

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 749-5073

Videoconference Location:
Santa Rosa Junior College
Doyle Library Room 4243
1501 Mendocino Avenue
Santa Rosa, CA 95401

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Wednesday, October 23, 2013

1. Call to Order – Roll Call

Committee Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson John Avalos; Vice-Chairperson David Hudson; and Directors Susan Adams, Teresa Barrett, John Gioia, Jan Pepper, Mark Ross and Shirlee Zane (via videoconference).

Absent: Director Scott Haggerty.

Also Present: Board of Directors Chairperson Ash Kalra.

2. Public Comment Period: None.

3. Approval of Minutes of July 18, 2013

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Adams, to approve the Minutes of July 18, 2013. The motion carried unanimously.

4. Assembly Bill (AB) 32 Scoping Plan Update

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Abby Young, Principal Environmental Planner, who gave the staff presentation AB 32 Scoping Plan 2013 Update,

including reduction achievements, emissions trend, 2050 goal and estimated emissions trajectories, Air Resources Board achievements, scoping plan update, outreach efforts and workshop outcomes, state and regional collaboration and the plan update schedule.

Chairperson Avalos asked, regarding slide 3, Original Scoping Plan Meeting 2020 Goal, for an explanation of the Pavley Standards, which information was provided by Ms. Young.

Ms. Young concluded the presentation.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Pepper was noted present at 9:43 a.m.

Committee Comments:

Director Gioia said, regarding slide 6, Feedback, that others are discussing the use of cap-and-trade auction proceeds to achieve a number of co-benefits.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Ross was noted present at 9:48 a.m.

Director Adams asked how the achievement of planned goals is being tracked, how transparent that process is for the public and that a graphic representation of the same be presented to the Committee, inquired about the state of related incentive funding that takes into consideration possible co-benefits so as to maximize return and finally asked staff about the development of templates and models for use by local governments, perhaps combined with some form of friendly competition to incentivize their utilization.

Director Zane encouraged the Air District to address greenhouse gases (GHG) in the areas of waste and water, despite being outside its purview.

Director Hudson urged the creation of regional report cards, perhaps by the California Air Resources Board (CARB), that detail progress toward state goals, said the Pavley Standards are multi-faceted but the local governments do not get to utilize any of the resources except land use, and said he attended the Public Workshop on the AB32 Scoping Plan Update on July 30, 2013, and walked out after an unknown presenter was speaking offline in an inappropriate way about unrelated matters.

Director Ross said increased water efficiency is important because of how much electricity is used in California for pumping and the Air District needs to support casual carpooling and telecommuting, perhaps with cap-and-trade auction proceeds.

Director Gioia suggested the Air District advocate for the use of cap-and-trade auction proceeds, in a way it deems appropriate, in order to better inform the final decision of the Governor's administration and the Legislature.

Director Pepper echoed those comments that call for the development of metrics that will enable measurement of progress and, in turn, a plan going forward.

Director Hudson said the scoping plan adoption schedule makes this an urgent item.

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, acknowledged the Committee's desire to know how the State intends to meet the 2020 goals.

Committee Chairperson Avalos asked for more information about the 2020 goals, which question was answered by Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, and Mr. Broadbent.

Director Adams asked for more information on past successes, future needs and ripe opportunities. Mr. Broadbent said staff will prepare and deliver a staff report with a focus on the Bay Area.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

5. Regional Climate Protection Strategy Resolution

Committee Chairperson Avalos made introductory comments regarding the importance of collaboration in the past and future, distributed, "Proposed Amendments to Climate Strategy Resolution and 10-Point Climate Action Work Program from Director Avalos," dated 10/23/2013, and urged the Committee to support the proposed resolution, as amended.

NOTED PRESENT: Board Chairperson Kalra was noted present at 10:01 a.m.

Mr. Broadbent made introductory comments regarding staff efforts to date and plans for the future.

Director Adams and Committee Chairperson Avalos discussed the semantics of "goal" versus "objective."

Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, gave the staff presentation Regional Climate Protection Strategy Resolution and recommends that the Board of Directors adopt the climate protection resolution attached to the staff report and provide direction to staff on the draft work program.

Committee Comments:

Committee Chairperson Avalos asked about the rulemaking ideas under consideration and the staffing levels that will be required to undertake the enhanced program that is proposed, which questions were answered by Messrs. Hilken and Broadbent.

Director Gioia suggested that this strategy reference and be tied to the development of Plan Bay Area and the Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS), a process the Air District will have an official role in during its next phase. Committee Chairperson Avalos suggested the reference be

inserted in the work program #4. Director Gioia, Mr. Broadbent and Ms. Roggenkamp discussed the viability of the suggestion to interconnect these efforts.

Director Zane suggested early stakeholder involvement in the development of the work program and said portions of the resolution should have stronger language, including replacing “make progress” with “achieve” on page 2, last paragraph, more fleshed out language regarding the health impacts, and the naming of Bay Area counties who have adopted ambitious climate action plans, which work program suggestion was addressed by Messrs. Hilken and Broadbent.

Board Chairperson Kalra commended the inclusion of a work program and expressed his support for the proposed resolution, as amended.

Director Adams commended the inclusion of a work program, expressed her support for the proposed amendments, proposed an amendment to the resolution that adopts the GHG reduction goals with performance objectives, proposed an amendment to the work program to include performance objectives, and urged for expanding the scope of Air District intended partners beyond the 110 cities and counties to include the special districts working within the Bay Area.

Director Pepper expressed her support for the proposed amendments and asked if a provision should be included regarding the climate action plan updating process, which question was answered by Ms. Roggenkamp. Director Pepper asked if an amendment should be made to explicitly set forth the monitoring and rule development process and suggested it would be helpful to local governments interested in adopting green building code but lacking the expertise if the Air District could provide documentary guidance while also working with the California Energy Commission for corresponding change at that level.

Director Gioia proposed a conceptual amendment to include environmental social equity and stressed the need to develop a sense of co-benefits.

Director Ross echoed Director Gioia’s comment regarding co-benefits, emphasized the importance of various forms, including economic, public health and mental health, and asked if the work program will be adopted as a separate resolution.

Director Gioia said the work program will be referenced in the climate protection strategy resolution and, therefore, can be more easily changed over time as the need arises.

Public Comments:

Taylor Hawke, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee in support of the proposed resolution.

Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee in support of the proposed resolution and amendments.

Rand Wrobel, Sierra Club, addressed the Committee in support of a more strongly worded resolution.

Nile Malloy, Communities for a Better Environment, addressed the Committee in support of the proposed resolution.

Jed Holtzman, 350 San Francisco, addressed the Committee in support of a resolution with the strongest possible language.

Bill Pinkham, 350 Bay Area and East Bay Bicycle Coalition, thanked the Committee for the adoption of the resolution opposing the Keystone XL pipeline and warned of a rail transport backup plan by oil companies.

Robert Gould, M.D., Physicians for Social Responsibility, addressed the Committee in support of a resolution with the strongest possible language and to suggest further amendments to work program #4 and 8.

Committee Comments (continued):

Committee Chairperson Avalos expressed his support for the proposed amendments by Directors Adams and Gioia and directed staff to include the same for consideration by the Board of Directors after it is approved by the ad hoc committee comprised of himself and Directors Adams, Gioia and Hudson.

Director Hudson expressed his concern about participants meeting the goals of the SCS and AB32 Scoping Plan, asked Director Gioia to work with CARB to remove exceptions regarding emissions from outside the state and airports, requested a report card for the Bay Area that helps better define regional responsibility to meet state goals so as to better balance priorities, and noted the importance of the reforestation protocol despite its not being mentioned.

Director Gioia said the model should be expanded to the national and international levels and that should be noted in the resolution.

Director Pepper said the Air District's primary authority should be mentioned in the resolution.

Committee Action:

Director Adams made a motion, seconded by Director Hudson, to recommend the Board of Directors:

1. Adopt the climate protection resolution attached to the staff report with amendments as stated and approved by the ad hoc committee; and
2. Provide direction to staff on the draft work program.

The motion carried unanimously.

6. Committee Members' Comments: None.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Thursday, November 21, 2013, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

8. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 11:27 a.m.

151 Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards