



BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT

BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
PATH TO CLEAN AIR COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN COMMUNITY  
STEERING COMMITTEE

COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBERS

ALFREDO ANGULO	JESSICA RANGE	MICHELLE GOMEZ
AMANDA BOOTH	JIM HOLLAND	GARCIA
DARLENA DAVID	KEVIN RUANO	NANCY AGUIRRE
DARLENE RIOS DRAPKIN	HERNANDEZ	OMONIYI OMOTOSO
DAVE SEVERY	LIZBETH IBARRA	PHILLIP MITCHELL
ERIKA RAMIREZ	LUCIA CASTELLO	ROBERTA FELICIANO
FRANCISCO AVILA	LUZ GOMEZ	SIMREN SANDHU
HAKIM JOHNSON	MARISOL CANTÚ	SUZANNE COFFEE
HEIDI V SWILLINGER	MICAELA ZARAGOZA-	VERNON WHITMORE
JEFFREY L KILBRETH	SOTO	Y'ANAD BURRELL

**THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY ASSEMBLY BILL 361 (RIVAS 2021) ALLOWING REMOTE MEETINGS. THIS MEETING WILL BE ACCESSIBLE VIA WEBCAST, TELECONFERENCE, AND ZOOM. A ZOOM PANELIST LINK WILL BE SENT SEPARATELY TO COMMITTEE OR BOARD MEMBERS**

- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING THROUGH THE WEBCAST BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S AGENDA WEBPAGE AT**

<https://www.baaqmd.gov/community-health/community-health-protection-program/richmond-area-community-health-protection-program>

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/84721043117>

**(669) 900-6833 or (408) 638-0968**

**WEBINAR ID: 847 2104 3117**

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENT CAN USE THE "RAISE HAND" FEATURE BY DIALING "\*9". IN ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**

- **VERSIÓN EN ESPAÑOL DEL WEBINAR**

# PATH TO CLEAN AIR COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING AGENDA

MONDAY, AUGUST 15, 2022

5:30 PM

1. **Call to Order - Roll Call**

2. **Public Meeting Procedure**

*The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.*

*This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit [www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas](http://www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas) at the time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain errors and omissions and are not certified for their content or form.*

***Public Comment on Agenda Items:** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have two minutes each to address the Committee. No speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

**CONSENT CALENDAR (Item 3)**

3. Approval of the Minutes of July 18, 2022

*The Committee will consider approving the draft minutes of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee meeting of July 18, 2022.*

**REGULAR AGENDA (Items 4 - 6)**

4. Ad Hoc Updates

*The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will receive an update on the Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc working group.*

5. Writer's Guide to Developing and Reviewing Path to Clean Air (PTCA) Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Strategies

*The Steering Committee will receive a presentation of a draft writer's guide to developing and reviewing PTCA CERP Strategies, created by staff, and have an opportunity to discuss and provide edits.*

6. Discussion and Vote on Recommendation to the Air District Board of Directors that the Board Should Disband the Current Path to Clean Air Steering Committee so that the Community Emission Reduction Plan Can Be Developed by a Non-Board-Appointed Committee that is not Subject to the Brown Act

*The Steering Committee will discuss and vote on whether to recommend to the Air District Board of Directors that the Board should disband the current Path to Clean Air Community Steering Committee so that the Community Emission Reduction Plan can be developed by a non-Board-appointed committee that is not subject to the Brown Act.*

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

7. Environmental Justice Updates

*The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.*

8. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters

*Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3*

*Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have two minutes each to address the Committee.*

9. Committee Member Comments

*Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)*

10. Time and Place of Next Meeting

*Monday, September 19, 2022, at 5:30 p.m., via webcast, teleconference, or Zoom, pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361 (Rivas 2021).*

11. Adjournment

*The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.*

**CONTACT:**

**KARISSA WHITE, STAFF SPECIALIST**  
**375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105**  
[kwhite@baaqmd.gov](mailto:kwhite@baaqmd.gov)

**(415) 516-8662**  
**FAX: (415) 928-8560**  
**BAAQMD homepage:**  
[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the Air District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

**Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy**

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at [www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility](http://www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility) to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Suma Peesapati, at (415) 749-4967 or by email at [speesapati@baaqmd.gov](mailto:speesapati@baaqmd.gov).

# BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

## EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

### MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

#### AUGUST 2022

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Path to Clean Air Community Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee	Monday	15	5:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361

#### SEPTEMBER 2022

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee - CANCELLED	Thursday	1	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	7	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Community Advisory Council Mtg.	Thursday	8	6:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Advisory Council Meeting	Monday	12	8:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Legislative Committee - CANCELLED	Monday	12	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee	Thursday	15	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Monday	19	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Path to Clean Air Community Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee	Monday	19	5:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	21	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Administration Committee	Wednesday	21	11:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Thursday	22	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Budget and Finance Committee - CANCELLED	Wednesday	28	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**  
Memorandum

To: Members of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee

From: Veronica Eady  
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Date: August 15, 2022

Re: Approval of the Minutes of July 18, 2022

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee meeting of July 18, 2022.

BACKGROUND

None.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee meeting of July 18, 2022.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Veronica Eady  
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Prepared by: Karissa White

Reviewed by: Veronica Eady

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Draft Minutes of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee Meeting of July 18, 2022



Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105

## **DRAFT MINUTES**

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee

July 18, 2022, 5:30 P.M

### **1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chairs Y’Anad Burrell called the meeting to order at 5:33 pm.

Present: Co-Chair Alfredo Angulo and Y’Anad Burrell, and Members Nancy Aguirre, Francisco Avila, Marisol Cantú, Roberta Feliciano, Luz Gomez, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Jessica Range, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Vernon Whitmore, Micaela Zaragoza-Soto, Jim Holland (non-voting), Hakim Johnson (non-voting)

Absent: Members Amanda Booth, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Patricia A. Daniels, Dr. Darlena David, Darlene Rios Drapkin, Phillip Mitchell, and Erika Ramirez

Also Present: Air District Staff, Joshua Abraham, Song Bai, Justine Buenafior, Laura Cackette, Ranyee Chiang, Victor Douglas, Samuel Garcia, Wendy Goodfriend, David Holstius, Marcy Hiratzka, Kate Hoag, Vanessa Johnson, Eric Lara, Lily MacIver, Kelly Malinowski, Elinor Mattern, Kevin Olp, Raymond Salalila, Nolwenn Smith, Marcia Raymond, Stephen Reid, Barry Young, Ying Yu; MIG staff, Ana Padilla, and Yesenia Perez; Interpreter Norma Herrera; Members of the Public Eric Bissinger, Cameron Carr, Denis Coghlan, John Cunningham, Sophie Douglas, Kyle Goff, Ben Gonzalo, Aloha de Guzman, HLee, Julia Luongo, Robson Swift, Alex Sohn, and Lily Wu

### **2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE**

#### Public Comments

None.

**3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JUNE 27, 2022**

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the June 27, 2022, Meeting Minutes with edits in a roll call vote.

Committee Comments

None.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Action

Kevin Ruano Hernandez made a motion, seconded by Heidi Swillinger to approve the minutes of the June 27, 2022, minutes. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

**AYES:** Co-Chair Alfredo Angulo and Y’Anad Burrell, and Members Nancy Aguirre, Francisco Avila, Marisol Cantó, Roberta Feliciano, Luz Gomez, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Phillip Mitchell, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Vernon Whitmore, and Micaela Zaragoza-Soto.

**NOES:** None.

**ABSTAIN:** None.

**ABSENT:** Members Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Patricia A. Daniels, Dr. Darlena David, Darlene Rios Drapkin, Phillip Mitchell, and Erika Ramirez.

**4. AD HOC UPDATES**

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public received updates on the active Ad Hoc working groups.

Committee Comments

Y’Anad Burrell: Reported the Committee will be making a formal presentation on an update on Community Description Ad Hoc co-leads. Burrell described how the Ad Hoc has been developing an outline of the community description that will be incorporated into the Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP).

Public Comments

None.

### Committee Action

None; receive and file.

## 5. **DRAFT FINAL COMMUNITY DESCRIPTION FROM AD HOC**

The Committee and the public received an overview of the Community Description Ad Hoc process from Committee member Nancy Aguirre and BAAQMD Staff member Lily MacIver. The presentation stated the purpose of the Community Description, the various themes and lenses used to describe the community, the audiences, and the Ad Hoc's process. Aguirre and MacIver shared the Community description outline and requested the Community Steering Committee to review the draft outline Community Description.

### Committee Comments

Committee Member Kevin Ruano Hernandez asked for clarity on where educational institutions fall in the groups of audiences. Nancy responded that the ad hoc categorized them in the residents' grouping and can see the benefits of placing education in its own group.

### Public Comments

John Cunningham, a Contra Costa County Transportation Planner, complemented the committee's work and described the condition of the transportation infrastructure and behavior in the Richmond area. He explained that describing traffic behavior would be information that would support the community description.

### Committee Action

None; receive and file.

## 6. **DISCUSSION OF KEY ISSUES APPROACH**

The Committee and the public received an overview of the Key Issues Approach. Kelly Malinowski described the discussion exercise and resources. Kevin Olp described the logistical needs of the approach. The meeting went to recess to provide an opportunity for ad-hoc small group discussions about various specific key issues, in which members of the public will be invited to participate. The Steering Committee meeting will then reconvene for the Committee to hear and discuss reports from the ad-hoc small group discussions and to review the Key Issues Approach for strategy development.

### Public Comments

None.

### Committee Comments Segment 1

None.

### Committee Action

Jessica Range made a motion, seconded by Micaela Zaragoza-Soto to go to recess for 1 hour. The motion was carried by the following vote of the Committee:

**AYES:** Co-Chair Alfredo Angulo and Y’Anad Burrell, and Members Nancy Aguirre, Francisco Avila, Marisol Cantó, Roberta Feliciano, Luz Gomez, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Phillip Mitchell, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Vernon Whitmore, and Micaela Zaragoza-Soto.

**NOES:** None.

**ABSTAIN:** None.

**ABSENT:** Members Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Patricia A. Daniels, Dr. Darlena David, Darlene Rios Drapkin, Phillip Mitchell, and Erika Ramirez.

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) reconvened the meeting at 7:09 PM.

Committee Members reported back from the six recess breakout discussions: Addressing Public Health and Reducing Exposure; Fuel Refining, Support Facilities, Storage, and Distribution; Industrial and Commercial Sources Near Communities; Odors and Smells; Vehicles and Trucks, Streets and Freeways, and Logistics and Warehouses; and Marine and Rail. The report back shared high-level concerns, what they know, and the consequences.

### Committee Comments Segment 2

Committee Member Luz Gomez requested that the jam boards be shared during the report back.

Committee Member Kevin Ruano Hernandez challenged the committee to prioritize listening to the community when providing background or education around community concerns. Community Member Nancy Aguirre suggested empowering the community to take space and provide their point of view by providing the tools and knowledge to do so.

Committee Members Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Jessica Range, Francisco Avila, Nancy Aguirre, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Heidi Swillinger, and Co-chair Y’Anad Burrell all commented that they like and enjoy the new recess breakout rooms approach. There were sentiments that there are more in-depth, interconnected, and informal conversations. There were suggestions to invite more community members, stakeholders, topic area experts (Urban Planning, City Staff, and responsible agencies), and professional contacts with solutions in mind.

Committee Member Francisco Avila acknowledged a solution that Vernon Whitmore brought to the City of Richmond; they reinstated street sweeping to address street dust. He suggested that committee members get in the rooms and spaces with stakeholders and decision-makers.

Committee Member Heidi Swillinger expressed concern regarding some breakout groups did not have many steering committee members. She suggested surveying the members that did not want to participate in any of the groups.

#### Public Comments

None.

### **7. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE UPDATES**

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.

#### Committee Comments

Committee Member Kevin Ruano Hernandez shared that on July 28, 2022, 5:30 PM to 8:30 PM there will be an in-person CARB Climate Scoping Plan Meeting in Oakland.

#### Public Comments

None.

### **8. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Committee.

#### Public Comments

None.

### **9. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her activities, and provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

Committee Comments

None.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

10. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, August 15, 2022, at 5:30 p.m., Zoom Video Conferencing,  
Zoom Log In: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/84721043117>  
Meeting ID: 847 2104 3117

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting was adjourned by Committee Co-Chair Angulo at 7:51pm.

MIG Consulting

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**  
Memorandum

To: Members of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee

From: Veronica Eady  
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Date: August 15, 2022

Re: Writer's Guide to Developing and Reviewing Path to Clean Air (PTCA) Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) Strategies

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Staff developed a draft writer's guide to developing and reviewing PTCA CERP Strategies, that includes a glossary, feasibility criteria, alignment with vision and principles criteria, and an outline of content, for review and discussion by the Steering Committee, in preparation for strategy development.

DISCUSSION

Steering Committee members will review the proposed draft writer's guide to developing and reviewing PTCA CERP Strategies. There will be a recess to allow Committee members to discuss the draft writer's guide in small groups. The meeting will then reconvene for the Committee to discuss the draft and provide edits.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Veronica Eady  
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Prepared by: Karissa White

Reviewed by: Veronica Eady

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Strategy Writing Guide and Checklist



## Path to Clean Air Community Steering Committee (PTCA CSC) Support Document

Draft v3, July 27, 2022

**Part I.** Below is a proposed outline for the Key Issues and Strategies Chapters to be included in the PTCA Community Emission Reduction Plan

### Key Issues and Strategies Chapter Outline

1. Chapter Title
2. Brief Description of Key Issue(s), including Key Issue Statement(s) [*narrative describing key issues (what's the concerns, what do we know, what are the consequences), and any relevant background, and key issue statement(s)*]
3. Weight of Evidence [*Any and all of the following to describe the key issues*]
  - a. Technical Assessment Information [*Specific and detailed relevant information from the Technical Assessment, including impacts (emissions and exposure)*]
  - b. Community Description Information [*Specific and detailed relevant information from the Community Description*]
  - c. Compliance and Enforcement Information [*Specific and detailed relevant information from Compliance and Enforcement*]
4. Strategies [See Part II Writer's Guide, Section III. Strategy Content]

### Part II. Writer's Guide to Developing and Reviewing PTCA CERP Strategies

**Purpose and Instructions:** The purpose of the Writer's Guide is to serve as both a guide for writing and developing strategies, as well as a checklist for reviewing strategies to ensure they include all necessary components and reflect the Path to Clean Air (PTCA) Community Steering Committee (CSC)'s Vision and Principles. Strategy-writing is expected to be a collaborative effort involving Community Steering Committee members (CSC) and Air District staff, in which community voices are centered.

This document is organized into three sections, as detailed below in the Outline. For each strategy, ask the questions laid out in Sections II and III below. Use these as a guide for assessing whether the strategy meets feasibility criteria, aligns with the community's Visions and Principles, and is complete. To decide if a strategy meets all criteria described here, we recommend CSC members and Air District staff work together to reach general consensus. **Guiding questions for each section are highlighted in blue throughout.**

#### Outline:

- I. Glossary: Definitions of terms included in the Guide and Checklist.
- II. Strategy Criteria: Criteria for writing and developing, as well as reviewing, strategies.

III. Content: Necessary components of each strategy, to review both during the writing and development, as well as for review of each strategy after development.

---

## I. **GLOSSARY**

- **Social Equity:** Social equity is impartiality, fairness, and justice for all people in a society. Social equity considers systemic inequalities to ensure everyone in a community has access to the same opportunities and outcomes. Equity practice acknowledges that inequalities exist and works to eliminate them by developing approaches to addressing disparities.
- **Disparity:** A noticeable and usually significant difference or dissimilarity. This word is used herein to describe a social or economic condition that's considered unfairly unequal: a racial disparity in hiring, a health disparity between the rich and the poor, an income disparity between men and women, and so on.
- **Environmental Justice:** Environmental justice is the fair treatment and meaningful involvement\* of all people with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies. Fair treatment means that no population bears a disproportionate share of negative environmental consequences resulting from industrial, municipal, and commercial operations or from the execution of federal, state, and local laws; regulations; and policies. Environmental justice addresses disproportionate environmental and health impacts in all laws, rules, and policies by prioritizing vulnerable populations and overburdened communities and pursuing the equitable distribution of resources and benefits to eliminate harm.<sup>1 2</sup>  
*\*Meaningful Involvement* means sharing power with community members in every step of a process, especially members from the most impacted populations – Black, indigenous, and people of color.
- **Action:** Actions are specific, clear, achievable, and focused. These are the individual steps that together form an overall Strategy that addresses a Key Issue. Air District Actions could include, for example: regulations, permitting, enforcement, incentives, further study, and/or education and outreach, whereas a Strategy could be a combination of a regulation, incentive, and outreach effort to form an overall, holistic Strategy. Note that all actions that form a strategy should be related to that strategy, and collectively address a Key Issue.
- **Strategy:** A Strategy is a collection of actions, that together address a Key Issue holistically. This is the overall change we want to create, and the Actions are the specific steps to get there.

## II. **STRATEGY CRITERIA**

**Feasibility:** Can the strategy be implemented successfully? Below are some questions to ask yourself to determine if the strategy is feasible, that is, is it implementable? If you identify obstacles to

---

<sup>1</sup> US EPA, OP. Environmental Justice. 3 Nov. 2014, <https://www.epa.gov/environmentaljustice>.

<sup>2</sup> "What Is Environmental Justice?" *Energy.Gov*, <https://www.energy.gov/lm/services/environmental-justice/what-environmental-justice>. Accessed 5 July 2022.

implementation, can you also identify options to overcome these or change the strategy or action to increase the chance of success?

- Funding: can the strategy be implemented with existing or expected funding sources?
- Political support: is there a high likelihood of political support for the strategy?
- Technical: how much certainty is there that the strategy can be implemented and achieve the expected benefits with existing technology or know-how?
- Authority/Legality: can the strategy be implemented within existing authorities of the lead/partners?
- Champion: does the strategy have a champion that will help ensure its success?
- Timeline: will the community benefit from this strategy within a reasonable timeframe, i.e., for strategies that will have long timelines, are they worth the wait?

**Alignment with Vision & Principles:** Does the strategy align with the PTCA Vision and Principles? Below are some questions to ask yourself to answer this question. Each question below includes reference to the PTCA CSC Principles or Vision related to the question.

- Vision: Does the strategy, and particularly the objective, reflect the needs of the people who have been disproportionately harmed by environmental injustice? (expected racial and social equity outcomes)
- Principle #3: Is the strategy based on, or does it reflect, the information we have about racial and social disparities, and if not, what information do you need? (analysis of information)
- Principle #2: Does the strategy center the stakeholders who benefit and/or are burdened to be included, at what level of participation, and will this participation be meaningful (see definition of meaningful participation in glossary above)? (stakeholder inclusion)
- Principle #5: Does the strategy further or create disparities or inequities in communities that have been disproportionately harmed? (who is burdened)
- Principle #5: Does the strategy lead to investment, or dismantle barriers, in communities that have been disproportionately harmed by environmental injustice? (who benefits)
- Principle #4: Does the strategy achieve the highest emissions and exposure reductions possible in a matter that is sustainable for the long-term? (strategies and implementation)
- Principle #4: Will strategy implementation result in unintended consequences for communities most disproportionately harmed by environmental justice? [*e.g. increased property value, leading to gentrification*] (strategies and implementation)
- Principles #1, 3 and 5: (evaluation and accountability)
  - Are the metrics and measures understandable to community?
  - Are the metrics and measures data-driven and evidence based?
  - Will the metrics and measures demonstrate progress towards addressing longstanding disproportionate injustices and inequities?

### III. CONTENT

Is the strategy complete, have you been able to fill in all components? Below the components, or the content, of a strategy are named and defined. To note, a strategy may have numerous actions.

<b>Component</b>	<b>Description</b>
Strategy #	<i>This will be assigned and will reference the Key Issue the strategy addresses</i>
Strategy name	<i>A brief descriptive name, related to the Key Issue the strategy addresses, that can be used as “short-hand” to talk about the strategy, e.g.; “Zero or low emission logistics centers”</i>
Key Issue Addressed	<i>List the Key Issue addressed by this strategy.</i>
Objective (intended outcome of the strategy)	<i>What the strategy is meant to achieve, or the overarching goal of the strategy, which upholds or advances the Vision and Principles. What is the expected outcome of the strategy? Be as specific as possible. E.g. Outcome = Starting in 2025, all new logistics centers are zero emissions.</i>
Measure (metric of success)	<i>How will we measure the success of the strategy? Measure = % of new logistic centers that are zero emission (goal is 100%), and see below for detail on how we achieve that outcome via the actions measures.</i>
Action #	<i>This will be assigned and will reference the strategy the action is part of.</i>
Action name/brief description	<i>A brief descriptive name, related to the strategy, that can be used as “short-hand” to talk about the action, e.g.; “Local requirement for electric vehicle charging infrastructure at all loading docks.”</i>
Type of action	<i>Type of action (helps sort/filter during implementation), e.g.; regulatory, enforcement, incentives, further research, education/outreach</i>
Lead action implementor	<i>The agency, organization, or group that is primarily responsible for implementing the action</i>
Partners in action implementation	<i>Partners who will work with the lead to implement the action</i>
Key stakeholders to engage in action implementation	<i>Stakeholders to be engaged in the implementation of the action should include those that are most burdened, most likely to benefit, and who may be subject to unintended consequences</i>
Potential obstacles	<i>Any potential obstacles to implementation of action, and plan for overcoming that obstacle</i>
Action initiation timeframe	<i>Defined timeframe to initiate the action, e.g.; Near=&lt;2 years; Mid=2-4 years; Long &gt; 4 years</i>

Action intervention point*	<i>At what point in the causal chain is the action intervening, e.g.; emissions, ambient concentration, exposure, dosage, health effects</i>
Action impact timeframe	<i>Defined timeframe for the action's impact to be observed, e.g.; Near=&lt;2 years; Mid=2-4 years; Long &gt; 4 years</i>
Measure/metric of action implementation	<p><i>How the action implementation will be measured, typically using output metrics, e.g.;</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Direct emission reductions (yes/no?)</i></li> <li>• <i>Direct exposure reductions (yes/no?)</i></li> <li>• <i>Indirect emission reductions (yes/no?)</i></li> <li>• <i>Indirect exposure reductions (yes/no?)</i></li> <li>• <i>Was a regulation implemented (yes/no?)</i></li> <li>• <i>Was a grant received (yes/no?)</i></li> </ul>
Estimate of action's emission/exposure reduction	<i>Was the potential emissions or exposure reduction of the implemented strategy estimated - Yes/no? If yes, see technical support and summary of quantitative reduction estimates</i>
Narrative on how Strategy meets Feasibility Criteria	<i>Describe how the strategy does or does not meet the feasibility criteria</i>
Narrative on how Strategy meets Vision and Principles Criteria	<i>Describe how the strategy does or does not meet the feasibility criteria</i>

\*causal chain of air pollution and health, see PTCA CSC [Technical Assessment presentation #2](#) or [PTCA CSC Nov 15, 2022 Meeting](#)



**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

## Memorandum

To: Members of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee

From: Veronica Eady  
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Date: August 15, 2022

Re: Discussion and Vote on Recommendation to the Air District Board of Directors that the Board Should Disband the Current Path to Clean Air Steering Committee so that the Community Emission Reduction Plan Can Be Developed by a Non-Board-Appointed Committee that is not Subject to the Brown Act

**RECOMMENDED ACTION**

Staff recommend that the Steering Committee discuss and take a vote on whether to recommend to the Air District Board of Directors that the Board disband the current Board-appointed Path to Clean Air Community Steering Committee, which would allow the Community Emission Reduction Plan (CERP) to be developed by a non-Board-appointed committee that is not subject to the Brown Act.

**BACKGROUND**

On March 3, 2021, the Air District Board of Directors established the Path to Clean Air Community Steering Committee (CSC) and appointed the members. Because the CSC was established by the Board of Directors, it is subject to the Ralph M. Brown Open Meetings Act (Brown Act). CSC members have expressed concerns and frustrations that the Brown Act limits creative ways of engaging during meetings, creates an undue burden for co-developing and/or reviewing materials ahead of CSC meetings, and makes recruiting and appointing new members a challenging and arduous process. CSC members have therefore called for the current Board-appointed CSC to be disbanded, and for it to be replaced by a non-Board-appointed committee that would not be subject to the Brown Act. Neither Assembly Bill 617 nor the California Air Resources Board Blueprint require CSCs to be appointed by air district boards.

After requests from multiple Path to Clean Air CSC members, the Committee's Co-Chairs asked to agenda the discussion and vote to recommend to the Air District Board of Directors that it disband the CSC by rescinding Resolution No. 2021-02, which established the CSC. If the CSC votes to make this recommendation, the Co-chairs will draft and send a letter to the Community Equity, Health and Justice Board Committee. If the Community Equity, Health and Justice committee and ultimately the full Board agree with the request, then the CSC would be dissolved and a new non-Board-appointed community steering committee would be re-formed to complete work on the Path to Clean Air CERP. Before it is dissolved, the CSC would develop a

recommendation for how the members of this new non-Board-appointed committee will be recruited, selected and appointed.

DISCUSSION

CSC members will discuss if there are any concerns regarding the recommendation to rescind Resolution No. 2021-02 and disband the current Board-appointed CSC, as well as what recommendations could be made to replace the current CSC with a non-Board-appointed committee. CSC members will then vote on whether to make this recommendation to the Board of Directors.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Veronica Eady  
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Prepared by: Karissa White  
Reviewed by: Veronica Eady

ATTACHMENTS:

None