Bay Area Air Quality Management District 375 Beale Street, Suite 600 San Francisco, California 94105 (415) 749-5073

#### APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors

Joint Meeting of the Executive Committee and Advisory Council

Monday, March 26, 2018

## 1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

Executive Committee (Committee) Chairperson, David Hudson, called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m.

# **Roll Call:**

Present: Executive Committee Members: Committee Chairperson David Hudson; and Directors Carole Groom, Nate Miley, Mark, Ross, Rod Sinks, Jim Spering, and Brad Wagenknecht.

Advisory Council (Council) Members: Council Chair Stan Hayes; and Members Professor Severin Borenstein, Dr. Michael Kleinman, Dr. Tim Lipman, and Dr. Jane Long.

Absent: Executive Committee Members: Vice Chairperson Katie Rice; and Directors John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, and Liz Kniss.

Advisory Council Members: None.

Also Present: None.

### 2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 7, 2018

Public Comments:		
No requests received.		
Committee Comments:		

# Committee Action:

None.

Director Spering made a motion, seconded by Director Ross, to approve the minutes of February 7, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Groom, Hudson, Sinks, Spering and Wagenknecht.

NOES: None. ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Gioia, Haggerty, Kniss, Miley, and Rice.

### 3. OVERVIEW OF THE AIR DISTRICT'S ADVISORY COUNCIL

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, gave the staff presentation *Advisory Council Overview*, including: Advisory Council history; Senate Bill 1415 - Health and Safety Code Amendments; Advisory Council mission; current Advisory Council member biographies; presentations to the Advisory Council – efficacy of greenhouse gas caps at refineries, Advisory Council opinion, policy recommendation; and Advisory Council next area of focus – particulate matter (PM.)

NOTED PRESENT: Dr. Kleinman was noted present at 9:42 a.m.

## **Public Comments:**

Public comments were made by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

# **Committee Comments:**

The Committee and staff discussed how politics impact the integration of scientists' and climate change experts' recommendations; the request for a District process that requires the Board to officially receive and respond to recommendations from the Advisory Council; the need for improved communication between the Board and Advisory Council, and the suggestion that quarterly reports to the Board from the Advisory Council be reinstated, that the Advisory Council be invited to present at Board meetings as needed, or the Executive Committee meets with the Advisory Council and reports back to the full Board about the Advisory Council's recommendations; the status of the District's efforts to establish a community/environmental justice advocacy body, and the challenges of integrating the environmental justice community into Advisory Council membership; whether the Advisory Council should be a scientific or environmental advocacy body; and the request for the District's public recruitment process for Advisory Council vacancies.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Miley was noted present at 10:22 a.m.

# Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

### 4. REVIEW OF AIR DISTRICT PRIORITIES

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, gave the staff presentation *Review of Air District Priorities*, including: update on air quality; and key rule making efforts.

### Public Comments:

No requests received.

### **Committee Comments:**

None.

### Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

# 5. UPDATE ON ASSEMBLY BILL 617 (AB 617)

Henry Hilken, Director of Planning and Climate Protection, gave the staff presentation *AB 617 - Protecting Community Health*, including: AB 6127 background; program components; community selection; how do we select all candidate communities; criteria under consideration; sources that impact the Interstate-880 corridor; how do we prioritize communities for action; community monitoring objectives, role, screening, and challenges; emissions reduction plans; emissions inventory; incentives; Best Available Retrofit Control Technology; AB 617 statutory and program deadlines; Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) provides foundation for AB 617; early AB 617 actions; and what's next?

# **Public Comments:**

No requests received.

### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed how AB 134 provided \$50 million to the District to support immediate reductions through Carl Moyer Program incentives; how the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) will be applied to local community action plans, Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT), and the California Air Resource Board's (CARB) statewide strategies to reduce emissions of criteria air pollutants and toxic air contaminants; how, when looking beyond attainment, correlation does not always imply causation, and how to select the proper variables to determine causation; low-cost sensors that that public has access to, and the need to curtail wood burning on non-Winter Spare the Air days; the need for the California Legislature to take more significant action to achieve diesel and PM emission reductions, rather than create modest grant programs that have minimal effects; the need for the District to collect copies of counties' Community Health Assessments that are conducted every few years; the importance of the District's relationships with County Health Officers; the need for joint legislation or regulation from local air districts and CARB, as air districts only have direct regulatory authority over stationary sources, but much of the air pollution is generated from mobile sources, which are regulated by CARB; the suggestion that the Advisory Council deliberates on the health risks and monitoring of nanoparticles and methane leakage from fracking; and how the monitoring of acute health issues, such as emergency room trips for asthma and cardiovascular disease and complications with newborns, can better measure the effectiveness of emissionreducing strategies than gathering data on mortality, life-expectancy, and cancer-risk rates, which are accumulated over lifetimes of exposure.

# **Committee Action:**

None; receive and file.

#### 6. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were made by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

### 7. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Advisory Council Chairperson Hayes and Member Lipman both thanked the Executive Committee for the opportunity to combine both bodies.

Executive Committee Chairperson Hudson explained his reasoning for moving forward with the Ad Hoc Refinery Oversight Committee, despite pushback from the environmental justice community. He explained how his selection of the Ad-Hoc Refinery Oversight Committee members was based on geographic representation from all over the Bay Area, and how he hopes to have the Committee address things that Proposed Rule 12-16 would have addressed. Chair Hudson also stated that he is amazed at the rate at which various modes of transportation are becoming electrified.

# 8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

The next Executive Committee meeting will be held on Monday, April 18, 2018, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

#### 9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:50 a.m.

/S/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards