

Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD)
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105

DRAFT MINUTES

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee

April 24, 2023, 5:30 P:M

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chairs Y'Anad Burrell called the meeting to order at 5:32 pm.

Present: In Person; Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro, Darlena David, Dave Severy, Jeffrey L. Kilbreth, Jessica Range, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Lucia Castello, Nancy Aguirre, Omoniyi Omotoso, Sandra Marquez, and Co-Chair Y'Anad Burrell.

Virtual; Hakim Johnson, Heidi V Swillinger, Lizbeth Ibarra, Michael Kent, Marisol Cantu, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Simren Sandhu, and Suzanne Coffee.

Absent: Roberta Feliciano

Also Present: Air District staff, Alona Davis, Dan Alrick, Eric Bissinger, Eric Lara, Joshua Abraham, Kate Hoag, Karissa White, Kevin Olp, Laura C. Cackette, Marcia Raymond, Ranyee Chiang, Raymond Salalila, Samuel Garcia, Song Bai, Stephen Reid, Vanessa Johnson, Veronica Eady, Wendy Goodfriend, and Ying Yu; MIG staff, Ana Padilla, and Maria Mayer; Interpreter Norma Herrera; Members of the Public Cameron Carr, Eric Bissinger, Hannah Karlan, Kyle Goff, Lily Wu, Sondra Abruzzo, and Thomas Namara.

2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

Public Comments

None.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 27, 2023

00:06:10

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the February 27, 2023, Meeting Minutes with edits in a roll call vote.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Comments

Committee Co-Chair Burrell asked to clarify if committee members should indicate their position by a verbal role call or physically raising hands for approval of the minutes. BAAQMD staff suggested verbal role call so that meeting participants in the Virtual room are aware of people's positions.

Committee Member Nancy Aguirre clarified that the CSC will continue to undergo the Brown Act meeting process to be consistent until the Community-led CSC charter is adopted.

Committee Action

Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso made a motion, seconded by Jessica Range, to approve the minutes of the February 27, 2023, minutes. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro, Darlena David, Dave Severy, Jessica Range, Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez, Lizbeth Ibarra, Lucia Castello, Marisol Cantú, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Nancy Aguirre, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Simren Sandhu, Suzanne Coffee, and Co-Chair Y'Anad Burrell

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Heidi V Swillinger, Jeffrey L. Kilbreth, Michael Kent, and Sandra Marquez

ABSENT: Roberta Feliciano

4. **AD HOC UPDATES**

00:11:53

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public received updates on the active ad hoc working groups.

Committee Comment

Committee Member Aguirre reported that the Problems to Solution Ad Hoc is making progress. She mentioned that the Public Health group is doing well. She shared that the Marine and Rail group is working with CARB. She shared that most groups are in the writing process and meeting with staff and stakeholders. Aguirre shared that she and committee member Kilbreth are working on the website strategy and the complaint system with BAAQMD.

Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro shared that there are opportunities to join the different groups because some members have had to step back due to their capacity.

Committee Co-Chair Burrell shared that she is excited about the work in the Public Health group. She reported that there are discussions about tracking information, health considerations, and mental health and that going to the groups is a great opportunity to work with different combinations of committee members. Dr. Omotoso added that they are talking to stakeholders and considering everything.

Committee Member Cantú reminded the CSC to keep an eye on the participants in the virtual room. She reported an update on the Fuel Refining group, she shared that the group has been struggling due to staffing and the failed consulting contract with Greg Karris. She shared that the group is behind in developing strategies and that she has been reaching out to different community partners. She requested additional support from the CSC to analyze fuel refining for monitoring, permitting, refining compliance, and enforcement. She reiterated the importance of reducing the impacts of fuel refining. Committee Member Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez volunteered to start participating in the group.

Committee Member Castello shared that Committee Members Sandu, Zaragoza-Soto, and herself are writing some of the strategies and asked for information regarding the cross-cutting group. Committee member Aguirre responded and shared that the cross-cutting ad hoc was focusing on legislation but is all-inclusive of the topic areas; the group meets on Thursdays at 5:30 pm. Co-Chair Burrell asked for clarity on when the different groups meet. Committee Member Cantú specified that fuel refining meets on Fridays at 8:00 am and suggested listing the subgroups for the next update. BAAQMD staff stated that they can share the times and descriptions of the CSC. They shared that since the start of the process, there have been four ad hocs: Problems to Solutions, Governance, Community Description, and Technical Advisory. Staff shared that the Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc has sub-working groups currently working on the different topic areas.

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro shared that the Governance Ad Hoc has worked with the BAAQMD board to transition the CERP CSC to a community-led process. Angulo-Castro shared that the ad hoc will continue to support the application and recruitment process. He also shared that they will collect comments on the new charter and make the necessary changes after the charter discussion in agenda item 7.

Public Comment

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. PRESENTATION: COMMUNITY-LED COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE AND APPLICATION PROCESS

00:31:42

The Committee and the public received a presentation with an overview of the new community-led CSC format from Co-Chair Angulo-Castro and Committee Member Aguirre.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Cantú requested that the presenters speak clearly into the room mic and state “next slide” to ensure everyone is receiving the same information and queuing for the PowerPoint technician especially for the people in the virtual part of the meeting.

Committee Member Severy asked if there is government representation from the city of Richmond. Co-Chair Angulo-Castro shared that Committee Member Feliciano reapplied but is currently on vacation.

Committee Member Johnson asked Co-Chair Angulo-Castro to repeat the names of the new government representatives. Co-Chair Angulo-Castro shared that Sandra Marquez for the City of San Pablo and Michael Kent from Contra County have applied, interviewed, and will be joining the CSC.

Committee Member Kilbreth recommended that due to the transition to a community-led process, there should be a consistent notetaker to continue building institutional and content knowledge. Co-chair Angulo-Castro shared that the CSC will not need to make a motion to approve the minutes but can make edits. Committee Member Range asked if notes are being taken and Co-chair Angulo-Castro clarified that the team is taking notes.

6. PRESENTATION: DRAFT CHARTER OVERVIEW

00:46:59

The Committee and the public received a presentation with an overview of the new charter for the community-led CSC from Co-Chair Angulo-Castro.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Kilbreth asked when the next CSC meeting was. Co-chair Angulo-Castro confirmed that the next meeting was scheduled for May 15. BAAQMD staff added that in the past they were not able to send calendar invitations for the regular CSC meeting due to the Brown Act but will be able to move forward by sharing a calendar invitation and reminder. They also added that there will be a follow-up email with instructions and details for feedback for the charter.

Committee Member Johnson asked for clarification on the 72-hour deadline for materials. BAAQMD staff clarified that it was calendar days not business days. Johnson also asked if there is a certain target number of CSC members. Co-chair Angulo-Castro responded that they are aiming for 21–27 CSC members.

Committee Member Ruano Hernandez asked what the number of members before the Brown Act CSC was dissolved and with the current recruitment effort what is the number of CSC now. Co-Chair Angulo responded that prior to being dissolved as a Brown Act CSC, there were 27–31 members; currently there are 21 members, but total members will adjust as recruitment begins.

Angulo-Castro reminded the group that the Charter can be changed if the CSC would like to add more members. Ruano Hernandez followed up about how many members reapplied. Co-chair Angulo-Castro responded that some members had to step down for various reasons, but many have reapplied.

Committee Member Ruano Hernandez asked if there is a specific percentage of the different sectors they want to reach with applicants. Co-Chair Angulo-Castro described that the goal for the percentage of members that live in the study area has gone up, but in terms of industry, nothing was specified.

7. **PRESENTATION: CERP TIMELINE DISCUSSION**

00:59:17

The committee and the public received the presentation on the CERP timelines from Wendy Goodfriend.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Comments

Co-Chair Burrell uplifted Committee Member Cantú's earlier request for support in the fuel refining group so that the CSC can meet the June 5 deadline to finalize the writing for the CERP. Burrell shared concern for the group work due to the Greg Karris contract falling through. BAAQMD staff shared that they are in the process of forming a tactical team to collaborate with the group and community to get the work done. Committee Member Cantú responded that the proposed scope for Greg Karris was to study the flares from the last two years, but due to the red tape the contract fell through. She reminded the group that the fuel refining group has been requesting extra support since October. She shared that the group is currently coordinating with Victor Douglas to do the flaring analysis but continues to have issues with staffing, resources, and coordination. Cantú shared that the group has met with Phi Fine, the BAAQMD COO, and are challenging the BAAQMD to be accountable for the necessary data and support. She shared that she will send a doodle poll for those interested in joining the group because they are aiming to coordinate with the community and community advocates.

Committee Member Johnson asked about when the CERP will be submitted and adopted by the BAAQMD. BAAQMD staff shared that the CERP will first have to go to their Community Equity, Health, and Justice group, then is estimated to go to the Board in 2024. Staff shared that while finishing drafts of the plan and going out to the public, CSC can present strategies and have a discussion with the Community Equity, Health, and Justice group potentially the third week of September.

Committee Member Range asked if there is a community outreach plan and if that timeline will be presented to the CSC. Co-Chair Angulo-Castro responded that CSC made a motion in January to approve the engagement scope for another contractor that will be focused on community engagement. Committee Member Cantú responded that the Community Engagement subgroup is working with Ratha Lai. She shared that he is currently assessing applications to ask about gaps regarding networks and helping create the community engagement plan so that the CSC can go

to the community with the draft CERP plan. Cantú shared that to date Lai has become familiar with the community description, working group documents, and strategies that have already been written and is beginning to synthesize the content into a narrative and thinking about how AB617 will be presented to the community.

Co-Chair Burrell asked if the meeting she went to the previous week was the community engagement group and requested to continue to be part of the group. Committee Member Cantú specified that the group meets every Wednesday at 2:00 pm and invited additional CSC members to join. Cantú also reminded the group that the engagement plan will be finalized in June and that there are 6 weeks.

Committee Member Marquez asked who the consultant for the engagement strategies is. Committee member Cantú stated that is Ratha Lai. Marquez followed up with a request to join the community engagement group.

Committee Member Aguirre reminded the BAAQMD staff to share the subgroup information and calendar invitations with the CSC. She encouraged other CSC members to get involved. BAAQMD staff stated that they will share a simple form with the 11 subgroups, the regular meeting times, and a Google document with an update on all of the groups so that CSC can sign up for what they are interested in.

Committee Member Kilbreth commented that the community engagement plan is different from the CERP and specified that it involves a different skill set. He shared that the Community Engagement group will be presenting to Richmond City Council at the end of May to give them a heads up about the CERP. Committee Member Severy added that he appreciates Mr. Lai's mind for audience mapping and challenged the CSC to think expansively about social networks people have. Severy encouraged CSC members to attend the Wednesday meeting.

Committee member Castello introduced the idea of going to the Spring Family Day event at the Richmond Art Center on Saturday, April 29, which focuses on air quality and clean Hampton Bay as an opportunity to start networking and building connections with groups. She shared that she sent an email about it. Co-chair Angulo-Castro shared that he will be at the event for work but can ask if the CSC can go to table. BAAQMD staff stated they can forward the event details.

8. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE UPDATES

01:23:59

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.

Committee Comments

Co-Chair Angulo shared that he sent a survey on April 17 that some students at UC Berkeley created in cooperation with him and Committee Member Aguirre. The students want to get an understanding of CSC member experience with the BAAQMD, communities, and municipalities as well as a sense of the progress. Angulo-Castro shared that the students' goal is to use the findings to inform future communities and other Air District CERPs on how to improve the process in updates and changes. He requested that members respond by April 25. Committee Member Ruano Hernandez asked Co-chair Angulo what he thought of the survey. He and Committee Member

Aguirre said that was good. She added that the students are in the Masters for Planning. Aguirre shared that the students are looking at how to become planners with an environmental justice background and they are the next generation. Committee Member Range requested the link to the survey.

Committee Member Ruano Hernandez shared that BAAQMD released new CEQA thresholds and guidelines and noted that chapter two of the guidelines is titled “Best Practices for Centering Environmental Justice in Health Equity”. He also shared that he tabled for the engineering department at Hunterville's College for an Earth Day event on April 21. Ruano Hernandez also shared that Chabot College of Hayward is hosting the first Annual Bay Area Environmental Justice Assembly Friday, April 28, from 10:00 am to 3:00 pm.

Committee Member Swillinger asked BAAQMD staff if there is impact on the BAAQMD or county for the recent Supreme Court decision to uphold municipalities’ ability to hold businesses accountable for the effects of climate change. Staff stated that they will get back to her.

Committee Member Marquez shared that she is working on San Pablo's General Plan update and that the city is currently doing environmental justice outreach. She stated that there will be a listening session with the Housing Authority at their Kidd Manor location in San Pablo.

Committee Member Cantú reminded Co-Chair Angulo-Castro that he has Toxic Tour for youth and shared that the Annual Literacy Festival is Saturday, April 29, at the Civic Center in Richmond. She shared that there are a lot of tabling events, and it is an opportunity to present some basic information about AB617. Co-Chair Angulo-Castro followed up and shared that he has a Toxic Tour scheduled for Friday, April 28, with Communities For a Better Environment for a class at CSU East Bay. He shared that they are planning more Toxic Tours in the future. Committee Member Kilbreth asked if Co-Chair Angulo-Castro was a guide and Angulo-Castro responded that he is a guide, driver, and support. Committee member Aguirre asked if the CSC can sign up. Co-Chair Angulo-Castro specified that it was through an environmental sociology class at CSU East Bay but he can extend the invitation to the CSC.

Committee Member Kilbreth shared that in the No Coal in Richmond Campaign, the City of Richmond passed an ordinance that said by 2027 the Levin Terminal has to cease coal exports. He stated that it would reduce the coal train cars going through Richmond. He shared that a study was completed of the estimated 2.5 PM reduction by carload. He warned that Oakland has not been able to achieve the same but validated the information can be used in Oakland so that they can eventually reach that goal.

Co-Chair Angulo shared that Committee Member Swillinger put him in touch with a reporter from the Associated Press to discuss with one or two community members about the harm from the rail industry in Richmond. Angulo-Castro shared that he will be speaking with the reporter on Wednesday, May 3, at 2:00 pm. He encouraged those that live next to the railroad to attend and share their experience since he does not have that experience. Committee Member Range asked if it was specifically about air pollution. Angulo-Castro responded that it is regarding the cumulative impact. Committee member Kilbreth stated that he would share data for rail impacts. Committee Member Swillinger also shared that she is speaking with a different reporter about a similar issue since CARB is about to vote on in-use rail regulation, but she has not been able to find information regarding the vote. Staff shared that the vote will be held on April 27. Swillinger shared that the reporters are gathering input from communities impacted by rail.

Committee Member Aguirre congratulated Committee Member Cantú for her appearance on KQED TV and asked her to share her experience. Committee Member Cantú shared that she was honored to have been able to share about the lack of Air District accountability for the refineries, the many notices of violation, asthma rates, and her personal story and connection to environmental justice work. She shared that it aired April 21 with Priya Clement and Sajal, San Francisco Baykeeper, and was an Earth Day special. Committee Member Kilbreth asked where it can be viewed. Cantú shared that a Google search for KQED Earth Day Marisol is enough.

Public Comments

Sondra Abruzzo shared that she and a classmate, Hannah, are the UC Berkeley students conducting the CSC survey regarding the CSC experience. She shared that they are in a sustainable communities class in the Department of City and Regional Planning and that their final project has been focused on AB617 implementation in Richmond. She shared that on May 1 they will be presenting their research on CERP, BAAQMD, and different groups to showcase the CSC experience. She stated their appreciation for sharing their feedback about their experience and their work. She shared that they are willing to answer any additional questions.

Hannah Karlan reiterated their appreciation for filling out the CSC Survey, the opportunity to uplift CSC voices, and that they are open to any other questions.

9. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, May 15, 2023, at 5:30 pm, Zoom Video Conferencing, at 5:30 pm.

Zoom Log In: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/87966014618>

Meeting ID: 8796 601 4618

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting was adjourned by Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro at 7:27 pm.

MIG Consulting