

In the interest of time, Mr. Nudd requested that this item be TABLED until a future Climate Protection Committee meeting date. Chair Barrett expressed her disappointment at having to shorten this meeting to accommodate another Air District Board Committee meeting that was scheduled at 10:30 a.m. and requested that this scheduling conflict not be repeated in the future. The consensus of the Committee members present was to table this item.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS, PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54954.3

No requests received.

8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

None.

9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Monday, June 10, 2019, at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:57 a.m.

Marcy Hirtzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Teresa Barrett and Members
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: June 4, 2019

Re: Update on Community Choice Energy Study

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Community Choice Energy (CCE) is a transformational model that allows local governments to aggregate the buying power of electricity customers in their jurisdiction, and directly purchase and/or generate power for their communities. The CCE model works in partnership with existing utilities, which continue to deliver power over their transmission and distribution systems, maintain the grid, and provide consolidated billing and other customer services. By providing greater local control over energy sourcing in the production of electricity, CCE programs can result in a reduction in the carbon content of the electricity used in communities. Cumulatively, this can have a large impact on the greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions coming from the electricity sector. Statewide, CCEs have contracted for over 2,000 megawatts of new renewable generating capacity.

Today, Bay Area CCE programs are available to residents and businesses of all nine Bay Area counties (over two million customer accounts). These CCE programs represent over 27 million megawatts in annual electric load. For many local governments, participation in a CCE program is the single largest GHG-reducing measure in the local climate action plan. The Air District has a history of supporting the formation and work of CCE programs across the Bay Area. The Air District's 2017 Clean Air Plan, *Spare the Air – Cool the Climate*, includes a control measure (EN-1) describing how the Air District will work with and support the GHG-reducing efforts of CCEs.

DISCUSSION

Community Choice Energy programs offer various electricity products to customers, with a default product that ensures a minimum level of renewable energy that is at or above the renewable content offered by the local utility company, Pacific Gas and Electric (PG&E). Other products offered by the CCE can have higher renewable energy content at a higher cost. The Air District contracted with KyotoUSA to conduct a study to evaluate the potential for local governments within a CCE program to choose 100% renewable electricity for their communities.

The objective of this study was to support local decision-making to accelerate the transformation to carbon-free energy and meet local climate protection goals.

Air District staff will highlight the work the Air District has done to support Bay Area CCEs. Staff from KyotoUSA will provide the Committee with an overview of the study, key issues, challenges and findings.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Abby Young
Reviewed by: Henry Hilken

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Teresa Barrett and Members
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: June 4, 2019

Re: Diesel Free by '33 Implementation Plan

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Pollution from diesel engines causes both health and climate change impacts. Diesel exhaust is highly toxic and impacts the health of residents where emissions are most concentrated, often in communities already significantly impacted by air pollution, environmental hazards, and economic inequality. Particulate matter (PM) from diesel engines can trigger respiratory distress, especially in children, the elderly and those with asthma, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD), emphysema, and other chronic lung and heart conditions. Diesel engines also emit pollutants that impact global climate change, including carbon dioxide (CO₂) and black carbon, which is thousands of times more potent than CO₂ in terms of global warming potential.

The Air District launched the Diesel Free by '33 initiative in September 2018, at the Global Climate Action Summit to commit to cutting diesel use by the end of 2033, and 118 mayors, city and county officials, and business leaders, mostly from the Bay Area, have signed the Diesel Free by '33 Statement of Purpose (Attachment A).

DISCUSSION

Staff evaluated a range of implementation options for this program and are recommending a work plan to support signatories in the Bay Area. The proposed work plans also seeks to extend efforts to support other government and business leaders from all over the world in adopting the Diesel Free by '33 Statement of Purpose. The work plan proposes to leverage existing Air District activities that already significantly address Diesel Free by '33 goals, while also increasing effort in areas that will be most impactful for reducing diesel use. The five program areas include:

- **Technical Assistance** on eliminating current diesel sources, alternative technology availability, costs and benefits
- **Policy Support** for governments, including developing a clearing house of model ordinances, policies, and targets

- **Grants and Financing** for upgrading to diesel-free alternatives in the Bay Area, with information on other programs available outside our jurisdiction.
- **Convening Signatories** to report progress towards the Diesel Free by '33 goal and to share best practices
- **Communications and Outreach** to share resources, progress, and recruit new signatories for the Statement of Purpose.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Ranyee Chiang and Abby Young
Reviewed by: Jack P. Broadbent

Attachment A: Statement of Purpose Diesel Free By '33 (Example signed by Chair of Air District Board of Directors)

STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

DIESEL FREE BY '33

The intention of this *Statement of Purpose* is to establish a goal to reduce diesel emissions in local communities throughout California and beyond. The need for this action is immediate. Diesel exhaust takes a tremendous toll on both the global climate and public health.

By signing the *Statement of Purpose*, mayors, city and county governments, industry and businesses leaders will join the Bay Area Air Quality Management District and the state of California to showcase our collective leadership to identify and adopt innovative solutions to eliminate diesel emissions and black carbon from our communities.

Diesel exhaust causes significant public health effects and accelerates climate change. The California Air Resources Board estimates that on-road diesel and off-road mobile engines comprise 54 percent of the state of California's total black carbon emissions, a short-lived climate pollutant that is contributing significantly to global climate change. Diesel air pollution is highly toxic and can have an immediate impact on the health of residents in communities where emissions are most concentrated. The impacts will fall most heavily on communities and populations already significantly impacted by air pollution, environmental hazards, and economic inequality.

The signatories may each develop their own individual strategies to achieve the goal of reaching zero diesel emissions in their communities. Signatories to this agreement express their intent to:

- Collaborate and coordinate on ordinances, policies, and procurement practices that will reduce diesel emissions to zero within their jurisdictions, communities or companies;
- Share and promote effective financing mechanisms domestically and internationally to the extent feasible that allow for the purchase of zero emissions equipment;
- Share information and assessments regarding zero emissions technology;
- Build capacity for action and technology adaptation through technology transfer and sharing expertise;
- Use policies and incentives that assist the private sector as it moves to diesel-free fleets and buildings; and
- Periodic reporting to all signers of progress towards the zero-diesel emissions goal.

This *Statement of Purpose* is intended to accelerate action toward meaningful progress in support of all climate protection agreements. It is not the intent of the signatories to create through this *Statement of Purpose* any legally binding obligation. For purposes of this Statement, "diesel emissions" and "diesel exhaust" means emissions or exhaust emitted from the combustion of petroleum-based diesel fuel.

Signatories are committing to develop an implementation strategy to reduce diesel emissions in their jurisdictions, share solutions, and report progress. Together, we will forge a path toward a cleaner, healthier future by reducing diesel emissions in our communities, states, and beyond.

Katie Rice

First and Last Name (Print)



Signature

Supervisor

Title

County of Marin

City/Jurisdiction

9/12/18

Date



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT