

RICHMOND - NORTH
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

**Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP)
Community Steering Committee Meeting #37**

October 28, 2024

Welcome

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead

RICHMOND - NORTH
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**
CLEAN AIR

Agenda

TIME	TOPIC
5:30 PM	Welcome, Meeting Logistics, Agenda
5:35 PM	Approval of Meeting Minutes from September 23, 2024 (Action Item)
5:45 PM	CSC Leads Ongoing Updates
5:50 PM	Charter Amendments Regarding Attendance Policy, and Standing Committees and Ad Hoc (Action Item)
6:20 PM	Charter: Standing Committee and Ad Hoc Structure Overview
6:30 PM	Recruitment Ad Hoc Plan of Action Proposal and Breakout Activity (Action Item)
6:40 PM	Break
6:50 PM	Year One Implementation Plan Overview (Action Item)
7:15 PM	Community Gathering Survey Results, PTCA CSC December Meeting, and Next Steps
7:25 PM	Public Comment on Non-Agenda Item Matters and Meeting Close-Out

Tips for Participants for a Successful Hybrid Meeting

- **Raise your hand** to speak, physically or virtually.
- **Say your name before speaking** so that virtual participants know who is speaking.
- **Speak one at a time** – overlapping conversations are difficult for online participants to hear.
- **Mute microphone** unless speaking to minimize background noise.
- **Avoid side conversations** or other background noise.
- **Share video** if you are joining virtually so we can stay visually connected.
- **Technology happens** – please be flexible and patient.
- **Use the zoom chat or raised hand function** if unable to hear participants.

Path To Clean Air Meeting Agreements

Member expectations:

- **One mic, one voice:** If in person, raise your hand to speak. If on Zoom, use Raised Hand function under Reactions at the bottom of your screen.
- Be respectful and open to other points of view.
- Review all materials prior to the meeting.
- Take care of yourself (Stretch, drink water and breathe).
- ‘Popcorning’ or passing the mic method will be used to encourage participation amongst quieter CSC members.





Meeting procedures:

- Begin each meeting by taking roll call to establish a quorum.
- Ask for public comment before taking any action.
- Any member can make a motion which then has to be seconded by another member.
- Facilitating Lead adjourns.

Meeting Goals

Goal 1	Approve the September 23, 2024 Meeting Minutes.
Goal 2	CSC Members will receive a presentation overview on the Standing Committee and Ad Hoc structure per the Charter.
Goal 3	CSC Members will receive a presentation and convene in a breakout activity on the Recruitment Ad Hoc Plan of Action Proposal followed by a vote.
Goal 4	CSC Members will receive a presentation on the proposed changes to the Charter's Attendance Policy, and Standing Committees and Ad Hoc followed by a vote.
Goal 5	CSC Members will receive a presentation and partake in a Q&A session on the Year One Implementation Plan Overview followed by a vote.

Where are We Today?

		2024									
Phase	Work Product	Mar	April	May	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec
 SCOPE AND ORGANIZE PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY	Steering Committee (CSC)										
	Leadership Committee										
	Subcommittees (Ad Hoc or Standing)										
 COMMUNITY OUTREACH	Community Education										
	Community Outreach										
	Community Engagement										
 PLAN REVIEW & ADOPT	Plan Adoption - CSC	☑									
	Plan Adoption - BAAQMD			☑							
	Plan Adoption - CARB						?				
	Translate Final Plan					☑					
 IMPLEMENT SHARED COMMITMENT TO ACTION	Pre-Implementation										
	Implementation Plan										
	Implementation Activities								☑		
	Annual Progress Report										

☑ Major Milestone

Approval of September 23, 2024 Meeting Minutes

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Public Comment

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



CSC Leads Ongoing Updates

Marisol Cantú, CSC Lead



Ongoing Updates from Leads

- **Progressive Stack**
 - Recommend implementing Progressive Stack to make sure our discussions are fair and inclusive.
- **CSC Leads 1:1s with CSC Members**
 - Leads have scheduled 1:1 check-ins with CSC members.
 - Opportunity to ask questions, receive support, build partnership.
- **Thank you Lucia Castello**



July 2024 CSC Social Gathering

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Public Comment

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Charter Amendments Regarding Attendance Policy, and Standing Committees and Ad Hoc (Action Item)

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Current Charter Language on Attendance

4.4.2 CSC Membership Engagement

g. A Lead will meet with a CSC member who misses more than 3 monthly steering committee meetings within a 12-month period to assess their capacity to serve as a CSC member.

6.3. Play an active role by:

c. Participating in a minimum of 9 out of the 12 CSC monthly meetings (in their entirety) for the year. Participation includes submitting agenda items to the Leadership Committee, giving updates on strategies and actions, being a thought partner, and asking clarifying questions.

Proposed CSC Attendance Policy Changes to the Charter

4.4.2 CSC Membership Engagement

g. A Lead will meet with a CSC member who misses more than 2 monthly steering committee meetings within a 12-month period to assess their capacity to serve as a CSC member.

6.3. Play an active role by:

c. Participate in monthly CSC meetings (in their entirety) with less than 3 excused absences within a 12-month period. Participation includes submitting agenda items to the Leadership Committee, giving updates on strategies and actions, being a thought partner, and asking clarifying questions.

Proposed CSC Attendance Policy Changes to Charter

14. Attendance Policy

Excused Absence: An absence is considered excused if a CSC member notifies all three (3) Leads that they cannot attend the monthly CSC meeting and the reason for the absence (e.g., personal or family emergency, planned vacation, work conflict etc.). Notice must be given before 4:30 PM on the day of scheduled CSC monthly meeting, barring any extenuating circumstances. Notification can be sent via email or text messaging.

Proposed CSC Attendance Policy Changes to Charter (Cont.)

14. Attendance Policy

Unexcused Absence: An absence is considered unexcused if a CSC member does not notify all 3 Leads that they cannot attend the monthly CSC meeting before 4:30 PM on day of CSC monthly meeting and/or the Leads determine the reason does not qualify as an excused absence.

Proposed CSC Attendance Policy Changes to Charter (Cont.)

14. Attendance Policy

Attendance Tracking: Leads will notify Air District staff of the CSC member's absence and whether that absence is excused or unexcused within one week of the missed meeting. District staff will create an attendance tracker and share it with CSC members. The tracker will capture both excused and unexcused absences of CSC members.

*Please note that a CSC member will not be paid a stipend for a missed monthly CSC meeting, whether excused or unexcused.

Definition of Standing Committee and Ad Hoc

- There is no definition for subcommittee in the Charter and subcommittee and committee are used synonymously and inconsistently. To bring about clarity we suggest using “standing committee” in sections references on the next slide.
- Standing committees are permanent, meaning they do not have an end date. A standing committee would be formed for matters requiring an extended scope and duration.
- An ad hoc would be created to handle one-time special projects and end once the project is completed.
- Definitions of standing committee and ad hoc will be in section 7.4 of the Charter

References to Subcommittee and Committee in the Charter

- Replace subcommittee and committee with “standing committee” in sections 4.4, 4.4.1(c), 4.4.2(e), 5.2, 5.4, 6.2(a)(b), 6.3(f), 7.4, and 9.
- We will not be changing committee when it refers to Leadership Committee, Board Committees and City/County Committees or the Steering Committee.

Request for Action

Recommend the CSC amend the Charter as follows:

- Add the new attendance policy in section 14 and revisions to sections 4.4.2(g), 6.3(c),
- Define standing committee and ad hoc in section 7.4, and
- Replace subcommittee and committee with “standing committee” in sections 4.4, 4.4.1(c), 4.4.2(e), 5.2, 5.4, 6.2(a)(b), 6.3(f), 7.4, and 9

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Public Comment

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Vote to Adopt Charter Amendments

Action Item

The CSC will vote to approve (i.e., yes, no or may abstain) the following amendments to the Charter:

- Add the new attendance policy in section 14 and revisions to sections 4.4.2(g), 6.3(c),
- Define standing committee and ad hoc in section 7.4, and
- Replace subcommittee and committee with “standing committee” in sections 4.4, 4.4.1(c), 4.4.2(e), 5.2, 5.4, 6.2(a)(b), 6.3(f), 7.4, and 9.

Charter: Standing Committee and Ad Hoc Structure Overview

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Lead



Charter Language From Section 6: Participation Principles

6. Participation Principles

“Active participation by CSC members is crucial to the success of the CERP.”

6.3. *Play an active role by:*

“
...

f. Participating in at least one standing committee or ad hoc per year.

Subcommittees, ad-hoc, or other potential working groups may arise throughout implementation, so joining more than one is encouraged.”

Charter Language From Section 5. CSC Membership Roles and Responsibilities

5.2 Standing Committee and Ad Hoc Facilitators: “CSC members who volunteer as standing committee, ad hoc, or potential working group facilitators will be responsible for assisting Air District and the Leads in implementing the Richmond-North Richmond-San Pablo CERP....”

“They will present a plan of action to the Leads that identifies the purpose, goals, and key strategies of their standing committee or ad hoc. This plan will then be discussed and voted on by the CSC.”

“Specific duties include co-developing standing committee or ad hoc agendas, facilitating meetings, making regular progress reports to leads, recruiting members and creating pathways for them to move the work of the CSC. Facilitators are expected to commit to 4-6 hours of service per month.”

Standing Committee and Ad Hoc Recommendations

Recommendation from CSC Leads:

- Each standing committee or ad hoc will be staffed with 2 facilitators
- Submittal of a **proposed plan of action** to the Leads is the first step to creating a standing committee or ad hoc
- Proposed plan of action should be no more than 2 pages
- Proposed plan of action includes:
 - Purpose
 - Goals
 - Key strategies of the committee
 - Timeline for the standing committee or ad hoc,
 - Potential facilitators and interested CSC members
 - Meeting frequency
 - Other details (e.g., technical and staff assistance)
- Proposed plans of action will be considered in order received

Standing Committee and Ad Hoc Roles and Responsibilities

Facilitators Role and Responsibilities:

- 4-6 Hours of Service per Month
- Collaborate with CSC Leads and Air District Staff:
 - Implement “Plan of Action”
 - Co-develop agendas
 - Facilitate standing committee or ad hoc meetings
 - Provide regular progress reports to CSC Leads
 - Recruit members for the standing committee or ad hoc
 - Create a pathway for CSC to join the standing committee or ad hoc

CSC Standing Committee or Ad Hoc Facilitator Interest

1. Is anyone interested in becoming a standing committee or ad hoc facilitator? If so, a CSC Lead will schedule a follow up conversation.

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Lead



Public Comment

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Lead



Recruitment Ad Hoc Plan of Action Proposal and Breakout Activity (Action Item)

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Lead



Recruitment Ad Hoc Plan of Action Proposal

Review Proposed Plan of Action

- [CSC Recruitment Plan of Action Proposal](#)

Breakout Group Activity (15 minutes)

Goal for Breakout Activity

- Define who the Recruitment Ad Hoc should reach out to and prioritize target groups
- Reflect on what outreach strategies have been used in the past and assess their effectiveness

Instructions

- Split into 2 groups: 1 in person and 1 virtual
- Brainstorm and answer questions about the ad hoc and recruitment plan
 - Who should we reach out to?
 - What outreach strategies have worked?
 - What should we try for outreach?
 - How would you like to participate in outreach?
- Report Out Discussion

Report Out

- **5 Minute Large Group Report Out**

Request for Action

Recommend the CSC approve the Recruitment Ad Hoc Plan of Action Proposal and create the Recruitment Ad Hoc.

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Public Comment

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Vote

Action Item

The CSC will vote to approve (i.e., yes, no or may abstain) the Recruitment Ad Hoc Plan of Action Proposal and to create the Recruitment Ad Hoc with the following members: Nancy Aguirre, Dr. Niyi Omotoso, Y'Anad Burrell, Suzanne Coffee, and Jessica Range.

Break (10 minutes)

RICHMOND - NORTH
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

Year One Implementation Plan Overview (Action Item)

Laura Cackette, BAAQMD



Recap of August and September CSC Monthly Meetings

August:

- CSC selected 10 “In Progress Actions” as priorities for engagement

September:

- CSC selected the top “CSC Lead Initiator/Implementer” action(s) and the top “Not Yet Started” action

Year One Implementation Plan Overview

PTCA Year One Implementation Plan (Year 1 IP) is designed to

- Provide a roadmap for the Air District and CSC
- Help action implementers get on the same page about priorities, expectations, and next steps
- Support group cohesion

It does this by

- Identifying and prioritizing actions for Oct 2024 - Sept 2025
- Describing the CSC and CSC standing committees and ad hoc
- Outlining communications mechanisms, including reporting

Year 1 Actions

55

**Implementation
Status**

In Progress (33)
Ongoing (6)
Not Yet Started (16)

**Lead
Implementer**

Air District
CSC
CARB

**CSC Priority
for
Engagement**

12 actions

Year 1 Actions Prioritized by the CSC for Engagement



Guiding Framework for Engagement:

IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation



IAP2's Spectrum of Public Participation was designed to assist with the selection of the level of participation that defines the public's role in any public participation process. The Spectrum is used internationally, and it is found in public participation plans around the world.

INCREASING IMPACT ON THE DECISION

	INFORM	CONSULT	INVOLVE	COLLABORATE	EMPOWER
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION GOAL	To provide the public with balanced and objective information to assist them in understanding the problem, alternatives, opportunities and/or solutions.	To obtain public feedback on analysis, alternatives and/or decisions.	To work directly with the public throughout the process to ensure that public concerns and aspirations are consistently understood and considered.	To partner with the public in each aspect of the decision including the development of alternatives and the identification of the preferred solution.	To place final decision making in the hands of the public.
PROMISE TO THE PUBLIC	We will keep you informed.	We will keep you informed, listen to and acknowledge concerns and aspirations, and provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision.	We will work with you to ensure that your concerns and aspirations are directly reflected in the alternatives developed and provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision.	We will look to you for advice and innovation in formulating solutions and incorporate your advice and recommendations into the decisions to the maximum extent possible.	We will implement what you decide.

© IAP2 International Federation 2018. All rights reserved. 20181112_v1

Collaborate



Top “CSC Lead Implementer / Initiator” Action(s)

COLLABORATE

The CSC Selected:

2 Actions from *Fuel Refining Strategy 1: Move Towards a Just Transition*

<p><u>FR 1.1</u></p>	<p>Educate the CSC and Air District on how Just Transition would apply to the Zero Emission Future and a managed phase-down of fossil fuels in the PTCA area. The CSC will establish a Just Transition Subcommittee [standing committee] (JTS) as part of PTCA Implementation by Q2 2024.</p>
<p><u>FR 1.2</u></p>	<p>Incorporate Just Transition Principles and Criteria in the prioritization and implementation of the PTCA Plan and explore incorporating these in governmental policy making and rulemaking.</p>



Top “Not Yet Started” Action - Committed to Start in Year 1

COLLABORATE

The CSC Selected:

1 Action from *Fuel Refining Strategy 3: Hold Polluters Accountable*

FR 3.9

First, Air District will partner with the CSC to develop, within 1 year of PTCA Plan adoption, a Community Benefits Policy (CBP) that invests up to 100% of penalty monies from the fuel refining sector back into the PTCA area. Then, Air District will partner with the CSC to expand the Fuel Refining Community Benefits Policy (CBP) to cover the full PTCA area.

Inform, Consult, or Involve

still to be determined

Not Yet Started Actions - Committed to Start in Year 1

From September CSC Meeting

<p>FR 2.6</p>	<p>Air District will initiate a rule development effort, further evaluating potential updates to flaring rules (Rule 12-11: Flare Monitoring at Refineries and Rule 12-12: Flares at Refineries), by the end of 2024.</p>
<p>FR 3.8</p>	<p>Air District will collaboratively develop, with the CSC, and pilot legal enforcement approaches for fuel refining facilities within one year of final approval of the PTCA Plan. Then this will be expanded to cover all PTCA sources.</p>
<p>M&R 4.1</p>	<p>Regulate Emissions Reductions via proposal and adoption of Amendments to CARB’s Mobile Cargo Handling Equipment Regulation, by 2025</p>

In Progress Actions

**INFORM
CONSULT
INVOLVE**

Top 10 “In Progress” Actions CSC chose to prioritize engagement on for Year 1

From August CSC Meeting

C&I 1.1	Dust White Paper (Identify Best Management Practices, evaluate Rule Development opportunities, and implement recommendations)
C&I 4.4	West Contra Costa County Landfill: Implement Rule 11-18 and Conduct Gap Analysis
C&I 4.5	Metal Recycling (Sims, Pick ‘n Pull): Source Evaluation and Metals White Paper
FR 2.1	BAAQMD + CSC work w/ City of Richmond to strengthen the ISO
FR 2.2	BAAQMD coordinate with CSC to improve and expand communications about all flaring events and also for major incidents at both fuel-refining and non-fuel refining sources

In Progress Actions

**INFORM
CONSULT
INVOLVE**

Top 10 “In Progress” Actions CSC chose to prioritize engagement on for Year 1

From August CSC Meeting

FR 4.1	Amend Rule 11-18 to improve stringency, efficiency, transparency, and public engagement
FR 5.1	Implement Rule 6-5 Settlement Agreement
H 2.5	Reduce exposure to wood burning: Evaluate rule development opportunities. Initiate by the end of 2024.
R 1.2	Co-develop and implement an annual implementation plan
FR 3.5*	BAAQMD expedite the Notice of Violations resolutions process in the fuel refining sector*

*Status changed to Ongoing in Oct 2024

CSC Standing Committees and Ad Hoc



CSC Standing Committees and Ad Hoc

- Standing Committee/Ad Hoc Initiation
 - Up to two Standing Committees or Ad Hoc at a time
- Proposed/Upcoming Standing Committees/Ad Hoc
 - CSC Recruitment
 - + CSC prioritized 3 actions involving standing committees/ad hoc
 - Just Transition
 - Community Benefits Policy
- Roles and Responsibilities
 - CSC Facilitator
 - CSC Members
 - Air District Staff

Communications and Reporting



Communications and Reporting

- Monthly CSC Communications
- Web Dashboard
 - Public platform to view updates on PTCA implementation
 - Beta version to be reviewed by CSC Leads and CSC members
- Reporting
 - Ongoing reporting actions
 - Annual Report to CARB
 - Meet requirements from CARB *Blueprint 2.0* Guidance
 - Reflect on Year 1 progress
 - Refine strategies and actions
 - Communicate success stories and lessons learned
 - Provide data to help the CSC set priorities for Year 2

Request for Action

- Recommend the CSC approve the Year One Implementation Plan.

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Laura Cackette, BAAQMD



Public Comment

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Vote to Approve Year One Implementation Plan

Action Item

- The CSC will vote to approve (i.e., yes, no or may abstain) the Year One Implementation Plan.

Community Gathering Survey Results, PTCA CSC December Meeting, and Next Steps

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead



Survey Results

- **December CSC Meeting Preference Selected:**
 - Monday, December 9th
- **Holiday Community Gathering Preferences Selected:**
 - Restaurant/Cafe
 - TBD (Poll to schedule date and location coming soon)
 - Friday
 - Afternoon
 - 11 CSC members want to participate in White Elephant/Secret Santa (\$15 max)

Next Steps and December Meeting

- **Monday, December 9th, 2024**
 - Time: 5:30 - 7:30 PM
 - On-site Location: Richmond HQE
 - 4114 Lakeside Dr., Richmond CA 94806
 - Online: Zoom (link provided in the coming weeks)

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Lead

RICHMOND - NORTH
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR