

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105

DRAFT MINUTES

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee

February 27, 2023, 5:30 P.M

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

Air District Staff Member Karissa White called the meeting to order on behalf of the Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo and Y’Anad Burrell at 5:33 pm.

Present: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo and Y’Anad Burrell, and Members Nancy Aguirre, Francisco Avila, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Roberta Feliciano, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Micaela Zaragoza-Soto, Jim Holland (non-voting), Hakim Johnson (non-voting)

Absent: Members Dr. Darlena David, Luz Gomez, Phillip Mitchell, Erika Ramirez, Vernon Whitmore

Also Present: Air District Staff, Almira Van, Alona Davis, Barry Young, Dan Alrick, Diana Ruiz, Eric Lara, Joshua Abraham, Karissa White, Kate Hoag, Kelly Malinowski, Kevin Olp, Laura Cackette, Marcia Raymond, Dr. Philip Fine, Sharon Landers, Stephen Reid, Veronica Eady, and Wendy Goodfriend; MIG staff, Bridget Brown, Maria Mayer, and Ramona McCabe; Interpreter Norma Herrera; Members of the Public Deldi Reyes, Eric Bissinger, Lily Wu, Michael Kent, Michelle Byars, Samuel Garcia, and Scott Andrews.

Staff Comments

Air District Staff Member, Dr. Philip Fine, was introduced as the new Executive Officer.

2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

Public Comments

None.

3. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF January 30, 2023**

00.08:07

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the January 30, 2023, Meeting Minutes with edits in a roll call vote.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Jeffrey Kilbreth: Requested that the CERP timeline be updated to include community engagement and education regarding the Plan. Air District Staff Member Kelly Malinowski: Stated that the timeline will be updated to include a line describing CERP community engagement.

Committee Action

Committee Member Castello made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Omotoso to approve the minutes of the January 30, 2023, meeting. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo and Y'Anad Burrell, and Members Francisco Avila, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Nancy Aquirre, Heidi Swillinger, Micaela Zaragoza-Soto

ABSENT: Members Dr. Darlena David, Roberta Feliciano, Luz Gomez, Phillip Mitchell, Erika Ramirez, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Vernon Whitmore

Public Comments

None.

4. **AD HOC UPDATES**

0:13:19

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public received updates on the active Ad Hoc working groups.

Committee Comment

Committee Member Francisco Avila: Reported an update on the Problems to Solution Ad Hoc. Avila described that the group has been meeting frequently to work on refining metrics to gauge the success of strategies and finalizing the updated writer's guide. They foresee submitting for internal review within a few weeks.

Public Comment

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. **DISCUSSION AND REQUEST FOR VOLUNTEERS TO DRAFT CHAPTERS 2 (CSC MEMBERS) AND CHAPTER 3 (VISION AND PRINCIPLES) OF THE CERP**

0.15.39

The Community Steering Committee discussed the intent of CERP Chapter 2 ‘CSC Members’ and Chapter 3 ‘Vision and Principles’ and the timeline for drafting these chapters. The co-chairs also asked for volunteer(s) to draft Chapters 2 and 3 with support from Air District staff as needed.

Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo described that the Committee is seeking three or four volunteers to draft Chapter 2, ‘CSC Members’ and Chapter 3, ‘Vision and Principles’ of the CERP.

Air District Staff Member Kelly Malinoski: Described the intent of Chapters 2 and 3. She explained that Chapter 2 will appear at the beginning of the CERP, and will contain an overview of Steering Committee members and their affiliations, as well as Ad Hoc and Writing Teams formed and their members, and any additional information the CSC would like to share about who the CSC members are and how they have worked together. She explained that Chapter 3 will list the vision and principles that the Committee has developed for the CERP, with an overview of the development process, how the vision and principles are being used to guide CERP development, and their potential role during CERP implementation. She recommended that drafting begin as soon as feasible, with initial first drafts to be completed in April and ready for Committee review no later than the end of May. She called for volunteers to draft these chapters.

Committee Comments

Committee Members Lucia Castello, Michaela Zaragoza-Soto and Simren Sandhu volunteered to work on both chapters.

Air District Staff Member Kelly Malinoski: Stated that she will send a reminder email and resources to the volunteers so they can begin drafting the chapters and thanked the members for volunteering.

Committee Member Jeffrey Kilbreth: Stated that the Vision and Principles are simple and clear. Kilbreth recommended that the CERP provide context with some detail on the history of achievements and trends in pollution control over the last 40-50 years and its current status. Air District Staff Member Kelly Malinoski: Agreed that this context is important and that once more of the draft CERP has been completed, the team will review it to ensure that appropriate context is provided.

Public Comments

None.

6. **DISCUSSION AND VOTE TO CONSIDER RECOMMENDING TO THE BAAQMD COMMUNITY, EQUITY HEALTH AND JUSTICE (CEHJ) COMMITTEE THAT THE CEHJ COMMITTEE RECOMMEND TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS THAT THE BOARD DISSOLVE THE CSC APPOINTED BY RESOLUTION NO. 2021-02 BY THE END OF APRIL TO ALLOW FOR THE CREATION OF A NEW, NON-BOARD-APPOINTED STEERING COMMITTEE WITH A COMMUNITY-LED GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE**

00:26:00

The Committee and the public received a presentation on the proposal from Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo, Committee Member Nancy Aguirre, and Air District Staff Member Kevin Olp.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Francisco Avila: Stated appreciation of the work done by the governance Ad Hoc to develop and clearly communicate the proposal, answer all questions, and ensure that current Committee members are retained. Avila further stated his willingness to make a motion to approve the proposal and intention to vote in favor.

Committee Member Nancy Aguirre: Agreed with Committee Member Avila's comments, and expressed appreciation for participation in the governance Ad Hoc, providing an opportunity to clarify previous questions and ensure that the Committee is well supported through the transition and beyond. Aguirre stated that she was prepared to second a motion to approve.

Committee Member Hakim Johnson: Described the understanding that the Air District Board's membership appointments were made deliberately to ensure appropriate makeup of the Committee. Johnson asked whether there is also a goal to identify interested community members who are new to Committee. Johnson also recommended considering giving some preference to those who were involved in the previous Community Air Monitoring Plan effort. Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo: Responded that current members will have initial priority but that after that first round of applications, the process will be open to the public and applications from those individuals accepted and considered.

Committee Member Marisol Cantú: Expressed appreciation to the Ad Hoc for considering how to develop a true community process, and also to Dr. Fine for emphasizing the community-led nature of this effort, which will allow an inclusive process, diversify membership, and bring new voices and ideas to the table.

Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo: Requested that Dr. Fine confirm the Air District's continued commitment as the transition takes place. Air District Staff Member Philip Fine: Responded that the Air District will continue to be fully committed to and supportive of its partnership with the CSC, no matter what governance structure is in effect.

Committee Member Jeffrey Kilbreth: Expressed that the transition in governance structure, allowing the Committee the flexibility to easily convene informal, ad hoc meetings and discussions, will improve its function and ability to work collaboratively with the community. Kilbreth stated further that the Committee will need focused support from the Air District over the next three to four months to complete the CERP. Air District Staff Member Philip Fine: Reiterated the Air District's commitment to helping the Committee move forward efficiently.

Committee Member Heidi Swillinger: Commended Co-Chair Alfredo Argulo for foresight in recognizing the benefits of a community-led governance structure some months ago at a time when many other Committee members were not yet in agreement.

Public Comment

None.

Committee Action

Committee Member Francisco Avila made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Nancy Aguirre, that the CSC vote to recommend to the BAAQMD Community, Equity, Health, and Justice Committee and finally to the Board of Directors that the CSC appointed by Resolution No. 2021-02 be dissolved by the end of April to allow for the transition to a community led governance structure. The motion carried by the following vote of the committee:

AYES: Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo and Y'Anad Burrell, and Members Nancy Aguirre, Francisco Avila, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Roberta Feliciano, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, and Micaela Zaragoza-Soto.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Members Dr. Darlena David, Luz Gomez, Phillip Mitchell, Erika Ramirez, Vernon Whitmore

Staff Comments

Air District Staff Member Kevin Olp: Addressed next steps, which will also be provided to the entire Committee via email. The recommendation will be presented by the CSC Co-Chairs and Governance Ad Hoc members to the CEHJ Committee for a vote on March 15th. If the CEHJ committee approves, the recommendation will be presented to the Board of Directors at their April meeting, the date of which is yet to be finalized. Also in March, the Air District will send out the application paperwork to current CSC Members. The process will be streamlined to allow the Committee to reconvene as soon as possible. Revised applications will contain all information from Members' original applications, requiring Members simply to make any needed updates and redo their conflict of interest forms. Further information and confirmed dates and links for the CEHJ and Board meetings will be sent out to all Committee members to allow participation in those meetings if desired.

7. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE UPDATES

00:59:42

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Nancy Aguirre: Recommended that Committee members consult the Richmond Communities for a Better Environment (CBE) website for an update on Chevron's request for the Richmond City Council to assess the environmental impact of its current upcoming project. Committee Member Jeffrey Kilbreth: Stated that this involves a significant request by Chevron that will go through the full review process with the Planning Commission and City Council, and potentially presents an opportunity for Committee members to voice concerns. Kilbreth further stated that the new hydrogen plant being built as part of Chevron's modernization process is certainly the cause of much of the increased flaring and urged that Committee members watch this process closely as it may be closely tied to the Committee's goal of reducing flaring. Committee Member Hakim Johnson: Noted in response that he has offered to discuss Chevron's proposals with the entire Committee. The item under discussion, which is on tomorrow's agenda for the Planning Commission, is not a full review of the project, but instead an opportunity for the City to bring someone on board to fully assess what the new project will be. Johnson stated that he will check the information on the CBE website, and also encouraged Committee Members to reach out with any questions. He confirmed that all upcoming Chevron projects coming down in the queue will go through a full review process. Committee Member Jeffrey Kilbreth: Asked that Johnson provide a brief written description of the project currently under discussion to better inform Committee Members.

Committee Member Suzanne Coffee: Described that a company called Raven SR made a presentation at the most recent Richmond Coordinating Neighborhood Council meeting regarding their proposed carbon capture facility on the of the Richmond Sanitary Landfill. Air District Staff Member called on Member of the Public Michael Ken to share more information. Member of the Public Michael Kent introduced himself as a representative of the Contra Costa County Health Department and Ombudsman for the County's Hazardous Materials program, staffing the County's Hazardous Materials Commission. Kent described that Raven has presented its plans to the Commission to take organic waste from the landfill and convert it to clean hydrogen through a proprietary process that is completely pollution-free. They are in the process of going through environmental review with the City of Richmond to procure a permit for this work. He has previously been in communication with Lena Vasquez of the City regarding the status of the project, which is still at an early stage.

Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo: Stated that there will be a study session at the February 28, 2023 Richmond City Council meeting led by Dr. Christina Hill from UC Berkeley's Urban and Regional Development Department on sea level rise and groundwater intrusion and how the city will be impacted.

Public Comments

None.

8. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS 6 :42

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Committee.

Public Comment

None.

9. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her activities, and provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

Committee Comments

None.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

10. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

The planned meeting of Monday, March 20, 2023 is cancelled. The date and details for the next meeting, planned for April, will be set once the Board vote has taken place.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The Committee meeting was adjourned by Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo at 6:44 pm.

MIG Consulting