

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105

MINUTES

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee

June 26, 2023, 5:30 P.M

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chair Alfredo Angulo-Castro called the meeting to order at 5:33 PM.

Present: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y’Anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantú, Suzanne Coffee, Dr. Darlena David, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Roberta Feliciano (non-voting), Hakim Johnson (non-voting) Michael Kent (non-voting), and BK White (non-voting)

Absent: Lucia Castello, and Kevin Ruano Hernandez

Also Present: Air District Staff Joshua Abraham, Dan Alrick, Laura Cackette, Victor Douglas, Samuel Garcia, Wendy Goodfriend, Paul Hibser, Kate Hoag, David Holstius, Eric Lara, Phil Martien, Kelly Malinowski, Greg Nudd, Kevin Olp, Marcia Raymond, Diana Ruiz, Raymond Salalila, Alex Sohn, Almira Van, and Karissa White; MIG staff Ana Padilla, and Maria Mayer; Interpreter Norma Herrera; Members of the Public Eric Bissinger, Paul Hibser, Alexander Lopez, Jonathan London, Julia Longo, Deldi Reyes, rbressler, and Lily Wu.

2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

00:03:43

Co-Chair Burrell shared that there is a new CSC member, B. K. White, Policy Director for the City of Richmond. She then described the meeting format and procedures.

Public Comments

None.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MAY 15, 2023

00:07:31

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the May 15, 2023, Meeting Minutes in a show-of-hands vote.

Committee Action

Committee Member Aguirre made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Marisol Cantú, to approve the minutes of the May 15, 2023 meeting. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y’Anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantú, Suzanne Coffee, Dr. Darlena David, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, and Heidi Swillinger,

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Roberta Feliciano (non-voting), BK White (non-voting)

ABSENT: Lucia Castello, and Kevin Ruano Hernandez

Public Comments

None.

4. AD HOC UPDATES

00:11:24

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public received updates on the active Ad Hoc working groups.

Committee Comments

Steering Committee Co-Chair Angulo and Steering Committee Member Marisol Cantú shared some of the findings from the Fuel Refining Group and a presentation on “just transition” for the Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc. Committee Member Cantú shared that the group worked on embedding “just transition” values and principles within their strategies but is in the process of reviewing and editing them. Co-Chair Angulo presented what “just transition” means in principle and practice. He explained that “just transition” aims to build economic and political power to shift from extractive economies and economic systems to regenerative and restorative ones by holistically approaching both production and consumption cycles in waste-free ways. Co-Chair Angulo explained the eight principles and shared a video that further explained how to plan for an economy beyond fossil fuels.

Steering Committee Member Aguirre shared some updates about the Governance Ad Hoc. She explained that the Charter, the interview questions for voting CSC applicants, and the review criteria will be finalized and reviewed by the Governance Ad Hoc, then the greater CSC. She shared that the process for approving new members will be proposed during the July CSC meeting. Committee member Aguirre reminded people to promote the CSC membership applications.

Public Comments

None.

5. PRESENTATION: CHARTER FINALIZATION

00:32:13

The Committee and the public received a presentation with a review of the revised Path to Clean Air Charter for the new community-led CSC from Committee Member Jessica Range. She explained that there were revisions to parts of the charter as discussed in the May 15 CSC meeting. Committee Member Range clarified that the CSC would include up to four city and/or county representatives. She explained that the charter is a living document and will be reviewed and updated as needed on a quarterly basis.

Committee Action

Committee Member Aguirre made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Kilbreth, to approve the revised CSC Charter. The motion was carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y’Anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantú, Suzanne Coffee, Dr. Darlena David, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, and Heidi Swillinger

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Roberta Feliciano (non-voting)

ABSENT: Lucia Castello, and Kevin Ruano Hernandez

Committee Comments

None.

Public Comments

None.

6. PRESENTATION: STRATEGY REVIEW TIMELINE AND PROCESS

00:39:27

The Committee and the public received a presentation on setting Plan goals to track progress from BAAQMD Staff member Wendy Goodfriend. She also reviewed the review process for Chapter Seven, Key Issues and Strategies. She walked through how the Key Issues and Strategies chapter was developed, what the approach and timeline for review was going to be, and then the next steps.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Swillinger clarified that the groups needs fresh eyes to review the strategies to see if there's anything that is missing or suggestions on how the strategies can be improved. She further explained that there will be resources, CSC members, and staff to answer any questions to ensure the review process is not daunting.

Committee Member Cantú seconded Committee Member Swillinger's comments and explained that if one does not understand the chapter and strategies as a CSC member, it will be difficult to explain to a community member. She also reiterated Committee Member Swillinger's call to action for CSC members to review Chapter Seven. Member Cantú asked if it would be possible to incorporate an orientation for people to come together and feel supported. She also asked if a "just transition" criteria can be better incorporated into the review process and Chapter Seven. Staff Member Olp responded that the BAAQMD is planning on incorporating an orientation with a one-page guidance document to lead the review process and an orientation for all of the lead reviewers on July 6th at the Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc. Staff will also meet with each of the review teams to assist with walking through the orientation document which will incorporate just transition criteria and principles.

Committee Member Range asked if edits and comments can made and shared in a Word document instead of Google Docs because she will not have guaranteed access to the Google Doc in the coming weeks. BAAQMD Staff stated that they will work with Committee Member Range and any other members that will have difficulty accessing the document and making comments or edits.

Co-Chair Angulo seconded that BAAQMD Staff can provide accommodations to ensure participation. He also reiterated Committee Cantú's point to make sure the strategies and chapter are clear and understandable to be able to hold the Air District and community accountable during

implementation. Angulo encouraged that CSC members that have not been as involved should participate in one of the review teams.

Committee Member Aguirre reiterated the importance of Committee Members Swillinger and Cantú's comments to ensure that nothing is overlooked, information is digestible for community members, incorporates just transition, and that everyone's voice is heard.

Committee Member Kilbreth; suggested to BAAQMD Staff and Committee Member Range to incorporate instruction on the offline capability of Google Docs in the one-page orientation if there are people that are going to have trouble accessing Wi-Fi. Staff responded that they will confirm accommodation for whoever needs any.

Committee Member Swillinger asked for confirmation that reviewers will be compensated for their review time. BAAQMD Staff will work with everyone for tracking time spent on reviewing the strategies and chapter.

Public Comments

None.

7. PRESENTATION: GOALS ALIGNMENT

01:11:01

The Committee and public received a presentation with an overview of the Plan goals for a goal alignment activity by BAAQMD staff member Kelly Malinowski. The CSC split into three groups for a small group activity on goal alignment.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Cantú described how the first group differentiated Plan goals, strategies, and objectives. The common themes were health, exposure reductions, emissions reductions, decreasing health burdens, and inequities but they did not get to their intended discussion to clarify what was missing. The group discussed integrating "just transition" into common community themes, visions, and principles but has not looked at the economic burdens or the workers' rights. The group was able were able to categorize and discuss the goals but also saw an opportunity to be more creative with the goals. They described having a larger goal, with sub-bullets.

Committee Member Severy reported that the second group's common themes for the goals were pollution and emissions reduction, public health improvement, data transparency, and jurisdiction and empowerment. He reported that the group discussed having five high-level goals for the whole plan with other goals that boil down to personal choices to keep people healthy. Committee Member Aguirre thanked Dr. David for her point of view for the keep yourself healthy approach so that the burden is not back on the individual. Committee Member Coffee asked Dr. David to clarify her input on what is a personal responsibility as opposed to administrative. Dr. David explained that the goal that states "understand how our daily choices affect our exposure to emissions" should be adapted because it makes it an onus on individuals. Dr. David shared that

the goals should be articulated so that the community understands how they can drive the change using data and more choices at an individual level.

Committee Member Range described that the third group favored the ability to make choices because there are many people who do not have a choice such as in transportation mode or route. Dr. David responded and shared that the goals should make people aware of their choices and resources for the need the community may have. Committee Member Swillinger explained that they spent time on what was missing, such as permit limits and enforcement of Title VI civil rights that may be in violation.

Public Comments

None.

8. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE UPDATES

01:33:09

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.

Committee Comments

None.

Public Comments

Jonathan London, a professor at UC Davis, conducting research on AB 617, explained that he had done some research involving the Richmond, North Richmond, San Pablo SES as funded by the California Resources Board. Currently, he is researching to help develop information to help AB 617 implementing partners across the state learn about their successes, challenges, and lessons learned. London shared that there is an English and Spanish survey as part of a statewide study. He shared that they are trying to get people's perceptions about how AB 617 implementation could be improved to really meet the goals of all the stakeholders, legislature, CARB, air districts, and communities. He shared that they are raffling off gift cards, ranging from \$250 to \$50, to thank people for their time after July 21st. He shared that the program is committed to climate justice.

9. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

01:37:15

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Committee.

Committee Comment

Committee Member Aguirre asked if the BAAQMD staff can share Jonathan London's survey with the CSC in a follow-up email.

Public Comment

None.

10. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her activities, and provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

Committee Comments

Committee Member Castañeda, shared that she had been emailing Committee Members Cantú and Kilbreth about being on the San Pablo City Council agenda for a resolution in support of AB 617. She stated she will first give a presentation to the public safety standing committee on July 6th. She requested help with the presentation to explain the entire process. Committee Member Aguirre shared that she could help support. Co-Chair Burrell requested that Member Castañeda send reminders for the meetings.

Public Comments

None.

11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Monday, July 24, 2023, at 5:30 p.m., both in-person at a location to be determined and via Zoom Video Conferencing.

Zoom Log In:

12. ADJOURNMENT

The Committee meeting was adjourned by Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro at 7:58 pm.

MIG Consulting