

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105

## **DRAFT MINUTES**

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee

October 23, 2023, 5:30 P.M

### **1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chairs Alfredo Angulo-Castro and called the meeting to order at 5:33 pm.

Present: Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantó, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jefferey Killbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Franklin Ungo, Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Hakim Johnson (non-voting), Michael Kent (non-voting), BK White (non-voting)

Absent: Co-Chair Y’anad Burrell, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Stephanie Wright

Also Present: Air District Staff Karissa White, Diana Ruiz, Wendy Goodfriend, Dan Alrick, Marcia Raymond, Laura Cackette, Samuel Garcia, Alicia Parker, Eric Lara, Alona Davis, Meredith Bauer, Victor Douglas; MIG staff, Bridget Brown, Itzel Peña; Interpreter Norma Herrera

### **2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE**

00:04:25

Air District Staff Member Karissa White described the meeting format and procedures.

00:08:05

Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend announced the compiled Clean Air plan and next steps for the Plan including ADA accessibility review, Spanish translation, and Review by Council in December. Goodfriend also announced that the Community Engagement and Outreach Standing Committee was present to speak about their community outreach.

### Public Comments

None.

### 3. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF September 25, 2023**

00:10:17

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the September 25, 2023, Meeting Minutes in a show-of-hands vote.

### Committee Comments

None.

### Staff Comments

None.

### Committee Action

Committee Member Omotoso made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Aguirre to approve the minutes of the September 25, 2023, minutes. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

**AYES:** Nancy Aguirre, Alfredo Rafael Angulo, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy

**NOES:** None.

**ABSTAIN:** Jessica Range, Heidi Swillinger

**ABSENT:** Y'anad Burrell, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Stephanie Wright

### Public Comments

None.

### 4. **AD HOC UPDATES**

00:14:50

Committee Member Omotoso provided updates from the Community Engagement and Outreach Standing Committee, including the completed chapters of the Path to Clean Air (PTCA) Plan Strategies and Actions.

Committee Member Aguirre provided updates from the Governance Ad Hoc. These updates included sharing that CSC applications and Recruitment has been paused until Spring 2024 while the Strategies and Actions is adopted, Committee Member Roberta Feliciano has stepped down from the CSC, and a review of the Steering Committee Management Structure.

### Committee Comment

Committee Member Omotoso requested to know Roberta Feliciano's current title. Committee Member Aguirre clarified that Roberta Feliciano is no longer part of the Clean Air Steering Committee and therefore is no longer a government representative. Co-Chair Angulo further explained that Feliciano will have to reapply to the CSC to be a part of the Committee and that BK White still serves as a government representative with the City of Richmond.

Committee Member Killbreth asked if Governance Ad Hoc updates will be worked through with the CSC. Committee Member Aguirre clarified that no action towards Governance Ad Hoc will be made until after the plan is adopted. Co-Chair Angulo added that there will be upcoming meetings in November and December and that no decisions on Governance Ad Hoc will be made without the CSC's approval. Committee Member Aguirre added that information on the Governance Ad Hoc will be brought to the CSC in December and reiterated that decisions will not be made without the CSC.

### Public Comment

None.

## **5. COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND OUTREACH STANDING COMMITTEE UPDATE**

00:27:50

Committee Member Dave Severy provided an update on the Community Engagement and Outreach Steering Committee including outreach goals, timeline, and approach, describing outreach efforts with different vulnerable communities, youth groups, public agencies and electeds. Committee Member Severy described tools that the public can use to effectively do outreach including an elevator pitch, flyering, project FAQ, and PowerPoint presentation.

### Committee Comments

Committee Member Sandra Castañeda asked if the materials described are accessible to the CSC and the public. Air District Staff Diana Ruiz confirmed that links and files should be available for public use.

### Public Comment

None.

## **6. MOCK COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND OUTREACH STANDING COMMITTEE CERP PRESENTATION**

00:35:30

Committee Member Suzanne Coffee presented a mock presentation on the Community Engagement and Outreach Standing Committee CERP. Committee Member Suzanne Coffee described the background of the Clean Air program, the plan process, community mapping

process, the air pollution technical assessment and the example actions that can support the Clean Air program.

#### Committee Comments

Committee Member Heidi Swillinger asked about accessing the project webpage for public involvement. Air District Staff Diana Ruiz confirmed that the page is accessible through the Richmond Path to Clean Air page.

The Committee joined three different breakout rooms for 30-minutes to familiarize the Path to Clean Air Plan, materials available, and outreach and engagement strategies. All Committee Members reconvened following the breakout rooms and facilitators shared what was discussed.

Committee Member Suzanne Coffee represented Breakout Group 3 and summarized discussion about how to access technical information that can enhance presentations and discussions with community members.

Committee Member Dave Severy represented Breakout Room 2. Severy shared that Committee Member Simren Sandhu mentioned the rights of truck drivers affected by the Clean Air Program. Severy also described the need to define the just transition in outreach materials, some of the data in the fact sheet for public members who are unfamiliar with the statistics, and the legal status of the plan.

Co-Chair Alfredo Angulo represented Breakout Room 1 and summarized the discussion of specializing the presentation slides for different audiences and ideas for how to make the presentation more interactive and engaging.

Committee Member Nancy Aguirre shared a reminder that if Committee members do not prefer to present in front of audiences, there are other ways to be involved. Sending out emails to contacts and spreading the word in other ways are other helpful ways to participate.

#### Public Comment

None.

### **7. PUBLIC COMMENT: NEED/PURPOSE AND EXPECTED TIMELINE**

01:38:20

Air District Staff Alicia Parker described the timeline of getting the Clean Air Plan adopted and implemented. Parker described the ways the public can comment on the Plan chapters once posted online through email, how they will be reviewed, and how these comments inform critical policy change.

#### Committee Comments

Committee Member Jessica Range asked who will edit the plan based on public comments. Co-Chair Alfredo Angulo stated that the CSC is responsible for this. Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend described how public comments will go to the CSC and then to the Board of Directors, both of which can implement the changes.

Committee Member Jeffrey Killbreth suggested a letter campaign that supports the Clean Air Plan. Killbreth also requested the Air District produce material that supports the public outreach actions.

Committee Member Lucia Castello asked who will have access to the Plan once published on December 4. Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend stated the CSC members will be able to access the Clean Air Plan through administrative access of the Clean Air Steering Committee site before it is publicized.

Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend described other methods of effective outreach for the public such as Public Comment in Committee meetings in response to Committee Member Jeffrey Killbreth.

Committee Member Marisol Cantú responded to Committee Member Killbreth to share that it is not realistic or fair to ask Air District Staff to create more public outreach materials. The Committee was hopeful that the materials designed by Ratha would meet this request but unfortunately, they do not.

Committee Member Hakim Johnson stated that the CSC should have a longer time period to access the Clean Air Plan until it is publicized. Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend clarified that the dates for accessing the Plan are based on the Plan's timeline which the CSC agreed to. Goodfriend stated that the earliest the Plan will be available is December 4.

Committee Member Michael Kent agreed with Committee Member Johnson's concern and asked to see separate chapters of the Plan once completed instead of waiting to review the complete draft Plan. Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend stated that this would only be possible through a private copy and would not be shared with the public. Committee Member Nancy Aguirre stated that summaries on specific subject matters from the Plan will be presented in the November meeting.

Committee Member Jeffrey Killbreth agreed with Committee Member Hakim Johnson in needing a longer time period to review the Plan to be able to promote the CSC's goals for the Clean Air Program. Killbreth requested again that the CSC focus on more outreach that can inform a larger amount of residents.

Air District Staff Diana Ruiz responded to Committee Member Kent and shared the FAQ page that covers topline for strategies and actions of the plan.

Committee Member Diana Range agreed with Committee Member Killbreth and requested to have a timeline of events for releasing and reviewing the Clean Air Plan.

Committee Member Heidi Swillinger requested that the January meeting be devoted to explaining the plan to properly inform the public of outreach projects. This could be an opportunity for Committee Members to invite their contacts to the meeting to familiarize themselves with the outreach materials also.

Committee Member Sandra Castañeda agreed that having time for CSC Members and local jurisdictions to understand and support the Clean Air Plan.

Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend stated that the Draft Plan will be distributed to the CSC for familiarization two weeks before releasing it to the public. Goodfriend stated that a month of Public Comment is necessary.

Air District Staff Diana Ruiz shared that the FAQ page includes a table that covers topline strategies and actions of the plan. Ruiz stated that BAAQMD is unable to create an advocacy campaign for Public Comment once the Draft Clean Air Plan is public but Committee Members can lead these advocacy efforts.

Co-Chair Angulo Castro reiterated that now is the time for Committee Members to step into their roles as community members during this public comment period.

Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend clarified that Air District staff are staff to the Board of Directors. Staff cannot advocate to the Board or advocate to the public to advocate to the Board. This is the nature of a regulatory agency like the Air District.

#### Public Comments

None.

### **8. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE UPDATES**

02:23:47

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.

#### Committee Comments

Committee Member Nancy Aguirre thanked Committee Member Hakim Johnson for the invitation to the Chevron Refinery tour.

#### Public Comments

None.

### **9. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

02:25:05

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Committee.

#### Public Comment

None.

### **10. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her activities, and provide a reference to staff regarding factual information,

request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

Committee Comments

None.

Public Comments

None.

11. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, December 4, 2023, at 5:30 p.m., Zoom Video Conferencing. Agenda TBD

Zoom Log In: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/81059352934>

Meeting ID: 81059352934

12. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting was adjourned by Co-chair Alfredo Angulo-Castro at 8:00 pm.

MIG Consulting