

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, California 94105  
(415) 749-5073

**APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Climate Protection Committee Meeting  
Thursday, September 15, 2016

**1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL**

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Vice Chairperson, John Avalos, called the meeting to order at 9:38 a.m.

Present: Vice-Chairperson John Avalos, and Directors Teresa Barrett, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, Katie Rice, and Rod Sinks.

Absent: Chairperson Jan Pepper, and Directors David J. Canepa and Mark Ross.

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS:**

No requests received.

**3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MARCH 17, 2016**

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

None.

Committee Action:

Director Sinks made a motion, seconded by Director Gioia, to approve the minutes of March 17, 2016; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Barrett, Gioia, Rice, and Sinks.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Canepa, Haggerty, Pepper, and Ross.

#### 4. CLIMATE LEGISLATION UPDATE

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Executive Officer, introduced Tom Addison, Senior Policy Advisor, who gave the staff presentation *Climate Legislation Update*, including the following list of climate-related bills:

SB 32 (Pavley)  
AB 197 (Garcia)  
SB 1383 (Lara)  
AB 1613 (Committee on Budget)  
SB 859 (Committee on Budget)  
AB 1550 (Gomez)  
AB 2292 (Gordon)  
SB 1441 (Leno)  
AB 2722 (Burke)

##### Public Comments:

Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding her optimism for AB 197's provisions to regulate emissions at the source, and also advocated for direct emission reductions, climate justice, and community co-benefits from the reductions.

Quanah Parker Brightman, United Native Americans, addressed the committee regarding his concern that air pollution is the number-one worldwide health risk, and advocated for: regulation and caps that would prevent tar sands and crude oil from being used in Bay Area refineries, banning methane emissions from fracking wells, banning coal exports in California, and supporting Native Americans who are being affected by the construction of the Dakota Access Pipeline.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 9:58 a.m.

##### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the Legislature's criticism of the California Air Resources Board (ARB) due to lack of transparency and the amount of time it takes to respond to the Legislature's questions, i.e.: the expenditure of Cap and Trade revenues; the fact that some Legislators would like the Legislature to have more authority over the ARB; AB 197's provisions to regulate emissions at the source (as specified in Section 38562.5), rather than through a market-based cap and trade mechanism; the debate of extending Cap and Trade past 2020; new statutory targets for 2030; and an article from *The Wall Street Journal* entitled "A Price on Carbon May Be Coming Soon to the U.S.".

##### Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

## **5. UPDATE ON CLIMATE FORWARD BAY AREA: A LEADERSHIP FORUM**

Ms. Roggenkamp introduced Lisa Fasano, Communications Officer, who gave the staff presentation *Climate Forward Bay Area: A Leadership Forum – Update*, including conference planning, date and location; speakers; agenda; registration; and sponsors.

### Public Comments:

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding the distinction between 350.org and 350 Bay Area, which are separate organizations. Mr. Holtzman thanked staff for making scholarship opportunities possible for this event, and spoke about the letter that 350 Bay Area sent to the District regarding its different idea of what climate leadership in the Bay Area means.

Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding her appreciation for staff's adjustment in direction for this conference, based upon 350 Bay Area's comments, as well as for the invitation to 350 Bay Area to speak at this conference. Ms. Stromberg acknowledged the invitations that were extended to various non-governmental groups and requested that staff also send one to the California Environmental Justice Alliance, Asian Pacific Environmental Network, and Communities for a Better Environment.

Quanah Parker Brightman, United Native Americans, requested that staff reach out to local Native American tribe leadership with invitations to this conference as well.

### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the conference's overall goal of expanding the discussion on the intersection between technology and policy and positioning the Bay Area to be a climate change leading agency in California; the opportunity to use this conference as a place in which climate change experts can discuss new 2030 goals and lessons learned; Board members' roles in break-out sessions; and how staff plans to involve non-governmental organizations who wish to participate.

### Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

## **6. CAP AND TRADE FUNDING UPDATE**

Damian Breen, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Karen Schkolnick, Acting Director of the Strategic Incentives Division, who gave the staff presentation *State Cap and Trade Funding Update*, including background; Fiscal Year 2016/2017 Cap and Trade Expenditure Plan: \$900 Million; recent awards to Bay Area; future opportunities for Air District in Fiscal Year Ending 2016/2017 (Damian presented this slide); and future for Cap and Trade funding.

### Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the extent to which credits may be reduced; the ARB's auction results and data measuring the efficiency of the cap; and the splitting of trucks and total funding between the Bay Area Air Quality Management District and the South Coast Air Quality Management District for the Zero-Emission Drayage Truck Demonstration project.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

**7. CLEAN AIR PLAN / REGIONAL CLIMATE PROTECTION STRATEGY UPDATE**

Ms. Roggenkamp introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning and Climate Protection, who gave the staff presentation *2016 Clean Air Plan/Regional Climate Protection Strategy Update*, including: Clean Air Plan/Regional Climate Protection Strategy; state and regional climate planning; recent work; Bay Area greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions; Bay Area GHG projection to 2050 with key state programs; Bay Area in 2050; tools and objectives; transportation; stationary sources; energy; buildings; waste and water; agriculture and natural and working lands; short-lived climate pollutants; progress underway; and next steps.

Public Comments:

Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area, thanked staff for agreeing to meet with representatives from 350 Bay Area after this meeting, requested that the Board adopt the goals of SB 32 and policies of AB 197, and also advocated for spending GHG funds cost-effectively on transportation incentives.

Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area, supported measuring the cost-effectiveness of District programs and said that GHG emissions could be greatly reduced by altering the community's diet to a plant-based one.

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding his support of the multi-sectoral strategy to reduce GHG emissions and serve as an example for other regions. Mr. Holtzman also proposed drafting a visual estimation of how emissions are to be reduced to meet the State's 2030 interim and 2050 long-term targets, to which the District's actual progress could be compared.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed how the largest sources of methane are generated from landfills; how landfills can now capture and recycling methane to produce biogas; the practice of removing organics from landfills; the need for a cost-benefit analysis of District demonstration projects and investments to show how the results relate to the District's short/mid/long-term goals; the fact that the strategies mentioned in this presentation are all intended to be proposed rules; how the District is unable to change policy without the State's approval; the difficulty of accurately determining cost-effectiveness of cost per ton of GHG reductions; and the importance of educating the public about how to reduce GHG emissions within the transportation sector, as it is the largest economic sector to produce GHG emissions.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

**8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

**9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Thursday, November 17, 2016, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

**10. ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting adjourned at 11:22 a.m.

*MS/ Marcy Hirtzka*  
Marcy Hirtzka  
Clerk of the Boards