

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Thursday, January 15, 2015

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:42 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson John Avalos; and Directors Teresa Barrett, Scott Haggerty, Jan Pepper and Mark Ross.

Absent: Directors John Gioia and Shirlee Zane.

Also Present: Board of Directors (Board) Chairperson Nate Miley.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS:

Margaret Pearce addressed the Committee regarding personal and public responsibilities to mitigate the impacts of air pollution; to encourage a quickening of the pace of climate action work; to highlight the importance of mitigating air pollution issues as much as possible in new construction; and of taking action to mitigate air pollution as much as possible in every way possible.

NOTED PRESENT: Board Chairperson Miley and Director Pepper were noted present at 9:46 a.m.

Larry Danos addressed the Committee regarding the need for more mitigating efforts particularly during the winter months.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 9:48 a.m.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 1, 2014

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action:

Director Ross made a motion, seconded by Director Haggerty, to approve the Minutes of December 1, 2014; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Barrett, Haggerty, Pepper and Ross.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Adams, Gioia, Kalra, and Zane.

4. UPDATE ON REGIONAL CLIMATE PROTECTION WORK PROGRAM, RULE DEVELOPMENT AND STAFFING

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Abby Young, Principal Environmental Planner of the Planning, Rules and Research Division, who gave the initial staff presentation *Climate Protection Program Update* through slide 12, *Rule Development*, including background; overviews of the Regional Climate Protection Strategy, technical program, local government assistance, and policy approaches.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 4, *Regional Climate Protection Strategy, Sector-based Gap Analysis*, whether any differentiation exists between goals and mandates.

Ms. Young continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 10, *Assist Local Governments*, the meaning of “Focus on fewer, but meaningful, indicators;” what commonalities may exist between local governments; and the Air District’s ability to help local governments with reconciling aspirational goals and implementation realities.

Ms. Young continued the presentation and then introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, who gave the final staff presentation *Climate Protection Program Update*, including overviews of rule development, staffing resources and next steps.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 12, *Rule Development*, the current level of backup generator use; the impact of permitted generators on future rule development; possible non-combustion alternative energy sources now and in the future; the applicability of the proposed rule to small backup generators commonly used in residences; non-District regulatory framework for smaller backup generators; internet server backup needs; and the evolution of infrastructure analysis relative to building construction and retrofits.

Mr. Hilken continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed, also at slide 12, *Rule Development*, what is expected from the California Air Resources Board (ARB) and when it is expected; clarification that the Air District is not waiting for ARB but working in consultation with an eye to complimenting their program; and Air District staff work to invite a member of ARB’s staff to present to the Board.

Mr. Hilken continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 13, *Staffing Resources*, the urgency of and demand on staff by the rule development schedule.

Mr. Hilken finished the presentation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the urgency of the need for rule development in the near term and the added and reassigned staff in response to that need.

Public Comments:

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, submitted written material entitled *350 Bay Area Talking Points for BAAQMD Climate Protection Committee January 15, 2015*, and addressed the Committee regarding the accelerating pace of climate change in the last ten years, as well as the enhanced media coverage and scientific analysis.

David Gassman, Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice, addressed the Committee regarding his being impressed with the staff presentation; to opine on the importance of the Air District making every effort to bring about a change; and to suggest that the Bay Area can do everything right environmentally and have little direct impact but that the example would have a significant impact as an example of good policy.

Steven Nadel, Sunflower Alliance, addressed the Committee regarding emerging studies that suggest it is too late to mitigate climate change because of the damage done and feedback loops that have resulted; to suggest the technology to enable change has been available and the discussion happening for twenty years but without the necessary political will; and to urge staff to expedite all efforts.

Kathy Dervin, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding her expertise relative to the climate; to express her appreciation for the challenges but to urge for immediate action based on what is already known and well established; and to urge for generally stronger and more immediate action.

Tom Griffith, Martinez Environmental Group, addressed the Committee regarding the difference between the gap analysis being discussed and the rule development called for in the Climate Action Work Plan; to suggest the Air District accept the responsibility to address GHGs this year; and to request a revision of permit regulations.

Quanah Brightman, United Native Americans, addressed the Committee regarding the existence of thirteen gasoline-producing refineries in California, five of which are in the Bay Area, and to request that steps be taken to address their methane emissions.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

5. UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA (UC) BERKELEY CARBON DIOXIDE AND AIR QUALITY MONITORING STUDY

Ms. Roggenkamp introduced Professor Ronald C. Cohen, Professor of Chemistry, Professor of Earth and Planetary Science, UC Berkeley, who gave the presentation *Observing CO₂ [Carbon Dioxide] in the Bay Area: Documenting Emissions Changes as They Happen*, including climate, emissions, CO₂ plans, mapping of CO₂ emissions in the Bay Area, an exploration of the number of measurements needed to verify CO₂ emissions from a source or area, an overview of the Berkeley Atmospheric CO₂ Observing Network and the instruments being utilized, and initial air quality measurements data.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the extent and form of the relationship between Berkeley Atmospheric CO₂ Observation Network (BEACON) and the Air District; future monitoring needs and how to show that various mitigation strategies are effective; the enhanced efficacy of a robust monitoring system over voluntary reporting; the meaning and origin of slide 4, *Climate: CO₂ Plans*, item “D. Support Trip Reduction Through Employer-Based Programs; BEACON’s role as one of providing necessary information for policy-makers to make informed decisions; related work in Sacramento and Fresno; the committee and BEACON’s mutual desire to see program expansion eastward along Interstate 580 to Interstate 5, the approximate cost and scale of said expansion, and the viability of an Air District grant in support of the same; whether this discussion will be shared with the Joint Policy Committee (JPC); the absence of Santa Clara County from the map on slide 5, *CO₂ Emissions [tC/yr]*, but not the modeling; the need for an expansion to particular areas of concern in Santa Clara County along with the approximate cost, challenges and the viability of including other emission types, such as methane; further details from slide 18, *BEACO₂N CO₂ 2013*, regarding background levels, large-scale contributions and similarities to measurements in other parts of the world; emissions level differences between weekdays and weekends.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

6. Committee Members’ Comments/Other Business: None.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Thursday, March 19, 2015, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

8. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 11:24 a.m.

151 Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards