

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

Video Conference Location
Santa Rosa Junior College
Doyle Library, Room 4248
1501 Mendocino Avenue
Santa Rosa, CA 95401

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Monday, June 4, 2018

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Teresa Barrett, called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. and announced that Director Zane was participating via videoconference from Santa Rosa Junior College.

Present: Chairperson Teresa Barrett; Vice Chair Hillary Ronen; and Directors John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, Doug Kim, Mark Ross, Rod Sinks, Brad Wagenknecht, and Shirlee Zane (remote).

Absent: Directors Liz Kniss and Katie Rice.

Also Present: Board of Directors Chair, David Hudson

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MARCH 15, 2018

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty and Vice Chair Ronen were noted present at 9:36 a.m.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

None.

Committee Action:

Director Gioia made a motion, seconded by Vice Chair Ronen, to approve the Minutes of March 15, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Gioia, Haggerty, Hudson, Ronen, Sinks, Wagenknecht, and Zane.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Kim, Kniss, Rice, and Ross.

3. CLIMATE PROTECTION GRANT PROGRAM

Henry Hilken, Director of Planning and Climate Protection, introduced Abby Young, Climate Protection Manager, who gave the staff presentation *Climate Protection Grant Program*, including: goal and objectives; grant program structure; applications submitted; evaluation process; scoring criteria; results; high-level outcomes; decarbonizing buildings on a regional scale; innovative new approaches; and application results.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Kim was noted present at 9:38 a.m., and Director Ross was noted present at 9:41 a.m.

Public Comments:

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the scoring of various applications and which projects are expected to be the most replicable; the number of applications that included proposed or secured matching funds; the fact that many project applications included strategies for circulating to other jurisdictions how to replicate their project, and how the Air District (District) plans to use that information to circulate best practices to other jurisdictions and air districts; concern that “web-based community engagement” may not yield tangible, measurable benefits; the fact that the City of Santa Clara’s project application for electric vehicle charging at schools was not recommended for funding because staff feels that the District’s Charge! program would be better suited for the application’s proposed scope of work; potential challenges that Marin County, the applicant that seeks to develop a market for low-carbon concrete, may face, as using recycled material would affect current building codes; the potential for partnerships between the District and insurance agencies who might be interested in the reduction of carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions in homes that could result if fossil-fuel equipment and appliances are replaced with electric heat pumps, as many of the project applications seek to do; scoring criteria and requirements regarding budget and local matching funds; the Committee’s request to view the project applications; staff’s methodology and formula for estimating each project application’s GHG reductions, and the request for a more stringent formula that is consistently applied during the scoring process in future grant cycles of this program; and reporting requirements of grantees and the suggestion that grantees be required to submit a formal synopsis after the completion of their projects.

Committee Action:

Director Haggerty made a motion, seconded by Director Ross, to recommend that the Board approve proposed projects for the 2018 Climate Protection Grant Program and authorization for the Executive Officer/APCO to execute grant agreements for the recommended projects; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Gioia, Haggerty, Hudson, Kim, Ronen, Ross, Sinks, Wagenknecht, and Zane.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Kniss and Rice.

4. CONSUMPTION-BASED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS INVENTORY

Mr. Hilken introduced David Burch, Principal Environmental Planner, who gave the staff presentation *Consumption-Based Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Emissions Inventory (CBEI)*, including: overview; rationale for CBEI; basic concept; example - life cycle emissions for automobile; CBEI work products; map of total emissions; map of block group detail; local variation in GHG footprint; US average household GHG footprint; San Francisco Bay Area average household GHG footprint; policy implications; key take-aways; using CBEI in Climate Protection Program; looking forward, and additional information.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed staff's acknowledgement that only a portion of the entire Bay Area region is captured on the slide called "total emissions of carbon dioxide equivalent (CO₂e) per household"; how to use interactive map products that show emissions by sector in a given census block or city, and data sources that contribute to consumption profiles for each sector; the stages of the lifecycle of food as a key sector of CO₂e emissions, and the request that the District creates educational tools to help people make food choices that support sustainability and have a lower carbon footprint; how socioeconomic characteristics and disparities correlate with factors that account for variation in the GHG footprint in a given area; the difficulty in measuring the savings in GHG emissions between a consumer driving to a store versus delivery from an internet retailer, and the Committee's interest in exploring how the behaviors and decisions made by consumers can affect GHG emission levels; industries that make up the "services" sector in the chart called "San Francisco Area Average Household GHG Footprint"; the interest in reuse of cardboard boxes used in product delivery and other green delivery options from internet retailers; and the request for both source-based and consumption-based inventories for each county or even community choice agency in the Bay Area.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

5. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Board Chair Hudson requested that staff needs to better celebrate the accomplishment of milestones and goals that have been reached over the years, so that people can more easily observe progress, improvements, and how District programs are connected.

Director Zane announced that she accepted a position on the Board of Directors for the National Council for Science and the Environment.

Public Comments:

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

6. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the Climate Protection Committee meeting will be at the call of the Chair.

7. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:29 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards