

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 749-5073

Videoconference Location:
Santa Rosa Junior College
Doyle Library Room 4243
1501 Mendocino Avenue
Santa Rosa, CA 95401

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Thursday, May 9, 2013

1. Call to Order – Roll Call

Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m.

Present: Chairperson John Avalos; and Directors Teresa Barrett, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, Mark Ross and Shirlee Zane (from videoconference location).

Absent: Vice-Chairperson David Hudson and Director Susan Adams.

Also Present: None.

2. Public Comment Period:

Steve Birdlebough, Sonoma County Transportation & Land Use Coalition, addressed the Committee regarding the need for more robust land use planning in the Plan Bay Area, particularly in regard to greenhouse gases.

Ellen Osuna, 350 Bay Area / Occupy SF Environmental Justice Working Group, addressed the Committee to note the recent study by Mark Jacobson which provides a blueprint for the State of New York to switch to 100% renewable fuel sources and said additional studies for the other 49 states are in the works.

Beverly Pfizer, Transition SF, addressed the Committee in support of the Air District adopting the proposed resolution to be delivered at today's meeting by representatives of 350 Bay Area.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 10:13 a.m.

Taylor Hawke, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding his concern about climate change and to deliver a proposed resolution entitled, *A Proposed Resolution Establishing a Commitment and Path to Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions Levels to 80% Below 1990 levels by 2050* (350 Resolution).

Aaron Reaven, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee by reading a portion of the 350 Resolution.

Floyd Earl Smith, 350 Bay Area CAP / Transition Town San Francisco, addressed the Committee by reading a subsequent portion of the 350 Resolution.

Kathy Kemp, 350 Bay Area CAP / 350.org, addressed the Committee by reading a subsequent portion of the 350 Resolution.

Patrick Kennedy, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee by reading the final portion of the 350 Resolution.

Laura Galligan, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to express the support of the Air District's climate efforts by her organization and its readiness to assist as needed.

Jed Holtzman, 350 SF, addressed the Committee regarding the need to quickly address the climate crisis with a strong action plan and to express his opposition to the Keystone XL pipeline.

Kirsten Schwind, Bay Localize, addressed the Committee in support of the Air District adopting the 350 Resolution.

Corrine Van Hook, Bay Localize, addressed the Committee to echo the comments of Ms. Schwind and to encourage consideration of the human cost of inaction.

3. Approval of Minutes of March 14, 2013

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: Director Gioia made a motion to approve the Minutes of March 14, 2013; Director Haggerty seconded; and the motion carried unanimously with Director Barrett abstaining.

4. Climate Change Science Overview

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced the topic and Brian Bateman, Health and Science Officer, who gave the staff presentation Climate Change Science Overview, including indicators of and milestones in the science of climate change, summary of global energy balance and the Greenhouse Effect, a look at the role of water vapor and clouds in the Greenhouse Effect, overviews of greenhouse gases and trends in their atmospheric levels, a look at radiative climate forcings and climate feedbacks, projections of future global warming and potential and a snapshot of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions by country and California.

Director Ross asked, regarding slide #17, GHG, about the ultimate fate of heat absorbed by black carbon (BC), which questions were answered by Mr. Bateman.

Mr. Bateman concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

Director Ross asked about the feasibility of altering emissions chemically rather than quantitatively to alter climate trends and about the regulation of water vapor emissions from facilities currently regulated by the Air District, which questions were answered by Mr. Bateman.

Director Zane requested detailed information regarding the source types contributing to climate change, such as automobiles, that can be passed along to constituents to aid in lifestyle choices.

Public Comments:

Mr. Smith addressed the Committee regarding the accelerated rate of the global temperature increase and emissions contributions.

Warren Linney, World Stewardship Institute – Stanford, addressed the Committee regarding efforts underway to develop methods to draw GHGs out of the atmosphere and similar responses to existing pollutants. Mr. Bateman and Ms. Roggenkamp responded in turn.

Mr. Reaven addressed the Committee regarding slide #17, GHGs, and the more significant impact of methane if measured differently.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

5. Overview of Air District Climate Protection Program

Ms. Roggenkamp introduced the topic and Abby Young, Principal Environmental Planner of Planning Rules & Research, gave the staff presentation Overview of District Climate Protection Program 2005 – 2013, including climate program approach, history of regional summits, grants and incentives, community outreach efforts, stationary sources, assistance to local governments, local and regional planning activities, and regional and state-wide collaboration opportunities.

Director Avalos asked, regarding slide #7, Stationary Sources, about the percentage of cost recovery on the GHG fee and how a proposal to increase the fee would have to be handled in light of Proposition 26 requirements, which questions were answered by Ms. Roggenkamp.

Ms. Young concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

6. Next Steps for Air District Climate Protection Program

Ms. Roggenkamp gave the staff presentation Next Steps for Air District Climate Protection Program, namely the 2014 Clean Air Plan (Plan), including the Plan as a vehicle for climate protection, the change in landscape since 2010, options for inclusion in the 2014 Plan, possible measures in a multi-pollutant control strategy and what they require, and considerations going into the process for developing the 2014 Plan.

Chairperson Avalos asked, regarding slide #6, Moving Forward: The 2014 Plan, about the lack of an explicit GHG goal in the current Plan and suggested its inclusion to be essential, which questions were answered by Ms. Roggenkamp and Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules & Research.

Director Gioia said the goals should tie into the work being done by various regional agencies through the Sustainable Communities Strategy. Director Ross echoed Director Gioia and the Committee and staff discussed the same.

Ms. Roggenkamp concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

Chairperson Avalos asked about the state of long-term funding for the programs, which questions were answered by Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer.

Chairperson Avalos urged staff to review the 350 Resolution and to engage interested members of the public when developing the next Plan.

Public Comments:

Ms. Schwind addressed the Committee regarding the importance of setting non-arbitrary goals.

Mr. Birdleough addressed the Committee regarding the need to set better than average goals and urged the Air District to set more aspirational goals than those set by the State.

The Committee and staff discussed the timeline for development of the Plan.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

7. Discussion on Proposed Keystone Pipeline

Chairperson Avalos deferred the staff presentation, Discussion on Proposed Keystone XL Pipeline, for lack of time, made introductory comments and asked for public comment.

Public Comments:

Loring Dales, M.D., addressed the Committee regarding the importance of taking action in the face of climate change.

Gary Latshaw, Sierra Club, addressed the Committee in support of the Air District taking action in opposition to the Proposed Keystone Pipeline.

Stephanie Flaniken addressed the Committee in support of the Air District taking action in opposition to the Proposed Keystone Pipeline.

Mr. Smith addressed the Committee in support of the Air District taking action in opposition to the Proposed Keystone Pipeline, to encourage any and all action that may positively affect climate change and to request the webcasting of future Committee meetings.

Committee Comments:

Chairperson Avalos thanked the public and staff, expressed optimism about Air District efforts moving forward and said the resolution prepared by staff will be agendaized for further discussion by the Committee.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

8. **Committee Member Comments/Other Business:** None.
9. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** At the call of the Chairperson.
10. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 12:24 p.m.

15/ Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards