

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 4105
(415) 749-5073

Board of Directors Regular Meeting
Wednesday, April 4, 2018

APPROVED MINUTES

*Note: Audio recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the
Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
www.baaqmd.gov/BODagendas*

CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments:** Board Chairperson, David Hudson, called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson David Hudson; Secretary Rod Sinks; and Directors Margaret Abe-Koga, Teresa Barrett, David J. Canepa, Cindy Chavez, Pauline Russo Cutter, John Gioia, Carole Groom, Scott Haggerty, Tyrone Jue, Rebecca Kaplan, Doug Kim, Liz Kniss, Nate Miley, Karen Mitchoff, Hilary Ronen, Mark Ross, Pete Sanchez, Jim Spring, Brad Wagenknecht, and Shirlee Zane.

Absent: Vice Chair Katie Rice.

COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS

2. The Board of Directors recognized outgoing Director Rebecca Kaplan for her two years of service, leadership, and dedication to protecting air quality in the Bay Area. Director Jeff Sheehy was recognized in absentia. Director Kaplan gave outgoing remarks.

Public Comments:

Public comments were given by Andres Soto, Communities for a Better Environment; and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Ross was noted present at 9:41 a.m., Director Ronen was noted present at 9:43 a.m., and Directors Cutter and Jue were noted present at 9:45 a.m.

CONSENT CALENDAR (ITEMS 3-11)

3. Minutes of the Regular Board of Directors Meeting of March 7, 2018
4. Board Communications Received from March 7, 2018 through April 3, 2018
5. Air District Personnel on Out-of-State Business Travel
6. Notices of Violations Issued and Settlements in Excess of \$10,000 in the month of February 2018

7. Cooperative Air District Project with the California Air Resources Board (CARB) to Improve West Coast Ozone Boundary Conditions for Regional Air Quality Modeling
8. Projects and Contracts with Proposed Grant Awards Over \$100,000
9. Consider Approving Air District Participation in a Woodstove Changeout Program Administered by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association
10. Consider Recognizing an EPA Grant Award for \$321,000 and Consider Authorizing the Executive Officer/APCO to Award a Contract and Issue a Purchase Order for Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2018, not to exceed \$250,000 to Ramboll Environ, Inc., Pursuant to Administrative Code Division II Fiscal Policies and Procedures, Section 4.3 Contract Limitations, to perform a Community Scale Air Toxics Ambient Monitoring Project in the City of Richmond
11. Climate Protection Grant Program

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

Director Sanchez stated for the record that he abstained on Item 3, but approved Items 4 through 11.

Board Action:

Director Wagenknecht made a motion, seconded by Director Barrett, to **approve** the Consent Calendar Items 3 through 11, inclusive; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

- | | |
|----------|---|
| AYES: | Abe-Koga, Barrett, Canepa, Chavez, Cutter, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Hudson, Jue, Kaplan, Kim, Kniss, Mitchoff, Ronen, Ross, Sanchez (Items 4-11), Sinks, Spering, Wagenknecht, and Zane. |
| NOES: | None. |
| ABSTAIN: | Sanchez (Item 3). |
| ABSENT: | Rice and Miley. |

COMMITTEE REPORTS

12. Report of the **Climate Protection Committee** Meeting of March 15, 2018

Climate Protection Committee Chair, Director Teresa Barrett, read the following Committee report:

The Climate Protection Committee met on Thursday, March 15, 2018, and approved the minutes of November 16, 2017.

The Committee received and discussed the staff presentation Climate Protection Grant Program. The Committee recommends the Board:

1. *Approve the Climate Protection Grant Program Guidelines, containing a suggested revision, at the consensus of the Climate Protection Committee, to Section V: Evaluation*

and Scoring Criteria. The suggested revision is that an eighth criterion be added, adding 5 points for projects that benefit low-income communities.

Finally, the Committee received and discussed the staff presentation Update on the Air District's Basin-Wide Methane Strategy.

The next meeting of the Committee will be held on Thursday, May 17, 2018, at 9:30 a.m., at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. I move that the Board approve the Climate Protection Committee's recommendations. This concludes the Chair report of the Climate Protection Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

Director Barrett made a motion, seconded by Director Kaplan, to **approve** the recommendations of the Climate Protection Committee; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Abe-Koga, Barrett, Canepa, Chavez, Cutter, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Hudson, Jue, Kaplan, Kim, Kniss, Mitchoff, Ronen, Ross, Sanchez, Sinks, Spring, Wagenknecht, and Zane.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Miley and Rice.

13. Report of the **Stationary Source Committee** Meeting of March 19, 2018

Stationary Source Committee Chair, Director John Gioia, read the following Committee report:

The Committee met on Monday, March 19, 2018, and approved the minutes of December 18, 2017.

The Committee received over fifty public comments on the renewal of the Philipps 66 Title 5 permit under non-agenda items. As a result, the Committee did not receive the staff report Update on the Preliminary Best Available Retrofit Control Technology Evaluation and Identification of Potential Rule Development Projects, nor the staff report Update on the Air District's Basin-Wide Methane Strategy. These items were tabled until the next meeting of the Committee.

The next meeting of the Committee will be held on Monday, May 21, 2018, at 10:30 a.m., at the Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105. This concludes the Chair report of the Stationary Source Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

None; receive and file.

14. Report of the **Legislative Committee** Meeting of March 22, 2018

Legislative Committee Chair Hudson read the following Committee report:

The Legislative Committee met on Thursday, March 22, 2018, and approved the minutes of February 22, 2018.

The Committee considered new bills and recommends that the Board of Directors take the following positions:

- *SUPPORT Assembly Bill 1796 (Muratsuchi), which addresses electric vehicle charging station installation in rent-controlled buildings;*
- *SUPPORT Assembly Bill 2061 (Frazier), which increases truck weight limits for electric, fuel cell, or natural gas trucks;*
- *OPPOSE Assembly Bill 2940 (Caballero), which exempts certain heavy-duty diesel low-use and agricultural vehicles from existing requirements that would prevent their registration;*
- *SUPPORT Assembly Bill 3059 (Bloom), which authorizes congestion pricing demonstration projects;*
- *Upon discussion, the Committee recommended that staff's recommended position be changed from SUPPORT IF AMENDED to SEEK AMENDMENTS regarding Senate Bill 1144 (Dodd), which increases civil stationary source air penalty ceilings for serious violations at power plants, petrochemical facilities, and refineries; and*
- *SUPPORT Senate Bill 1427 (Hill), which states legislative intent to improve enforcement of high-occupancy vehicle and high-occupancy toll lanes.*

Staff brought an additional issue to the Committee for its consideration, and the Committee recommends that the Board of Directors take the following position:

- *OPPOSE Assembly Bill 2336 (Salas), which prioritizes the retrofit or replacement of high-emission school buses operating in air districts that are designated federal extreme nonattainment.*

Finally, staff updated the Committee on Sacramento events of significance since its last meeting.

The next meeting of the Legislative Committee is at the call of the Chair. I move that the Board approve the Committee's recommendations. This concludes the Chair's report of the Legislative Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the request for staff to evaluate Senate Bill 100 (De Leon), California Renewables Portfolio Standard Program: emissions of greenhouse gases, and bring it back to the Legislative Committee with a recommended position for the Board's consideration.

Board Action:

Chair Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Mitchoff, to **approve** the recommendations of the Legislative Committee; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Abe-Koga, Barrett, Canepa, Chavez, Cutter, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Hudson, Jue, Kaplan, Kim, Kniss, Mitchoff, Ronen, Ross, Sanchez, Sinks, Spering, Wagenknecht, and Zane.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Miley and Rice.

15. Report of the **Executive Committee and Advisory Council Joint** Meeting of March 26, 2018

Executive Committee Chair Hudson read the following Committee report:

A joint meeting of the Executive Committee and Advisory Council was held on Monday, March 26, 2018. The Committee approved the minutes of February 7, 2018.

The Committee reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Overview of the Air District's Advisory Council.

The Committee then reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Air District Priorities.

Finally, the Committee reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Update on Assembly Bill 617.

The next meeting of the Executive Committee will be held on Monday, April 18, 2018, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 9:30 a.m. This concludes the Chair report of the Executive Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

None; receive and file.

16. Report of the **Advisory Council** Meeting of March 26, 2018

Advisory Council Board Liaison, Director Rod Sinks, read the following Council report:

The Council met on Monday, March 26, 2018, and approved the minutes of December 11, 2017.

The Council received the staff presentation Particulate Matter in the Bay Area.

Finally, the Council received the staff presentation Advisory Council Next Area of Focus: Continuation of Discussions of Particulate Matter.

The next meeting of the Council is at the call of the Chair. This concludes the Chair Report of the Advisory Council.

Public Comments:

Public comments were given by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed Governor Brown's Global Climate Action Summit, scheduled for September 12-14, 2018, the desire to see the District's Advisory Council's and staff's participation and promotion of the 2017 Clean Air Plan at that event; the District's subsequent one-day affiliate event with the Metropolitan Transportation Commission, called the "Bay Area Climate Leadership Forum", and expanding participants to a California level, as opposed to just the Bay Area, or even to the United States; the Advisory Council's appreciation for the joint meeting with the Executive Council in March; the Advisory Council's next area of focus, which will be "Continuation of Discussions of Particulate Matter Beyond Attainment"; and the District's proposed Diesel PM strategy, how both mobile and stationary sources should be included in that discussion as stakeholders, and how this initiative is in alignment with CARB's long-term goals.

Board Action:

None; receive and file

17. Report of the **Budget and Finance Committee** Meeting of March 28, 2018

Budget and Finance Committee Chair, Director Carole Groom, read the following Committee report:

The Committee met on Wednesday, March 28, 2018, and approved the minutes of February 28, 2018.

The Committee reviewed and discussed the presentation Proposed Amendments to Regulation 3: Fees.

Finally, the Committee reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Discussion of Proposed Budget for Fiscal Year Ending 2019.

The next meeting of the Budget and Finance Committee will be held on Wednesday, April 25, 2018, at 9:30 a.m., at the Bay Area Air Quality Management District office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. This concludes the Chair Report of the Budget and Finance Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

None; receive and file

18. Report of the **Public Engagement Committee** Meeting of April 2, 2018

Public Engagement Committee Chair, Dir. Brad Wagenknecht, read the following Committee report:

The Committee met on Monday, April 2, 2018 and approved the minutes of September 25, 2017.

The Committee reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Approval of a Contract for Spare the Air Advertising and Messaging Campaigns. The Committee recommends that the Board:

- 1. Approve Pro시오 Communications as the selected contractor for the Spare the Air Campaigns, Advertising, Communications and Evaluation Services; and*
- 2. Authorize the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer to execute a contract with Pro시오 Communications, for an amount not to exceed \$1,950,000 per contract year, during Fiscal Year Ending 2019 and Fiscal Year Ending 2020, and \$2,019,000 for Fiscal Year Ending 2021.*

The Committee then reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Authorization to Execute Contract Amendments for Spare the Air Program Website Development. The Committee recommends that the Board:

- 1. Authorize the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer to execute contract amendments with Cylogy in the amount of \$100,000 for backend website content management system development, integration, customization, and infrastructure support.*

The Committee then reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Selection of a Contractor to Facilitate the Spare the Air Resource Teams. The Committee recommends that the Board:

- 1. Approve the selection of Community Focus, a contractor to facilitate the Spare the Air Resource Team;*

2. *Approve the selection of Kearns and West, a contractor to establish a Spare the Air Resource Team in Marin County;*
3. *Authorize the Executive Officer//Air Pollution Control to execute a contract with Community Focus for facilitation services in an amount not to exceed \$222,000 per contract year, for up to three years; and*
4. *Authorize the Executive Officer//Air Pollution Control to execute a contract with Kearns and West to create a new Spare the Air Resource Team and meeting facilitation support in an amount not to exceed \$38,000 per contract year, for up to three years.*

The Committee then reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Accept and Appropriate Funds from Two State Community Climate Investment Grants for Supporting Community Engagement Efforts in Alameda County. The Committee recommends that the Board:

1. *Accept and appropriate funds from the County of Alameda Flood Control District for the California Natural Resources Agency Urban Greening Grant in an amount not to exceed \$109,000 in support of the San Leandro Creek Urban Greenway, Phase 1 project in East Oakland;*
2. *Accept and appropriate funds from the California Department of Conservation for the State Transformative Climate Community Program in an amount not to exceed \$170,000, in support of the West Oakland Marcus Garvey Commons Project; and*
3. *Ensure the contracts include maintenance and licensing agreement language. This was requested by the maker of the motion.*

The Committee then reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Overview of the Spare the Air Youth for Environmental Sustainability Conference.

Finally, the Committee reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Overview of Awarded Fiscal Year Ending 2019 James Cary Smith Community Grant Projects.

The next meeting is at the call of the Chair. I move that the Board approve the Public Engagement Committee's recommendation. This concludes the Chair Report of the Public Engagement Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

Director Wagenknecht made a motion, seconded by Director Ross, to **approve** the recommendations of the Public Engagement Committee; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Abe-Koga, Barrett, Canepa, Chavez, Cutter, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Hudson, Jue, Kaplan, Kim, Kniss, Mitchoff, Ronen, Ross, Sanchez, Sinks, Spring, Wagenknecht, and Zane.

NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Miley and Rice.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

19. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Public comments were given by San Francisco residents, Radu Patrichi, and Diana Rivers.

Board Comments:

In response to the public comments, regarding complaints of smoke from a commercial facility affecting residences, the Board and staff discussed how this issue is being addressed by both the District and the City of San Francisco, and the request that staff brings this issue to the next meeting of the Executive Committee.

BOARD MEMBERS' COMMENTS

20. Board Members' Comments

The Board members wished Director Kaplan well and thanked her for her service on the Board for the past two years, specifically noting that she always made a point to advocate for all regions of the Bay Area, and not just her own.

Director Gioia asked staff to give a status update on the recruitment for the two Advisory Council positions that are currently vacant, specifically how the District is publicizing the recruitment, and whether particular disciplines are desired. Staff responded that the recruitment was promoted to the home page on the District's website, that candidates will be interviewed in May by the Personnel Committee, that CARB, the Board, Advisory Council, Hearing Board, academic institutions, and non-governmental organizations were all encouraged to circulate these opportunities, and that another reminder will be sent to all of these groups, as the deadline for applications has been extended to April 13, 2018.

Secretary Sinks spoke of a company/product in Berkeley called Clarity, which has deployed dense air quality monitoring networks around the world to build smarter cities through smarter data.

Director Kaplan suggested that the District streamlines the application processes for the various incentives the District offers, to increase the ease for the applicants. She also reiterated her praise of the data provided by Google and Aclima that was captured in their pilot program in Oakland, which measured and analyzed pollution data collected by Google Street View cars, and suggested that other cities also get the opportunity for similar pilot projects.

OTHER BUSINESS

21. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO

Mr. Broadbent announced the following:

- Gratitude to Director Kaplan for her service to the Board.
- The Advisory Council will make routine reports directly to the Board in preparation for the Global Climate Action Summit in September.
- The District issued a press release regarding the US Environmental Protection Agency’s decision to roll back auto emissions standards. Possible legal action will be discussed in Closed Session at the April 18 Board meeting.
- Committee and Board meeting agendas now have links to presentations embedded in them, per the Board’s request.
- Video conferencing is now technically possible from Santa Rosa Junior College. Another location in the South Bay is also being considered.
- The hyper wall in the atrium of the first-floor lobby now displays NASA video footage of the pollutant mass moving over the earth.
- Former Engineering Manager, Pam Leong, is the new Director of Engineering, and Elizabeth Yura was hired as the Community Protection Officer (new position.)
- In honor of Women’s History Month, the District invited Betty Soskin, the oldest active National Park Ranger, to speak on March 21.

22. Chairperson’s Report

Chair Hudson announced the following:

- The first meeting of the Ad Hoc Refinery Oversight Committee, which will discuss all matters pertaining to refineries, will be held on April 9.
- The Ad Hoc Building Oversight Committee will reconvene in April (date to be determined.)
- He attended the 2018 Shared Mobility Summit from March 12-15 in Chicago, the American Public Transportation Association’s 2018 Legislative Conference from March 18-20 in Washington DC, the Redefining Mobility Summit on March 29 in San Ramon, and the District’s Workshop on New Funding and New Efforts to Curb Local Air Pollution (AB 617) on March 28 in San Leandro.
- The Board members attending the Air and Waste Management Association’s 2018 Annual Conference with him are Directors Wagenknecht, Sanchez, Canepa, Ross, and Gioia.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Miley was noted present at 11:12 a.m.

23. Time and Place of Next Meeting

Wednesday, April 18, 2018, at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105 at 9:30 am.

24. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:12 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
 Marcy Hiratzka
 Clerk of the Boards