

BOARD OF DIRECTORS CLIMATE PROTECTION COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

TERESA BARRETT - CHAIR
JOHN GIOIA
DOUG KIM
KATIE RICE
ROD SINKS
SHIRLEE ZANE

HILLARY RONEN - VICE CHAIR
SCOTT HAGGERTY
LIZ KNISS
MARK ROSS
BRAD WAGENKNECHT

THURSDAY SEPTEMBER 20, 2018 9:30 A.M. 1ST FLOOR BOARD ROOM 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

VIDEO CONFERENCE LOCATION SANTA ROSA JUNIOR COLLEGE DOYLE LIBRARY, ROOM 4248 1501 MENDOCINO AVENUE SANTA ROSA, CA 95401

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members. The Committee Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas at the time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain errors and omissions and are not certified for their content or form.

Public Comment on Agenda Items The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Public Comment Cards for items on the agenda must be submitted in person to the Clerk of the Boards at the location of the meeting and prior to the Board taking up the particular item. Where an item was moved from the Consent Calendar to an Action item, no speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.

For the first round of public comment on non-agenda matters at the beginning of the agenda, ten persons selected by a drawing by the Clerk of the Boards from among the Public Comment Cards indicating they wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Board on matters not on the agenda. For this first round of public comments on non-agenda matters, all Public Comment Cards must be submitted in person to the Clerk of the Board at the location of the meeting and prior to commencement of the meeting.

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA**

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3 For the first round of public comment on non-agenda matters at the beginning of the agenda, ten persons selected by a drawing by the Clerk of the Boards from among the Public Comment Cards indicating they wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Board on matters not on the agenda. For this first round of public comments on non-agenda matters, all Public Comment Cards must be submitted in person to the Clerk of the Board at the location of the meeting and prior to commencement of the meeting.

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JUNE 4, 2018

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Committee will consider approving the draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of June 4, 2018.

4. UPDATE ON DEVELOPMENT OF RULE 13-1: SIGNIFICANT METHANE RELEASES J. Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

Staff will provide background information on Greenhouse Gas emission reduction goals, purpose of the rule, the affected industries, a summary of rule development efforts and the next steps in process.

5. ORGANICS RECOVERY STRATEGY

J. Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

Staff will brief the Committee on the Organics Recovery Strategy, an effort to coordinate activities related to organic waste diversion to minimize Greenhouse Gases, Air pollutants and odors.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Speakers who did not have the opportunity to address the Board in the first round of comments on non-agenda matters will be allowed two minutes each to address the Board on non-agenda matters.

7. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Any member of the Board, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Thursday, November 15, 2018, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.

CONTACT:

MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

BAAQMD homepage:

FAX: (415) 928-8560

vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

www.baagmd.gov

(415) 749-4941

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the "Members of the Climate Protection Committee" and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Board meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Board at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baagmd.goy/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at rsanders@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE: MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

SEPTEMBER 2018

TYPE OF MEETING	<u>DAY</u>	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Monday of every other Month)	Monday	17	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Ad Hoc Building Oversight Committee (At the Call of the Chair)	Wednesday	19	9:00 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Special Meeting of the Sole Members of the Bay Area Clean Air Foundation (At the Call of the Chair)	Wednesday	19	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	19	9:45 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Thursday of every other Month)	Thursday	20	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets on the 4 th Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	26	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)	Thursday	27	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room

OCTOBER 2018

TYPE OF MEETING	<u>DAY</u>	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	3	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Ad Hoc Refinery Oversight Committee (At the Call of the Chair)	Wednesday	3	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	17	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors TIO Steering Committee (At the Call of the Chair)	Monday	22	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets on the 4 th Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	24	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 th Thursday of each Month)	Thursday	25	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Advisory Council Mtg. (At the Call of the Chair)	Monday	29	10:00 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room

NOVEMBER 2018

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	7	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Thursday of every other Month)	Thursday	15	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Monday of every other Month)	Monday	19	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	21	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 th Thursday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Thursday	22	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets on the 4 th Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	28	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109

HL - 9/11/18 - 3:00 p.m.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Teresa Barrett and Members

of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent

Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 7, 2018

Re: Approval of the Minutes of June 4, 2018

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee (Committee) meeting of June 4, 2018.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Committee meeting of June 4, 2018.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: <u>Marcy Hiratzka</u>
Reviewed by: <u>Vanessa Johnson</u>

Attachment 3A: Draft Minutes of the Committee meeting of June 4, 2018

Draft Minutes - Climate Protection Committee Meeting of June 4, 2018

Bay Area Air Quality Management District 375 Beale Street, Suite 600 San Francisco, California 94105 (415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee Meeting Monday, June 4, 2018

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Teresa Barrett, called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m.

Present: Chairperson Teresa Barrett; Vice Chair Hillary Ronen; and Directors John

Gioia, Scott Haggerty, Doug Kim, Mark Ross, Rod Sinks, Brad

Wagenknecht, and Shirlee Zane.

Absent: Directors Liz Kniss and Katie Rice.

Also Present: Board of Directors Chair, David Hudson

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MARCH 15, 2018

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty and Vice Chair Ronen were noted present at 9:36 a.m.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

None.

Committee Action:

Director Gioia made a motion, seconded by Vice Chair Ronen, to approve the Minutes of March 15, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Gioia, Haggerty, Hudson, Ronen, Sinks, Wagenknecht, and Zane.

NOES: None. ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Kim, Kniss, Rice, and Ross.

3. CLIMATE PROTECTION GRANT PROGRAM

Henry Hilken, Director of Planning and Climate Protection, introduced Abby Young, Climate Protection Manager, who gave the staff presentation *Climate Protection Grant Program*, including: goal and objectives; grant program structure; applications submitted; evaluation process; scoring criteria; results; high-level outcomes; decarbonizing buildings on a regional scale; innovative new approaches; and application results.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Kim was noted present at 9:38 a.m., and Director Ross was noted present at 9:41 a.m.

Public Comments:

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the scoring of various applications and which projects are expected to be the most replicable; the number of applications that included proposed or secured matching funds; the fact that many project applications included strategies for circulating to other jurisdictions how to replicate their project, and how the Air District (District) plans to use that information to circulate best practices to other jurisdictions and air districts; concern that "webbased community engagement" may not yield tangible, measurable benefits; the fact that the City of Santa Clara's project application for electric vehicle charging at schools was not recommended for funding because staff feels that the District's Charge! program would be better suited for the application's proposed scope of work; potential challenges that Marin County, the applicant that seeks to develop a market for low-carbon concrete, may face, as using recycled material would affect current building codes; the potential for partnerships between the District and insurance agencies who might be interested in the reduction of carbon dioxide (CO2) emissions in homes that could result if fossil-fuel equipment and appliances are replaced with electric heat pumps, as many of the project applications seek to do; scoring criteria and requirements regarding budget and local matching funds; the Committee's request to view the project applications; staff's methodology and formula for estimating each project application's GHG reductions, and the request for a more stringent formula that is consistently applied during the scoring process in future grant cycles of this program; and reporting requirements of grantees and the suggestion that grantees be required to submit a formal synopsis after the completion of their projects.

Committee Action:

Director Haggerty made a motion, seconded by Director Ross, to recommend that the Board approve proposed projects for the 2018 Climate Protection Grant Program and authorization for the Executive Officer/APCO to execute grant agreements for the recommended projects; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Gioia, Haggerty, Hudson, Kim, Ronen, Ross, Sinks, Wagenknecht,

and Zane.

NOES: None. ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Kniss and Rice.

4. CONSUMPTION-BASED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS INVENTORY

Mr. Hilken introduced David Burch, Principal Environmental Planner, who gave the staff presentation *Consumption-Based Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Emissions Inventory (CBEI)*, including: overview; rationale for CBEI; basic concept; example - life cycle emissions for automobile; CBEI work products; map of total emissions; map of block group detail; local variation in GHG footprint; US average household GHG footprint; San Francisco Bay Area average household GHG footprint; policy implications; key take-aways; using CBEI in Climate Protection Program; looking forward, and additional information.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed staff's acknowledgement that only a portion of the entire Bay Area region is captured on the slide called "total emissions of carbon dioxide equivalent (CO2e) per household"; how to use interactive map products that show emissions by sector in a given census block or city, and data sources that contribute to consumption profiles for each sector; the stages of the lifecycle of food as a key sector of CO2e emissions, and the request that the District creates educational tools to help people make food choices that support sustainability and have a lower carbon footprint; how socioeconomic characteristics and disparities correlate with factors that account for variation in the GHG footprint in a given area; the difficulty in measuring the savings in GHG emissions between a consumer driving to a store versus delivery from an internet retailer, and the Committee's interest in exploring how the behaviors and decisions made by consumers can affect GHG emission levels; industries that make up the "services" sector in the chart called "San Francisco Area Average Household GHG Footprint"; the interest in reuse of carboard boxes used in product delivery and other green delivery options from internet retailers; and the request for both source-based and consumption-based inventories for each county or even community choice agency in the Bay Area.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

5. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Board Chair Hudson requested that staff needs to better celebrate the accomplishment of milestones and goals that have been reached over the years, so that people can more easily observe progress, improvements, and how District programs are connected.

Draft Minutes - Climate Protection Committee Meeting of June 4, 2018

Director Zane announced that she accepted a position on the Board of Directors for the National Council for Science and the Environment.

Public Comments:

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

6. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the Climate Protection Committee meeting will be at the call of the Chair.

7. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:29 a.m.

Marcy Hiratzka Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Teresa Barrett and Members

of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent

Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 11, 2018

Re: <u>Update on Development of Rule 13-1: Significant Methane Releases</u>

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

The Air District has a policy goal of reducing Bay Area greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions to 40 percent below 1990 levels by 2030, and 80 percent below 1990 levels by 2050. Methane (CH₄) is a potent and short-lived GHG; pound per pound, its global warming potential is 86 times stronger than that of carbon dioxide (CO₂), when compared on a 20-year time horizon. Methane represents the second largest emissions of GHGs in the region, after CO₂. In 2015, all methane sources located within the Air District boundaries emitted an estimated 10 million metric tons of CO₂ equivalent (MMT CO₂e) about 10 percent of the Bay Area's GHG inventory. These sources include stationary sources such as landfills; wastewater treatment; petroleum refineries; the natural gas production and distribution systems; mobile sources, such as cars and trucks; and natural sources such as wetlands. Given the importance of controlling methane, the Air District has developed a comprehensive Basin-wide Methane Strategy as part of its 2017 Clean Air Plan.

The Methane Strategy is an agency-wide effort to better quantify and reduce the region's methane emissions. Regulation 13: Climate Pollutants, Rule 1: Significant Methane Releases (Rule 13-1) would be the first rule developed as part of this Strategy. The purpose of the Rule is to limit significant methane releases throughout the Bay Area and, if adopted, it would be the first Air District rule to focus on climate protection by regulating methane emissions. Subsequent source-specific methane rules will be adopted to address emissions from various specific operations.

DISCUSSION

In this presentation, staff will provide the Stationary Source Committee with information on:

- Background greenhouse gas emission reduction goals;
- Purpose of this rule;
- Most likely affected industries;
- Summary of rule development efforts; and
- Next steps in the process.

BUDGET CONSIDERATIONS/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: William Thomas Saltz

Reviewed by: Victor Douglas

AGENDA: 5

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Teresa Barrett and Members

of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent

Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 5, 2018

Re: Organics Recovery Strategy

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

The California Air Resources Board (CARB) adopted the Short-Lived Climate Pollutant (SLCP) Reduction Strategy for the state of California in March 2017. The Strategy addresses emissions of methane (and other SLCPs) that may not be reduced by CARB's Cap-and-Trade Program. The SLCP Strategy was developed to help the State achieve its goal of reducing methane emissions 40 percent by the year 2030. As part of key actions to reduce waste sector emissions, the Short-Lived Climate Pollutant Act of 2016 (SB 1383) requires the State to divert organic materials from landfills on a relatively rapid schedule: 50% by 2020 and 75% by 2025. Currently, landfills account for over half of all methane emissions in the Bay Area, predominantly from organic material decomposition. Diverting organics from landfills can play a critical role in reducing these emissions – and potentially result in recovered resources and energy – provided these materials are processed using best practices.

To meet the goals of SB 1383, preliminary calculations suggest that the Bay Area region needs the equivalent of 10-20 new facilities processing on the order of 50,000-100,000 tons per year of organic materials. In addition, new separation, storage, and hauling infrastructure will be needed to meet these goals. The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) will likely experience an increase in the number of permit applications for new and existing facilities needed to handle the rising volumes of organic materials expected. These facilities may include transfer stations, composting and anaerobic digestion facilities. In the absence of Air District rules for these facilities, air quality permitting in this sector has relied largely on a case-by-case approach when reviewing applications.

Thus far, air emissions from organics recovery activities have not been well characterized, partly due to limited study of the operations and factors affecting emissions. This knowledge gap has made it difficult to estimate the magnitude and characteristics of emissions from collection, separation, transport, storage, processing, and application of recovered organics. Emissions differences among processing technologies and the effects of changing environmental and

operational conditions are even less well known. As a result, existing emission factors are relatively coarse, which presents a key challenge in permitting and crafting regulations for this sector.

DISCUSSION

Over the past several months, staff has been working on the development of a comprehensive organics recovery strategy to address the air quality challenges associated with diverting organic materials from landfills while also supporting the State's organics diversion goals. This effort is a key component of the Air District's Methane Strategy, particularly since landfills are responsible for over half of all the methane emitted in the Bay Area. Over the next few years, the Air District expects to develop a suite of rules, permitting requirements, enforcement practices and guidance on best management practices that will focus on preventing greenhouse gas, criteria and toxic pollutant emissions and odors from the organics recovery sector. Staff will also collaborate with industry, academia, and other regulatory agencies to improve the understanding of emissions from this sector. Work on the first of the rules, Draft Rule 13-2: Organic Material Handling and Rule 13-3: Composting Operations, has already commenced. The Air District seeks to ensure that as more organic materials are diverted from landfills, these measures will protect public health and help reduce greenhouse gas emissions consistent with the Air District's 2017 Clean Air Plan.

On June 25, 2018, the Air District invited stakeholders to a Regional Convening to provide input on what a comprehensive organics recovery strategy might include and to discuss local or regional issues that should be considered in developing this strategy. These considerations include state planning requirements on local governments, land use compatibility, environmental review, existing regulations, permitting, enforcement, incentives and how the Air District can best provide guidance to local governments and other stakeholders on these issues.

Staff will report on the progress of developing the Air District's Organics Recovery Strategy, including highlights from the Regional Convening and an update on the first organic sector rules being developed.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None. Resources to develop the Organics Recovery Strategy are included in the Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2019 budget.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: <u>Idania Zamora</u> Reviewed by: <u>Henry Hilken</u>