

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
Computer History Museum, Hahn Auditorium
1401 N. Shoreline Boulevard, Mountain View, CA 94043
(415) 749-5073

Board of Directors Special Meeting / Retreat
Wednesday, January 18, 2017

APPROVED MINUTES

*Note: Audio recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the
Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/board-of-directors/resolutionsagendasminutes>*

CALL TO ORDER:

1. **Opening Comments:** Chairperson Liz Kniss welcomed everyone to the Computer History Museum and called the meeting to order 10:00 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Liz Kniss; Secretary Katie Rice; and Directors Teresa Barrett, David J. Canepa, Cindy Chavez, John Gioia, Carole Groom, Scott Haggerty, Tyrone Jue, Rebecca Kaplan, Doug Kim, Nate Miley, Karen Mitchoff, Jan Pepper, Mark Ross, Rod Sinks, and Jim Spering.

Absent: Vice Chair Dave Hudson; and Directors John Avalos, Pauline Russo Cutter, Eric Mar, Pete Sanchez, Brad Wagenknecht, and Shirlee Zane.

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Public comments were made by the following speakers:

Tom Lewis, East County NAACP; Fa Yu, Milpitas resident; Gary Latshaw, Cupertino resident; Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area; Janet Pygeorge, Rodeo Citizens Association; Nancy Reiser, Crockett-Rodeo United to Defend the Environment; Aihua Zhu, Milpitas resident; Betty Shih, Milpitas resident; Paula Wallis, Bay Area for Clean Environment; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; Andres Soto, Communities for a Better Environment (CBE); Roger Lin, CBE; Dr. Heather Kuiper; Laura Gracia, CBE; Ganesh Rama, Milpitas resident; and Robyn Chenm Milpitas resident.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Jue was noted present at 10:06 a.m.; Director Rice was noted present at 10:11 a.m.; and Director Ross was noted present at 10:14 a.m.

COMMENDATIONS / PROCLAMATIONS / AWARDS

3. **Recognition of Outgoing Board Member, Warren Slocum**

The Board of Directors recognized outgoing Board Member, Warren Slocum, who was replaced by new San Mateo County Supervisor, David Canepa.

CONSENT CALENDAR (ITEMS 4-8)

- 4. **Minutes of the Regular Board of Directors Meeting of December 7, 2016**
- 5. **Board Communications Received from December 7, 2016 through January 17, 2017**
- 6. **Air District Personnel on Out-of-State Business Travel**
- 7. **Notices of Violation Issued and Settlements in Excess of \$10,000 in the month of December 2016**
- 8. **Consider Amending Job Descriptions for the Engineer, Inspector, and Administrative Analyst Classification Series**

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

Director Chavez made a motion, seconded by Secretary Rice, to **approve** the Consent Calendar Items 4 through 8, inclusive; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

- AYES: Barrett, Canepa, Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Jue, Kaplan, Kim, Kniss, Miley, Mitchoff, Pepper, Rice, Ross, Sinks, and Sperring.
- NOES: None.
- ABSTAIN: None.
- ABSENT: Avalos, Cutter, Hudson, Mar, Sanchez, Wagenknecht, and Zane.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

9. **Report of the Legislative Committee Meeting of December 12, 2016**

Legislative Committee Vice Chair Mitchoff read the following Committee report:

The Legislative Committee met on Monday, December 12, 2016, and approved the minutes of March 30, 2015, October 26, 2015, March 21, 2016, and June 27, 2016. The Committee then discussed the review of the 2016 Legislative year. Finally, the Committee discussed the potential 2017 Legislative agenda. The consensus of the members' present was to recommend that the Board of Directors authorize staff to:

- 1. *Pursue and support legislation seeking to reform CalEnviroScreen as means of distribution of state revenues; and*
- 2. *Support legislative efforts relative to reformulating penalties for air quality violations.*

The next meeting of the Committee is at the Call of the Chair. This concludes the Chair's report of the Legislative Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

Director Mitchoff made a motion, seconded by Director Kaplan, to **approve** the recommendations of the Legislative Committee; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Barrett, Canepa, Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Jue, Kaplan, Kim, Kniss, Miley, Mitchoff, Pepper, Rice, Ross, Sinks, and Spring.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Avalos, Cutter, Hudson, Mar, Sanchez, Wagenknecht, and Zane.

10. Report of the Mobile Source Committee Meeting of December 15, 2016

Mobile Source Committee Chair Haggerty read the following Committee report:

The Committee met on Thursday, December 15, 2016 and approved the minutes of October 27, 2016. The Committee reviewed and discussed the staff presentation; Projects and Contracts with Proposed Grant Awards Over \$100,000. The Committee recommends the Board approve:

- 1. Carl Moyer Program projects with proposed grant awards over \$100,000 as shown in Attachment 1; and*
- 2. Authorization of the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer to enter into agreements with applicants for the recommended projects.*

The Committee then reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Fiscal Year Ending 2015 Transportation Fund for Clean Air Audit Report Results. The Committee finally reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Fiscal Year Ending 2016 Report On Transportation Fund for Clean Air Regional Fund Expenditures and Effectiveness. The next meeting of the Mobile Source Committee will be held on Thursday, January 26, 2017, at 9:30 a.m., at the Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105. I move that the Board approve the Mobile Source Committee recommendations. This concludes the Chair Report of the Mobile Source Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

Director Haggerty made a motion, seconded by Director Groom, to **approve** the recommendations of the Mobile Source Committee; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Barrett, Canepa, Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Jue, Kaplan, Kim, Kniss, Miley, Mitchoff, Pepper, Rice, Ross, Sinks, and Spering.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Avalos, Cutter, Hudson, Mar, Sanchez, Wagenknecht, and Zane.

11. Report of the Budget and Finance Committee Meeting of December 16, 2016

Budget and Finance Committee Vice Chair Rice read the following Committee report:

The Committee met on Wednesday, December 16, 2016. Lacking a quorum, a consensus of the Committee members present postponed the approval of the minutes of March 23, 2016 and April 27, 2016 until the January 18, 2017 Board meeting. The Committee reviewed and discussed the staff presentation Fourth Quarter Preliminary Financial Report - Fiscal Year Ending 2016. The Committee then reviewed and discussed the staff presentation First Quarter Financial Report - Fiscal Year Ending 2017. The Committee finally reviewed and discussed the staff presentation 375 Beale Street Acquisition Update. The next meeting of the Budget and Finance Committee will be held on Wednesday, January 25, 2017, at 9:30 a.m., at the Bay Area Air Quality Management District office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. I move that the Board approve the recommendation to approve the minutes of March 23, 2016 and April 27, 2016, which is supported by the consensus of Budget and Finance Committee members present on December 16, 2016. This concludes the Chair Report of the Budget and Finance Committee.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

Board Action:

Secretary Rice made a motion, seconded by Director Pepper, to **approve** the recommendations of the Budget and Finance Committee; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Barrett, Canepa, Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Jue, Kaplan, Kim, Kniss, Miley, Mitchoff, Pepper, Rice, Ross, Sinks, and Spering.
NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Avalos, Cutter, Hudson, Mar, Sanchez, Wagenknecht, and Zane.

BOARD OF DIRECTORS RETREAT

12. Opening Comments

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer / Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), gave an overview of the retreat presentation, explaining the topics that would be covered.

A. State of the Air District, Air Quality Summary, and the Proposed Regulatory Agenda for 2017

Mr. Broadbent presented the following slides: Air District background; state of the Air District; Bay Area air quality concerns; ozone exceedance trends - 1980 to present; Particulate Matter (PM) 2.5 exceedance trends - 2000 to present; toxic air contaminants; Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) maps; health benefits of cleaner air; Bay Area greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions trends - 1990-2050; and 2017 regulatory agenda.

Public Comments:

Public comments were made by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the importance of remembering that high-risk is still prevalent in the Bay Area, despite the general trend of declining pollutant levels over the last several decades; how current deficiencies in the CalEnviroScreen tool may be exacerbated by groundwater contamination requirements in the future, and possible alliances with other Air Districts who feel that disadvantaged communities within their jurisdictions are being unfairly overlooked; the differences between proposed Rule 12-16 (refinery emissions cap) and Rule 13-1 (refinery carbon intensity limits), which of the two is more viable and worth the District resources, and whether or not the Stationary Source Committee is the appropriate body to facilitate this discussion with the public; staff's prior commitments to rulemaking schedules and the public's response to the District's 2017 regulatory agenda; whether or not the District's Advisory Council will begin to formally consider how to reduce carbon emissions.

B. Air District Administrative Overview

Dr. Jeff McKay, Deputy APCO, presented the following slides: financial summary - recent history; financial summary - topics for Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2018 budget; staffing update; and purchase of 375 Beale Street.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Miley was noted present at 11:52 a.m.

Public Comments:

Public comments were made by Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the Board's dissatisfaction of the fact that electric vehicle charging stations have not yet been installed at 375 Beale Street, how the District's electric fleet is currently being charged, the status of the installation, what can be done to accelerate the installation; and how pending issues that have yet to be resolved may affect the District's impending purchase of additional space at 375 Beale Street.

The meeting was adjourned for lunch at 12:07.

The meeting commenced at 12:29.

C. Clean Air Plan and Climate Protection Strategy (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 12-D)

Mr. Broadbent introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning and Climate Protection, who presented the following slides: critical challenges; what is this plan?; climate challenge in the Bay Area; healthy air for all Bay Area residents; where do we want to be in 2050?; how does this plan get us there?; priority actions; input into this plan; Bay Area leadership; and next steps.

Public Comments:

Public comments were made by Janet Stromberg and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed new programs that will be needed to reach the State's 2030 goal; why the Bay Area's projections differ from the State's projections; the District's guidance document, *Planning Healthy Places*, which provides recommended best practices for reducing exposure and emissions from local sources of air pollutants; strategies to reduce the emissions of on-road heavy-duty trucks between now and 2023, when the California Air Resources Board will require that nearly all trucks and buses will need to have 2010 model year engines or equivalent; the information that is captured in the table in Appendix C, page 6, *Reductions in Annual Cases, "Then" to "Now" Including an Eighty Percent Confidence Interval*; the need for staff-recommended implementation strategies; how to involve other regional organizations; the feasibility of matching funds and an incentive structure for participating institutions; the importance of communicating the public health and economic co-benefits of the policies in this document, in order to dispute claims from the members of the business community, and that California is becoming uncompetitive; the difference between *production*-based and *consumption*-based GHG emissions inventory; whether or not analyzing 85 strategies to reduce multi-pollutants is realistic, or if the number needs to be reduced, and the need to know how much impact each strategy will have; the need for revisions to make this document more interactive for residents; how the District can get involved in the Sharing Economy; how this document may be used as a forum for developing municipal policies and community choice aggregation agencies; the need to increase the emphasis of carpooling and including electric vehicle charging stations at rental properties and affordable housing; the number of public and private electric vehicle charging stations that the District has helped finance; the Advisory Council's review of this document; and staff's projections on how the Trump administration could impact climate policy.

D. Technology Implementation Office (ITEM 12-C)

Mr. Broadbent introduced Damian Breen, Deputy APCO, who presented the following slides: the vision; the need; why implementation versus development; TIO mission statement and concepts; examples of implementation projects; and next steps.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed who advised the District on this new office and how to begin the recruitment process; whether or not the District's current structure is equipped to properly integrate this office, or if increased collaboration with the science and technology industries will be needed; the resource need and projected rate of return for the District; how the District can work with the Metropolitan Transportation Commission to reduce vehicle emission levels, given the success of the sharing economy; the need to prioritize methane reduction; and the valuable feedback that county and city planners can provide regarding the development of this office.

E. Update on Community Programs

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Executive Officer, introduced David Ralston and Luz Gomez, Public Engagement Managers, who presented the following slides: engagement within our diverse communities; advisory bodies and community listening session; community stakeholder meetings; resource teams; Pittsburg – Freedom Breathers; Marin/Napa – Strategic Incentives Division investments; James Cary Smith Community Grants Program; Oakland – Rose Foundation/Bay Localize/Emilia Zapata Street Academy; Richmond/Rich City Rides; regional engagement efforts; 2016 Youth for the Environment and Sustainability Conference; Cumulative Impact Forum; Climate Forward and Clean Air open houses; public participation plan – CARE to community air risk engagement; next steps on the road; community science partnerships – Bay Area Near Roadway Study; Kyoto USA – Bay Area school partnerships; vegetative buffer project – Brookfield School; and engaging for a difference: before and after.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the District's efforts to travel around the Bay Area's nine counties to listen to and engage with the public; the need for staff to work with Board members to better determine the most ideal locations to hold open houses; the need for staff and the Board members from Santa Clara County to reach out to the new Mayor and city staff of Milpitas regarding the District's efforts and programs; and the status of the public's ability to file complaints online.

F. Upcoming Committee Assignments and Goals

Chair Kniss reported that she and District staff finalized the Board Committee assignments and that Board members may request revisions.

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Board Comments:

None.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

13. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

No requests received.

14. Board Member Comments

Director Gioia announced that he was reappointed by the Contra Costa County Board of Supervisors to serve on the District's Board of Directors for another four-year term, ending in June 2021.

OTHER BUSINESS

15. Report of the Executive Officer / APCO

Mr. Broadbent's update on the ozone seasons of 2016 has been posted on the District's website.

16. Chairperson's Report

Chair Kniss welcomed Belmont Vice Mayor, Doug Kim, to the Board, announced that Suisun City Mayor, Pete Sanchez, has been appointed to the Board, and congratulated Director Canepa, Director Chavez, Director Gioia, Director Groom, Director Lee, Director Sinks, Director Spering, and Director Zane for their reappointments to the Board.

17. Time and Place of Next Meeting

Wednesday, February 1, 2017, at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:45 a.m., at 9:45 a.m.

18. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 2:18 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards