

Community Equity Health & Justice Committee
Community Convening
Co-Chair: Davina Hurt
Co-Chair: Tyrone Jue

Wednesday, April 21, 2021, 4:00p – 6:00p

Summary Notes

Time	Item	Presenter	Notes
4:00 – 4:05 pm	Welcome	Co-Chair Hurt	Community Equity Health and Justice Committee Community convening Co-Chair: Director Davina Hurt Co-Chair: Director Tyrone Jue
4:06 – 4:07 pm	Housekeeping	Co-Chair Hurt	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Review agenda <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Work plan ○ Visioning session Raise Hand Feature ○ Respectful Behavior ○ One speaker at a time ○ Limit comment length ○ Mute microphone ○ This meeting is being recorded and transcribed ○ Patience w Technology
4:08 – 4:10 pm	Review Agenda	Co-Chair Hurt	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Name and organization <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Enter your information into the chat box ○ End time for the meeting is 6pm
4:11 – 4:16 p	Opening Remarks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Co-Chair Hurt ● Co-Chair Jue 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Review agenda <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Work plan ○ Visioning session ● Purpose ● Goal ● Future Meetings <p>Co-Chair Hurt, Opening Remarks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>We want to hear from you all today, visible with our plans, honest with our thoughts, adaptable with our actions, the mark of leadership</i> - <i>Community meetings will get to these points, the committee want to be conscious of equity within the air district; formality of the meeting gets in the way of us having a conversation and getting into deep thought, important as committee provide time to build a two-year work plan</i> - <i>Reconnect in this forum, hammer down the details; this plan is cumulation of community input/thoughts, committee thoughts, staff, community,</i> - <i>See if this plan still makes sense for community, are we missing anything, what are the higher priorities, do we need delete action items, solidify this work plan so we can get to action; appreciate your time and thank you in advance</i> <p>Co-Chair, Jue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>Thanks for being available; time is precious, you give a lot to your communities and to the air district. we appreciate your guidance as we learn how we can move forward</i>

4:17 – 4:21 p	Background/History	Sr. Deputy Executive Officer Eady	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Ad Hoc Committee on Equity Access and Inclusion ● Formation of CEHJ Committee ● Highpoints over the last four years <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 2017: opened DEI offices, headed by two staff persons, MaryAnn, director, Tim, staff person ○ Process of hiring in the next year; additional staff members because of the workload ● Board has made resolution condemning racism in June 2021: statement condemning racism, global and social awakening accompanying the murder of George Floyd ● Goes without saying, happy about the verdict, it's only a first step, Down payment, a long way to go, makes our work very important here ● Board formed AD-Hoc, Feb 2020: access, equity and inclusion ● There is a rotating board chair every year; new incoming chair Cindy Chavez; made DEI a standing committee, merged it with public health committee - to be merged with AB 617, made sense for the committees to be merged given the focus of the work ● 2021 Priorities <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ What are our goals that is supported by staff ○ Create a work plan ○ Objectives and two-year goals ○ Get community thought in the work plan and implement
---------------	---------------------------	--	---

4:22 – 4:23 p	AD Mission & Map	Deputy Nudd	<p>Co-Chair Hurt</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Solidify the work plan - living document for this committee, committee approval next stage of action • Deputy Greg Nudd will give a high level outline of the existing work plan; edit the work plan as we see fit together <p>Deputy Nudd</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft work was a list of things that we thought had to that needed more community engagement, deep community engagement for the board, high priority for the board • Skeleton that was put together and open to considering changes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ AB 617 Work Plan ○ Community Advisory Council ○ Community Benefit Fund ○ Transparent and Equitable funding project ○ Update to grant programs and guidelines • AB 617 Overview <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Community Health Protection Program; created by assembly bill 617 in conjunction with the cap and trade bill ○ Air district identified several high priority communities to be working on to build a community reduction plans and Community monitoring plans • Two designated communities: West Oakland, North Richmond- San Pablo <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Implementing emission plan in West Oakland ○ Beginning the process for developing emission reductions for Richmond, North Richmond and San Pablo • Communities Identified Pending Designation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ East County ○ East Oakland ○ Eastern SF ○ San Jose ○ Tri-Valley Vallejo • Both Significantly air pollution and particular vulnerable population • AB 617 Implementation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Talking about the regional work designated communities ○ New Community ○ Community Pending Designation ○ Naming a new co ○ Naming a new community ○ Talk about the future program • Regional Scale: Provide benefits for all AB 617 communities <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Right now, we can go into communities, we can't tell them with great accuracy about the pollution source; are the freeways • Working with planning staff at the high priority community and at
---------------	-----------------------------	--------------------	---

			<p>the local jurisdiction</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Staff is aware of EJ issues when they do the land use planning ● Implementing a region wide monitoring program; our partner is driving every street in the Bay Area and measuring air pollution <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Analyzing data and identify areas that are overburdened ● Designated Communities: Implementing the Owing Our Air enforcement plan <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Developing and monitoring plan in Richmond/San Pablo ● Communities Pending Designation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Developing Air quality fact sheets ○ ID major sources of air pollution, inventions of the planning efforts ● Regional work, developing air equality fact sheets, identifying a community advisory council <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Purpose of the Community Advisory Council will advise the Air District Board, CEHJ Committee, and staff on policies and programs affecting impacted communities. ○ Brown Act committee; eahr of decision making process for programs that impact ● Community Benefit Fund <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Identify money in the budget in July 2022; 1 million dollars as down payment/seed funding, building capacity for CBO's resources and projects for impacted communities ○ Not restricted to AB 617 communities as the current funding is ● Transparent Equitable Funding Projects <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Budgeting process is not sufficiently transparent; the way we present the information is overly complex and impeding full, robust participation ○ Look at where the money is going; track racial and ethnic statistics for who we hire and who we promote, who leaves the agency, have this as performance metrics for improvements that need to be made ○ Same kind of kind performance for the money that the air district is spending across the Bay Area; identify areas and folks who are not bidding their fair, changes internally for any disparities we identify ● Grant Programs and Guideline Updates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Grant program are designed to provide resources for CBO's (Community Based Organizations), <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Build capacity for community-based organizations, strengthen their ability to participate in the air quality processes ○ Provide monetary resources for projects in impacted communities to reduce exposure to air pollution and address public health impacts ○ Work closely with the committee and community advocates on moving that forward for the next round of grants
--	--	--	--

4:22 – 4:50 p	High Level Outline of Workplan Items Q&A	Deputy Nudd Sr. Deputy Executive Officer Eady	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● AB617 Work Plan ● Community Advisory Council ● Community Benefits Fund ● Transparent & Equitable Funding Project ● Grant Programs and Guidelines Update
4:51 – 4:56	BREAK		
4:57 – 5:49 p	Community Visioning Session	Co-Chair Hurt	<p>Community members will share thoughts on items they would like to have included in the Work Plan</p> <p>Sample facilitation questions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What workplan items resonate with you and/or excites you? 2. What could help make this work plan better? 3. What is missing from the workplan?

			<p><u>Questions/Discussion/Feedback from Community Members</u></p> <p>Community Member 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The elephant in the room as we move forward, there is perception that one size fits, I don't see the capacity in the BAAQMD to function as an agency to make planning based on conditions, capacity, and needs of each of the communities either by zip codes or census tract; based on the current conditions per community - If this genuine, transparent with equity; that rationales be part of the rationale for this work - what is happening in Richmond is not happening in the same areas in other part of the Bay Area, what is happening in San Jose is not the same thing that is happening in West Oakland - Specificity on each one of these communities and how they will interject themselves with this plan - There has not been a discussion or dialogues, planning; this is not going to work; this is the baseline problems over the years in the work I have engaged with BAAQMD - That is the cause frustration anger and confusion; every community needs a different type of process, engagement and how they recognize their problems - It doesn't make sense to have a list and solutions to supports that <p>Co-Chair Hurt: Thank you (Community Member1). That is the elephant in the room; we have to got start chipping away and I completely understand agree with you</p> <p>Community Member 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Not starting off with understand those complications in this process -- it has not been asked or has it been answered - There is no broad based equity; unrealistic engagement based on broad strokes of continuity <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We need to do Community profiling and understand deeply about which community needs and respond appropriately. Discuss with staff and in this environment again - Does anyone want to provide the feedback? <p>Community Member 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Does anyone is this audience disagrees with the statements <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Start of the work that has been a major barrier in city improvement in air quality <p>Community Member 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Residents of East Oakland; East Oakland's idea of equity for community members have different ideas from West Oakland's around equity, where is the community input? - Engagement is the most important piece in helping in developing a plan; getting an idea about what their specific needs are; it has
--	--	--	---

			<p>not been not as much as it should</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This is a great forum but what is the ideal equity around air quality in regards to unhoused residents? - What is your idea of equity and air quality for unhoused residents? - What does protection look like? - My idea of protection is being able to access safe shelter; our community needs us to reimagine environmental justice; what we are here for, to reimagine what environmental justice is, what will the atonement for health disparities for those still suffering? <p>Community Member 3:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Agree about the differential needs within the community; part of the research - Prioritization of what prior... (inaudible) - From a scientific standpoint, the need for each individual neighborhood needs an equity review and profiling as it relates to.... <p>Community Member 4: - Agree with Community Members 1&3; Neighborhoods have different capability to respond; they will need that assistance to develop community level resources; not all gifted with the same community members....</p> <p>Community Member 5:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Richmond, we have been assessing the findings from the work that has been done through identifying the sources of pollution that is affecting our communities; send community contacts in the Richmond, San Pablo, findings from the Monitoring efforts in our area - Seems to me, our last meeting is concerned in terms of communicating to the communities our findings; I am not seeing where we in Richmond is not up to date or on board around recognizing and the unique pollution impacts - Developing action plan to address those sources <p>Community Member 6:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Question on the Community benefit fund: hearing that made me think about the readily accessible fund that community members to pull from to deal with health impacts, the names throw me off but it sounds like another grant program that would be available for CBO's - What are those parameters around accessing agency funds is not accessible; organizations that don't have the infrastructure in place to manage or to channel those funds <p>Deputy Nudd</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - With respect to the community benefits find; Broader applicability; it's fluid at this point - Good point around accessibility for grant funding - What kind of infrastructure organizations need to maintain to accept funds from the air district; opportunities we have to improve the way we do business; Build capacity for community-based organizations <p>Co-Chair Jue: Review questions/Comments from chat body</p>
--	--	--	---

			<p>Highlight: a number of people agreed with Community Member 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Community Member 7: continuity of regulatory pollutants decided by BAAQMD - Community Member 2: studies that we rely on unhoused resident that are tackling issues of equity - Studies that we rely on; how residents are often unaccounted for, how do we define equity and protection without considering quality of life without ad <p>Co-Chair Hurt: it is important to hear where we need to be better, thank you for your questions and comments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Timeline of establishing the community advisory council as a brown act, looking for that new community advisory council to help decide what it will be called. - What kind of outreach will BAAQMD intend to recruit community members for the council - How fast can we move to make it a Brown Act body? - What are the steps? We want to do it sooner than later, but community members request to not rush the process and do it right the first time around - Speak about the tension between the two as it related to the timeline <p>Executive Officer Broadbent</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - On behalf of the staff, we want to create the community advisory council; we envision it to be a brown act body; the tension is related to the process of selecting those that will serve; we want to think this through and be inclusive of all voices. You have unique communities around the Bay Area that we want to participate; we are getting caught up in the process of how to move forward - How do we make sure all voices and communities are heard? - This body is going to help us have lesson learned from the work done so far; what can we take from the work and apply it elsewhere - Vehicle that will get the community to be the voices in the district; that it the values - We have board meeting and variety ways; there needs to be formal process for community engagement <p>Co-Chair Hurt: Outreach, how would we get the word out? Thoughts from staff on expansion and outreach</p> <p>Executive Officer Broadbent: Sr. Deputy Officer Eady and her staff will be working on this; we will get an overwhelming support for a community advisory council, bring it back to the board; will take some time; internally to get this up and running by the end of the year; seeking input, selecting committee members, and getting them started; last quarter of 2021</p> <p>Sr. Deputy Executive Officer Eady:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Team of staff speaking with advocates in the region; not all of the advisory agrees. How can we take the advice and give it the weight it deserves; how to be inclusive in the advisory committee
--	--	--	--

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In being inclusive, we are going to reach as many communities; some community member have limited or more experience with working with the air district - Need to take it all into account as we think through the process and get advice; projection by end of the year is correct - Early in Q4 - Important that we put this body together; all issues that we want to bring to the community advisory countio <p>Community Member 7:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide monetary resources for projects in impacted communities to reduce exposure to air pollution and address public health impacts - Community Member 2: Most of the studies that we rely on are of housed residential districts and our unhoused residents are unaccounted for. How do we even attempt to define Equity or Protection without being willing to improve ALL of our communities Quality of life? <p>Community Member 8:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What is the timeline for establishing the community advisory council? - How are members decided? - What kind of outreach to get folks on the council? <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What are the steps? - Community, don't rush the process and do it right this time around <p>Executive Officer Broadbent:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Envision it to be Brown Act body - Tension: process of selecting the people that will serve - A lot of very unique voices; how do we be inclusive? - What Is the process on how we move forward? - This body will help us determine our work - What can we take from what we have learned? - How do we make sure the voices of the community on the decision-making process? - Board meeting and variety ways; formal ways to get voices heard - Outreach <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advisory council and seeding it - Any thoughts from staff <p>Sr. Deputy Executive Officer Eady:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Get their input and their advice - How can we take the advice? - Make sure we are inclusive - Try to reach as many communities as possible - Some community members have a lot of experience with air quality and working with the air district, take all of this into account as we think through the process - Really important to put this body together; we have issues to bring
--	--	--	--

			<p>the community advisory council it's not lost on us on how urgent this issue is</p> <p>Community Member 9:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I have been to AB 617 selection meetings and I have seen first hand how competitive it can be for communities to ask for resources let alone to actually receive them - people are saying to decision makers Why is their community "better" or more "deserving"? - Question: What are you going to do in your work plan to lessen the load and not have communities to fight over them? <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We saw this at a CARB meeting, difficulty around the exchange for resources; limited resources but everyone need support - Staff have any initial feeling and thoughts; staff to educate, supporting AB 617 communities - Any additional thoughts around supporting communities? <p>Deputy Nudd:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We have been giving this a lot of thought; we have been at all the selection meeting at CARB and it's a bad process; one of the problems with AB 617 is that the way that is structured is it's all or nothing - In the Bay Area, we took the resources and make them more broadly available to high priority communities - Giving a lot of thought for the work plan in the next year - Important to have these conversations with committee and community advocates; the tension around community capacity and needs - Leverage economies of scale wit the air district; maximum benefit for community - Address particular needs for particular communities; a lot of what is driving our thinning and work plan <p>Community Member 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I work with WOEIP as a committee member; knowing that this plan will be coming to East Oakland, I would like to know how the outreach will get to those most impacted? They have not been reaching them. What are your outreach tools to ensure you are reaching those most impacted? How are we educating those impacted? - Community engagement piece: education, background outreach, meaningful engagement from those we are not at the table - We need the voices that don't have power to be at the table; ensure trust in the community that the district is doing work differently this time around <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I am learning as you are; there is a lot in the pool of knowledge around these issues that are so big; it is difficult, do people have time?
--	--	--	---

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We need to figure out to streamline and get to those folks <p>Community Member 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Based on what happened with George Floyd, there is no reason to have an advisory committee that does not have authority or power based on equity - Elephant in the room: permits and proactive to make polluters clean up - If BAAQMD really wants to be both transparent and pursue having an advisory committee that does not understand their power and feel empowerment - More clear and specificity, that we are not rubber stamping for BAAQMD - We are there to empower and give authority, of decision making to our community; starting with the issues with permits and how it felts through community that BAAQMD are giving polluters break and not having compromised based on needs based per community <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Permitting <p>Community Member 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Plan of action; one of the items that have been hurtful to many communities; how permits are issued, carried out, through certain communities; it is not clear, no workshops, no filter of understanding about certain permitting applications - Polluter have to do a certain level of not creating harm <p>Co-Chair Hurt: May 12th workshop on permitting; we need to address permitting and have more clarification</p> <p>Community Member 10:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Agreeing with Community Member 1 - explicit that the 'advisory' part of the advisory committee is always problematic, given the conflicted nature of BAAQMD as a public health agency vs a pollution-permitting agency. <p>Community Member 8:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Rules and regulations, how the district is affecting people with their policies - Work plan: issue of penalties, air district regulations that are violated per year; air district cuts violators a break, even repeat violators, instead of charging the full fees, the air district that is due and not feel guilty to charge - Money left on the table for community health, taxes on the public - Communities fighting for selection; how you will select from the communities? - How do make this process less contentious? <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p>
--	--	--	--

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We want to help everyone even with capacity limits to do it all at once <p>Community Member 7:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We have been doing permitting for decades, nothing has changed - Bay Area Health Collaborative worked with the air district years ago around considering cumulative impacts; worked with BAAQMD in confirming that there will be public commentary and notice and yet, this last week, we were asking for a public hearing on common period on permits that were going to be issued - that is illegal - It is a violation of the civil rights of the Bayview-Hunters Points - Community is highly vulnerable - Concrete plants that have been operating for years; the agency allows for polluters operate without permit in vulnerable and at-risk communities, you don't give the notice, you pre-determine the outcomes and even though we have been on the contact list, we don't not received courtesy notice - We will have to spend time and air district to go through the appeals process; maybe in court, as long as this is going on, there's almost no point - Quite honestly, even though there are well intentioned and sincere staff on BAAQMD - Upload the policies you signed off to have legitimate public comment period - I was told to chase down staff to get the documents - Reality check: compliance with environmental justice and not just talk about it <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Workplan: anything that resonate with you, interest, what we should prioritize besides the advisory council, community profiles; finding out what each community needs equity wise - This is not of interest; we can downgrade the priority <p>Community Member 3:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Protocol questions: If we have particular issues; concrete facilities and exposure to residents, how do we handle this within this committee? How do we go about presenting the arguments that need immediate action from BAAQMD? - Do we need to develop a mechanism and how it impacts people's health right now as we speak - How do we develop this within the district? - How do we move this to be more efficient and responsive to people's needs? <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Committee work plan and action items that staff need to work on <p>Sr. Deputy Executive Officer Eady:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilitate the work plan for the committee; how does this feed into the action items for the staff
--	--	--	--

			<p>Community Member 3:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What is the mechanism that is set up in the district for handling these issues? Deal with health and equity, how do we address is this with the proper committee? - How can I expedite issues within the district? <p>Sr. Deputy Executive Officer Eady:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Work closely with the committee; the meetings are organized - Co-chairs are giving us direction, working closely hand in hand - Issues that have come up around permitting, Greg Nudd, noted in the chat, we have staff who are working with permitting reform - May 12th: public health hearing and workshop - Work plan in the committee is not going to be verbatim, will not be the strategic plan that the staff is putting together - We haven't started that process; this meeting is important in laying down the foundation - We will take this back to the committee; public inform the process and giving us direction - Conversations that we are having with staff are important, and conversation with the committee is just as important; underscoring and not overlapping when speaking to us <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Is there a complaint process? Issue process in place to engage facility or area can put those ideas and thoughts, transparent and accountability of response <p>Community Member 6:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Where is the Covid framework from this? - Impacts from Covid - How is this implemented in the advocacy you do for our communities? - Funds for our communities, action in our communities, starting today and years from before - How will it inform the community benefit fund; need to prioritize project - Impacts of the pandemic on our communities - It needs to be at the center; our communities are left behind in any progress <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Most disparate impact have been in Black and Latinx communities; Air quality plays are part of this, discussion around that as we think about that post covid - Post-covid - Vulnerable if something were to occur again <p>Sr. Deputy Executive Officer Eady:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Health Officer, Dr. Judy Cutino. who is working closely on the public health issues - Aware about CARB's study linking covid and air pollution, there are some things that are in the works
--	--	--	--

			<p>Deputy Nudd:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Tracking issues of COVID and air pollution; looking at the science - Considering economic impacts of the pandemic; health and lives and livelihood - What we are seeing with COVID numbers, same sad repeat for asthma, cardiovascular disease, inequity and structural racism impacting people's health - Interesting idea to take a look at co-benefits for interventions, air quality intervention - Provide additional protection to those impacted by the pandemic <p>Community Member 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Knowing that some of your parameter that they are able to function from - When we speak on equity, will BAAQMD be willing to take the lead to be found to be unprotected outside of your range of jurisdiction; how does BAAQMD look at this issues? - Looking at what equity means? How does it satisfy the past wrong and prepare for the fallout from COVID-19 and health disparities that people suffer from? <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Matter of many agencies working together to support these communities - We have to work with others to create a support system - How are we going to satisfy the past wrong and improve their future? - <p>Executive Officer Broadbent:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Questions to pose our community leaders who will be relying on the future? - Pose to the community advisory council; not presume to think we know how we could address past wrongs <p>Community Member 11:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Enforcement and compliance; that is just one example - This type of things happen in every neighborhood; as a group, we put a lot of effort in rule making, however, we didn't put balanced efforts on compliance and enforcement; the way that rule making and compliance and enforcements, you need both for progress - Meeting times devoted to rule making and not enough time for compliance and enforcement - Structured short fall - Veronica and Greg: outreach on rule making - Compliance and enforcement does not fall in their division; not outreach and compliance - balance between rulemaking, compliance and enforcement; address the problem, there are so many cases - Talk with people with my community, they are discouraged by compliance enforcement because there is not enough outcomes
--	--	--	---

			<p>Community Member 12:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Enforcement and compliance: What recourse for communities when enforcement and complaint is not met? Follow up on noting issues - Tremendous demands on the BAAQMD, what can the public do to support the work? Santa Clara university and National Lawyers Guild, legally trained who have the time and energy to support, mobilize residents - resource to be able to tap into - What can do to bring equity to communities who have not had it? <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Air quality improvements who are really struggling - How are we going to improve their future? <p>Executive Officer Broadbent:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We can write all the rules without compliance, but if companies do not comply with them, it means nothing - Strong enforcement when needed - Internally, to build and foster better communication <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Outreach to us on additional support <p>Community Member 4:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Key permitting issues <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Critical to equity, How do we incorporate health impacts? - How do we move beyond the limitation of the tools that staff are forced to rely on? - What resources need to strengthen and expedite developing those capabilities? - How we look at cumulative impacts - General comment: every time we go down this path, we are waiting for presentation materials a day or two period <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Comment periods needs to be extended to give people more time <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Permits and aspect we need to focus on to bring equity Compliance and enforcement - Hearing a number of items missing from the work plan - Compliance, enforcement, process for transparency and accountability <p>Community Member 13:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Listening to the conversation; understand all the concerns; my concerns around rules that are affecting the trucking business; grants require big companies to understand what is going on - I have to go to a consultant to see if I can qualify for grants <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We are being pushed to newer technology; not enough resources - 1/3 truckers who live in Oakland; rules are kicking in and we can't - We have dedicated funding for AB 617 communities
--	--	--	---

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Grant options: what do I qualify for? - Inequity comes because the way the grants are set up are by use; we are in local communities; we put less miles but we idle all day - Someone who runs from here to Reno will qualify; how do we help the local truckers and have the most impact on the communities <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This is going to be big issues; individual contractors properly engaged - Navigate resources and grant funding as it relates to small businesses <p>Community Member 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - BAAQMD had a staff person who worked and supported truckers with grant; part of community benefits and outreach that staff are there to support truck drivers in grant application - OT 411: supported truckers with grant, reestablished based on what Bill shared <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This is going to be big issues; impact on how to individual contractors properly engaged to get the funds, supports air quality for the community - Navigate resources and grant funding as it relates to small businesses <p>Community Member 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - As part of outreach, the district who have oversights grants and have office hours within the community for such issues; this has happened in the past <p>BAAQMD Staff 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The truckers were in dire need of technical assistance and understanding parameters of the grants - Strategic incentive division, dedicated staff borrowed from another division; provided technical assistance, we were stationed at OT 411 for most days - I definitely experience the high level of need from the trucker community and greatly appreciative to the air district for the service <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <p>we have to refocus our work in that space and strategy to support truckers; exactly what the future holds</p> <p>Co-Chair Jue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Does CARB have an official form? - Proposal for air filtration <p>Community Member 2: community action board, without policy shaping power is just a suggestion box; communities have endured this previously; we just want to make sure that equity is defined from those most impacted,</p>
--	--	--	--

			<p>empowerment through communication action board, just pick and choose low level goals; challenges from COVID</p> <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Staff are collecting your thoughts on the jam board - Less than about rulemaking - Many ideas have been repeated, compliance and enforcement, less about rulemaking <p>Sr. Deputy Executive Officer Eady:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Comments are on point; constructive and we have a lot to work with - If people have thought after, share with the staff <p>Co-Chair Jue:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Circulate notes so we are on the same page <p>Community Member 3:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - As a committee, look at factors when communities are complaining about dust, construction industries using a different standard for PM 10; PM 2.5 is true risk to community health and the public at large - Consolidate policy - 600 page report saying; antiquated standard from the 20th centuries; not dealing with what we have learned today - Impact on the quality of life on residents - District move forward in this community, protective health measures for high level of exposure <p>Co-Chair Hurt:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Thankful and appreciative the input; BAAQMD, co-chair are thankful for your time - Send emails to BAAQMD staff to follow up with a call and we can talk more <p>Meeting Concluded</p>
5:50 – 5:55 p	Next Steps	Air District Panel	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Based on discussions -takeaways ● Date of Next Convening (May 26th 4-6 p) ● Open conversation
5:56 – 6:00 p	Closing Remarks	Chair Hurt	<p>Items on the work plan; work we are committed Lifetime of inequities and we need to work on them immediately I am learning and listening; we have a lot of work to do</p>