



BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT

BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

JIM SPERING - CHAIR  
TERESA BARRETT  
JOHN GIOIA  
SCOTT HAGGERTY  
LIZ KNISS  
BRAD WAGENKNECT

DOUG KIM – VICE CHAIR  
DAVID CANEPA  
CAROLE GROOM  
DAVE HUDSON  
KAREN MITCHOFF

MONDAY  
MAY 7, 2018  
9:30 A.M.

1<sup>ST</sup> FLOOR BOARD ROOM  
375 BEALE STREET  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

AGENDA

1. **CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL – PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE – PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE**

*The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members. The Committee Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.*

*This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit [www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas](http://www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas) at the time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain errors and omissions, and are not certified for their content or form.*

**Public Comment on Agenda Items** *The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Public Comment Cards for items on the agenda must be submitted in person to the Clerk of the Boards at the location of the meeting and prior to the Board taking up the particular item. Where an item was moved from the Consent Calendar to an Action item, no speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

*Speakers may speak for up to three minutes on each item on the Agenda. However, the Chairperson or other Board Member presiding at the meeting may limit the public comment for all speakers to fewer than three minutes per speaker, or make other rules to ensure that all speakers have an equal opportunity to be heard. The Chairperson or other Board Member presiding at the meeting may, with the consent of persons representing both sides of an issue, allocate a block of time (not to exceed six minutes) to each side to present their issue.*

2. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 7, 2018**

Clerk of the Boards/5073

*The Committee will consider approving the attached draft minutes of the Personnel Committee meeting of February 7, 2018.*

3. **RECOMMEND REAPPOINTMENT OF FIVE INCUMBENTS AND INTERVIEW AND RECOMMEND APPLICANTS FOR ADVISORY COUNCIL VACANCIES**

J. Broadbent/5052

[jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov)

*The Committee will interview and review qualifications for those seeking appointment to join the Air District's Advisory Council and recommend reappointment of five incumbents and up to two applicants for appointment by the Board of Directors.*

4. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

*Any member of the Board, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)*

5. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

*At the Call of the Chair.*

6. **ADJOURNMENT**

*The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.*

**CONTACT:**

**MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS**  
**375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105**  
[vjohnson@baaqmd.gov](mailto:vjohnson@baaqmd.gov)

**(415) 749-4941**  
**FAX: (415) 928-8560**  
**BAAQMD homepage:**  
[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the “Members of the Personnel Committee” and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Committee meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Committee at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

**Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy**

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District’s policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at [www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility](http://www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility) to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District’s Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at [rsanders@baaqmd.gov](mailto:rsanders@baaqmd.gov).

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105  
FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:  
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS**

**MAY 2018**

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Special Budget Hearing</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i> - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO MAY 2, 2018 AT 9:30 A.M.	Wednesday	16	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	16	10:00 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday of every other Month)</i> - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO MONDAY, JUNE 4, 2018 AT 9:30 A.M.	Thursday	17	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	21	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of every other Month)</i>	Monday	21	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	23	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room

## JUNE 2018

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday of every other Month)</i>	Monday	4	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	6	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Monday	18	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	20	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Technology Implementation Office Steering Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Thursday	21	1:00 p.m.	1st Floor, Ohlone Room #107
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	27	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	28	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room

## JULY 2018

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	4	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of every other Month)</i>	Monday	16	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	18	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday of every other Month)</i>	Thursday	19	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	25	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	26	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room

HL – 4/30/18 – 4:20 p.m.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Jim Spering and Members  
of the Personnel Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: April 23, 2018

Re: Approval of the Minutes of February 7, 2018

---

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve attached draft minutes of the Personnel Committee (Committee) meeting of February 7, 2018.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Committee meeting of February 7, 2018.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka  
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Committee Meeting of February 7, 2018

## AGENDA: 2A – ATTACHMENT

Draft Minutes – Personnel Committee Meeting of February 7, 2018

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, California 94105  
(415) 749-5073

### **DRAFT MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Personnel Committee Meeting  
Wednesday, February 7, 2018

#### **1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL**

Personnel Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Jim Spering, called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson Jim Spering; Committee Vice Chairperson Doug Kim; and Directors Teresa Barrett, David J. Canepa, Scott Haggerty, Liz Kniss, and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Directors John Gioia and Carole Groom.

Also Present: Board of Directors Chairperson, David Hudson.

#### **2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

No requests received.

#### **3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 18, 2017**

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

None.

Committee Action:

Director Haggerty made a motion, seconded by Director Hudson, to approve the minutes of December 18, 2017; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Canepa, Haggerty, Hudson, Kniss, and Spering.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: Barrett.  
ABSENT: Gioia, Groom, Kim, and Wagenknecht.

4. **UPDATE OF THE AIR DISTRICT’S DIVERSITY, EQUITY, AND INCLUSION PROGRAM**

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Rex Sanders, Chief Administrative Officer, Judy Yu, Human Resources Manager, and Mary Ann Okpalauugo, Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Manager, who all gave the staff presentation *Update on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Program*, including: overview; current snapshot of the Air District; new hires and promotions by gender and race from 2013 to 2017; Air District’s diversity efforts; the Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Office; participation in Government Alliance on Race and Equity (GARE); and ongoing efforts.

NOTED PRESENT: Vice Chair Kim was noted present at 9:36 a.m.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed how District salary schedules ensure pay equity for positions of the same title across different District divisions; the District’s awareness of the historical trend of male District employees outnumbering female District employees, the District’s intent to diversity moving forward; the concern that listing some, but not all, Bay Area colleges on the list of organizations that receive Air District job announcements is misleading; whether the Board will be asked for its guidance on the comparable salaries researched by the consultant that will be selected by the District to conduct a salary survey; the request for the number of District positions for which recruitment is currently open, and how many of those positions require a four - year degree; the request that staff brings back to the Committee data regarding positions relative to gender (percentage of women to men within a given position); how often District job classifications are reviewed and updated; the District’s enhanced efforts to reach out to veterans regarding District employment opportunities; whether opportunities for reimbursement for job-related skill enhancement exist at the District; the suggestion that staff remains cognizant of the changing workforce and trends pertaining to the retention of younger employees; the suggestion that staff considers how to attract potential employees that might not have been considered in the past; and the suggestion that the District opens job classifications to two-year degrees, rather than four-year degrees.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Wagenknecht was noted present at 9:43 a.m.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

**CLOSED SESSION** (commenced at 10:12 a.m.)



5. **PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION - (Government Code Section 54957 and 54957.6)**

*Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957 and 54957.6, the Committee will meet in closed session to conduct a performance evaluation of the Executive Officer.*

6. **PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION - (Government Code Section 54957 and 54957.6)**

*Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957 and 54957.6, the Committee will meet in closed session to conduct a performance evaluation of the District Counsel.*

**OPEN SESSION** (commenced at 11:15 a.m.)

Chair Sperring reported that Mr. Broadbent and Brian Bunger, District Counsel, both received excellent performance evaluations, and he praised their work during a particularly controversial year in 2017.

7. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

8. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING**

At the call of the Chairperson.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:16 a.m.

Marcy Hirtzka  
Clerk of the Boards

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Jim Spering and Members  
of the Personnel Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: May 3, 2018

Re: Recommend Reappointment of Five Incumbents and Interview and Recommend  
Applicants for Advisory Council Vacancies

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Conduct interviews and consider recommending Board of Directors' approval of up to two candidates for appointment and recommend reappointment of five incumbents to serve an additional two-year term to the Air District's Advisory Council.

BACKGROUND

Pursuant to Section 40262 of the California Health & Safety Code, the Air District is required to maintain an Advisory Council consisting of seven appointed members "skilled and experienced in the fields of air pollution, climate change, or the health impacts of air pollution. Members shall be selected to include a diversity of perspectives, expertise and backgrounds." The Council advises and consults with the Air District Board and the Air Pollution Control Officer on implementation of the Air District's regulatory authority.

ADVISORY COUNCIL NEXT AREA OF FOCUS

The Council has been focused on identifying strategies that will be most effective in improving air quality related health outcomes in the Bay Area. In particular, the Council is focusing on local effects, as opposed to basin-wide criteria pollutants, and especially on the effects of fine particulate matter. This focus is consistent with the Air District's work related to Rule 11-18, and AB 617.

MEMBERSHIP

The current five members of the Air District's Advisory Council represent an extraordinary resource to the District, and have provided invaluable service over the last two years. The members' backgrounds are provided below.

**Stan Hayes (Current Chair)**  
*Principal, Environ (Emeritus)*

M.S., Aeronautics & Astronautics, Stanford University

B.S., Mechanical Engineering, Stanford University

- More than 40 years' experience, air pollution science and engineering, including air quality modeling and health risk assessment
- Fellow, Air & Waste Management Association
- Chair, Advisory Council, Bay Area Air Quality Management District (member: 1995-2007, 2009-)
- Member, U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board panel on EPA risk assessment methods
- Several hundred air dispersion and HRAs of a wide range of industrial facilities
- More than seventy scientific papers and presentations
- Several hundred technical reports on air-related topics

**Severin Borenstein**

*E.T. Grether Professor of Business Administration and Public Policy, Haas School of Business  
Research Associate of the Energy Institute at the Haas School of Business  
Affiliated Faculty, Energy & Resources Group, UC Berkeley  
Research Associate of the National Bureau of Economic Research*

Ph.D., Economics, MIT

B.S., UC Berkeley

- Research focuses broadly on business competition, strategy, and regulation
- Published extensively on oil, gasoline, and electricity markets, and other industries
- Recent research on the impact of oil prices on gasoline markets, alternative models of retail electricity pricing, and the economics of renewable energy and climate change
- Past member of the editorial board of the *Journal of the Association of Environmental and Resource Economists*
- 1997-2003, member of the Governing Board of the California Power Exchange
- Served on the Emissions Market Assessment Committee, which advised the California Air Resources Board on the operation of California's Cap and Trade market
- Chaired California Energy Commission's Petroleum Market Advisory Committee from 2015 until 2017

**Michael T. Kleinman (Current Vice Chair)**

*Professor Environmental Toxicology  
Co-Director of the Air Pollution Health Effects Laboratory  
Adjunct Professor in College of Medicine  
University of California, Irvine*

Ph.D., Environmental Health Sciences, New York University, NY

- Expertise in the health effects of air pollution on animals and humans
- Development of analytical techniques for assessing biological and physiological responses to exposure to environmental contaminants
- Studies of the effects of ambient particles on blood pressure and heart rate

- Studies of the link between asthma and environmental exposures to ambient particles
- Mechanisms of cardiopulmonary injury following inhalation of toxic compounds
- Studies of inhalation exposures to manufactured and combustion-generated nanomaterials
- Biological mechanisms by which particulate matter exposure affects pathological and physiological changes in the heart and lungs

**Tim Lipman**

*Co-Director UC Berkeley Transportation Sustainability Research Center*

*Lecturer and Researcher: Energy and environmental technology, economics, and policy*

*University of California - Berkeley.*

Ph.D., Environmental Policy Analysis, Graduate Group in Ecology at UC Davis

M.S., Graduate Group in Transportation Technology and Policy at UC Davis

B.A., Stanford

- Co-Director for the campus' Transportation Sustainability Research Center
- Past Director: U.S. Department of Energy Pacific Region Clean Energy Application Center
- Research on the transformation of energy systems to support motor vehicles and buildings while reducing greenhouse gas emissions
- Research on electric-drive vehicles, fuel cell technology, combined heat and power systems, biofuels, renewable energy, and electricity and hydrogen energy systems infrastructure
- 2005 Climate Change Fellow with the Woods Institute at Stanford University

**Jane CS Long**

*Senior Fellow and Council Member of the California Council on Science and Technology*

*Associate Director for Energy and Environment, retired, Lawrence Livermore National Lab*

Ph.D., UC Berkeley

B.S., Engineering, Brown University

- Chairman of the California Council on Science and Technology's committee on California's Energy Future
- Current work involves strategies for dealing with climate change including reinvention of the energy system, geoengineering, and adaptation
- Past Dean of the Mackay School of Mines, University of Nevada, Reno
- Past Department Chair for the Energy Resources Technology and the Environmental Research Departments at Lawrence Berkeley National Lab.
- Fellow of the American Association for the Advancement of Science

**DISCUSSION**

Staff have assessed the candidates' experience and education relative to the Advisory Council and have determined that the candidates who are interviewing with the Committee possess the

necessary experience and education to serve on the Council. The application materials of the candidates will be provided to the Committee for your review.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Jeff McKay  
Rex Sanders